



CITY OF SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Joseph A. Curtatone

Mayor

MINUTES

Tuesday, December 16, 2008

City Hall

3rd Floor Conference Room

6:40 p.m.

Staff Present: Kristi Chase and Brandon Wilson (for last portion of the meeting).

Members Present: Kevin Allen*, Dick Bauer, Tom DeYoung, Ryan Falvey, Abby Freedman, Michael Payne. Michael Payne left at 9:00 pm.

Members Absent: DJ Chagnon*, O. Susan Fontano*, Ian Judge*, Barbara Mangum, Jeff Meese, Susan Rabinowitz*, Derick Snare* Brad Stearns*.

Alternates*

Others Present: Eric Parkes, Nichole Bookwalter, Ken Winokur, Jane Gillooly, Michael Gillooly, James Veneziano, Ted Tobin, Ed Bradford, Stephen Smith, Darin Samaraweera, Michael Binette, Caron Guigli, Michael Guigli, Madeleine Masters.

Final Review and Approval of HPC Minutes: November 2008

*Abby Freedman made a motion, seconded by Tom DeYoung to **accept** the November Minutes as written. The vote was unanimous (3-0-2 (Dick Bauer and Ryan Falvey abstaining)).*

DELIBERATION OF HPC CASES

HPC 08.70 – 117 Washington Street – Ireland House (1783)

Applicant: H. A. Wollman, New Owner

The Applicant seeks a **Certificate of Appropriateness** for the following:

1. Replace exiting asphalt 3-tab shingle roof with cedar shingles similar to those found inside enclosed roof;

2. Replace 6 1/1 replacement windows on front façade of building with Pella insulated glass 6/6 wood windows;
3. Replace 12 1/1 replacement windows with 6/6 vinyl replacement windows; and
4. Replace 3 exterior replacement doors.

The Applicant did not appear for the hearing. The motion was made by Dick Bauer, seconded by Tom DeYoung to deny the Application without prejudice due to lack of full information to make a determination. The vote was unanimous (5-0).

HPC #08.77 – 61 Atherton Street, W.L. Edgerton House (1860)

Applicants: Jane Gillooly and Ken Winokur, New Owners

The Applicants seek a Certificate of Appropriateness for the following:

1. Remove asphalt paving;
2. Replace one window on rear ell with French doors;
3. Replace side doors with Simpson 2055 style doors;
4. Install door hoods over all side entries, replicating existing kitchen door hood;
5. Install large landing;
6. Enlarge three kitchen window openings to match original framing and replace missing fourth opening;
7. Install four kitchen windows with 6/6 sash to match original size and configuration and framing;
8. Enclose small garage addition;
9. Install two windows to match original 6/6 windows on new garage wall;
10. Remove 3/3 window on side wall of garage;
11. Replace garage window with casement window removed from kitchen;
12. Replace rusted basement windows with hopper-style vinyl replacement windows with the same configuration of panes; and
13. Replace wood 2/2 window under stairs to match other existing windows.

Ken Winokur presented their plans with assistance from Michael Gillooly, contractor. They are renovating and rehabilitating the building which as been only minimally maintained in recent years. Removing some of the asphalt paving will allow for a larger garden. The building has several additions. They are reconfiguring the rooms to separate work areas from living space. They would like to remove one window and enlarge the opening to install French doors, which would open onto a large landing/deck at the end of the first addition. The landing would have a long door hood similar to the existing back door hood and be composed of a material similar to the existing front porch deck, treated with rosewood oil that acts as a sealant and allows the wood to weather naturally. Jane Gillooly particularly wanted more light in that room as well as a spot to leave groceries and other bags while manipulating keys to enter the house.

The Commission was concerned about the proposed door hood. The existing one is a much later addition and not in keeping with the Greek Revival style of the house. The supports were a simple construction but not sensitive to the building. They disliked the way it crossed over the sides of one addition to the next rather than being contained by the addition. The proposed one would also have to span parts of two additions with varying setbacks. After a discussion about the slope, scale, design and amount of projection of the hood, the Applicants decided to revisit their plans for it. Michael Payne questioned the wisdom and aesthetics of placing a French door right against the edge of the addition and noted that a door with sidelights would permit the same amount of light to enter into the room and would be more in keeping with the architectural style of the house.

*Plans more sympathetic to the Greek Revival style would be more appropriate and would need investigation for the proposed door hood and landing. It was agreed that this portion of the case would be **continued** until the January 20th HPC meeting.*

After due consideration, they have decided that they would like to replace the two back side doors with Brosco F117 doors which matches one of the two existing doors. Enlarging the windows along the side to match the original would be a reversion to a historic condition as can be seen from the newly exposed framing.

Closing in the attached garage with clapboard and windows to match the rest of the house would make the space more usable for a studio.

*Dick Bauer made a motion, seconded by Michael Payne to grant a **Certificate of Appropriateness** for the removal of asphalt paving from the property. The vote was unanimous (6-0).*

*Dick Bauer made a motion, seconded by Michael Payne to grant a **Certificate of Appropriateness** to replace one window on rear ell with a single door with sidelights and Staff review and approval; and to replace side doors with Brosco F117 style doors to match the existing. The vote was unanimous (6-0).*

*Dick Bauer made a motion, seconded by Abby Freedman to grant a **Certificate of Appropriateness** to enlarge three kitchen window openings to match original framing, replace missing fourth opening, and install four kitchen windows with 6/6 sash to match original size and configuration and framing. The vote was unanimous (6-0).*

*Michael Payne made a motion, seconded by Ryan Falvey to grant a **Certificate of Appropriateness** to remove 3/3 window on side wall of garage and replace garage window with casement window removed from kitchen. The vote was unanimous (4-0-2 (Abby Freedman and Dick Bauer abstaining)).*

*Michael Payne made a motion, seconded by Abby Freedman to grant a **Certificate of Appropriateness** to replace rusted basement windows with hopper-style vinyl replacement windows with the same configuration of panes. The vote was unanimous (6-0).*

*A **Certificate of Non-Applicability** will be issued to replace wood 2/2 window under stairs to match other existing windows because the window is not visible from the public right of way.*

HPC #08.78 – 18 Westwood Road – Charles S. Parks House (1911)

Applicant: James Veneziano, Owner

The Applicant seeks a Certificate of Appropriateness for the following:

1. Relocate bathroom window on 1st floor rear approximately 2' to the east; and
2. Replace 2nd floor rear kitchen casement window with 2/2 double hung wood window to match other existing windows.

James Veneziano presented his plans to renovate the bathroom which would cause problems to the window if it were to remain in its current location. He proposes that the window be moved 2' to the east which would place in alignment with the windows on the upper floors. He also proposes to return a second floor window to its original configuration. He will use original materials where possible and in-kind materials where needed.

*Kevin Allen made a motion, seconded by Abby Freedman to grant a **Certificate of Appropriateness** to relocate bathroom window on 1st floor rear approximately 2' to the east and to line up with the windows on the floors above. The vote was unanimous (6-0).*

*Dick Bauer made a motion, seconded by Tom DeYoung to grant a **Certificate of Appropriateness** to Replace 2nd floor rear kitchen casement window with a 2/2 wood double hung wood window to match other existing windows. The vote was unanimous (6-0).*

HPC #08.31 – 140 Highland Avenue – Robert Luce House (1885-95) (continued from 6/24/08)

Applicants: Michael and Caron Guigli, Owners

The Applicants seek approval for the following:

1. Remove a secondary chimney to below the roofline (C/A);
2. Remove remaining portion of the chimney from the interior (C/NA); and
3. Install new slate and copper ridge where needed to match original (C/A);

*In June 2008 **Mike Guigli** presented the following. The chimney has leakage problem; flashing has to be redone. The mortar is falling inside the chimney and would require a significant effort to repair. The chimney serves two oil burners. These will be replaced with high efficiency furnaces which will be vented out the rear of the building. The lower 6 courses are spalling due to moisture. A carrying girder sits on a portion of the chimney. The chimney no longer serves a purpose and he would like to remove it. Lally columns would replace the chimney to support the girder. The spalling is not due to rising damp because there is no water in the basement. It is due to moisture that comes down the chimney and has no outlet other than evaporation through the bricks. The chimney base is full of damp ash and soot. To fix the chimney would be prohibitive.*

***Ryan Falvey** asked if they thought of installing a metal sleeve in the chimney. **Mike Guigli** replied that the new furnaces would be vented out the side of the building and that he would rather spend \$30,000 on heating rather than on the chimney. **Susan Fontano** suggested that he look at replicating the chimney in a brick veneer. **Michael Guigli** said that the other chimney would be repointed but this chimney was badly constructed and not the original one seen in the historic photo.*

***DJ Chagnon** noted that the chimney still contributes to the over all character of the building while **Michael Payne** stated that it did not add as much value to the building as it would if both chimneys retained their original aspect. **Michael Guigli** said that he felt that the rebuilt chimney detracted from the appearance of the building. **Michael Payne** then noted that if the second chimney were removed, the remaining one would have even more importance than it currently does; matching slates would have to be found. **DJ Chagnon** suggested that they should get an estimate of the cost to rebuild the chimney as well as the estimate for the slates. The visual impact of having both chimneys would be very strong. It was pointed out that the house was a Queen Anne and asymmetry was characteristic. **Michael Guigli** said that any owner knows that the fewer roof penetrations the better. The units would gain closet space. **Michael Guigli** said that he would remove the roofing tar from the existing slates and replace some of the windows that had been insensitively installed if he could remove the chimney. He did not want to do the work of looking for the slates unless he had some assurance from the Commission that he would be able to remove the chimney. A straw vote was taken to show how those Commissioners present felt regarding the proposal. He then agreed to **continue** the hearing so that he could undertake further research on the relative costs and availability of materials.*

Michael Guigli has now located the slate and demonstrated a color match to the existing slates and has a contractor that will undertake the chimney removal and slate work needed.

Kevin Allen made a motion, seconded by Ryan Falvey, to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove a secondary chimney to below the roofline and install new slate where needed to match original. The vote was unanimous (4-0-1 (Dick Bauer abstaining)).

HPC #08.80 – 140 Highland Avenue – Robert Luce House (1885-95)

Applicants: Michael and Caron Guigli, Owners

The Applicants seek approval for the following:

1. Remove 4 white vinyl clad windows on 1st floor (C/A);
2. Install 4 wood replacement windows to match original sash configuration (C/A);
3. Install storm windows over the 4 replacement windows and match to existing storm windows (C/NA) and
4. Repair in-kind front porch ceiling and floor to match existing (C/NA).

Michael Guigli presented. They would like to remove the four vinyl windows on the ground floor to replace them with sash that would match the rest of the house. He proposes to install storm windows and also make repairs in-kind to the front porch. These items are exempt from review by the Commission and will automatically be granted a Certificate of Non-Applicability.

Ryan Falvey made a motion, seconded by Kevin Allen, to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove 4 white vinyl clad windows on 1st floor (C/A); and install 4 wood replacement windows to match original sash configuration (C/A). The vote was unanimous (5-0).

REQUEST FOR REVIEW AND COMMENT

HPC 08.81 – MaxPak Square, 56 & 61 Clyde Street

12/8/08

Applicants: KSS Realty Partners, Ted Tobin, Project Manager

Michael Binette and Ed Bradford of the Architectural Team presented a PowerPoint of the plans for the 56-61 Clyde Street site noting the changes that had been made since the conceptual plans had been reviewed under the Demolition Review Ordinance. They made taken the following 5 points of the Memoranda of Agreement into consideration when designing their buildings and the site: glazing, metal cladding, roof lines, entry canopies and building layout and massing.

Ted Tobin is working with Brandon Wilson, the High School and others on other facets of the Memoranda of Agreement including a kiosk constructed of steel and glass from the original building. The exact location has not been determined but it would be in an area accessible by the public. Along with the oral history and the written and photographic history of the site, the Commission noted that the development process undertaken by KSS and their team also ought to be part of the story told. The three years taken to get to this stage of the process were a great example of how to build a development that meets many people's needs and requirements and finish with a better product than the original concepts.

Kevin Allen particularly liked the ideas behind the interpretive materials and had suggested to MaxPac that they consider including info on the incorporation of design elements into the interpretive materials. Ryan Falvey found the plans to be creative and interesting. **Dick Bauer**, while disappointed that the strong roofline was altered, felt that it was a tremendous effort to meet all the desires of several disparate groups and should be commended.

Dick Bauer made a motion, seconded by **Abby Freedman** noting that the Commission had reviewed the plans set forth by KSS Realty Trust pursuant to Section 5 of the Memoranda of Agreement, that the Commission thinks that those requirements have been met in good faith, that they have been accepted as being compliant with the Memoranda and that they recommend the design to the Planning Board. The vote was unanimous (5-0).

DEMOLITION REVIEW

HPC 08.71 D - 27 Jackson Road – John M. Hager House (circa 1905)

11/17/08

Requested by Planning Department

Walnut Street Center is planning a group home and has submitted preliminary drawings to the Planning Board. The original 2-family house will be demolished and a larger predominantly 1-story house would be constructed in its place. Staff has begun preliminary research. Constructed on land once belonging to Civil War hero and Medford Resident, Brigadier General S. C. Lawrence, the building was completed in 1905. The first owner was John M. Hager who started one of Somerville many dairy distribution businesses. In 1930, he redirected the business from the distribution of milk to the manufacture of ice cream. Both of his children, Clayton and Mildred were also involved with the company. Clayton took over as President of the company during the 1930s.

Because no official application for demolition is before the Commission, no vote was taken. All appeared to agree that it was an intact example of early 20th century shingle/craftsman style home that was an inherent part of the fabric of a neighborhood that had never been surveyed. Abby Freedman particularly felt that demolition of the building would be a shame and that it was eligible to be designated as an LHD. The Commission recommends that the original building be retained with an addition constructed on the other side of the lot to meet the needs of the Walnut Street Center. Staff to send a memo to Planning Board.

HPC 08.72 D - 92 Properzi Way House - James W. Maloy House (<1884)

11/17/08

Owner: Moshe Safdie, Principal of firm

Moshe Safdie Associates would like a determination of significance in preparation for a possible new structure on that location. Staff has begun preliminary research. The neighborhood began development before 1852 as workers housing for the Bleachery, Wyatt's brick factory and the American Tube Works. The house in question may exist on the 1852 Draper Map which shows 5 small houses along that side of Vine Street. According to the Hopkins 1874 atlases the house was owned by Jas. W. Maloy, a machinist at 63 Beverley Street, Boston along with the house next door. By 1895, 92 Properzi was owned by L. Marchant but lived in by Albert L. Marchant. He was a hairdresser and barber whose shop was located in 14 Union Square (now Mid-nite Convenient). His wife ran a variety store on Somerville Avenue. They had at least 5 other adult Marchants living in this small house at various times whose occupations are listed as stenographer, variety, student, and mariner. The Marchant family lived there until at least 1940.

Lamont Marchant, a plumber resided next door at 88 Properzi Way. His sons, Edward and Leonidas were also listed in the City Directories as living there until around 1925 after which Thomas Potter, steward and his wife Minnie resided there until at least 1940. Thomas Potter was the first man on the street to have a telephone.

Obviously, more research needs to be done to fully understand the relationships between the owners of the Properzi Way buildings and their relationship to the neighborhood as a whole. The City Clerk’s records of Births, Deaths and Marriages may shed more light on the relationships of the owners to each other.

Abby Freedman made a motion, seconded by **Ryan Falvey** to determine 92 Properzi Way to be significant as a worker-owned cottage that (Criteria B)

Is at least 50 years old, and is or has been determined by the Commission to be a significant building or structure after a finding that the building or structure is either:

- i. *Importantly associated with one or more historic persons or events, or with the broad architectural, cultural, political, economic or social history of the City or the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, or*
- ii. *Historically or architecturally significant (in terms of period, style, method of building construction, or association with a reputed architect or builder) either by itself or in the context of a group of buildings or structures, and therefore it is in the public interest to be preserved or rehabilitated rather than to be demolished.*

The Commission voted unanimously (5-0) to determine the building ‘significant’.

DEMOLITION UPDATES: Buildings at the following addresses have recently come to the attention of the Staff:

HPC 07.66 D - 23 Milton Street Carriage House

11/5/08

Owner: Eden Frye

Staff received voicemail from Eden Frye saying that because she would have to start the process all over, she and the other owners have decided to continue with the carriage house alterations and reconstruction despite the unsympathetic changes it would entail.

DEMOLITIONS REVIEWED BY THE STAFF

HPC 08.82 D – 205 Broadway – Service Station Canopy - 1973

Owner: Maurice Haddad

Determination of Significance:	Not significant (less than 50 years old)	12/15/08
Notification of Application for Demolition of Structures:		12/04/08
Demolition Notification Signed		12/15/08

CERTIFICATES OF NON-APPLICABILITY ISSUED BY THE STAFF

HPC 08.77 – 61 Atherton Street

11/21/08

Applicants: Jane Gillooly and Ken Winokur, New Owners

1. Renovate interior;
2. Install insulation;
3. Repair windows;
4. Install storm windows;
5. Repair slate roof and wood gutters;
6. Repoint chimney; and
7. Repair and replace siding in-kind.

HPC#08.79 –58-60 Bow Street, 365-377 Somerville Avenue (Drouet Block)

12/01/08

Applicant: Pat Duncan, contractor for Greater Boston Properties, building management for the Gerrior Square Condominium Trust

1. Remove existing drip edge and 1st course of clapboards along 1st floor frieze;
2. Install rubber membrane flashing;
3. Install new mill finish drip edge; and
4. Replace clapboards

SECTION 106/NEPA/MEPA REVIEWS PERFORMED BY STAFF

No adverse effect found to historic properties

HPC 08.73 - 114 Highland Avenue (Highland Gardens) – 1975

11/17/08

Somerville Housing Authority

HPC 08.74 - 252 Medford Street (Brady Towers) - 1994

11/17/08

Somerville Housing Authority

HPC 08.75 - 15 Weston Avenue (Weston Manor) - 1996

11/17/08

Somerville Housing Authority

HPC 08.76 - Mystic Avenue and Memorial Road – 6 buildings circa 1954 with alterations

11/17/08

Somerville Housing Authority

REVIEWS AND COMMENTS PERFORMED BY STAFF PER REQUEST OF THE PLANNING BOARD

None this month.

OTHER BUSINESS AND PROJECT UPDATES

• **Grant-related Projects**

▪ **ArtsUnion Grant Update:**

- MCC Grant review meeting Report – Brandon
- “Union Square Revisited: Sand Pit to Melting Pot” – Walking tour brochure update—Abby Luthin will be editing and condensing.

Somerville City Hall, 93 Highland Avenue. Somerville, Massachusetts 02143

(617) 625-6600, Ext.2500. TTY: (617) 666-0001. Fax: (617) 625-0722

www.ci.somerville.ma.us

- **Milk Row Cemetery Phase II Project Update** – Brandon & Barbara
- **Local Historic Districts Expansion Project Update** – Brandon & Kristi
 - *Brandon has completed Group A and hopes to have Group B Report complete by the end of the year.*
- **West Branch Library ADA Compliance Feasibility Study** – Brandon
- **Union Square Re-zoning Update** – Abby
- **Union Square Commercial /Historic District Expansion** – Brandon, Abby & Kristi
 - *Subcommittee has reviewed several properties.*
 - *Abby has put together the list of properties discussed.*
- **Permit Streamlining Committee Update** – Kevin & Brandon
 - Review of discussion points at last/December meeting.
- **Upcoming Events or Reports on Recently Past Events**
 - **Flag Raising on Prospect Hill on Thurs. January 1st, 2009** – Brandon
 - Event planning underway volunteers to help publicize needed! Contact Brandon for details.
 - **Somerville, MA: A Brief History - Brandon**
 - Consider for holiday gifts! All profits support heritage education projects in City.
 - **2009 Preservation Awards Program Status Report – Kristi and Brandon**
 - *Kristi to have lists and routing map ready for subcommittee review in January*
 - *Subcommittee to meet 1/11/09 at Abby's house at 1:00pm. Tour will continue until dark or all houses viewed for evaluation*
 - **SHPC Membership Update – Brandon**

Meeting schedule for 2009: January 20, February 17, March 17, April 21, May 19, June 16, July 21, August 18, September 15, October 20, November 17, and December 15.