



CITY OF SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS
MAYOR'S OFFICE OF STRATEGIC PLANNING & COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT
JOSEPH A. CURTATONE
MAYOR

MICHAEL F. GLAVIN
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Dick Bauer, Chair
George Born (Alt.)
Heather Davies, Secretary (Alt.)
Abby Freedman
Mark Sternman

Alan Bingham, Vice Chair (Alt.)
Denis (DJ) Chagnon (Alt.)
Ryan Falvey
Eric Parkes

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

Visiting Nurses Association, Community Room, 3rd Floor, 259 Lowell Street
6:40 p.m. on Tuesday, February 21, 2017

Members Present: Alan Bingham*, Dick Bauer, Abby Freedman, Eric Parkes, Mark Sternman..

Members Absent: George Born*, DJ Chagnon*. Heather Davies*, Ryan Falvey.

*Alternates

Staff Present: Kristi Chase

Others Present: Dan Anderson, Elaine B – , Vickie Choitz, Marilyn DiPietro, Joan DiPietro Gardner, Seth Grady, Ella Lehrich, Gerry McDonough, Mary Nastasi, John Topalis, Diane P. Topliffe.

I. Determinations of Appropriateness

HPC 2016.089 – 27-29 Meacham Road	
Applicant:	Ronald Cavallo
Property Owner:	Joseph A & Anna R Cavallo
Application Date:	October 25, 2016
Legal Notice:	<i>Install a metal fence; Add a hitching post to yard; Install mailboxes.</i>
Recommendation:	<i>Conditional Certificate of Appropriateness</i>
Current Status:	Continued from December 20, 2016; Request to continue to March 21, 2017
Decision:	The Commission voted unanimously (5-0) to continue to March 21, 2017



CITY HALL • 93 HIGHLAND AVENUE • SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS 02143
(617) 625-6600 EXT. 2500 • TTY: (617) 666-0001 • FAX: (617) 625-0722

www.somervillema.gov



HPC 2017.001 – 359-365 Broadway	
Applicant:	John K. Holmes
Property Owner:	John K. Holmes
Application Date:	1/24/2017
Legal Notice:	<i>Replace cementitious board with clapboard</i>
Recommendation:	<i>Conditional</i> Certificate of Appropriateness
Current Status:	Will be heard on February 21, 2017
Presentation:	J. Holmes presented. The work had been completed without permits. He now wanted to remove the existing siding and replace it with wood clapboard. And appropriate trim material.
Public Comment:	There was no public comment.
Staff Report:	Staff noted in her report that work done in error a few years ago was being rectified. The Applicant had an expired Certificate of Appropriateness to make the alteration of the siding. The proposed alteration was in-keeping with historic guidelines and ordinances.
Documents:	Staff Report based upon the City of Somerville Ordinance sections 7.16 – 7.27, HPC Design Guidelines, and Massachusetts Historical Commission Property Survey Form and site visits
Discussion:	There was no discussion.
Decision:	The Commission voted unanimously (5-0) to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. All appropriate building permits shall be obtained prior to the start of any work. 2. Cement board siding shall be removed and replaced with wood clapboarding. 3. Composite trim shall be removed and replaced with wood trim. 4. Applicant shall use wood clapboard that is similar to late 19th century wood siding in reveal (exposure), thickness and contour. Pine will not be considered an acceptable siding material. 5. Applicant shall use wood trim that is similar to late 19th century wood trim in terms of thickness and contour. Pine will not be considered an acceptable trim material. 6. Applicant shall ensure that the structure is properly protected from any adverse impact from the elements if there be any delay between the removal of the cement board and composite trim and the installation of the wood trim and clapboarding, 7. If changes are necessary to the proposed work for which this Certificate of Appropriateness was issued, new plans shall be submitted to Historic Staff prior to commencing the work. 8. Applicant shall contact HPC Staff upon completion of the work for sign-off that the work was done in accordance with the Certificate of Appropriateness (C/A) and approved.

HPC 2017.002 – 56 Bow Street	
Applicant:	Erik and Lindsay Neu
Property Owner:	Erik and Lindsay Neu
Application Date:	1/24/2017
Legal Notice:	<i>Replace existing front door and second floor porch door.</i>
Recommendation:	<i>Conditional</i> Certificate of Appropriateness
Current Status:	Will be heard on February 21, 2017
Presentation:	Eric Neu presented. He noted that the lead time for the arch topped doors was too long so they had ordered the flat top doors on the strength of the Commissions opinions in January. They were planning to move in early May.
Public Comment:	There was no public comment.
Staff Report:	Staff noted that the Commission had reviewed and commented on the proposal last month. The Applicant had followed those recommendations.



CITY HALL • 93 HIGHLAND AVENUE • SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS 02143
 (617) 625-6600 EXT. 2500 • TTY: (617) 666-0001 • FAX: (617) 625-0722

www.somervillema.gov



Documents:	Staff Report based upon the City of Somerville Ordinance sections 7.16 – 7.27, HPC Design Guidelines, and Massachusetts Historical Commission Property Survey Form and site visits
Discussion:	The Commission noted that the work on the house was proceeding well. Abby Freedman gave them a special thank you for all the improvements they have undertaken.
Decision:	The Commission voted unanimously (5-0) to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. All appropriate building permits shall be obtained prior to the start of any work. 2. If changes are necessary to the proposed design for which this Certificate of Appropriateness was issued, new plans shall be submitted to Historic Staff prior to commencing the work. 3. The front door shall be Simpson® model F-7444. 4. The porch door shall be Simpson® model Plymouth G-326. 5. Applicant shall contact HPC Staff upon completion of the work for sign-off that the work was executed in accordance with the Certificate of Appropriateness (C/A).

HPC 2015.084 R1 – 237 Washington Street	
Applicant:	Seth Grady
Property Owner:	Union Square Partners LLC
Application Date:	1/25/2017
Legal Notice:	<i>Revisions to Certificate of Appropriateness; Letter of Support for Tax Credits</i>
Recommendation:	<i>Conditional</i> Certificate of Appropriateness
Current Status:	Will be heard on February 21, 2017
Presentation:	Mary Nastasi of MacRostie Historic Advisors presented a PowerPoint of the revised plans made in response to comments from the Massachusetts Historical Commission. <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. All appropriate building permits shall be obtained prior to the start of any work. 2. All existing doors will be replaced with code-compliant new wood doors. The design of the new doors will be based upon the original drawings of the building. 3. Dormers on the east and west elevations have been deleted. 4. A single shed dormer will be located along the north elevation. 5. A simple 42” metal guardrail will be installed along the perimeter of the surface roof, set back from the main roofline by 4’. The previously-approved guardrail was at the main roofline. 6. Eleven new skylights will be installed in the roof. They will be flush with the roof assembly and will not be visible from the public way. 7. Additionally, the scope of work for the interior of the building has been expanded to include the retention of additional material on the interior of the building, particularly in the basement-level offices at the southern end of the building.
Public Comment:	There was no public comment.
Staff Report:	There was no Staff Report as the material was not received until the morning of the meeting.
Documents:	Staff Report based upon the City of Somerville Ordinance sections 7.16 – 7.27, HPC Design Guidelines, and Massachusetts Historical Commission Property Survey Forms and site visits
Discussion:	It was confirmed that the changes requested by the MHC were in compliance with HPC Guidelines.
Decision:	The Commission voted unanimously (5-0) to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. All existing doors will be replaced with code-compliant new wood doors. The design of the new doors will be based upon the original drawings of the building.



CITY HALL • 93 HIGHLAND AVENUE • SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS 02143
(617) 625-6600 EXT. 2500 • TTY: (617) 666-0001 • FAX: (617) 625-0722

www.somervillema.gov



	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 2. Dormers on the east and west elevations have been deleted. 3. A single shed dormer will be located along the north elevation. 4. A simple 42" metal guardrail will be installed along the perimeter of the surface roof, set back from the main roofline by 4". The previously-approved guardrail was at the main roofline. 5. If changes are necessary to the proposed work for which this Certificate of Appropriateness was issued, new plans shall be submitted to Historic Staff prior to commencing the work. 6. Applicant shall contact HPC Staff upon completion of the work for sign-off that the work was done in accordance with the Certificate of Appropriateness (C/A) and approved <p>The remaining work was not visible from the public right of way and should be issued a Certificate of Non-Applicability.</p>
--	--

HPC 2017.003 – 132 Perkins Street	
Applicant:	Elan Sassoon; John Topalis; Gerry McDonough
Property Owner:	132 Perkins LLC
Application Date:	1/30/2017
Legal Notice:	<i>Alter selected window and door openings; Remove fire escape and rear deck; Partial demolition and construction of new addition; remove chimneys.</i>
Recommendation:	<i>Plans under revision; Recommendations forthcoming at meeting</i>
Current Status:	Will be heard on February 21, 2017
Presentation:	<p>Dan Anderson, architect presented their plans. The owners bought the building a few months ago and intend to enlarge the structure with a new addition placed behind the hyphen or connector building between the Greek Revival and the Mansard structures. This had been designed as a continuation of the Mansard but after consultation with the Staff it was made smaller, separated more from the Greek Revival portion of the building and in a modern style with related proportions.</p> <p>Some of the windows had been altered over the years or were poorly located. They intend to make the windows consistent with the styles of the relative buildings. The existing windows are all vinyl replacement windows.</p> <p>The chimneys had been removed during the interior renovations by the workmen and would be rebuilt from the rafters to above the roofline using the historic bricks.</p> <p>Doors would need to be altered and relocated due to the interior logic of the apartments. The styles were not yet determined.</p>
Public Comment:	A Florence Street neighbor was concerned about what she could see from her house and whether the trees would be preserved. Dan Anderson responded that it had been important to them to preserve the mature trees on site.
Staff Report:	Because the Applicants were still revising plans for the addition and ways to retain historic doorways as of a meeting with Staff that morning, no recommendations were ready. Changes to the windows had been made following Staff recommendations for the windows to follow the architecture of the section of the building in which they were located. The addition had been more clearly differentiated from the Greek Revival portion of the building.
Documents:	Staff Report based upon the City of Somerville Ordinance sections 7.16 – 7.27, HPC Design Guidelines, and Massachusetts Historical Commission Property Survey Forms and site visits



CITY HALL • 93 HIGHLAND AVENUE • SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS 02143
 (617) 625-6600 EXT. 2500 • TTY: (617) 666-0001 • FAX: (617) 625-0722

www.somervillema.gov



Discussion:	The Commission reviewed the plans for the addition and made recommendations. Because they had not had sufficient time to review the plans prior to the meeting, they asked that the case be continued until next month. Abby Freedman noted that the addition was tall and asked for the structure to be made smaller. Eric Parkes noted that he generally felt that the addition was good, however the devil is in the details which could be tricky to get right. He would like to see further investigation in new materials. He is looking forward to having more information on the design. They did agree with Staff that the proposed window configuration and styles were appropriate and the Applicants could move forward on interior work.
Decision:	<p>The Commission voted unanimously (5-0) to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. All appropriate building permits shall be obtained prior to the start of any work. 2. If changes are necessary to the proposed design for which this Certificate of Appropriateness was issued, new plans shall be submitted to Historic Staff prior to commencing the work. 3. Selected windows openings shall be relocated on east and west elevations on both Greek Revival and Mansard building sections as found in plans EL2 and EL4 by Anderson Porter Design dated 2/21/2017. 4. Selected undersized window openings shall be enlarged to match existing full-sized windows in their respective building sections as found in plans EL2 and EL4 by Anderson Porter Design dated 2/21/2017. 5. The dormer on the east side of the Mansard section of the building shall be relocated as found in plan EL4 by Anderson Porter Design dated 2/21/2017. 6. All replacement windows shall have dark colored sash. 7. All replacement window sash shall be constructed of wood and not clad. Pine or other soft wood shall not be used. The sash shall be simulated divided light 6/6 with dark spaces and no Lo-E coatings in the Greek Revival section; and simulated divided light 2/2 with dark spaces and no Lo-E coatings on the Mansard and hyphen. 8. Applicant shall contact HPC Staff upon completion of the work for sign-off that the work was executed in accordance with the Certificate of Appropriateness (C/A). <p>A Certificate of Non-Applicability was issued with the following condition:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Existing siding, trim, dormers, cornices and eaves shall be repaired and replaced as necessary to match existing with respect to their material, dimensions, design, color, texture and other qualities. <p>The Commission voted unanimously (5-0) to continue the hearing to March 21, 2017.</p>

II. Determinations of Significance

HPC 2016.100 – 32R Glen Street, 25-27 Glen Street	
Applicant:	David Aposhian
Property Owner:	David Aposhian
Application Date:	11/30/2016
Recommendation:	Significant
Current Status:	Continued from January 17, 2017; request to continue until March 21, 2017
	The Commission voted unanimously (5-0) to continue to March 21, 2017



CITY HALL • 93 HIGHLAND AVENUE • SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS 02143
(617) 625-6600 EXT. 2500 • TTY: (617) 666-0001 • FAX: (617) 625-0722

www.somervillema.gov



HPC 2017.004 – 57 Broadway	
Applicant:	Vincent Lee
Property Owner:	Centrie Realty, LLC
Application Date:	2/1/2016
Recommendation:	Significant
Current Status:	Will be heard February 21, 2017
Presentation:	The Applicant was not present.
Public Comment:	Joan DiPietro Gardner said that her family had owned the house next door for almost 100 years. The neighborhood was very tight and extremely historic. She had known some of the history of the area but had learned more from the Staff Report. This was the first neighborhood encountered when coming from Boston and Sullivan Square. They waited every year for Paul Revere to ride by. A modern building would look stupid alongside the historic houses on Broadway, Austin Street and Benedict Avenue. She spoke about how the neighborhood had been altered by the construction of I-93 when part of Mount Benedict was taken and the homes on that side of the hill demolished. She intends to share the Staff Report with her neighbors and will be back next month. They shared a look at a 1946 volume titled "Leading Americans of Italian Descent" by Joseph William Carlevale which mentioned several Somerville families.
Staff Report:	<p>Only one portion of Mt. Benedict's original elevation survives, at the eastern edge. Austin, Benedict, and Union Streets are a fragment of the residential corner now bisected by I-93. Several Italianate and Second Empire Style houses give an indication of the original character of this area. The Austin area was platted in the 1850s by heirs of Sarah Stearnes, who lived in a pre-Revolutionary War house at the foot of Mt. Benedict (since replaced by Broadway Brake).</p> <p>57 Broadway is one of two mirror image Italianates currently sided in contrasting materials was owned by Gilbert Tufts, who owned a tannery in Charlestown. The building is located on property surveyed by William A. Garbett dated 1867. Other than Gilbert Tufts inclusion at this address in the 1873 City Directory, he is listed as living on Broadway at the corner of Mount Vernon Street. The next known owner (1895-1900) was J. H. Cotton, a lawyer who was involved in the American Tube Works and numerous other businesses in Somerville, Boston and Charlestown. During the 1930s and 1940s, the house was owned by Catherine Dainley or Dawley, a tailor. At least one of the tenants had certain fame for his achievements. Louis H. Mudgett (1860-1924), who lived at #57 in 1885 at the beginning of his 40-year career, became well known as the manager of the Music Hall, Boston Opera and the Boston Symphony Hall.</p> <p>57 Broadway is an L-shaped 2 ½ story Italianate cottage with a bay on the first floor facing Broadway and a simple side porch on the inside of the L facing Benedict Avenue. The building is one bay wide by three bays deep. Fenestration is simple 1/1 sash. The siding is aluminum. The roof has deep eave returns which have partially enclosed to keep out pigeons. The brackets have been removed although their outline remains. There are two chimneys, one for the parlors and bedrooms in the main portion and one for the kitchen and the bedroom above.</p> <p>The building has not been moved. The neighborhood is a mix of Italianate and Mansard style homes constructed on Mount Benedict before 1874 between the north side of Broadway and the saltmarsh along the Mystic River. Much of Mount Benedict has been removed. The neighborhood is now contained by I-93 to the north while much of the hill has been removed to make bricks and fill in the various saltmarshes to make land.</p> <p>This house is one of a small collection of working class houses on the north side of Broadway on the remains of Mount Benedict all constructed before 1874. 59 Broadway shares the same form and construction although its brick veneer gives the building more solidity.</p>



CITY HALL • 93 HIGHLAND AVENUE • SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS 02143
 (617) 625-6600 EXT. 2500 • TTY: (617) 666-0001 • FAX: (617) 625-0722

www.somervillema.gov



	alteration of massing and form will distort the proportions of the remaining buildings on the street.
Documents:	Staff Report based upon the City of Somerville Ordinance sections 7.28, historic maps, US Census, City Directories, the Boston Globe and site visits
Discussion:	The Commission concurred with the Staff findings. Abby Freedman noted that additional details could be seen on the porch and in the foundation. She explained more about the process and noted that the neighbors could lobby for a Local Historic District established but that it would take longer than the 9-months demolition review period. Staff noted that typically it could take about 18 months if there were no impediments to the process.
Decision:	<p>The Commission voted unanimously (5-0) to find the building ‘significant’ and agreed with the Staff findings that:</p> <p>(A) The structure is NOT listed on or within an area listed on the National Register of Historic Places, nor is the structure the subject of a pending application for listing on the National Register.</p> <p>AND</p> <p>(B) The structure, circa 1874, is at least 50 years old.</p> <p>AND</p> <p><i>For a Determination of Significance under (B), the subject building must be found either (a) importantly associated with people, events or history or (b) historically or architecturally significant.</i></p> <p>(a) In accordance with the <i>Findings on Historical Association</i>, which utilizes historic maps/atlas, City reports and directories, and building permit research, and through an examination of resources that document the history of the City, Staff recommend that the Historic Preservation Commission find 57 Broadway <u>importantly associated</u> with one or more historic persons or events, or with the broad architectural, cultural, political, economic or social history of the City or the Commonwealth.</p> <p>The subject building is found importantly associated with one or more historic persons the broad architectural, cultural, economic and social history of the City due to associations with the Tufts family, J.H. Cotton as a prominent landowner, and Louis H. Mudgett, manager of several musical institutions, and with the broad architectural, cultural, political, economic or social history of the City.</p> <p>AND/OR</p> <p>(b) In accordance with the <i>Findings on Historical and Architectural Significance</i>, which addresses period, style, method of building construction, and association with a reputed architect or builder, either by itself or in the context of a group of buildings or structures, as well as integrity, the ability to convey significance, Staff recommend that the Historic Preservation Commission find 57 Broadway historically and architecturally significant.</p> <p>The subject building is found historically and architecturally significant due to its period, style, method of building construction, and in the context of a group of buildings or structures, as well as integrity, which assess the ability of the property to convey significance, Staff find 57 Broadway historically or architecturally significant. This house is one of a small collection of working class houses on the north side of Broadway on the remains of Mount Benedict all constructed before 1874. 59 Broadway shares the same form and construction although its brick veneer gives the building more solidity. The building is in a key location. It is integral to the pre-1874 neighborhood and despite alterations is readily identifiable as an Italianate home.</p>



III. Community Preservation Act (CPA) Business

- Update by Dick Bauer

Dick Bauer noted that there were three historic properties looking for CPA funding: the Milk Row Cemetery, the Somerville Museum and the Grace Baptist Church at 59 Cross Street. The Commission agreed that these were all worthy of funding but was concerned that the Church had not come in to the Commission for alterations or repairs, yet several had been improperly undertaken. Dick Bauer noted that they had hired a qualified company, Spencer and Vogt to oversee the repairs needed. If the Church were to receive funding, they must come to the Commission rather than simply do the work on their own.

IV. Other Business, Updates and General Items not requiring legal notice

- Discussion of Local Historic Districts

Neither George Proakis nor Sarah White was able to make the meeting to update the Commission on LHD projects. Therefore there was no discussion.

- 485 Mystic Valley Parkway - Mystic Water Works Letter of Support for Tax Credits

The Commission approved the letter of support for the project.

Minutes:	January 26, 2016 – Historic Preservation Commission
	September 20, 2016 – Historic Preservation Commission
	January 10, 2017 – Historic Preservation Commission
	January 17, 2017 – Historic Preservation Commission
The Minutes were unanimously approved by those attending the meetings.	

Completed Staff Reviews – Listed for informational purposes

HPC 2017.005 – 37 Walnut Street	
Applicant:	Andrew Brandt
Property Owner:	Andrew Brandt
Description:	<i>Repair retaining wall</i>
Current Status:	Certificate of Non-Applicability – Repairs issued 2/1/2017

HPC 2017.006 – 11 Pleasant Avenue	
Applicant:	Eric Meserve
Property Owner:	Eric Meserve
Description:	<i>Replace lighting fixtures.</i>
Current Status:	Certificate of Non-Applicability – Exempt issued 2/13/2017

Reports and plans are available on the City of Somerville website at archive.somervillema.gov/departments/historic-preservation-commission/hpc-cases-and-decisions and on the third floor of City Hall at 93 Highland Avenue. Cases may be continued to a later date(s); therefore, check the agenda on the website 48 hours in advance of the meeting or call (617) 625-6600 x2500 to inquire if specific cases will be heard. Continued cases will not be re-advertized, but will be listed on the agenda. Interested persons may provide comments to the Historic Preservation Commission at the public hearing, by email to historic@somervillema.gov, by fax to (617) 625-0722, or by mail addressed to the Somerville Historic Preservation Commission.



CITY HALL • 93 HIGHLAND AVENUE • SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS 02143
(617) 625-6600 EXT. 2500 • TTY: (617) 666-0001 • FAX: (617) 625-0722

www.somervillema.gov

