



ELN101: Intro to Bilingualism

Week 5 Views on Bilingualism and Language Diversity

Tomonori Nagano <tnagano@lagcc.cuny.edu>

Education and Language Acquisition Dept.
LaGuardia Community College

March 30, 2024

Announcements & Recap of Week04 I

Announcements this week

- Assignments' deadline is always on Sunday
- Interview for research paper 1 this week (PLA Week 05)
 - Visit the Modern Language Lab (B-206) if you don't have anyone to interview.
- Practice Quiz and Quiz 1

Hypothetical Bilingual vs. Real Bilingual I

- Which one of them is a more realistic bilingual speaker?
 - Bilingual Frozen: <https://youtu.be/OC83NA5tAGE>
 - Bilingual Pocahontas: <https://youtu.be/8DyiXCLRPdY>
 - Bilingual Mark Zuckerberg: <https://youtu.be/HTmHtOSqHTk>



Hypothetical Bilingual vs. Real Bilingual II

- Why did Mark Zuckerberg use his Mandarin in that context? Do you consider him as a bilingual? Why?



Hypothetical Bilingual vs. Real Bilingual III

Various definitions of bilinguals

- Bloomfield (1933): Those with native-like control of two languages (cf. **balanced bilingual**)
- Hagen (1953): Those with even minimal proficiency in two languages (cf. **dominant bilingual**)
- Diebold (1964): Those at the very beginning of acquiring some competence in another language (cf. **incipient bilingual**)

Hypothetical Bilingual vs. Real Bilingual IV

Reality of a bilingual speaker

- A bilingual speaker is a person who:
 - uses languages differently
 - has diverse and unequal experiences with each of the languages
- A bilingual speaker's languages:
 - have different power and prestige
 - are used for different purposes, in different contexts, with different interlocutors
- Bilingual speakers make intentional decisions on their languages to fulfill different demands and goals in diverse and complex contexts.

Hypothetical Bilingual vs. Real Bilingual V

- Again why did Mark Zuckerberg use his Mandarin in that context? Do you consider him as a bilingual? Why?



Hypothetical Bilingual vs. Real Bilingual VI

Translanguaging (Garcia, 2009)

- Bilingual or multilingual discourse practices
- Bilingualism centered on the practices of bilinguals rather than languages
- Multiple discursive practice to make sense of the bilingual worlds
- Examples:
 - a meal in a bilingual family
 - a language minority child as translator for his/her parents
 - religious liturgy (e.g., prayer in Spanish)
- Translanguaging is important because
 - Bilinguals should not be assessed with monolinguals as their norms
 - Dominant bilingual is a natural phenomena rather than a deficiency
 - Shift from the bilingual's languages to the bilingual's acts

Hypothetical Bilingual vs. Real Bilingual VII

- Myths about a bilingual speaker



- An individual equally competent
 - in two languages
 - in all contexts
 - with all interlocutors

Hypothetical Bilingual vs. Real Bilingual VIII

- Reality of a bilingual speaker



- Bilinguals are NOT double monolinguals
- Like an all-terrain vehicle, which can transform its wheels for different land surfaces. **It's not about the number of wheels. It's about how many different conditions (surfaces) you can go with it.**

Hypothetical Bilingual vs. Real Bilingual IX

- Prof. Ofelia García on *translanguaging* (<https://youtu.be/vey1QoGrySg>)



OFELIA GARCÍA
PROFESSOR OF URBAN EDUCATION
CUNY GRADUATE CENTER

Hypothetical Bilingual vs. Real Bilingual X

(Linguistic) Domains

- "An abstraction which refers to a sphere of activity representing a combination of specific times, settings, and role relationships" (Romaine, 1994).
- Some example domains are:
 - HOME
 - WORK
 - SCHOOL
 - EXTENDED FAMILY MEETINGS
 - FUNERAL
 - SHOPPING
 - HOBBY
 - BUSINESS NEGOTIATION
 - DATING
 - LOVE AFFAIRS
 - SOCIAL GATHERING

Hypothetical Bilingual vs. Real Bilingual XI

- Do you use both (or all) languages in all the domains? Or do you use a specific language for specific domains? (e.g., HOME, WORK, SCHOOL, EXTENDED FAMILY MEETINGS, FUNERAL, SHOPPING, HOBBY, BUSINESS NEGOTIATION, DATING, LOVE AFFAIRS, SOCIAL GATHERING etc.)



Hypothetical Bilingual vs. Real Bilingual XII

Monoglossic vs. heteroglossic views of bilingualism (Garcia, 2009)

- **Monoglossic** ideology of bilingualism sees a child's languages as separate and whole and the two languages as bounded autonomous systems.
- **Heteroglossic** ideology of bilingualism sees a child's multiple language practices in interrelationship (e.g., how languages are used in society and real bilingual and multilingual practices)

Bilingual Education (Garcia, 2009) I

- What is Bilingual Education?



Bilingual Education (Garcia, 2009) II

- "Bilingual education refers to education in more than one language, often encompassing more than two languages" (Baker, 2001)
 - But it does not mean any education with multiple languages is "bilingual education"
 - For example, how about an elementary-level Spanish class. Can it be a type of "bilingual education"?

Bilingual Education (Garcia, 2009) III

- Differences between Bilingual Education (BE) and Foreign Language Education (FE)

	Bilingual Education	Foreign or Second-Language Education
Overarching Goal	Educate meaningfully and some type of bilingualism	Competence in additional language
Academic Goal	Educate bilingually and be able to function across cultures	Learn an additional language and become familiar with an additional culture
Language Use	Languages used as media of instruction	Additional language taught as subject Instructional
Use of Language	Uses some form of two or more languages	Uses target language mostly
Pedagogical Emphasis	Integration of language and content	Explicit language instruction Even the widely accepted definition of bilingual

Bilingual Education (Garcia, 2009) IV

In educating broadly, bilingual education focuses not only on the acquisition of additional languages, but also on helping students to become global and responsible citizens as they learn to function across cultures and worlds, that is, beyond the cultural borders in which traditional schooling often operates. (Garcia, 2009: p.6)

What is Bilingual Education?

- Bilingual education is a way of providing
 - meaningful and equitable education for speakers of the minority languages
 - an education that builds tolerance toward other linguistic and cultural groups
 - help to become global and responsible (global) citizens
- See The International School in Portland, OR (<https://youtu.be/St0dpEzT4rg>) or Davis School District, UT (<https://youtu.be/oc5qLT1ib5A>)

Bilingual Education (Garcia, 2009) V

- Bilingual education should have a heteroglossic ideology about a child's language

Monoglossic vs. heteroglossic views of bilingualism (Garcia, 2009)

- **Monoglossic** ideology of bilingualism sees a child's languages as separate and whole and the two languages as bounded autonomous systems.
- **Heteroglossic** ideology of bilingualism sees a child's multiple language practices in interrelationship (e.g., how languages are used in society and real bilingual and multilingual practices)

Bilingual Education (Garcia, 2009) VI

- What do you think? Do you think a bilingual speaker has two different linguistic profiles (e.g., Spanish-speaking *me* and English-speaking *me*) or just one profile with richer communication strategies?



Criticism against Bilingual Education (Garcia, 2009) I

- *Bilingual education* is a loaded term and many schools/researchers use alternative language (such as *multilingual education* and *transitional ESL*)

Criticism against Bilingual Education

- Bilingual education causes the ghettoization of U.S. Latino students
- Bilingual education is a form of segregation in classrooms
- Bilingual education pays little attention to ethnolinguistic minorities other than Latinos
- Bilingual education delays the acquisition of the majority language (i.e., English)
- Bilingual education strengthens immutable relationship between language and identity

Criticism against Bilingual Education (Garcia, 2009) II

- Do you think Bilingual Education is beneficial or harmful to children? Why?



Three Orientations for Bilingual Education I

Framework for Bilingual Education (Ruiz, 1984)

- Bilingual as a problem
- Bilingual as a right
- Bilingual as a resource

Three Orientations for Bilingual Education II

Bilingual as a Problem (Ruiz, 1984)

- The modernist development ideological (capitalist) frameworks, the narrative of a nation-state with one (official) language has been reiterated and reinforced.
- Languages, which symbolized national identity, were standardized, codified, and used in school, to the exclusion of others.
- Languages, which do not coincide with the one elevated to privileged status, is concern.
- Until the 1960's, it was a widespread belief that there was inherent connection between bilingualism and mental/cognitive disabilities.

Three Orientations for Bilingual Education III

Bilingual as a Right (Ruiz, 1984)

- The economic downturn in the 1970's questioned the modernist theories and the earlier orientation toward bilingualism.
- The role of sociohistorical process, in particular, the role of class, ethnicity, race, language, and gender, received increased attention.
- Language minorities started gaining *agency* in shaping their own language policies.

Three Orientations for Bilingual Education IV

Bilingual as a Resource (Ruiz, 1984)

- The development of globalization and the growing role of international organizations (e.g., UN and multinational corporations) have challenged the sovereignty of nation-states.
- Bilingual education as a means through which children and youth can interact within their own ethnolinguistic community, as well as with others.
- The notion of *linguistic ecology*, which include linguistic geostrategies to ensure the coexistence of languages in the same space

Three Orientations for Bilingual Education V

- Historical overview of the bilingual education

<i>Stages</i>	<i>Stage I: The End of WWII until the early 1970s</i>	<i>Stage II: The 1970s–1980s</i>	<i>Stage III: The mid-1980s to present</i>
Geopolitical Climate	Independence of Asia and African countries	Economic downturn and widening of social inequalities	Globalization; end of Cold War; growth of NGOs; technological advances
Theoretical Perspective	Structural-functionalist	Critical	Ecological
Language Orientations	Language diversity as problem	Language diversity as right	Language diversity as resource

Three Orientations for Bilingual Education VI

- Do you think bilingual education (or bilingualism in general) is beneficial for school children in the 21st century? In other words, do you think children with limited English proficiency should be educated in English or their home language? Why?



Ink-shedding

Ink-shedding (10 min)

1. What does "translanguaging" mean? How is it different from bilingualism?
2. One question that you have about today's class.

Bibliography I

García, O. (2008). *Bilingual Education in the 21st Century: A Global Perspective*. Wiley-Blackwell, xx. Course: ELN101, Price: \$41.95.

This presentation slide was created with \LaTeX and *beamer* \LaTeX style.