



CITY OF SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS
MAYOR'S OFFICE OF STRATEGIC PLANNING & COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT
JOSEPH A. CURTATONE
MAYOR

MICHAEL F. GLAVIN
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Dick Bauer, Chair
George Born (Alt.)
Heather Davies, Secretary (Alt.)
Abby Freedman
Mark Sternman

Alan Bingham, Vice Chair (Alt.)
Denis (DJ) Chagnon (Alt.)
Ryan Falvey
Eric Parkes

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

Visiting Nurses Association, Community Room, 3rd Floor, 259 Lowell Street
6:40 p.m. on Thursday, January 10, 2017

Members Present: Dick Bauer, Alan Bingham*, George Born*, DJ Chagnon*, Eric Parkes. DJ Chagnon left the meeting at 7:35 PM.

Members Absent: Heather Davies*, Ryan Falvey, Abby Freedman, Mark Sternman.

*Alternates

Staff Present: Kristi Chase

Others Present: Ron Cavallo, Chris Rucinski, John Ciccolo, Alex van Praagh, David Aposhian.

I. Others Present: Determinations of Appropriateness

HPC 2016.095 – 74 Mount Vernon Street	
Applicant:	Paul Turcotte
Property Owner:	Paul Turcotte
Application Date:	11/10/2016
Legal Notice:	<i>Demolish barn and garages.</i>
Recommendation:	Denial; <i>Conditional</i> Certificate of Appropriateness
Current Status:	Heard on January 10, 2016
Presentation:	David Aposhian presented with added information from Paul Turcotte, owner and Alex van Praagh, architect. The garages and barn are in poorer condition than they appear from the street. The owner would like to construct a second building on the lot and the outbuildings are in the way.



CITY HALL • 93 HIGHLAND AVENUE • SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS 02143
(617) 625-6600 EXT. 2500 • TTY: (617) 666-0001 • FAX: (617) 625-0722

www.somervillema.gov



Public Comment:	There was no public comment. Letters concerning the structure were received from Alex van Praagh, architect and William A. Curdo, carpenter.
Staff Report:	<p>The outbuildings were not discussed in the Form B. No historic fabric will be repaired or replaced. One of the concrete block garages is visible from Mount Vernon Street. All the buildings are visible between buildings from Crescent Street.</p> <p>The garages are not contemporary with the house, do not have any architectural relationship with the original house, nor have any historic association with Walter H. Durell; and the design is generic c. 1920s concrete block garage.</p> <p>However, the stable is contemporary with Walter H. Durell, wholesale and retail dealer of sashes, windows, and doors. He would have needed his own conveyance for his business rather than relying on the street car and railway system than ran past the bottom of the street. The stable is a gable end 1 ½ story building with a tall loft opening. The siding is clapboard on the sides and front gable. The rear has asbestos shingles over-lying the original siding and a window in the gable. The wagon entry has been enclosed with vertical board and a pedestrian entry. One side has a chimney pipe and a window. While not an elaborate or high style stable/barn, the building cannot be mistaken for another kind of structure.</p> <p>Staff recommended that the Historic Preservation Commission deny a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the stable but grant Paul Turcotte, Owner, a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. All appropriate building permits shall be obtained prior to the start of any work. 2. If changes are necessary to the proposed design for which this Certificate of Appropriateness was issued, new plans shall be submitted to Historic Staff prior to commencing the work. 3. The concrete block garages may be demolished. 4. The Owner shall work with the Commission to retain and reuse the stable. 5. Historic Staff shall issue a sign-off upon completion of the project that it was executed in accordance with this Certificate and approved plans.
Documents:	Staff Report based upon the City of Somerville Ordinance sections 7.16 – 7.27, HPC Design Guidelines, and Massachusetts Historical Commission Property Survey Form, site plan, photographs and site visits
Discussion:	Interior photos of the buildings and close examination of the exterior photos of the stable revealed that the c. 1913 garage wall replaced the original wall on that side. The lower 3' of the other side wall were also replaced with concrete or concrete block leaving little of the original structure. The Commission still found the stable to be sufficiently important to be retained. After a short deliberation among the owner and his team, they suggested to the Commission that the remaining part of the building be relocated to the southeast corner of the lot, visible from Mount Vernon and Crescent Streets. The Commission found this to be a reasonable solution.
Decision:	<p>The Commission voted unanimously (6-0) to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. All appropriate building permits shall be obtained prior to the start of any work. 2. If changes are necessary to the proposed design for which this Certificate of Appropriateness was issued, new plans shall be submitted to Historic Staff prior to commencing the work. 3. The concrete block garages may be demolished. 4. The stable shall be relocated to the southeast corner of the lot at the base of the driveway leading from Mount Vernon Street. 5. Measured drawings and documentation photos of the stable shall be completed prior to relocation of the building.



CITY HALL • 93 HIGHLAND AVENUE • SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS 02143
(617) 625-6600 EXT. 2500 • TTY: (617) 666-0001 • FAX: (617) 625-0722

www.somervillema.gov



	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 6. A relocation plan shall be submitted detailing the processes by which the historic structure will be relocated prior to receiving a demolition/building permit. 7. Historic Staff shall issue a sign-off upon completion of the project that it was executed in accordance with this Certificate and approved plans.
--	--

HPC 2016.098 – 22 Flint Street	
Applicant:	John A. Ciccolo
Property Owner:	Luna Properties LLC
Application Date:	11/29/2016
Legal Notice:	<i>Rebuild porches using Trex® flooring.</i>
Recommendation:	Denial; <i>Conditional Certificate of Appropriateness</i>
Current Status:	To be heard on January 10, 2016
Presentation:	John Ciccolo presented. While he was out of the country, his insurance company required that the wrap around porch had collapsed rebuilt. He asked his tenant, a carpenter to take care of it. The carpenter looked at the rear side steps and landing that had been recently done by a previous owner and replicated the materials. Unfortunately, the repair had not been done as authorized and the error was replicated and Trex® was used. He would also like to open up the upper porch by not replacing the plywood covering the rails.
Public Comment:	There was no public comment.
Staff Report:	<p>The main wrap-around porch was discussed in the Form B. The deteriorated posts will be reconstructed to match the existing. The porch appears to be 30” or less from the ground level which means the railings could be returned to their historic height. See detail showing existing rail with original post next to the front door. The second floor porch is not original to the building. The proposed alteration to the porch would bring it back to an earlier condition as can be seen in the photos below.</p> <p>Other than the decking and the removal of plywood from the porches, there would be no other changes. The railings, posts, balusters, spindles, brackets and other details would be repaired and replaced in kind to match the original.</p> <p>Staff did not recommend that the Historic Preservation Commission grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the use of Trex® or other synthetic materials but did recommend granting a Certificate of Appropriateness (C/A) to remove the plywood from the porches and issuance to the Applicant a Certificate of Non-Applicability (C/NA) for the repair and maintenance of the porches in-kind to match the originals to John Ciccolo, Owner for work on 22 Flint Street.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. All appropriate building permits shall be obtained prior to the start of any work. 2. If changes are necessary to the proposed design for which this Certificate of Appropriateness was issued, new plans shall be submitted to Historic Staff prior to commencing the work. 3. The plywood panels on the second floor porch shall be removed. (C/A) 4. The rails and balusters of the second floor shall match those on the first floor in form and materials. (C/NA) 5. The porches shall be rebuilt using a hard wood for the decking. (C/NA) 6. The railings and spindles on wrap-around porch shall be restored. (C/NA) 7. The porch posts shall be wrapped in wood to meet the original 6” x 6” dimensions. (C/NA) 8. The trim details where the fascia meets the roof shall be reproduced in kind. (C/NA)



CITY HALL • 93 HIGHLAND AVENUE • SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS 02143
 (617) 625-6600 EXT. 2500 • TTY: (617) 666-0001 • FAX: (617) 625-0722

www.somervillema.gov



	9. The railing height shall be returned to the original height. (C/A) 10. The porch skirt shall be made of wood lattice. (C/NA) 11. Historic Staff shall issue a sign-off upon completion of the project that it was executed in accordance with this Certificate and approved plans.
Documents:	Staff Report based upon the City of Somerville Ordinance sections 7.16 – 7.27, HPC Design Guidelines, and Massachusetts Historical Commission Property Survey Form, photographs and site visits
Discussion:	<p>The use of Trex® was of particular concern since it was already in place. After some deliberation it was determined to not be particularly visible due to the angle of view, cutting it back so that it would not be seen end. Trex® is both thicker and with more visual texture than traditional wood decking. Replacing the edge material with AZEK® or similar which would be paintable and of an appropriate dimension would fool the eye and would be visually more appropriate than Trex®.</p> <p>Spindle work, brackets and the extra post were discussed. The post must match the rest.</p>
Decision:	<p>The Commission voted unanimously (6-0) to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness (C/A) and issue a Certificate of Non-Applicability (C/NA) with the following conditions:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. All appropriate building permits shall be obtained prior to the start of any work. 2. If changes are necessary to the proposed design for which this Certificate of Appropriateness was issued, new plans shall be submitted to Historic Staff prior to commencing the work. 3. The plywood panels on the second floor porch shall be removed. (C/A) 4. The second floor porch posts shall match the existing. (C/NA) 5. The rails and balusters of the second floor shall match those on the first floor in form and materials. (C/NA) 6. The porch decking shall be rebuilt using Trex® with a 4”-6” smooth wood or AZEK® wide edging around the entire perimeter. (C/A) 7. The decking shall be painted. (C/A) 8. An additional post shall be installed along the eastern side of the first floor porch. (C/A) 9. The brackets, railings, spindles and other details on the wrap-around porch shall be restored or replicated where necessary. (C/NA) 10. All porch posts shall be wrapped in wood to meet the original 6” x 6” dimensions and design. (C/NA) 11. The trim details where the fascia meets the roof shall be reproduced in kind. (C/NA) 12. The railing height shall be returned to the original height as seen where the porch meets the edge of the house. (C/A) 13. The porch skirt shall be made of vertical wood lattice. (C/NA) 14. Historic Staff shall issue a sign-off upon completion of the project that it was executed in accordance with this Certificate and approved plans.

II. Community Preservation Act (CPA) Business

- Update from Dick Bauer

Dick Bauer discussed the projects before the Community Preservation Committee (CPC). These were the Milk Row Cemetery, The Somerville Museum and the former Grace Baptist Church on Cross Street. Most of the Applications were for open space. 45% was allocated to affordable housing.



CITY HALL • 93 HIGHLAND AVENUE • SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS 02143
 (617) 625-6600 EXT. 2500 • TTY: (617) 666-0001 • FAX: (617) 625-0722

www.somervillema.gov



III. Other Business, Updates and General Items not requiring legal notice

Minutes:	August 16, 2016 – Historic Preservation Commission
	The August HPC minutes were unanimously approved by those attending the meeting.

Properties within the Demolition Review Period

Property	Owner	Date of Pref. Pres.	End Demo Delay	Status
10 Emerson Street	Nicholas Earls	5/17/2016	2/17/2017	Mt w/ Staff on 6/16/16, 7/7/16, 8/4/16, 9/15/16
17 Porter Street	Daniel & Amanda Caspariello	5/17/2016	2/17/2017	Mt w/Staff on 6/21/16

Completed Staff Reviews – Listed for informational purposes

HPC 2016.094 – 25 Atherton Street	
Applicant:	Sara Ann Patterson
Property Owner:	Andrew & Sara Ann Patterson; The Carr Schoolhouse Condominium Trust
Application Date:	11/8/2016
Description:	<i>Install skylights on east roof.</i>
Current Status:	Certificate of Non-Applicability – visibility issued 12/13/2016

HPC 2016.104 – 17 Appleton Street	
Applicant:	Cyrus Amin
Property Owner	Cyrus Amin
Description:	<i>Demolish c. 1884 Mansard stable; rear wall missing; roof & joists severely compromised; intend to rebuild in-kind.</i>
Current Status:	Emergency Demolition per ISD.

Reports and plans are available on the City of Somerville website at www.somervillema.gov/departments/historic-preservation-commission/hpc-cases-and-decisions and on the third floor of City Hall at 93 Highland Avenue. Cases may be continued to a later date(s); therefore, check the agenda on the website 48 hours in advance of the meeting or call (617) 625-6600 x2500 to inquire if specific cases will be heard. Continued cases will not be re-advertized, but will be listed on the agenda. Interested persons may provide comments to the Historic Preservation Commission at the public hearing, by email to historic@somervillema.gov, by fax to (617) 625-0722, or by mail addressed to the Somerville Historic Preservation Commission.



CITY HALL • 93 HIGHLAND AVENUE • SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS 02143
(617) 625-6600 EXT. 2500 • TTY: (617) 666-0001 • FAX: (617) 625-0722

www.somervillema.gov

