

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Sent:** Monday, October 19, 2015 3:00 PM  
**To:** 'Carolyn Harvey'  
**Subject:** RE: From William Acker - Acker & Associates

Yeah, let's look at this on Wed so, we can have a good discussion with Bill.

Chua

---

**From:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Sent:** Monday, October 19, 2015 2:51 PM  
**To:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Subject:** Re: From William Acker - Acker & Associates

Good Afternoon, Chua,

It can be found in the paper that lists various experts from previous cases and then uses court documents to demonstrate who was seen as an expert by the court and who was not.

I don't know if you have a copy, because you gave me the original for my binder. Which of course I will bring with me Wednesday.

I read the forwarded message from Bill and I have several thoughts:

1. they use zoning and other municipal codes to litigate because there is not enough evidence to prove causation in court.
2. one case among dozens, is the act of a single judge. I see why they would hang on to this, but it doesn't change the fact this cannot be proved. In fact, it leads me to question the judge.
3. all the acoustical engineers study sound and are not qualified to comment on human illness, pathology or thereby a proposed mechanism of action. Bill can't really make the claims he does, nor can Dr Schomer who has a PhD in acoustics.
4. all the acoustical engineers draw our attention to infra-sound and pressure, but no one is saying there isn't infra-sound or pressure. In fact, everyone agrees there is. The question is if that sound can cause illness, and this is where the current science falls short. Naval studies from 80 years ago are relate able, but do not provide enough science, or current science to support the connection sought.
5. Carmen Krough, Bill Acker, Dr. Schomer, Rick James and others, all hang on to infra-sound like proving its presence proves their case. It does not. It provides a starting point. They need hundreds, a thousand would be better, rigorous studies that demonstrate how infra-sound causes illness. I can't find even one that reports a relative risk, risk difference or odds ratio.

I don't hear Bill saying anything new or different, and again, the question is whether the sound and pressure can cause illness, not whether it is present. That is actually their success, however, they are at least 10 years and more likely 20+ from being able to connect infra-sound to illness, and then, only in some people.

I will double check the source I have in writing and see if I can locate public notations of the case online as well.

See you Wednesday,  
Carolyn Harvey

---

**From:** Xiong, Chua L. <[Xiong\\_CL@co.brown.wi.us](mailto:Xiong_CL@co.brown.wi.us)>  
**Sent:** Sunday, October 18, 2015 8:32 PM  
**To:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Subject:** Fwd: From William Acker - Acker & Associates

Can we find out and clarify where the information is found with the Falmouth study in which the court case won because there was a defect in one of the windturbine? Bill is saying this isn't so. Just want to make sure our info is correct.

Chua

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** "William Acker" <[wgacker@sbcglobal.net](mailto:wgacker@sbcglobal.net)>  
**Date:** October 18, 2015 at 2:46:25 PM CDT  
**To:** <[Xiong\\_cl@co.brown.wi.us](mailto:Xiong_cl@co.brown.wi.us)>  
**Cc:** <[jaytibbetts@att.net](mailto:jaytibbetts@att.net)>  
**Subject:** From William Acker - Acker & Associates

Dear Chua Xiong: Sunday October 18, 2015 2:43 PM CST

I really enjoyed our conversation last week and I look forward to Our 10:30 AM meeting on Wednesday. Last week we discussed the Falmouth Mass. Wind Turbine Project and Court Case. This is a case that I have studied a lot and I have been in contact with Mr. Neil Andersen who has 2 courts cases against the developer which is the Town of Falmouth. In our discussion you mentioned that the problems In Falmouth was due to mechanical problems on one of the wind turbines. I had never heard that before so I contacted Neil to see what he knew. Neil told me that there were no mechanical problems with the wind turbines that was causing a noise problem, with the exception of the pressure pulsations off the blades that was causing infrasound, which is causing health problems to the neighbors near these turbines. So I am not sure where you are getting your information from. What I can tell you is that the noise testing at Falmouth is some of the best tests I have seen. One of the reasons for such good testing at this location is because the Wind Turbine Developer which is the Town of

Falmouth has nothing to hide, so they have allowed extensive testing. The pressure pulsations at this site are very significant not to mention additional pressure pulsations from the harmonics. At other sites that are owned by local utilities, the utilities generally do not assist the acoustical engineers with operational data and with shutting them down at times and starting them up so that the engineers can see how the noise changes with the wind turbines on and with them off. The Shirley Wind Study by the Wisconsin Public Service Commission, is one example where the Utility (Duke Energy) would not provide performance data and would not shut them down and start them up for the acoustical engineers hired to conduct the study.

For your information Neil has two pending court cases. One case is a nuisance court case that also involves 7 other families. The another family has a court case of their own. One of the issues in these cases is that the town failed to get a certain permit on the first installation called Wind 1. Due to the lack of that permit for Wind 1 the Zoning Board of Appeals demanded a shutdown of Wind 1 while the town seeks a special permit. So on Monday Sept. 28 the Town Board of Selectmen voted to comply with this recent order. Neil is not sure if the judge will allow a new application for Wind 1. The next meeting before the judge is Feb. 27, 2016.

Another thing you may or may not know is that when the town got numerous health complaints from some people the town selectmen decided to shutdown the wind turbines and to scrape the project. Later however the town found out that they could not get enough money from the sales of these wind turbines to support their removal. In order to remove the project the town would have to raise taxes. When the town heard about the raising of taxes to fund their removal the town demanded a vote. The vote was taken and the decision was to not shutdown the wind turbines. So the town wanted to do the right thing but it all came down to a money issue thus dividing the town over the right thing to do. This of course is a very unique situation because the town is the owner not a local utility.

You should also know that US Superior Court Judge Christopher J. Muse ruled on Nov. 22, 2013 that Wind Turbine Neighbors suffer irreparable Physical and psychological harm and demanded their shutdown from 7:00 PM to 7:00 AM Monday through Saturday and all day on Sundays, Thanksgiving, Christmas and New Years effective immediately. This was the first time that a Court in the U.S. has ruled that there is sufficient evidence that wind turbines near residential areas are a health hazard to families nearby.

If you need any additional information on this project please feel free to contact me. If you would like to know more about me my Web Site listed below, is full of facts and some of my articles.

William G. Acker  
Acker & Associates

P.O. Box 8695  
Green Bay, Wis. 54308-8695  
Phone: 920-465-3548  
E-mail: [wgacker@sbcglobal.net](mailto:wgacker@sbcglobal.net)  
Web Site: <http://www.ackerandassociates.com>

\*\*\*\*\* IMPORTANT CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE \*\*\*\*\* This electronic transmission, along with any information attached may contain confidential, proprietary, or privileged information, subject to, among other protections, the Health Insurance Portability & Accountability Act of 1996, codified as 45 C.F.R. Part 160; the Public Health Service Act, codified as 42 C.F.R. Part 2; and the attorney-client/attorney work-product statutory and common law privileges. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the information contained in or attached to this email is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender via return e-mail, then delete the email and any of its attachments, without reading or saving the email.

\*\*\*\*\* IMPORTANT CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE \*\*\*\*\* This electronic transmission, along with any information attached may contain confidential, proprietary, or privileged information, subject to, among other protections, the Health Insurance Portability & Accountability Act of 1996, codified as 45 C.F.R. Part 160; the Public Health Service Act, codified as 42 C.F.R. Part 2; and the attorney-client/attorney work-product statutory and common law privileges. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the information contained in or attached to this email is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender via return e-mail, then delete the email and any of its attachments, without reading or saving the email.

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Sent:** Monday, October 19, 2015 4:25 PM  
**To:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Subject:** Re: From William Acker - Acker & Associates

The website for the paper I was quoting. It is in the first few paragraphs.

<http://www.energyandpolicy.org/falmouth-wind-farm-case>

## Falmouth Wind Farm Case: The Outlier - Energy and Policy ...

In 2010, the town of Falmouth, Massachusetts constructed a pair of Vestas V82 1.65 MW wind turbines on their waste water treatment plant. After the first wind turbine ...

[Read more...](#)

---

**From:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Sent:** Monday, October 19, 2015 3:00 PM  
**To:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Subject:** RE: From William Acker - Acker & Associates  
Yeah, let's look at this on Wed so, we can have a good discussion with Bill.  
Chua

---

**From:** Carolyn Harvey [mailto:charvey4@wisc.edu]  
**Sent:** Monday, October 19, 2015 2:51 PM  
**To:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Subject:** Re: From William Acker - Acker & Associates

Good Afternoon, Chua,

It can be found in the paper that lists various experts from previous cases and then uses court documents to demonstrate who was seen as an expert by the court and who was not.

I don't know if you have a copy, because you gave me the original for my binder. Which of course I will bring with me Wednesday.

I read the forwarded message from Bill and I have several thoughts:

1. they use zoning and other municipal codes to litigate because there is not enough evidence to prove causation in court.
2. one case among dozens, is the act of a single judge. I see why they would hang on to this, but it doesn't change the fact this cannot be proved. In fact, it leads me to question the judge.

3. all the acoustical engineers study sound and are not qualified to comment on human illness, pathology or thereby a proposed mechanism of action. Bill can't really make the claims he does, nor can Dr Schomer who has a PhD in acoustics.

4. all the acoustical engineers draw our attention to infra-sound and pressure, but no one is saying there isn't infra-sound or pressure. In fact, everyone agrees there is. The question is if that sound can cause illness, and this is where the current science falls short. Naval studies from 80 years ago are relate able, but do not provide enough science, or current science to support the connection sought.

5. Carmen Krough, Bill Acker, Dr. Schomer, Rick James and others, all hang on to infra-sound like proving its presence proves their case. It does not. It provides a starting point. They need hundreds, a thousand would be better, rigorous studies that demonstrate how infra-sound causes illness. I can't find even one that reports a relative risk, risk difference or odds ratio.

I don't hear Bill saying anything new or different, and again, the question is whether the sound and pressure can cause illness, not whether it is present. That is actually their success, however, they are at least 10 years and more likely 20+ from being able to connect infra-sound to illness, and then, only in some people.

I will double check the source I have in writing and see if I can locate public notations of the case online as well.

See you Wednesday,  
Carolyn Harvey

---

**From:** Xiong, Chua L. <[Xiong\\_CL@co.brown.wi.us](mailto:Xiong_CL@co.brown.wi.us)>

**Sent:** Sunday, October 18, 2015 8:32 PM

**To:** Carolyn Harvey

**Subject:** Fwd: From William Acker - Acker & Associates

Can we find out and clarify where the information is found with the Falmouth study in which the court case won because there was a defect in one of the windturbine? Bill is saying this isn't so. Just want to make sure our info is correct.

Chua

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** "William Acker" <[wgacker@sbcglobal.net](mailto:wgacker@sbcglobal.net)>

**Date:** October 18, 2015 at 2:46:25 PM CDT

**To:** <[Xiong\\_cl@co.brown.wi.us](mailto:Xiong_cl@co.brown.wi.us)>

**Cc:** <[jaytibbetts@att.net](mailto:jaytibbetts@att.net)>

**Subject:** From William Acker - Acker & Associates

Dear Chua Xiong: Sunday October 18, 2015 2:43 PM CST

I really enjoyed our conversation last week and I look forward to

Our 10:30 AM meeting on Wednesday. Last week we discussed the

Falmouth Mass. Wind Turbine Project and Court Case. This is a case

that I have studied a lot and I have been in contact with Mr. Neil

Andersen who has 2 courts cases against the developer which is the

Town of Falmouth. In our discussion you mentioned that the problems

In Falmouth was due to mechanical problems on one of the wind

turbines. I had never heard that before so I contacted Neil to see

what he knew. Neil told me that there were no mechanical problems with

the wind turbines that was causing a noise problem, with the exception

of the pressure pulsations off the blades that was causing infrasound,

which is causing health problems to the neighbors near these turbines. So I am not sure where you are getting your information from. What I can tell you is that the noise testing at Falmouth is some of the best tests I have seen. One of the reasons for such good testing at this location is because the Wind Turbine Developer which is the Town of Falmouth has nothing to hide, so they have allowed extensive testing. The pressure pulsations at this site are very significant not to mention additional pressure pulsations from the harmonics. At other sites that are owned by local utilities, the utilities generally do not assist the acoustical engineers with operational data and with shutting them down at times and starting them up so that the engineers can see how the noise changes with the wind turbines on and with them off. The Shirley Wind Study by the Wisconsin Public Service Commission, is one example where the Utility (Duke Energy) would not provide performance data and would not shut them down and start them up for the acoustical engineers hired to conduct the study.

For your information Neil has two pending court cases. One case is a nuisance court case that also involves 7 other families. The another family has a court case of their own. One of the issues in these cases is that the town failed to get a certain permit on the first installation called Wind 1. Due to the lack of that permit for Wind 1 the Zoning Board of Appeals demanded a shutdown of Wind 1 while the town seeks a special permit. So on Monday Sept. 28 the Town Board of Selectmen voted to comply with this recent order. Neil is not sure if the judge will allow a new application for Wind 1. The next meeting before the judge is Feb. 27, 2016.

Another thing you may or may not know is that when the town got numerous health complaints from some people the town selectmen decided to shutdown the wind turbines and to scrape the project. Later however the town found out that they could not get enough money from the sales of these wind turbines to support their removal. In order to remove the project the town would have to raise taxes. When the town heard about the raising of taxes to fund their removal the town demanded a vote. The vote was taken and the decision was to not shutdown the wind turbines. So the town wanted to do the right thing but it all came down to a money issue thus dividing the town over the right thing to do. This of course is a very unique situation because the town is the owner not a local utility.

You should also know that US Superior Court Judge Christopher J. Muse ruled on Nov. 22, 2013 that Wind Turbine Neighbors suffer irreparable Physical and psychological harm and demanded their shutdown from 7:00 PM to 7:00 AM Monday through Saturday and all day on Sundays, Thanksgiving, Christmas and New Years effective immediately. This was the first time that a Court in the U.S. has ruled that there is sufficient evidence that wind turbines near residential areas are a health hazard to families nearby.

If you need any additional information on this project please feel free to contact me. If you would like to know more about me my Web Site

listed below, is full of facts and some of my articles.

William G. Acker

Acker & Associates

P.O. Box 8695

Green Bay, Wis. 54308-8695

Phone: 920-465-3548

E-mail: [wgacker@sbcglobal.net](mailto:wgacker@sbcglobal.net)

Web Site: <http://www.ackerandassociates.com>

\*\*\*\*\* IMPORTANT CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE \*\*\*\*\* This electronic transmission, along with any information attached may contain confidential, proprietary, or privileged information, subject to, among other protections, the Health Insurance Portability & Accountability Act of 1996, codified as 45 C.F.R. Part 160; the Public Health Service Act, codified as 42 C.F.R. Part 2; and the attorney-client/attorney work-product statutory and common law privileges. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the information contained in or attached to this email is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender via return e-mail, then delete the email and any of its attachments, without reading or saving the email.

\*\*\*\*\* IMPORTANT CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE \*\*\*\*\* This electronic transmission, along with any information attached may contain confidential, proprietary, or privileged information, subject to, among other protections, the Health Insurance Portability & Accountability Act of 1996, codified as 45 C.F.R. Part 160; the Public Health Service Act, codified as 42 C.F.R. Part 2; and the attorney-client/attorney work-product statutory and common law privileges. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the information contained in or attached to this email is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender via return e-mail, then delete the email and any of its attachments, without reading or saving the email.

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Sent:** Thursday, October 22, 2015 11:54 AM  
**To:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Subject:** Dave Enz

Hi Carolyn, I have made an appointment for us to meet with Dave Enz and his wife for next Wednesday, Oct 28<sup>th</sup> at 10:30am. He has made several attempts to contact me to meet with me so, I need to get this in my schedule. I am going to also see if I can get Michelle Buresch in as well for next Wednesday at 1:30pm.

Chua Xiong, RN, MSN  
Health Officer/Director  
Brown County HealthDepartment  
610 South Broadway Street  
Green Bay, WI, 54305  
(920) 448-6441 Telephone  
(920) 448-6441 Fax



**Public Health**  
Prevent Promote Protect

Brown County Health Department

**BCHD Mission::**

The Brown County Health Department protects and promotes individual and community health through education, regulation, and leadership to empower community members to attain well-being across the lifespan.

**"Follow" us on Facebook:**

Select one of these two options



**Follow the Brown County Health Department on Facebook: [www.facebook.com/BrownCountyHealthDept](http://www.facebook.com/BrownCountyHealthDept)**

\*\*\*\*\* IMPORTANT CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE \*\*\*\*\* This electronic transmission, along with any information attached may contain confidential, proprietary, or privileged information, subject to, among other protections, the Health Insurance Portability & Accountability Act of 1996, codified as 45 C.F.R. Part 160; the Public Health Service Act, codified as 42 C.F.R. Part 2; and the attorney-client/attorney work-product statutory and common law privileges. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the information contained in or attached to this email is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender via return e-mail, then delete the email and any of its attachments, without reading or saving the email.

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Sent:** Thursday, October 22, 2015 1:41 PM  
**To:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Subject:** Re: Dave Enz

Hi Chua, glad to see you are back in action today :)

The plan sounds good. I will make sure I have someone to pick up my daughter from school.

See you next week.

Take care,  
Carolyn

---

**From:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Sent:** Thursday, October 22, 2015 11:53 AM  
**To:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Subject:** Dave Enz

Hi Carolyn, I have made an appointment for us to meet with Dave Enz and his wife for next Wednesday, Oct 28<sup>th</sup> at 10:30am. He has made several attempts to contact me to meet with me so, I need to get this in my schedule. I am going to also see if I can get Michelle Buresch in as well for next Wednesday at 1:30pm.

Chua Xiong, RN, MSN  
Health Officer/Director  
Brown County Health Department  
610 South Broadway Street  
Green Bay, WI, 54305  
(920) 448-6441 Telephone  
(920) 448-6441 Fax



**Public Health**  
Prevent Promote Protect

Brown County Health Department

**BCHD Mission::**

The Brown County Health Department protects and promotes individual and community health through education, regulation, and leadership to empower community members to attain well-being across the lifespan.

**"Follow" us on Facebook:**

Select one of these two options



**Follow the Brown County Health Department on Facebook: [www.facebook.com/BrownCountyHealthDept](http://www.facebook.com/BrownCountyHealthDept)**

\*\*\*\*\* IMPORTANT CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE \*\*\*\*\* This electronic transmission, along with any information attached may contain confidential, proprietary, or privileged information, subject to, among other protections, the Health Insurance Portability & Accountability Act of 1996, codified as 45

C.F.R. Part 160; the Public Health Service Act, codified as 42 C.F.R. Part 2; and the attorney-client/attorney work-product statutory and common law privileges. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the information contained in or attached to this email is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender via return e-mail, then delete the email and any of its attachments, without reading or saving the email.

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Sent:** Thursday, October 22, 2015 2:00 PM  
**To:** 'Carolyn Harvey'  
**Subject:** RE: Dave Enz

Yeah, back in action again. I thought my head was going to explode yesterday. By the time I got home, I was feeling so nauseated. I took some sleeping meds to put me out (don't like taking those meds), but I needed to sleep so my migraine headache would go away. I was still feeling the effects of the meds this morning, but by afternoon, I was fine.

I tried calling Michelle to set a meeting with her at 1pm, but the phone number she left on my voice message is not working. So, I called Susan Ashley, and she wasn't home, but asked her husband to ask her to get me Michelle's number.

Okay, have a good weekend, see you next Wed.

Chua

---

**From:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Sent:** Thursday, October 22, 2015 1:41 PM  
**To:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Subject:** Re: Dave Enz

Hi Chua, glad to see you are back in action today :)

The plan sounds good. I will make sure I have someone to pick up my daughter from school.

See you next week.

Take care,  
Carolyn

---

**From:** Xiong, Chua L. <[Xiong\\_CL@co.brown.wi.us](mailto:Xiong_CL@co.brown.wi.us)>  
**Sent:** Thursday, October 22, 2015 11:53 AM  
**To:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Subject:** Dave Enz

Hi Carolyn, I have made an appointment for us to meet with Dave Enz and his wife for next Wednesday, Oct 28<sup>th</sup> at 10:30am. He has made several attempts to contact me to meet with me so, I need to get this in my schedule. I am going to also see if I can get Michelle Buresch in as well for next Wednesday at 1:30pm.

Chua Xiong, RN, MSN  
Health Officer/Director  
Brown County HealthDepartment  
610 South Broadway Street

Green Bay, WI, 54305  
(920) 448-6441 Telephone  
(920) 448-6441 Fax



**Public Health**  
Prevent Promote Protect

Brown County Health Department

**BCHD Mission::**

The Brown County Health Department protects and promotes individual and community health through education, regulation, and leadership to empower community members to attain well-being across the lifespan.

**“Follow” us on Facebook:**

Select one of these two options



***Follow the Brown County Health Department on Facebook:***

**[www.facebook.com/BrownCountyHealthDept](http://www.facebook.com/BrownCountyHealthDept)**

\*\*\*\*\* IMPORTANT CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE \*\*\*\*\* This electronic transmission, along with any information attached may contain confidential, proprietary, or privileged information, subject to, among other protections, the Health Insurance Portability & Accountability Act of 1996, codified as 45 C.F.R. Part 160; the Public Health Service Act, codified as 42 C.F.R. Part 2; and the attorney-client/attorney work-product statutory and common law privileges. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the information contained in or attached to this email is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender via return e-mail, then delete the email and any of its attachments, without reading or saving the email.

\*\*\*\*\* IMPORTANT CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE \*\*\*\*\* This electronic transmission, along with any information attached may contain confidential, proprietary, or privileged information, subject to, among other protections, the Health Insurance Portability & Accountability Act of 1996, codified as 45 C.F.R. Part 160; the Public Health Service Act, codified as 42 C.F.R. Part 2; and the attorney-client/attorney work-product statutory and common law privileges. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the information contained in or attached to this email is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender via return e-mail, then delete the email and any of its attachments, without reading or saving the email.

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Sent:** Friday, October 23, 2015 1:00 PM  
**To:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Subject:** Brown County Opening?

Hi Chua,

I had wanted to apply for one of the Economic Support Specialist position openings. I wanted to ask you if there is anything I should include on my resume and if it is okay to list you as a reference?

I think I may have missed the deadline now, I will cross my fingers and double check.

As always thank you for your thoughts and guidance,  
Carolyn

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Sent:** Friday, October 23, 2015 1:00 PM  
**To:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Subject:** Automatic reply: Brown County Opening?

I will be out of the office on Friday, Oct 23rd for all day conference in WI Dells. If you need immediate assistance, please call main number at (920) 448-6400.

\*\*\*\*\* IMPORTANT CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE \*\*\*\*\* This electronic transmission, along with any information attached may contain confidential, proprietary, or privileged information, subject to, among other protections, the Health Insurance Portability & Accountability Act of 1996, codified as 45 C.F.R. Part 160; the Public Health Service Act, codified as 42 C.F.R. Part 2; and the attorney-client/attorney work-product statutory and common law privileges. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the information contained in or attached to this email is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender via return e-mail, then delete the email and any of its attachments, without reading or saving the email.

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Sent:** Friday, October 23, 2015 1:53 PM  
**To:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Subject:** Re: Brown County Opening?

Yes, you may use me as reference.

Chua

Sent from my iPhone

On Oct 23, 2015, at 1:00 PM, Carolyn Harvey

rote:

Hi Chua,

I had wanted to apply for one of the Economic Support Specialist position openings. I wanted to ask you if there is anything I should include on my resume and if it is okay to list you as a reference?

I think I may have missed the deadline now, I will cross my fingers and double check.

As always thank you for your thoughts and guidance,

Carolyn

\*\*\*\*\* IMPORTANT CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE \*\*\*\*\* This electronic transmission, along with any information attached may contain confidential, proprietary, or privileged information, subject to, among other protections, the Health Insurance Portability & Accountability Act of 1996, codified as 45 C.F.R. Part 160; the Public Health Service Act, codified as 42 C.F.R. Part 2; and the attorney-client/attorney work-product statutory and common law privileges. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the information contained in or attached to this email is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender via return e-mail, then delete the email and any of its attachments, without reading or saving the email.

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Sent:** Thursday, November 12, 2015 9:31 AM  
**To:** Kristen Malecki; MARK EDGAR; DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER  
**Cc:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Subject:** Field Work Update  
**Attachments:** FW.Update.docx

Good Morning Everyone,

I have been busy accumulating evidence and keeping up with all the Health Department would like me to consider. I am attaching a document to let you all know what I've been up to in the way of wind turbines.

It continues to be a challenging position. I feel as though I am experiencing many of the challenges of Tom's River. It is more than a little like trying to investigate a cancer cluster. Difficult scientifically, difficult public health wise, difficult in personal accounts, transparency and understanding, difficult in that there isn't enough evidence to establish causation. It is hard to listen to people tell you how sick they are, and how certain they are of the 450 foot monster in their backyard, and know what I can offer will provide very little solace.

As always, thank you all for your guidance,  
Carolyn Harvey

Carolyn Harvey

**Field Work outputs:** for Brown County Health Department assessment of the Shirley Wind Farm, in the town of Glenmore; regarding citizen complaints of adverse health impacts, and the Brown County Board of Health declaration of a potential health hazard.

**1. Evidence log (10-28-15)**

A list of all materials presented (by citizens, civic groups, Duke Energy, members of the Brown County Board of Health) to the Brown County Health Department regarding the Shirley Wind Farm:

Primary Research Articles, Literature Reviews, Testimony and Affidavits, Non-research Articles, Communication Presented as Evidence, etc.

Purpose: To provide the department a list of all received materials

**2. Evaluation Tool (10-28-15)**

Table of criteria used to evaluate credibility of sources; primary research and literature reviews.

**3. Summary of Evidence log (11-11-15)**

List of primary and secondary research with evaluation outcomes, author's conclusions in support of, or contrary to, citizen complaints of adverse health impacts.

Purpose: To provide a snapshot of the evidence quality and conclusions

**4. Summary of Litigation (9-30-15)**

A list of cases filed against wind energy and their outcomes.

Purpose: To provide the department with a brief history of legal proceedings and outcomes.

**5. Annotated Bib.**

A list of evidence read and considered in its entirety.

Purpose: To increase my understanding of wind energy, citizen complaints and point of view, State legislation, Duke Energy's position, the function of wind turbines, infrasound/low-frequency sound and emissions, anatomy of the ear: sound propagation, vestibular cochlear response (cranial nerve 8, plasticity, memory and hearing loss).

**6. Citizen Interview Summary (9-30, 10-21, 10-28)**

These are interviews with citizens who reached out to the PH Department expressing a desire to share their experiences face to face with Health Officer Chua Xiong. Mrs. Xiong always tries to schedule these so that I am present as well.

**Purpose:** To provide citizens a platform to make complaints directly.

To promote understanding and increase transparency.

To ensure concerned community members the department continues in its mission to promote, protect and provide for their health and well-being.

To give the Health Officer and myself a firsthand account of their s/s.

**7. Board of Health Presentation: *Reviewing Evidence Based Research***

This was a short, 8-10 minute, presentation to the Brown County Board of Health (BOH) and community members.

**Purpose:** To update the BOH and community on the department's progress

To provide insight into the process being used to assess evidence

**Presented:** Tuesday, October 13 at 5:00pm

**From:** DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER <dssiegenthal@wisc.edu>  
**Sent:** Thursday, November 12, 2015 10:48 AM  
**To:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Cc:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Subject:** Fall 2015 Field work end-of-semester check in & evaluation  
**Attachments:** Preceptor\_Eval 2015.doc

Good morning Chua and Carolyn,

It is hard to believe that the close of the 2015 Fall semester is approaching! It is time to touch base regarding field work and completion of PHS 788 course work for the semester.

Thank you very much for sending along the update on where you are with deliverables. I see that you reported to the Board of Health on October 13th. I can very much empathize with the difficult and challenging nature of this work!

To review the field work plan, Carolyn began the work this fall and won't formally enroll for her 6 credits until Spring. I am not certain where you are at with logged hours or final completion of the project and am assuming you will need to carry over into the Spring to finish the project work (as well as due to the need to formally enroll for the 6 credits).

For students completing a project over several semesters, there are two options specific to evaluating the student for grading purposes.

1. We understand that it may be the case that not enough work has occurred to enable a grade to be assigned by the end of this fall semester session (December 15th, 2015). In this instance, preceptors may submit an "Incomplete" for the student. For this, please send a quick email confirming this is your desire by Thursday, December 17th at 5pm.
2. Students and preceptors can also choose to have the student evaluation completed each semester the student is enrolled. If this is the option chosen, an evaluation (attached) should be completed and signed by both preceptor and student each semester. A completed eval for the Fall semester should be returned by Thursday, December 17th at 5pm. An electronically signed copy works well if you can provide that.

Carolyn, a reminder that Learn@UW will be closing for the semester on December 15, 2015 at 1159 pm.

Please have desired posts and reflections uploaded by then. As a reminder, you can split up the entire amount of discussion posts and reflections over the semesters you complete the work. Continue to log your hours and submit what you have to date. You should wait to complete the student evaluation and summary until all project work is completed.

My notes indicate your current # postings are as listed below:

- a. 8 discussion questions, of which you have 0/8 posted
- b. 10 reflections posted, of which you have 0/10 posted

These next items WON'T be DUE until the final semester in which you complete the field work.

- c. The 3 part project summary paper (described on page 25 of the field handbook located on Learn@UW under the course content) which should be posted as the final summary on the dropbox assignment section
- d. Student evaluation (located on Learn@UW under the course content)
- e. The 400 hour time log (template located on Learn@UW under the course content) which must be signed by you and your preceptor

Chua, again I wish to sincerely thank you for your support of our MPH Program by serving in this preceptor role for Carolyn. We are incredibly appreciative of your valuable time and mentorship. Please do not hesitate to contact me if either of you have question.

Warm regards,  
Debbie

Debra Siegenthaler RN, MS  
Community Engagement Coordinator, MPH/PRIME  
Department of Population Health Sciences  
UW School of Medicine and Public Health  
734 WARF Building  
610 N. Walnut Street  
Madison, WI 53726  
Phone: 608.263.3036  
FAX: 608.263.2820

[dssiegenthal@wisc.edu](mailto:dssiegenthal@wisc.edu)

---

**From:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Sent:** Thursday, November 12, 2015 9:30 AM  
**To:** Kristen Malecki; MARK EDGAR; DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER  
**Cc:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Subject:** Field Work Update  
Good Morning Everyone,

I have been busy accumulating evidence and keeping up with all the Health Department would like me to consider. I am attaching a document to let you all know what I've been up to in the way of wind turbines.

It continues to be a challenging position. I feel as though I am experiencing many of the challenges of Tom's River. It is more than a little like trying to investigate a cancer cluster. Difficult scientifically, difficult public health wise, difficult in personal accounts, transparency and understanding, difficult in that there isn't enough evidence to establish causation. It is hard to listen to people tell you how sick they are, and how certain they are of the 450 foot monster in their backyard, and know what I can offer will provide very little solace.

As always, thank you all for your guidance,  
Carolyn Harvey



## PRECEPTOR EVALUATION OF STUDENT PERFORMANCE

The purpose of this form is to provide the preceptor with an opportunity to evaluate the student's performance in the Field Experience. The preceptor and student should review and discuss this evaluation together before it is submitted to the MPH Program.

| Student Information   |                    |             |
|-----------------------|--------------------|-------------|
| Student Name:         | Campus ID#         |             |
| Student's Phone:      | Student's Email:   |             |
| Preceptor Information |                    |             |
| Preceptor's Name:     | Preceptor's Title: |             |
| Preceptor's Phone:    | Preceptor's Email: |             |
| Organization:         |                    |             |
| Start Date:           | End Date:          | Hours/week: |

**1. Please rate the student's performance during the field experience based on the following criteria:**

|                                                                                             | Not Applicable | Unacceptable at this point in training | Somewhat below expectations | Met Expectations | Consistently Exceeded Expectations |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------|----------------------------------------|-----------------------------|------------------|------------------------------------|
| <b>COURSE REQUIREMENTS:</b>                                                                 |                |                                        |                             |                  |                                    |
| Achieved Field Experience Learning Objectives ( see Field Learning Agreement)               |                |                                        |                             |                  |                                    |
| Completed defined project in Public Health Practice                                         |                |                                        |                             |                  |                                    |
| Worked effectively within Preceptor/Organization                                            |                |                                        |                             |                  |                                    |
| Integrated public health theory into public health practice                                 |                |                                        |                             |                  |                                    |
| Demonstrated an appropriate level of public health skills and knowledge in field experience |                |                                        |                             |                  |                                    |

|                                                                                                                                                                           | Not Applicable | Unacceptable at this point in training | Somewhat below expectations | Met Expectations | Consistently Exceeded Expectations |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------|----------------------------------------|-----------------------------|------------------|------------------------------------|
| <b>PUBLIC HEALTH SKILLS AND KNOWLEDGE:</b>                                                                                                                                |                |                                        |                             |                  |                                    |
| Able to apply the core function of assessment in the analysis of public health problems. (Assessment)                                                                     |                |                                        |                             |                  |                                    |
| Demonstrated an understanding of the structure, process, and outcomes of health services including costs, financing, organization, outcomes, and accessibility. (Systems) |                |                                        |                             |                  |                                    |
| Able to plan for the design, development, implementation, and evaluation of strategies to improve individual and community health. (Program Planning)                     |                |                                        |                             |                  |                                    |
| Able to use the basic concepts and skills involved in culturally appropriate community engagement and empowerment with diverse populations. (Cultural Competency)         |                |                                        |                             |                  |                                    |
| Able to prepare a program budget with justification. (Financial Planning/Budgets)                                                                                         |                |                                        |                             |                  |                                    |
| Demonstrated an ability to use collaborative methods to achieve community and organizational goals. (Leadership)                                                          |                |                                        |                             |                  |                                    |
| <b>WORK HABITS:</b>                                                                                                                                                       |                |                                        |                             |                  |                                    |
| Reliable                                                                                                                                                                  |                |                                        |                             |                  |                                    |
| Took initiative in work                                                                                                                                                   |                |                                        |                             |                  |                                    |
| Efficient                                                                                                                                                                 |                |                                        |                             |                  |                                    |
| <b>INTERPERSONAL SKILLS:</b>                                                                                                                                              |                |                                        |                             |                  |                                    |
| Professional demeanor                                                                                                                                                     |                |                                        |                             |                  |                                    |
| Interactions with co-workers                                                                                                                                              |                |                                        |                             |                  |                                    |
| Interactions with community                                                                                                                                               |                |                                        |                             |                  |                                    |

2. Did the student bring the appropriate knowledge and skills needed to complete the project(s) in your organization? If no, what additional knowledge and skills were needed?

3. Was the student's work helpful or useful to you and your agency/organization? Please explain.

4. Please provide additional comments regarding the student's performance.

| Final Grade Assigned<br>for Field Experience | (Check<br>One) |
|----------------------------------------------|----------------|
| A = Outstanding                              |                |
| AB = Very Good                               |                |
| B = Good                                     |                |
| BC = Satisfactory, but<br>below expectations |                |
| C = Marginal Pass                            |                |
| F = No credit                                |                |

Preceptor's Signature: \_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Student's Signature: \_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Return completed form to Debbie Siegenthaler, MPH Program Community Engagement  
Coordinator, [dssiegenthal@wisc.edu](mailto:dssiegenthal@wisc.edu) Fax: 608/263-2820  
Mailing address: 734 WARF Bldg, 610 N Walnut St, Madison, WI 53726

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** Kristen Malecki <kmalecki@wisc.edu>  
**Sent:** Thursday, November 12, 2015 11:13 AM  
**To:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Cc:** MARK EDGAR; DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER; Xiong, Chua L.  
**Subject:** Re: Field Work Update

Carolyn,

This is a tremendous amount of work and a very interesting project. I am happy to sort through but assume that you and Brown county are working on developing public health messaging to address concerns that would potentially include action items and next steps. One person to reach out to or groups of people to determine what they have already done is the health hazards group at the state health department.

Thanks for the update, looking forward to seeing results/summary of all this hard work.

Kristen

On Nov 12, 2015, at 9:30 AM, Carolyn Harvey <[charvey4@wisc.edu](mailto:charvey4@wisc.edu)> wrote:

Good Morning Everyone,

I have been busy accumulating evidence and keeping up with all the Health Department would like me to consider. I am attaching a document to let you all know what I've been up to in the way of wind turbines.

It continues to be a challenging position. I feel as though I am experiencing many of the challenges of Tom's River. It is more than a little like trying to investigate a cancer cluster. Difficult scientifically, difficult public health wise, difficult in personal accounts, transparency and understanding, difficult in that there isn't enough evidence to establish causation. It is hard to listen to people tell you how sick they are, and how certain they are of the 450 foot monster in their backyard, and know what I can offer will provide very little solace.

As always, thank you all for your guidance,  
Carolyn Harvey

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Sent:** Thursday, November 12, 2015 1:18 PM  
**To:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Cc:** DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER  
**Subject:** Grading and Deb Siegenthaler's Message

Hi Chua,

Grading. I need to provide you with a folder of my current outputs, my hour log, and the form/rubric for grading. My semester ends 12-17 and final grades are due 12-29-15.

You can, at your discretion, wait until Spring semester to grade my work for you. We did not formally file the Field Learning Agreement until October so my credits will actually appear in the Spring Semester of my transcript. I am also required to complete several of my hours going into the Spring semester. I would like to do these in January, as I will not start Spring classes until 1-19-16. I'd like to be in the office on a daily basis over this time period in January, if that works for the department.

I expect to have the materials for grading updated and in a single, tangible place for you when we meet next week, as well as my hour log.

Thank you, Chua. I really enjoy being in the office, and working with you and the department staff. Everyone continues to be incredibly warm and welcoming.

Carolyn

P.s.

I may have to provide you all with "beef sticks" when I leave :)

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER <dssiegenthal@wisc.edu>  
**Sent:** Friday, November 13, 2015 9:26 AM  
**To:** Kristen Malecki; Carolyn Harvey  
**Cc:** MARK EDGAR; Xiong, Chua L.  
**Subject:** Re: Field Work Update

Hi Carolyn,

I agree, lots of hard and good work here! I would echo the advice Dr. Malecki gave regarding working with Brown County on messaging as well as collaboration and assistance from DHS. From my past Health Officer experience, you are spot on re the extremely challenging nature of this issue. The data is the one thing to always come back to.... and that may mean that there is no evidence to show causation. Showing empathy is important but can be tricky too. Of course, be sure to let Chua and the Board of Health take the lead, and take in all that you will learn from this rich experience!

Debbie

Debra Siegenthaler RN, MS  
Community Engagement Coordinator, MPH/PRIME  
Department of Population Health Sciences  
UW School of Medicine and Public Health  
734 WARF Building  
610 N. Walnut Street  
Madison, WI 53726  
Phone: 608.263.3936  
FAX: 608.263.2820

[dssiegenthal@wisc.edu](mailto:dssiegenthal@wisc.edu)

---

**From:** Kristen Malecki  
**Sent:** Thursday, November 12, 2015 11:13 AM  
**To:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Cc:** MARK EDGAR; DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER; Xiong, Chua L.  
**Subject:** Re: Field Work Update  
Carolyn,

This is a tremendous amount of work and a very interesting project. I am happy to sort through but assume that you and Brown county are working on developing public health messaging to address concerns that would potentially include action items and next steps. One person to reach out to or groups of people to determine what they have already done is the health hazards group at the state health department.

Thanks for the update, looking forward to seeing results/summary of all this hard work.

Kristen

On Nov 12, 2015, at 9:30 AM, Carolyn Harvey

wrote:

Good Morning Everyone,

I have been busy accumulating evidence and keeping up with all the Health Department would like me to consider. I am attaching a document to let you all know what I've been up to in the way of wind turbines.

It continues to be a challenging position. I feel as though I am experiencing many of the challenges of Tom's River. It is more than a little like trying to investigate a cancer cluster. Difficult scientifically, difficult public health wise, difficult in personal accounts, transparency and understanding, difficult in that there isn't enough evidence to establish causation. It is hard to listen to people tell you how sick they are, and how certain they are of the 450 foot monster in their backyard, and know what I can offer will provide very little solace.

As always, thank you all for your guidance,  
Carolyn Harvey

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** Xiong, Chua L  
**Sent:** Monday, November 16, 2015 5:10 PM  
**To:** 'Carolyn Harvey'  
**Cc:** DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER  
**Subject:** RE: Grading and Deb Siegenthaler's Message

Hi Carolyn, since your departure last Wednesday.....I have been chasing another fire to put out. So, I apologize for the lateness in this reply.

We can discuss further on this Wednesday. I do greatly appreciate all the assistance you have been giving me with the literature reviews. Your feedback and insights has been very insightful.

See you on Wednesday.

Chua

---

**From:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Sent:** Thursday, November 12, 2015 1:18 PM  
**To:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Cc:** DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER  
**Subject:** Grading and Deb Siegenthaler's Message

Hi Chua,  
Grading. I need to provide you with a folder of my current outputs, my hour log, and the form/rubric for grading. My semester ends 12-17 and final grades are due 12-29-15.

You can, at your discretion, wait until Spring semester to grade my work for you. We did not formally file the Field Learning Agreement until October so my credits will actually appear in the Spring Semester of my transcript. I am also required to complete several of my hours going into the Spring semester. I would like to do these in January, as I will not start Spring classes until 1-19-16. I'd like to be in the office on a daily basis over this time period in January, if that works for the department.

I expect to have the materials for grading updated and in a single, tangible place for you when we meet next week, as well as my hour log.

Thank you, Chua. I really enjoy being in the office, and working with you and the department staff. Everyone continues to be incredibly warm and welcoming.

Carolyn

P.s.

I may have to provide you all with "beef sticks" when I leave :)

\*\*\*\*\* IMPORTANT CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE \*\*\*\*\* This electronic transmission, along with any information attached may contain confidential, proprietary, or privileged information, subject to, among other protections, the Health Insurance Portability & Accountability Act of

1996, codified as 45 C.F.R. Part 160; the Public Health Service Act, codified as 42 C.F.R. Part 2; and the attorney-client/attorney work-product statutory and common law privileges. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the information contained in or attached to this email is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender via return e-mail, then delete the email and any of its attachments, without reading or saving the email.

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER <dssiegenthal@wisc.edu>  
**Sent:** Monday, November 16, 2015 5:31 PM  
**To:** Xiong, Chua L.; Carolyn Harvey  
**Subject:** Re: Grading and Deb Siegenthaler's Message

Hi to you both!

I wanted to just reiterate the timeframes for submitting grade related info. Carolyn indicated that final grades are due 12/29 which is the very last day that they can be entered into the system. Due to time off that I will be taking in late December, I will be entering grades on Friday, December 18th. So I just want to clarify that --

Thanks so much,  
Debbie

Debra Siegenthaler RN, MS  
Community Engagement Coordinator, MPH/PRIME  
Department of Population Health Sciences  
UW School of Medicine and Public Health  
734 WARF Building  
610 N. Walnut Street  
Madison, WI 53726  
Phone: 608.263.3036  
FAX: 608.263.2820

[dssiegenthal@wisc.edu](mailto:dssiegenthal@wisc.edu)

---

**From:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Sent:** Monday, November 16, 2015 5:09 PM  
**To:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Cc:** DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER  
**Subject:** RE: Grading and Deb Siegenthaler's Message

Hi Carolyn, since your departure last Wednesday.....I have been chasing another fire to put out. So, I apologize for the lateness in this reply.

We can discuss further on this Wednesday. I do greatly appreciate all the assistance you have been giving me with the literature reviews. Your feedback and insights has been very insightful.

See you on Wednesday.

Chua

---

**From:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Sent:** Thursday, November 12, 2015 1:18 PM  
**To:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Cc:** DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER  
**Subject:** Grading and Deb Siegenthaler's Message

Hi Chua,

Grading. I need to provide you with a folder of my current outputs, my hour log, and the form/rubric for grading. My semester ends 12-17 and final grades are due 12-29-15.

You can, at your discretion, wait until Spring semester to grade my work for you. We did not formally file the Field Learning Agreement until October so my credits will actually appear in the Spring Semester of my transcript. I am also required to complete several of my hours going into the Spring semester. I would like to

do these in January, as I will not start Spring classes until 1-19-16. I'd like to be in the office on a daily basis over this time period in January, if that works for the department.

I expect to have the materials for grading updated and in a single, tangible place for you when we meet next week, as well as my hour log.

Thank you, Chua. I really enjoy being in the office, and working with you and the department staff. Everyone continues to be incredibly warm and welcoming.

Carolyn

P.s.

I may have to provide you all with "beef sticks" when I leave :)

\*\*\*\*\* IMPORTANT CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE \*\*\*\*\* This electronic transmission, along with any information attached may contain confidential, proprietary, or privileged information, subject to, among other protections, the Health Insurance Portability & Accountability Act of 1996, codified as 45 C.F.R. Part 160; the Public Health Service Act, codified as 42 C.F.R. Part 2; and the attorney-client/attorney work-product statutory and common law privileges. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the information contained in or attached to this email is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender via return e-mail, then delete the email and any of its attachments, without reading or saving the email.

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Sent:** Monday, November 16, 2015 5:38 PM  
**To:** 'Kristen Malecki'; Carolyn Harvey  
**Cc:** MARK EDGAR; DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER  
**Subject:** RE: Field Work Update

Hi Kristen, I have outreached to both the regional and state health department for assistance early on in the year. I have been told to refer back to the Wisconsin Wind Siting Council Report. In their report, there are no recommendation at this point (legislation) as far as new regulations for Wind Turbines. The state stands strong on this decision.

This issue is left to Brown County Health Department since our Board of Health made the declaration that Wind Turbine are Human Health Hazard. This falls on me as the health officer to prove Wind Turbines are the causation of Human Health Hazard. This is where Carolyn has been a great assistance in helping me sort through the piles of literatures in search of evidence to support this declaration.

I will be putting talking points together for my final decision on Dec 15th. The decision as health officer is to determine if there is enough evidence base research, testimonies and other information submitted in to me for review supports this declaration or not.

There is no health department in the United States that has declared Wind Turbines as Human Health Hazard. We are the first ones to be this **BOLD!**

Have a nice evening,

Chua

---

**From:** Kristen Malecki [<mailto:kmalecki@wisc.edu>]  
**Sent:** Thursday, November 12, 2015 11:13 AM  
**To:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Cc:** MARK EDGAR; DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER; Xiong, Chua L.  
**Subject:** Re: Field Work Update

Carolyn,

This is a tremendous amount of work and a very interesting project. I am happy to sort through but assume that you and Brown county are working on developing public health messaging to address concerns that would potentially include action items and next steps. One person to reach out to or groups of people to determine what they have already done is the health hazards group at the state health department.

Thanks for the update, looking forward to seeing results/summary of all this hard work.

Kristen

On Nov 12, 2015, at 9:30 AM, Carolyn Harvey

wrote:

Good Morning Everyone,

I have been busy accumulating evidence and keeping up with all the Health Department would like me to consider. I am attaching a document to let you all know what I've been up to in the way of wind turbines.

It continues to be a challenging position. I feel as though I am experiencing many of the challenges of Tom's River. It is more than a little like trying to investigate a cancer cluster. Difficult scientifically, difficult public health wise, difficult in personal accounts, transparency and understanding, difficult in that there isn't enough evidence to establish causation. It is hard to listen to people tell you how sick they are, and how certain they are of the 450 foot monster in their backyard, and know what I can offer will provide very little solace.

As always, thank you all for your guidance,  
Carolyn Harvey

\*\*\*\*\* IMPORTANT CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE \*\*\*\*\* This electronic transmission, along with any information attached may contain confidential, proprietary, or privileged information, subject to, among other protections, the Health Insurance Portability & Accountability Act of 1996, codified as 45 C.F.R. Part 160; the Public Health Service Act, codified as 42 C.F.R. Part 2; and the attorney-client/attorney work-product statutory and common law privileges. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the information contained in or attached to this email is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender via return e-mail, then delete the email and any of its attachments, without reading or saving the email.

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** Xiong, Chua L  
**Sent:** Monday, November 16, 2015 5:41 PM  
**To:** 'DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER'; Carolyn Harvey  
**Subject:** RE: Grading and Deb Siegenthaler's Message

Hi Debbie, I have reviewed your email with all the grading information and deadlines. I will be discussing this with Carolyn on Wednesday. Thanks for reiterating the time frame again.

Have a nice evening,

Chua

---

**From:** DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER [<mailto:dssiegenthal@wisc.edu>]  
**Sent:** Monday, November 16, 2015 5:31 PM  
**To:** Xiong, Chua L.; Carolyn Harvey  
**Subject:** Re: Grading and Deb Siegenthaler's Message

Hi to you both!

I wanted to just reiterate the timeframes for submitting grade related info. Carolyn indicated that final grades are due 12/29 which is the very last day that they can be entered into the system. Due to time off that I will be taking in late December, I will be entering grades on Friday, December 18th. So I just want to clarify that --

Thanks so much,  
Debbie

Debra Siegenthaler RN, MS  
Community Engagement Coordinator, MPH/PRIME  
Department of Population Health Sciences  
UW School of Medicine and Public Health  
734 WARF Building  
610 N. Walnut Street  
Madison, WI 53726  
Phone: 608.263.3036  
FAX: 608.263.2820

[dssiegenthal@wisc.edu](mailto:dssiegenthal@wisc.edu)

---

**From:** Xiong, Chua L. <[Xiong\\_CL@co.brown.wi.us](mailto:Xiong_CL@co.brown.wi.us)>  
**Sent:** Monday, November 16, 2015 5:09 PM  
**To:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Cc:** DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER  
**Subject:** RE: Grading and Deb Siegenthaler's Message

Hi Carolyn, since your departure last Wednesday.....I have been chasing another fire to put out. So, I apologize for the lateness in this reply.

We can discuss further on this Wednesday. I do greatly appreciate all the assistance you have been giving me with the literature reviews. Your feedback and insights have been very insightful.

See you on Wednesday.

Chua

---

**From:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Sent:** Thursday, November 12, 2015 1:18 PM  
**To:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Cc:** DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER  
**Subject:** Grading and Deb Siegenthaler's Message

Hi Chua,

Grading. I need to provide you with a folder of my current outputs, my hour log, and the form/rubric for grading. My semester ends 12-17 and final grades are due 12-29-15.

You can, at your discretion, wait until Spring semester to grade my work for you. We did not formally file the Field Learning Agreement until October so my credits will actually appear in the Spring Semester of my transcript. I am also required to complete several of my hours going into the Spring semester. I would like to do these in January, as I will not start Spring classes until 1-19-16. I'd like to be in the office on a daily basis over this time period in January, if that works for the department.

I expect to have the materials for grading updated and in a single, tangible place for you when we meet next week, as well as my hour log.

Thank you, Chua. I really enjoy being in the office, and working with you and the department staff. Everyone continues to be incredibly warm and welcoming.

Carolyn

P.s.

I may have to provide you all with "beef sticks" when I leave :)

\*\*\*\*\* IMPORTANT CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE \*\*\*\*\* This electronic transmission, along with any information attached may contain confidential, proprietary, or privileged information, subject to, among other protections, the Health Insurance Portability & Accountability Act of 1996, codified as 45 C.F.R. Part 160; the Public Health Service Act, codified as 42 C.F.R. Part 2; and the attorney-client/attorney work-product statutory and common law privileges. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the information contained in or attached to this email is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender via return e-mail, then delete the email and any of its attachments, without reading or saving the email.

\*\*\*\*\* IMPORTANT CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE \*\*\*\*\* This electronic transmission, along with any information attached may contain confidential, proprietary, or privileged information, subject to, among other protections, the Health Insurance Portability & Accountability Act of 1996, codified as 45 C.F.R. Part 160; the Public Health Service Act, codified as 42 C.F.R. Part 2; and the attorney-client/attorney work-product statutory and common law privileges. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the

information contained in or attached to this email is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender via return e-mail, then delete the email and any of its attachments, without reading or saving the email.

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER <dssiegenthal@wisc.edu>  
**Sent:** Monday, November 16, 2015 8:11 PM  
**To:** Xiong, Chua L.; Carolyn Harvey  
**Subject:** Re: Grading and Deb Siegenthaler's Message

Thanks so much...  
take care,  
Debbie

Debra Siegenthaler RN, MS  
Community Engagement Coordinator, MPH/PRIME  
Department of Population Health Sciences  
UW School of Medicine and Public Health  
734 WARF Building  
610 N. Walnut Street  
Madison, WI 53726  
Phone: 608 263.3036  
FAX: 608 263.2820

dssiegenthal@wisc.edu

---

**From:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Sent:** Monday, November 16, 2015 5:40 PM  
**To:** DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER; Carolyn Harvey  
**Subject:** RE: Grading and Deb Siegenthaler's Message

Hi Debbie, I have reviewed your email with all the grading information and deadlines. I will be discussing this with Carolyn on Wednesday. Thanks for reiterating the time frame again.  
Have a nice evening,  
Chua

---

**From:** DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER [mailto:dssiegenthal@wisc.edu]  
**Sent:** Monday, November 16, 2015 5:31 PM  
**To:** Xiong, Chua L.; Carolyn Harvey  
**Subject:** Re: Grading and Deb Siegenthaler's Message

Hi to you both!

I wanted to just reiterate the timeframes for submitting grade related info. Carolyn indicated that final grades are due 12/29 which is the very last day that they can be entered into the system. Due to time off that I will be taking in late December, I will be entering grades on Friday, December 18th. So I just want to clarify that --  
Thanks so much,  
Debbie

Debra Siegenthaler RN, MS  
Community Engagement Coordinator, MPH/PRIME  
Department of Population Health Sciences  
UW School of Medicine and Public Health

734 WARF Building  
610 N. Walnut Street  
Madison, WI 53726  
Phone: 608.263.3036  
FAX: 608.263.2820  
[dssiegenthal@wisc.edu](mailto:dssiegenthal@wisc.edu)

---

**From:** Xiong, Chua L. <[Xiong\\_CL@co.brown.wi.us](mailto:Xiong_CL@co.brown.wi.us)>

**Sent:** Monday, November 16, 2015 5:09 PM

**To:** Carolyn Harvey

**Cc:** DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER

**Subject:** RE: Grading and Deb Siegenthaler's Message

Hi Carolyn, since your departure last Wednesday.....I have been chasing another fire to put out. So, I apologize for the lateness in this reply.

We can discuss further on this Wednesday. I do greatly appreciate all the assistance you have been giving me with the literature reviews. Your feedback and insights has been very insightful.

See you on Wednesday.

Chua

---

**From:** Carolyn Harvey

**Sent:** Thursday, November 12, 2015 1:18 PM

**To:** Xiong, Chua L.

**Cc:** DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER

**Subject:** Grading and Deb Siegenthaler's Message

Hi Chua,

Grading. I need to provide you with a folder of my current outputs, my hour log, and the form/rubric for grading. My semester ends 12-17 and final grades are due 12-29-15.

You can, at your discretion, wait until Spring semester to grade my work for you. We did not formally file the Field Learning Agreement until October so my credits will actually appear in the Spring Semester of my transcript. I am also required to complete several of my hours going into the Spring semester. I would like to do these in January, as I will not start Spring classes until 1-19-16. I'd like to be in the office on a daily basis over this time period in January, if that works for the department.

I expect to have the materials for grading updated and in a single, tangible place for you when we meet next week, as well as my hour log.

Thank you, Chua. I really enjoy being in the office, and working with you and the department staff. Everyone continues to be incredibly warm and welcoming.

Carolyn

P.s.

I may have to provide you all with "beef sticks" when I leave :)

\*\*\*\*\* IMPORTANT CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE \*\*\*\*\* This electronic transmission, along with any information attached may contain confidential, proprietary, or privileged information, subject to, among other protections, the Health Insurance Portability & Accountability Act of 1996, codified as 45 C.F.R. Part 160; the Public Health Service Act, codified as 42 C.F.R. Part 2; and the attorney-client/attorney work-product statutory and common law privileges. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the information contained in or attached to this email is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender via return e-mail, then delete the email and any of its attachments, without reading or saving the email.

\*\*\*\*\* IMPORTANT CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE \*\*\*\*\* This electronic transmission, along with any information attached may contain confidential, proprietary, or privileged information, subject

to, among other protections, the Health Insurance Portability & Accountability Act of 1996, codified as 45 C.F.R. Part 160; the Public Health Service Act, codified as 42 C.F.R. Part 2; and the attorney-client/attorney work-product statutory and common law privileges. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the information contained in or attached to this email is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender via return e-mail, then delete the email and any of its attachments, without reading or saving the email.

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** Kristen Malecki <[kmalecki@wisc.edu](mailto:kmalecki@wisc.edu)>  
**Sent:** Monday, November 16, 2015 9:18 PM  
**To:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Cc:** Carolyn Harvey; MARK EDGAR; DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER  
**Subject:** Re: Field Work Update

Hi Chua,

Thank you for the update. This is fascinating. Dr. Mark Werner is my old colleague who had been talking about doing potentially a sleep study in this regard but I talked to him over nine months ago, so perhaps the state has changed where it stands on the issue.

Good luck with combing through the evidence and your decision, I am sure Carolyn is doing a great job. If you need help in any way I would be happy to lend a hand.

If you are ever interested in teaching, I think that you and Carolyn would provide a fantastic guest lecture based on your experiences in my introduction to environmental health course next Spring. If interested please let me know and I would be happy to make it happen.

Best wishes,

Kristen

On Nov 16, 2015, at 5:37 PM, Xiong, Chua L. <[Xiong\\_CL@co.brown.wi.us](mailto:Xiong_CL@co.brown.wi.us)> wrote:

Hi Kristen, I have outreached to both the regional and state health department for assistance early on in the year. I have been told to refer back to the Wisconsin Wind Siting Council Report. In their report, there are no recommendation at this point (legislation) as far as new regulations for Wind Turbines. The state stands strong on this decision.

This issue is left to Brown County Health Department since our Board of Health made the declaration that Wind Turbine are Human Health Hazard. This falls on me as the health officer to prove Wind Turbines are the causation of Human Health Hazard. This is where Carolyn has been a great assistance in helping me sort through the piles of literatures in search of evidence to support this declaration.

I will be putting talking points together for my final decision on Dec 15th. The decision as health officer is to determine if there is enough evidence base research, testimonies and other information submitted in to me for review supports this declaration or not.

There is no health department in the United States that has declared Wind Turbines as Human Health Hazard. We are the first ones to be this BOLD!

Have a nice evening,

Chua

---

**From:** Kristen Malecki [<mailto:kmalecki@wisc.edu>]  
**Sent:** Thursday, November 12, 2015 11:13 AM  
**To:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Cc:** MARK EDGAR; DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER; Xiong, Chua L.  
**Subject:** Re: Field Work Update

Carolyn,

This is a tremendous amount of work and a very interesting project. I am happy to sort through but assume that you and Brown county are working on developing public health messaging to address concerns that would potentially include action items and next steps. One person to reach out to or groups of people to determine what they have already done is the health hazards group at the state health department.

Thanks for the update, looking forward to seeing results/summary of all this hard work.

Kristen

On Nov 12, 2015, at 9:30 AM, Carolyn Harvey

wrote:

Good Morning Everyone,

I have been busy accumulating evidence and keeping up with all the Health Department would like me to consider. I am attaching a document to let you all know what I've been up to in the way of wind turbines.

It continues to be a challenging position. I feel as though I am experiencing many of the challenges of Tom's River. It is more than a little like trying to investigate a cancer cluster. Difficult scientifically, difficult public health wise, difficult in personal accounts, transparency and understanding, difficult in that there isn't enough evidence to establish causation. It is hard to listen to people tell you how sick they are, and how certain they are of the 450 foot monster in their backyard, and know what I can offer will provide very little solace.

As always, thank you all for your guidance,

Carolyn Harvey

\*\*\*\*\* IMPORTANT CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE \*\*\*\*\* This electronic transmission, along with any information attached may contain confidential, proprietary, or privileged information, subject to, among other protections, the Health Insurance Portability & Accountability Act of 1996, codified as 45 C.F.R. Part 160; the Public Health Service Act, codified as 42 C.F.R. Part 2; and the attorney-client/attorney work-product statutory and common law privileges. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the information contained in or attached to this email is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender via return e-mail, then delete the email and any of its attachments, without reading or saving the email.

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Sent:** Wednesday, November 18, 2015 9:25 AM  
**To:** DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER (dssiegenthal@wisc.edu)  
**Cc:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Subject:** Continuation of Work Project into 2016 Spring Semester

Good morning Debbie, Carolyn and I discussed what our plans would be with her project and grading period. We have decided that we will continue the project work hours into the 2016 Spring Semester. Our understanding (Carolyn and I) is that the grading for 2015 Fall Semester would be an "incomplete."

If you need any further information from me before December 17<sup>th</sup>, please let me know in advance so, I can get that in to you right away.

Chua Xiong, RN, MSN  
Health Officer/Director  
Brown County Health Department  
610 South Broadway Street  
Green Bay, WI, 54305  
(920) 448-6441 Telephone  
(920) 448-6441 Fax



**Public Health**  
Prevent Promote Protect

Brown County Health Department

**BCHD Mission::**

The Brown County Health Department protects and promotes individual and community health through education, regulation, and leadership to empower community members to attain well-being across the lifespan.

**"Follow" us on Facebook:**

Select one of these two options



**Follow the Brown County Health Department on Facebook: [www.facebook.com/BrownCountyHealthDept](http://www.facebook.com/BrownCountyHealthDept)**

\*\*\*\*\* IMPORTANT CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE \*\*\*\*\* This electronic transmission, along with any information attached may contain confidential, proprietary, or privileged information, subject to, among other protections, the Health Insurance Portability & Accountability Act of 1996, codified as 45 C.F.R. Part 160; the Public Health Service Act, codified as 42 C.F.R. Part 2; and the attorney-client/attorney work-product statutory and common law privileges. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the information contained in or attached to this email is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email in error,

please immediately notify the sender via return e-mail, then delete the email and any of its attachments, without reading or saving the email.

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER <dssiegenthal@wisc.edu>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, November 18, 2015 10:03 AM  
**To:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Cc:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Subject:** Re: Continuation of Work Project into 2016 Spring Semester

Thanks so very much for the prompt response and information!

Carolyn, I see that you have registered for your 6 field work credits of PHS 788 in the Spring so great job.

Thanks again,  
Debbie

Debra Siegenthaler RN, MS  
Community Engagement Coordinator, MPH/PRIME  
Department of Population Health Sciences  
UW School of Medicine and Public Health  
734 WARF Building  
610 N. Walnut Street  
Madison, WI 53726  
Phone: 608.263.3036  
FAX: 608.263.2820

[dssiegenthal@wisc.edu](mailto:dssiegenthal@wisc.edu)

---

**From:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Sent:** Wednesday, November 18, 2015 9:25 AM  
**To:** DEBRA SUE SIEGENTHALER  
**Cc:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Subject:** Continuation of Work Project into 2016 Spring Semester

Good morning Debbie, Carolyn and I discussed what our plans would be with her project and grading period. We have decided that we will continue the project work hours into the 2016 Spring Semester. Our understanding (Carolyn and I) is that the grading for 2015 Fall Semester would be an "incomplete." If you need any further information from me before December 17<sup>th</sup>, please let me know in advance so, I can get that in to you right away.

Chua Xiong, RN, MSN  
Health Officer/Director  
Brown County HealthDepartment  
610 South Broadway Street  
Green Bay, WI, 54305  
(920) 448-6441 Telephone  
(920) 448-6441 Fax



**BCHD Mission::**

The Brown County Health Department protects and promotes individual and community health through education, regulation, and leadership to empower community members to attain well-being across the lifespan.

**"Follow" us on Facebook:**

Select one of these two options



***Follow the Brown County Health Department on Facebook:***

**[www.facebook.com/BrownCountyHealthDept](http://www.facebook.com/BrownCountyHealthDept)**

\*\*\*\*\* IMPORTANT CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE \*\*\*\*\* This electronic transmission, along with any information attached may contain confidential, proprietary, or privileged information, subject to, among other protections, the Health Insurance Portability & Accountability Act of 1996, codified as 45 C.F.R. Part 160; the Public Health Service Act, codified as 42 C.F.R. Part 2; and the attorney-client/attorney work-product statutory and common law privileges. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the information contained in or attached to this email is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender via return e-mail, then delete the email and any of its attachments, without reading or saving the email.

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Sent:** Saturday, November 21, 2015 8:29 AM  
**To:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Subject:** Good Morning!  
**Attachments:** BCHD.log.CX (Autosaved).docx

Hi Chua,

I am attaching the evidence log that we looked at on 11-18.

Be sure to go home early and have some away time :)

Take care,  
Carolyn

## Research Articles

### **Systematic Review 2013: Association between wind turbines and human distress.**

I Arra, H Lynn, K Barker, C Ogbuneke, S Regalado

Cureus, 2014 - cureus.com

**3,0,1,1=5**

- Literature Review
- Inclusion and Exclusion criteria clearly stated
- Evaluation Tool and subsequent evidence scores reported
- Authors conclude reasonable evidence of distress, dose-response, and consistency across studies.
- Authors further conclude MORE STUDY IS NEEDED.

### **Low-frequency Sound Affects Active Micromechanics in the Human Inner Ear**

Kathrin Kugler, Lutz Wiegerebe, Benedikt Grothe, Manfred Kössl, Robert Gürkov, Eike Krause, Markus Drexl

Royal Society Open Science, Published 1 October 2014.DOI: 10.1098/rsos.140166

**3,0,1,1=5**

- Article proposes a mechanism of action for low-frequency and inner ear disturbance
- Uses frequencies higher than those associated with Wind Turbine
- Appears in a pay-for-publication online journal

### **Wind Turbines: A Different Breed of Noise?**

Nate Seltenrich, Environ Health Perspect. 2014 Jan 1; 122(1): A20–A25.

Published online 2014 Jan 1. doi: 10.1289/ehp.122-A20

**1,0,0,0=1**

- Literature Review
- Evidence supports and negates health impacts relevant to wind turbine emissions
- Authors conclude "investigators do not know the exact relationship between noise and health impacts or why noise affects some people differently than others."

### **Health effects and wind turbines: A review of the literature**

Loren D Knopper and Christopher A Ollson, Environ Health. 2011; 10: 78

Published online 2011 Sep 14. doi: 10.1186/1476-069X-10-78

**3,0,1,1=5**

- Literature Review
- Methodology clearly reported
- No inclusion or exclusion criteria reported
- Results include "no peer review articles demonstrate a direct causal link," health impacts are likely environmental stressors and exist in a "segment" of the population.

### **Wind Turbine Infra and Low-Frequency Sound : Warning Signs That Were Not Heard**

James, Richard R.

Bulletin of Science Technology & Society 2012 32: 108 originally published online 15 December 2011.

**1,0,1,0=2**

- Literature Review
- Uses both current and very old science

|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Notes opposing opinions of other acousticians</li> <li>• Indicates a potential mechanism of action and moves directly to causation without reporting evidence.</li> <li>• Relevant finds are notable for “some people”</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                          |
| <p><b>A theory to explain some physiological effects of the infrasonic emissions at some wind farm sites</b><br/> Schomer PD1, Erdreich J2, Pamidighantam PK1, Boyle JH1,<br/> J Acoust Soc Am. 2015 Mar;137(3):1356-65. doi: 10.1121/1.4913775.</p>                                                                                                                                                                |
| <p>3,0,1,0=4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• This study uses the Shirley Windfarm Report conducted by Hessler, Hessler and Schomer to propose a possible mechanism of action.</li> <li>• Schomer holds a PhD in acoustical engineering and is not a physiologist, anatomist, clinician or MD.</li> </ul>                                                                                               |
| <p><b>WindVOiCe, a Self-Reporting Survey: Adverse Health Effects, Industrial Wind Turbines, and the Need for Vigilance Monitoring</b><br/> Carmen M.E. Krogh, Lorrie Gillis, Nicholas Kouwen, and Jeff Aramini<br/> Bulletin of Science, Technology &amp; Society August 2011 31: 334-345, doi:10.1177/0270467611412551</p>                                                                                         |
| <p>1,1,1,0=3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Community based initiative in Ontario, Canada</li> <li>• Cross sectional survey</li> <li>• Respondents self-report, mail in survey</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| <p><b>Industrial Wind Turbine Development and Loss of Social Justice?</b><br/> Krough, Carmen<br/> Bulletin of Science and Technology, 2011 31: 321</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| <p>1,0,1,0=2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Literature Review</li> <li>• No report of Methods or Materials</li> <li>• No appendices of survey/interview results</li> <li>• No tables, graphs, or statistical analysis</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                      |
| <p><b>Wind Turbines can be Hazardous to Human Health.</b><br/> Salt, Alec PhD.<br/> Washington University Cochlear Fluids Research Laboratory, April 2014.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| <p>3,1,1,1=6</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• This article proposes a mechanism of action and points toward biologic plausibility</li> <li>• Author concludes more study and knowledge are needed</li> <li>• Author reports no odds ratio, risk, or risk difference</li> </ul>                                                                                                                          |
| <p><b>Health-Based Audible Noise Guidelines Account for Infrasound and Low-Frequency Noise Produced by Wind Turbines</b><br/> Robert G. Berger,<sup>1</sup> Payam Ashtiani,<sup>2</sup> Christopher A. Olson,<sup>3</sup> Melissa Whitfield Aslund,<sup>3</sup> Lindsay C. McCallum,<sup>3,4</sup> Geoff Leventhall,<sup>5</sup> and Loren D. Knopper <sup>3</sup><br/> Frontiers in Public Health. 2015; 3: 31</p> |
| <p>3,1,1,1=6</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Authors conclude that wind turbines produce broad-band noise including infra and low-frequency sound.</li> <li>• There is no evidence suggesting the levels in this study effect human health</li> <li>• Subjective variables (expectations, perceptions, etc) are a more likely etiology</li> </ul>                                                      |
| <p><b>Multi-municipal Wind Turbine Working Group</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |

|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p>Stelling, Kieth, Krough, Carmen,<br/>Palmer, William (reviewed by)<br/>Literature Review for the Municipal Counselors of Grey, Bruce, Huron Counties, Ontario, Canada.</p>                                                                                                                                                                  |
| <p>2,0,0,0=2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Literature Review</li> <li>• Keith Stelling is a Master of Arts and Certified Herbalist</li> <li>• He draws conclusions about sound measurements, but is not an acoustician</li> <li>• Does not report inclusion or exclusion criteria</li> <li>• Does not report methods</li> </ul> |
| <p><b>Analysis of Aerodynamic Sound Noise Generated by a Large-scale Wind Turbine and its Physiological Evaluation</b><br/>Inagaki, T., Li, Y., Nishi, Y.<br/>International Journal of Environmental Science and Technology. 2015; 12:1933-1944</p>                                                                                            |
| <p>2,1,1,1=5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• n=15</li> <li>• subjects were exposed to varying sound frequencies</li> <li>• neuro-stimulus as brain waves was measured using EEG</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                        |
| <p><b>Investigation of Perception at Infrasound Frequencies by Functional Magnetic Resonance Imaging and Magnetoencephalography</b><br/>Bauer, M. etal<br/>22<sup>nd</sup> International Congress on Sound and Vibration. 2015</p>                                                                                                             |
| <p>3,1,1,1=6</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• subjects exposed to vary frequencies between 250hz and 8hz</li> <li>• measure nuero-stimulus and brain regions using MEG and fMRI</li> <li>• German institute of human development</li> </ul>                                                                                        |
| <p><b>Properly Interpreting the Epidemiologic Evidence About the Health Effects of Industrial Wind Turbines on Nearby Residents</b><br/>Phillips, C.<br/>Bulletin of Science, Technology &amp; Society. 2011</p>                                                                                                                               |
| <p>3,0,1,0=4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Literature Review</li> <li>• Too few citations, 8 for a lit review (many we have scored low for rigor)</li> <li>• No actual conclusions outside of his opinion</li> </ul>                                                                                                            |
| <p><b>Impact of Wind Turbine and Sound on Annoyance, Self-reported Sleep Disturbance and Psychological Distress</b><br/>Baker, RH, E. etal<br/>Science of the Total Environment. 2012</p>                                                                                                                                                      |
| <p>3,1,1,1=6</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Cross sectional survey</li> <li>• Respondents self-report</li> <li>• Authors conclude "Wind turbine noise and psychological distress were not directly related."</li> <li>• Authors conclude that "exposure to wind turbine and annoyance are positively related."</li> </ul>        |
| <p><b>ICBEN Review of Research on the Biological Effects of Noise</b><br/>Basner, M. etal<br/>Noise Health. 2015</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| <p>3,0,1,1=5</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |

- Literature Review
- Focus data between 2011 and 2014
- Focus on noise and hearing loss, performance and behavior, sleep and community response
- International Commission on Biological Effects of Noise (ICBEN)
- Conclusions: more study is needed.

#### **Outcome of Systematic Research on Wind Turbine Noise in Japan**

Tachibana, H.

Proceedings of Inter-Noise. 2014, 1-10

3,1,1,1=6

- Reports thorough materials and methods
- Uses statistical analysis
- N =164 points for sound measurement at 29 wind farms
- Decibel levels confirmed by laboratory analysis
- By far the largest sound study in this evidence/literature review
- Conclusions:
  - A-scale is an accurate measure of sound relating to Wind Turbine
  - Noise effects are between 25-50 decibels
  - Wind turbine should be assessed as "audible noise"

#### **Perception of Low Frequency Components in Wind Turbine Noise**

Yokoyama, S. et al

Noise Control Engineering Journal 62. 2015

#### **Response to Simulated Wind Farm Infrasound Including Effect of Expectation**

Tonin, R., Brett, J.

Sixth International Meeting on Wind Turbine Noise. 2015

#### **The Link Between Health Complaints and Wind Turbines: Support for the Nacebo Expectations Hypothesis**

Crichton, F. et al

Frontiers in Public Health. 2014

#### **Fomenting Sickness: Nocebo Priming of Residents about Expected Wind Turbine Health Harms**

Chapman, S. et al

Frontiers in Public Health. 2014

#### **Possible Psychological Mechanisms for "Wind Turbine Syndrome"**

Rubin, G. James et al

Noise and Health.

#### **The Pattern of Complaints about Australian Wind Farms Does Not Match the Establishment and Distribution of Turbines: Support for the Psychogenic, "Communicated Disease Hypothesis"**

Chapman, S. et al

PloS One 8 (10): e76584. Doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0076584

#### **The Power of Positive and Negative Expectations to Influence Reported Symptoms and Mood During Exposure to Wind Farm Sound**

Crichton, F. et al

**Health Psychology: Journal of the Division of Health Psychology, American Psychological Association.**

**On the Overlap Region between Wind Turbine Infrasound and Infrasound from Other Sources and its Relation to Criteria**

Leventhall, Geoff

Sixth International Meeting on Wind Turbine Noise. 2015

**Wind Turbine Noise and Health Study**

Michaud, David S. (Health Canada)

Sixth International Meeting on Wind Turbine Noise. 2015

**Legal Requirements for Human-health based Appeals of Wind Energy Projects in Ontario**

Engel, Albert M. LLP

Frontiers in Public Health. 2014

**Health-based Audible Noise Guidelines Account for Infrasound and Low-frequency Noise Produced by Wind Turbines.**

Berger, Robert G. etal

Frontiers in Public Health. 2015

**An Assessment of Quality of Life Using the WHOQOL-BREF Among Participants Living in the Vicinity of Wind Turbines**

Feter, K. etal

Environmental Research. 2015

**Proposed Criteria for the Assessment of Low-frequency Noise Disturbance**

Moorhouse, Andy PhD. etal

Acoustic Research Center, Salford University. 2005

**Non-Research Articles**

**Dairy cattle getting Wind Turbine Syndrome? Stray voltage? (Japan)**

Tsuruta, Yuki, Jan 2010

**States Tallest Wind turbines to be Operated Near Green Bay.**

Journal Sentinel

April 8, 2014

**Wind farms and Birth Defects.**

Duchamp Mark

World Council for Nature, 2014

**Nordex Safety Manual Summary, Turbine Classes K06, K07, K08, All Types**

Submitted by Glenmore Citizens

Retrieved from: [www.opsh.ohio.gov](http://www.opsh.ohio.gov)

**Wind Turbine and Infrasound and Low Frequency Noise Timeline- what the wind industry knew and**

when

Brown County Citizens for Responsible Wind Energy

**Peer Review of NCE Report "Infrasound Measurements of Falmouth Wind Turbines Wind 1 and Wind 2, and Kapsambelis, "Pressure Wave from Wind Turbines"**

James, R

2015

**Acoustic Engineering Investigation into Airborne and Ground-borne Pressure Pulses from Pacific Hydro's Wind Turbines at Cape Bridgewater A Simplified Explanation of the Findings, Previous Research and the Consequences**

Waubra Foundation

Waubra Foundation. 2015

**Wind Health Impacts Dismissed in Court**

Barnard, Mike

Energy and Policy Institute. 2014

### **Noise Surveys/Acoustic Measurements**

**A Cooperative Measurement Survey and Analysis of Low Frequency and Infrasound at the Shirley Wind Project in Brown County**

Walker, Hessler, Hessler, Rand and Schomer

December 24, 2012

**Sound Pressure Level Measurements of Infrasound Inside Home In and Proximate to the Footprint of the Shirley Wind Project (Duke Energy)**

James, Richard R.

August 9, 2014

**Ehrfurth Residence Sound Study, A Report on Complaints of Adverse Health Effects From Infra and Low-frequency Sounds**

James, Richard R.

December 16, 2011

### **Civic Leaders, Letters, and Testimonies**

**Submission of Dr.Christopher Hanning, to the Australian Senate Select Committee on Wind Turbines**

Hanning, Christopher MB, BS, MRCS, LRCP (anesthetist, sleep specialist)

**Letter to the Public Service Commission**

Lynne Knuth, PhD.

June 17, 2010

**Australian Senate Select Committee on Wind Turbines**

Laurie, Sara

Waubra Foundation, CEO

**Victorian Civil and Administrative Appeals Tribunal**

Laurie, Sara  
Waubra Foundation, CEO  
2012

**Provisions of Expert Opinion Concerning the Adverse Impacts of Wind Turbine Noise TruEnergy Renewable Developments vs Goyder Regional Council, A.W. Coffrey & H. Dunn**

Laurie, Sara  
April, 2014

**Rebuttal for Information Submitted by Duke Energy to the BCHD (letter)**

Vanden Boogart, Jim  
July, 2015

**Letter Regarding Salt and Lichtenhan**

Dobie, Robert  
2014

**Australian Senate Select Committee on Wind Turbines**

Mc Murtry, Robert MD

**The Adverse Health Impacts of Industrial Wind Turbines: A Scientific Response to "It's all in your head"**

Hatman, Raymond S.  
Submitted to the Zoning Board of Charleston, RI. July, 2013

**Appendix E: Minority Report (2010)**

**Wisconsin Wind Siting Council, Minority Response (2014)**  
Submitted by Brown County Citizens for Responsible Wind Energy

**PDF submission of Documents, Reports, Presentations:**

Additional copies of materials submitted on cd.

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Sent:** Saturday, November 21, 2015 8:42 AM  
**To:** 'Carolyn Harvey'  
**Subject:** RE: Good Morning!

Ha, ha.....no such luck! I am going to go out to the Wind Turbines again this morning to clearly map out the residents effected and the estimated distance from wind turbines to their homes. I also have to really go back to the research articles I was reading and pick up again. I keep getting interrupted during work hours with putting out fires. Carolyn the times I have been out there by the Wind Turbines, I get such migraine headaches. I think I should take some preventative Tylenol before I head out there.

Chua

---

**From:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Sent:** Saturday, November 21, 2015 8:29 AM  
**To:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Subject:** Good Morning!

Hi Chua,

I am attaching the evidence log that we looked at on 11-18.

Be sure to go home early and have some away time :)

Take care,  
Carolyn

\*\*\*\*\* IMPORTANT CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE \*\*\*\*\* This electronic transmission, along with any information attached may contain confidential, proprietary, or privileged information, subject to, among other protections, the Health Insurance Portability & Accountability Act of 1996, codified as 45 C.F.R. Part 160; the Public Health Service Act, codified as 42 C.F.R. Part 2; and the attorney-client/attorney work-product statutory and common law privileges. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the information contained in or attached to this email is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender via return e-mail, then delete the email and any of its attachments, without reading or saving the email.

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Sent:** Monday, November 30, 2015 4:14 PM  
**To:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Subject:** Automatic reply: The next couple of weeks:

I will be out of the state attending a Healthcare Coalition conference in San Diego, California Monday, Nov 30th-Monday, Dec 7th. If this is an urgent issue requiring immediate attention, please call main office number at (920) 448-6400 for further assistance.

\*\*\*\*\* IMPORTANT CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE \*\*\*\*\* This electronic transmission, along with any information attached may contain confidential, proprietary, or privileged information, subject to, among other protections, the Health Insurance Portability & Accountability Act of 1996, codified as 45 C.F.R. Part 160; the Public Health Service Act, codified as 42 C.F.R. Part 2; and the attorney-client/attorney work-product statutory and common law privileges. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the information contained in or attached to this email is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender via return e-mail, then delete the email and any of its attachments, without reading or saving the email.

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Sent:** Monday, November 30, 2015 4:14 PM  
**To:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Subject:** The next couple of weeks:

Good Afternoon, Chua,

I hope the holiday season started well for you, including a great game of Family Feud 😊

I wanted to check in with you regarding the next several Wednesdays and wrapping up the semester.

**1. Schedule:**

- If you have no meeting scheduled or specific plans, I'd like to work from home Wednesday 12-2.
- My plan is to provide you with completed outputs the following Wednesday 12-9. I want you to be able to have some time to really look over the talking points, logs, etc.
- I have also done a policy brief and action plan. Part of my fieldwork has to include an evaluation like this. You can, of course, do whatever you'd like with that. Even if it is just a jumping off point for the Department.
- 12-15 is the BOH meeting
- 12-16 is finals week, 12-23 is Christmas week. I do not plan to be in the office either of these days.
- I'd like to return Monday 12-28 in a more full-time capacity to complete my field work hours.

**2. Outputs:**

- Evidence Log
- Summary Log
- Citizen Accounts
- Litigation Hx.
- Policy Brief
- Action Plan
- I'm hoping to have an executive summary for you as well, but this might not be complete until the end of December.

**3. Binder:**

- Outputs
- Hours Log

Please let me know if you'd like to make any changes, or if you need me in the building Wednesday 12-2.

Thank you for all your help,  
Carolyn Harvey

**Ruenzel, Juliana M.**

---

**From:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Sent:** Tuesday, December 01, 2015 8:19 AM  
**To:** 'Carolyn Harvey'  
**Subject:** RE: The next couple of weeks:

See below reply

---

**From:** Carolyn Harvey  
**Sent:** Monday, November 30, 2015 4:14 PM  
**To:** Xiong, Chua L.  
**Subject:** The next couple of weeks:

Good Afternoon, Chua,

I hope the holiday season started well for you, including a great game of Family Feud 😊

I wanted to check in with you regarding the next several Wednesdays and wrapping up the semester.

1. Schedule:

- If you have no meeting scheduled or specific plans, I'd like to work from home Wednesday 12-2. Yes, since I will not be in the office.
- My plan is to provide you with completed outputs the following Wednesday 12-9. I want you to be able to have some time to really look over the talking points, logs, etc. Can you provide drafted outputs even before 12-9 to me so, I can also review as I am putting my own talking points together as well.
- I have also done a policy brief and action plan. Part of my fieldwork has to include an evaluation like this. You can, of course, do whatever you'd like with that. Even if it is just a jumping off point for the Department. This is fine, good evaluation for me.
- 12-15 is the BOH meeting
- 12-16 is finals week, 12-23 is Christmas week. I do not plan to be in the office either of these days. This is fine.
- I'd like to return Monday 12-28 in a more full-time capacity to complete my field work hours. Yes, sounds fine.

2. Outputs:

- Evidence Log
- Summary Log
- Citizen Accounts
- Litigation Hx.
- Policy Brief
- Action Plan
- I'm hoping to have an executive summary for you as well, but this might not be complete until the end of December.

3. Binder:

- Outputs
- Hours Log

Please let me know if you'd like to make any changes, or if you need me in the building Wednesday 12-2.

Thank you for all your help,  
Carolyn Harvey

**\*\*\*\*\* IMPORTANT CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE \*\*\*\*\*** This electronic transmission, along with any information attached may contain confidential, proprietary, or privileged information, subject to, among other protections, the Health Insurance Portability & Accountability Act of 1996, codified as 45 C.F.R. Part 160; the Public Health Service Act, codified as 42 C.F.R. Part 2; and the attorney-client/attorney work-product statutory and common law privileges. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the information contained in or attached to this email is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender via return e-mail, then delete the email and any of its attachments, without reading or saving the email.