A Rack of Reviews

Karl J. Franklin

Pike Center
for INTEGRATIVE
SCHOLARSHIP

A Rack of Reviews

Karl J. Franklin

This book is for sale at http://leanpub.com/arackofreviews

This version was published on 2017-10-25

Pike Center for Integrative Scholarship is an initiative of SIL International that builds capacity for language development through scholarship. Our Agile Publishing program uses the Lean Publishing platform to incubate in-progress ebooks using lightweight automated tools. These tools are placed in the hands of our scholars so that they can iterate and act on reader feedback to improve their work. Many of our titles are works in progress that are not yet ready for conventional publishing, but nonetheless have content that is worth sharing in its current state.

Contents

Preface

Reading books has been a life-long passion of mine. When I was about 12 years old I remember once hiding in my house and reading a book when I was supposed to be helping with farm chores. But reading books was not unusual at our house: books were everywhere because my father and mother were also rabid readers.

However, remembering what is/was in the books has not been as easy. I have undoubtedly read thousands of books and articles throughout my life, especially those I had to read in college, graduate schools and in my vocation, but I can't remember many without help.

In graduate school I kept track of what I read by summarizing the contents on 5 x 7 index cards, all of which have long since been discarded. It was before the days of computers, so they were handwritten. I probably should have kept them, but I developed another habit early in life—throwing things away that took up too much space, including notes, letters and cards.

Typing up my notes helped, but the contents of the notebooks are bulky and I confess that I have boxes of language materials in our garage that should probably be thrown away.

To some degree, computers and their storage modes have helped, but I have gone through several to save my writings: using cassettes, disks, thumb drives, and so on. Now a major problem is how to find what I want in my hundreds of folders and thousands of files. Although I am assisted with programs that index and search my computer, disks and drives, I often spend an inordinate amount of time looking for things.

Nevertheless, for the last several years I have been writing reviews of the books I read and that seemed worthwhile, then storing my writings in a folder called "reviews". I have also published a number or put some of them on my website (http://karlfranklin.com).

This book conatains a fair sampling, but by no means all, of my reviews. I have divided them into a number of categories, each serving as a chapter, such as linguistics and language, anthropology and folklore, orality, religion, biblical studies, biography, including autobiographies, and so on. There is, of course, overlap and sometimes a review in one section could have just as well been put in another.

The final chapter is a list of my published reviews and where they can be found and, in some cases, I have included them in this book. My collection has proved invaluable to me as a way of remembering what I've learned through reading. I hope what I have here will also be helpful to others as well.

My sincere thanks to Gary Simons for assistance in setting up these chapters and files.

1. Linguistics and Language

1.1 Chafe on Discourse

> Chafe, Wallace. 1994. *Discourse, consciousness, and time: The flow and displacement of conscious experience in speaking and writing.* Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

The picture on Chafe's book is symbolic: Two men, dressed from an earlier century are standing on a rock outcrop above a canyon, with a stream below and wooded hills beyond. They are in conscious discourse, out of context spatially and temporally, and yet the scenery has not changed perceptibly over the generations. The picture is a reminder of Chafe's contention that "The twentieth century has focused its attention on matters quite remote from relationships between language, consciousness, and time." He believes that we must "restore conscious experience to the central role it enjoyed in the human sciences a hundred years ago."(4)

Given this perspective, Chafe's book deals with two main aspects of discourse, its flow on the one hand and its displacement on the other. Each is treated in a series of chapters. But prior to this, Chafe sets the background to his study by reviewing the nature of understanding, which encompasses language, memory, and the imagination. Understanding deals with observation (data), and schemas (theories). He notes that "[much of] contemporary linguistics has focused on the construction of elaborate theories invented for the understanding of minuscule and questionable observations." (11) By dividing observations into Public versus Private (also objective and subjective, but he is not claiming that one is more real or scientific than the other) he contends that any study of discourse is equally dependent on introspective insights.

Public and private observations can be manipulated or they may be natural. Examples of the former are experimentation and elicitation or, in the case of private observations, semantic judgments, ones about how to construct language. Natural

observations, on the other hand, are public in the case of ethnography and corpus based research, or day-dreaming and literary when they are private.

As a further preliminary, Chafe discusses the nature of consciousness, including the philosophical question of how consciousness can observe itself. In his terms it has a focus, it is embedded in a surrounding area of peripheral consciousness, and it is dynamic. (Or, in Pike's framework consciousness could be described as a particle, part of a field, or constituting a wave.) There are, according to Chafe, five properties of consciousness: 1) it's source or experience; 2) context which allows remembering or imagining; 3) deciding whether it is fact or fiction; 4) noting if it is interesting or reinforcing; and, finally, 5) is it verbal or nonverbal. Chafe is also vitally interested in the difference between speaking and writing as conditions under which language is produced, as well as thinking as a third mode. He discusses the differences of each and contrasts the modes and attitudes associated with speaking and writing.

What does Chafe consider as the "flow" of discourse? First and foremost, it includes intonation units, perhaps a "biological necessity" (57), with features of fundamental frequency, duration, intensity, vocalization and voice quality. The function of the intonation unit is to verbalize the information, so it is not surprising that the unit often looks most like a clause. Information in the unit may be active, semi-active, or inactive, all representing states in the mind of the speaker. There is a certain "cost" in providing the information, for example in linguistic terms the speaker can choose between full NPs in the unit or pronominalizations.

The grammatical Subject is the starting point in a discourse, with all other information added to it. Chafe speaks of identificability and "definiteness" where information in the discourse is shared, verbalized, or contextually salient. Because Subjects are nearly always identifiable they function most often as the starting point. In his analysis the introductory unit is limited to one new idea, except for certain quantifiers, numerals, or intensifiers.

SIL students who have studied under Longacre will see many similarities with Chafe, including the idea of discourse topics. These are chunks larger than intonation units (i.e. clauses) and have topics which include one referent with a "point of view". Chafe discusses the universal versus culturally determined properties of a discourse schema, which includes orientation, complication, climax, denouement, and coda. Again, compare with Longacre.

Chafe applies his schema on discourse to Seneca, which he knows well. He finds that words in Seneca contain more information than in English, so that the intonation

unit in Seneca is about half the length of English. In Seneca the pronouns function as core participants and distinguish the Agent and Patient, rather than the Subject or non-Subject, as in English. There is also no Subjecthood as a starting point, although the one new idea constraint holds in Seneca. There the definite article identifies, but can also nominalize, events and states. In Seneca the word order depends on newsworthiness of the referent and, if such, it precedes the V. Chafe also makes some observations on Seneca music and relates it to his observations on discourse.

Chapter 13 appears to be an academic aside, an overview on "alternative approaches to information flow," and is created with observations from the works of Firbas, Halliday, Clark and Haviland, Prince, and Givon.

The third and final part of the book discusses what Chafe calls "displacement". It begins by examining the nature of immediate and displaced consciousness in conversational language. To account for this Chafe distinguishes between what he calls introverted ideas, that is those which are remembered and imagined, and extroverted ideas, those which are perceived, acted upon, and evaluated in the consciousness.

Chafe also contrasts overt speech with overt thought, although both have "referred-to" speech, indirect speech and direct speech. Inner speech or thought has dimensions which are not parallel to overt speech, such as pseudo-indirect thought, thought, and the possibility of pretending. Chafe discusses how writing, particularly fiction, fosters creativity and how tense is used to "establish displaced immediacy." (236) He illustrates his points by examining the fiction of authors such as a Stephen Crane, Eudora Welty and Nathaniel Hawthorne and the non-fiction of personal letters, autobiography and expository writing. Chafe's interest in displacement and flow also leads him to comment on written paragraphs and discourse topics and their relationship. His conclusion is "that paragraphs constitute a variable rather than a cognitively determined resource, one that can be manipulated by writers for diverse effects." (300)

We conclude by noting that Chafe has taken introspection seriously and that his insights on discourse are therefore quite different from linguists who stick mainly to the overt manifestations of speech. He is not interested in the manipulation of abstract constituent structures, which is often the main concern of syntax today. Applying his work on discourse can also provide a basis to stimulate translators to take advantage of the rich imaginative consciousness that native speakers bring to the translation table.

The book can serve SIL courses or workshops as a supplemental reading on discourse. Chafe's proposed model is of course incomplete, in that it includes dimensions of discourse that lie behind overt structure. It is not intended to outline discourse mechanics for the reader, but it is a valuable and stimulation contribution on most aspects of discourse. You will not be disappointed if you read it.

2. Explorations

2.1 Chatterton on Papua

Chatterton, Percy. 1974. *Day that I have loved: Percy Chatterton's Papua.* Illustrations by Bert Brown. Foreword by Stuart Inder. Sydney: Pacific Publications.

Hanuabada is the closest Motu village to Port Moresby. Captain John Moresby had anchored near their in 1873 and later the same year Cook Island pastors and their wives settled at Hanuabada–the next year Rev. W.G. Lawes and wife and young son joined the Cook Islanders. In 1884 the Union Jack was raised at the village and Papua became a British Protectorate. Opposite the village in a nearby harbor Port Moresby grew up. The Lieutenant-Governor at the time was Sir Hubert Murray.

Chatterton and his wife arrived at Port Moresby in 1924. He learned Motu and often translated for the government officers. Some early ordinances were that the "natives" had to wear clothes on the upper parts of their bodies. He wondered if he was doing the right thing in teaching the young people to read and write, particularly when one forged the name of his employer and ended up in jail. VIPs from Government House often visited his school, to which they gave "benign approval" The system of village constables (VCs) was in place, each of whom had a badge and certain services that they rendered. However village councilors eventually took their place. Chatterton says that even in pre-War years "self-government in the church at village level was very real" (28); He notes that when the village men were willing to teach children certain traditional dances, it meant that they no longer took them very seriously themselves;

Sixty miles NW of POM and across from Yule Island, the headquarters of the RC mission of the Sacred Heart, was the village of Delena. First contact with the area was in 1846 by a Lieutenant Yule, who visited Hall Sound after raising the flag on Cape Possession. In 1871 LMS missionary Samuel McFarland visited Yule Island, intending to establish a mission station there with Cook Island pastors. Chalmers later decided

on the mainland and over the next 75 years there were only four missionaries there, including Chatterton and his wife who began their work in 1939. From Delena he established and visited various stations throughout the area. Later the vernacular was allowed in the curriculum for "English had become a cargo cult…it was [as] though [there] were secret words of power" in it (51). In late 1942 signal station was established at Delena and in 1949 the first-ever visit of the Governor-General of Australia took place.

On the outskirts of POM lies Koke, where Chattertons established a church and a residence. They had left Delena and Chatterton notes (82) "Meanwhile the mispronunciations of indigenous names by expatriates goes on apace, all the way from the works supervisor shouting abuse at his labourers, to university dons introducing graduands to the Chancellor on graduation day."

In 1968 LMS was combined with the United Methodist church, but "I myself think that it was a mistake….all too often [it] means that the 'uniting' churches agree to use the same words and mean different things by them" (87). Comments on illicit drinking and the use of a 'kava-like' brew in the Western District and that "beer is here to stay; and the young nationalists who advocate a return to the Melanesian way of life and clamour for the rejection of customs

Chattertons moved their new home in 1972. However, Mrs Chatterton lived only a few months and then had to be cared for in the POM hospital. In March 1972 the UPNG conferred an honorary doctorate on him. He concluded his acceptance by saying: "The happiness we have found among the people of this land is in itself ample rewrd for anything we may have been able to do for them" (127).

This book of personal recollections was written by a veteran London Missionary Society missionary (LMS), educator, and politician. Chatterton (1898-1984) and his wife began their work in "Papua" in 1924 and continued in the country until they died. The LMS was inter-denominational and a missionary outlet for the congregation churches of Britain, Australia and NZ (27). Other helpful comments that relate to Chatterton are in the essay "Papua: Maybe old Percy was right after all" by Philip Fitzpatrick at: [http://asopa.typepad.com/asopa_people/2010/12/papua.

Chatterton translated the Hiri Bible, wrote a dictionary and a book to help others learn Motu. I don't think I ever met him but I did work with Bert Brown in the early 1970s. He was then living at Hanuabada at the LMS compound. Bert had a book written about him as well but, as far as I know, it was never published.

3. Orality

3.1 Esolen on Children's Imagination

> Esolen, Anthony. 2010. *Ten ways to destroy the imagination of your child.* Wilmington, DL: ISI.

Professor Esolen has a Ph.D. from the University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill (1987) where his dissertation was "A Rhetoric of Spenserian Irony." He teaches Renaissance English Literature and the Development of Western Civilization at Providence College, so it should come of no surprise that he loves old books and literature and draws from there most of his illustrations about killing imagination. He speaks frequently on Dante, on translation (or the translator's art), on Christian literature and art, and on contemporary issues surrounding culture and faith (his web page is at: http://www.anthonyesolen.com.

Esolen does not claim that his "ten ways" is an exhaustive list, but wryly notes "I am sure that a judicious application of even three or four of these methods will suffice to kill the imagination of an Einstein, a Beethoven, a Dante, or a Michelangelo" (xiii)

Despite the erudite nature of the books and articles cited, Esolen has a fine sense of humor. When commenting on the need for children to develop their memories, he says "Adults scoff at remembering things because they have–so they say–the higher tools of reason at their disposal" (13). Esolen suspects that such higher reasoning includes items like where to get lunch and who will buy the dog license.

Esolen likens the lack of imagination to the "Jellyfish Theory of Imagination," because in the land of the jellyfish there are no skeletons (no overarching structure to make sense of subjects like history or geography), so although the citizens can tell one jellyfish from another, they look exactly alike to us (15). Without knowing the structure of language, a writer like Tolkien would never have been able to imagine the Middle Earth and all that took place in it.

The first method to destroy a child's imagination is to "Keep your Children Indoors as Much as Possible." (27). Esolen recounts some of his childhood activities, which mainly occurred outdoors. Today children study inside of walls and their lives and so-called activities remain behind walls, so their imaginations do not focus upon nature, but rather on billboards and TV advertisements. "Not everyone is a poet, yet children come uneasily near to it in their natural fascination with anything at all" (37). One way to neutralize this is to keep them in parks and zoos and then act like "only the parks and zoos" are worth seeing. Esolen notes that many people in our bureaucracies have never been pestered with imagination. "Our universities are filled with them" (40). If we leave children to their imaginations they may develop into people who don't obey, such that "they will not buy what marketers want them to buy" (44). In this chapter Esolen's observations are interspersed with illustrations from writers like Virginia Woof, Mark Twain, Milton, and many others. He weaves into them his knowledge of classical literature easily and endlessly.

The second rule is to "Never Leave Children to Themselves" (47). They might improvise and play some games, change the rules a bit, ignoring the bureaucratic shackles that Esolen calls "Tormentaria". Instead, children must be looked after by paid professionals who know how to treat them nicely, feed and nap them regularly, allowing them just enough scheduled things "to keep them from rusting solid" (49). Even competition must be scheduled so that there are no real losers. The Tormentarians define learning in a new way so that a child may learn to spell SKY, but will not be tempted to look up. And at home, children will sleep there, but hardly live there. Instead they will be "crated and uncrated in one place every day, and hardly ever a single one lost" (52). Esolen compares one of his fictitious Tormentarian Saturdays with one of his baseball heroes, Stan Musial. Whereas Musial gobbled down breakfast, did some chores, and then disappeared with his buddies, only to reappear and gobble down supper before listening to the radio and doing some more chores before bedtime, Tormentarian children gobble down breakfast an hour later, are driven to soccer, driven to a fast food lunch, are driven home for video games and TV, with barely time to complain about dinner or pretend to do some homework while chatting with their friends on internet. They get to bed late and haven't been subjected to the dangers of an outside adventure or organizing their own games. Esolen returns to the adventures of Huck Finn and Tom Sawyer to describe such dangers. He says we prefer children who have no experience with animals, no practical skills, can't follow a trail or cook a meal and, what is more,

don't desire to do any of these things.

The third principle is to "Keep Children Away from Machines and Machinists or All Unauthorized Personnel Prohibited" (71). Experimenting and fooling around with machines, even building them, aids ingenuity, so that children do not end up "unable to change a doorknob" (75). The wisest thing is to "keep them away from adults who know how to do things" (76). Esolen comments on the values of apprenticeships, making friends with craftsmen and finding a kind of work "which is hard to distinguish from play" (86). Today arts and crafts are often for decoration, not to foster imagination. There is to be no hunting or raising animals where children may chance upon "an imaginative encounter with the natural world" (92).

Another way to stifle the imagination of children is to "Replace the Fairy Tale with Political Cliches and Fads" (95). "If you do not want a child to paint, you take away his palette," (97) and if you don't want him to have imagination you take away the narratives that might encourage one. "You turn all stories into a bald, beaten sales pitch, preferably a political pitch" (99). They no longer read about magic lamps but rather about propaganda for homosexual rights. Reading then becomes adopting the correct political message (108) and the reduction of people to "politically motivated cartoon figures" with history a comic book story (111).

The fifth assault upon children's memories is to "Cast Aspersions Upon the Heroic and Patriotic" (117). Esolen is adamant in his claim that we teach children not honor their country or their father and mother. He refers again to Tolkien and the imaginary scenes in Middle Earth to illustrate tales from an imaginary world that show honor and love for parents and country. In this chapter he also quotes from the works of William Butler Yeats, Shakespeare, Flannery O'Conner and classic scholars to provide a context for the concepts of loyalty and beauty.

The sixth method to belittle a child's imagination is to "Cut All Heroes Down to Size" (141), in fact reducing life to "a calculation of profit and loss" (144). Esolen warns that a "hero…is like a pack of dynamite, ready to blow any mountain of heaped-up conformity and dullness sky high" (146). He notes that the battlefield is the place where heroes show their courage and that the easy use of "self-serving pacifism" will belittle the ideals of the military. He refers to C.S. Lewis and his essay "Men without Chests" as the example of men without courage, generosity and courage (148). Those who go off to war are not virtuous, as we claim from our own "warm cocoon of safety" (149). "We choose not people who make peace, but people who talk about it a lot, preferably from a position of comfort" (151). We encourage flippancy

and "the habit of sneering at what is great or noble" (153).

A seventh method is to "Reduce All Talk of Love to Narcissism and Sex" (163) and eventually with television and "pictures in a state of undress… the only mysteries remaining will be the cruel, the bizarre, and the disgusting" (168). Instead of understanding the passage of a girl to a woman, from being a child to childbearing, everything "is reduced to twaddle and giggles" (174). Children's responsibilities to their bodies disappear and chaste love before marriage is vilified (176).

It follows that the next method is to "Level Distinctions Between Man and Woman or Spay and Geld" (179). "If …the imagination is essential to genuine humanity, and if that imagination is kindled by the strangeness of one sex to the other, then anything we do to blunt a child's humanity will probably also blunt his sense of wonder for the opposite sex" (182). To Esolen, committee work is counterproductive because it brings children to the least common denominator of what is acceptable to everyone (188). Words like "manhood" and "womanhood" are to be avoided because such notions will make children think of a particular man or woman, their behaviors and their virtues. Instead, the pictures that children get of men and women in popular culture, that is mass entertainment, will find the true man "a crazy mixture of steroid-exploding muscle mass, grunts, and a bad shave" (196).

The ninth method is to "Distract the Child with the Shallow and Unread or the Kingdom of Noise" (199). Milton wrote many of his poems when he was blind–he could not have "read" Paradise Lost. He dictated it to his daughter but "saw" the work in his mind. To him poetic imagination was hearing it instead of "curdling the imagination by stressing 'creativity' …The Muse comes to him" (200). That is why moments of silence and solitude are to be avoided and "Instead of music and the whisperings of the natural world, noise" (203). Esolen points out that TV shows are quick, disjointed, conversations are removed from reality with clever quips, the oafish husband is there, along with the snappy wife and snotty children. In the background is the bombastic music and, of course, lots of noise. Often the children are given comic books to read "with lots of noisy pictures and exclamation points" (207). Especially damaging are the "up-to-the-minute coverage of non-events, polling about polling, coverage about coverage, slogans about slogans, without pause" so that no one bothers to ask what is going on. (207) We end up regarding everything as noise, even people that we happen to meet. It seems that we prefer our bonds (216).

Finally, we should "Deny the Transcendent or Fix Above the Heads of Men the

Lowest Ceiling of All" (217). Esolen makes this point clear when hes says that "it is a grave mistake… to suppose that schools can or should be neutral with regard to the being of God" (223). Symbols and paintings show that the motive for art and worship are bound together–our heart seeks something beyond itself. We can look at expressions of art and drama and see the hand of God–people do not travel around the world "to look at a mural dedicated to Collaborative Learning or Development of Social Skills" (229). "Man is not only that creature that forges tools, that reasons, and that walks upright. Man is the creature that looks up. Man praises" (231).

Esolen is a master at presenting concerns of the imagination and how we need to think about them. He does it with wit and learning and it bodes well for any parent who will to listen to him. But there is more here than a lesson for parents and children. As missionaries and cross-cultural workers, we can apply his principles when we interact with people in other societies. We can begin by asking what we as Westerners believe is most important in our "work": Is it time? Efficiency? Bookkeeping? Computers and software? Although we proclaim that relationships are the most important, we insist on building most relationships around our values. We don't spend time in walking, feasting, trading, weaving, hunting, fishing, farming, or just sitting, all activities that can provide a type and style of imagination that eludes our concept of reason and our end goals. Probably we should.

And what about our style of training? There is so much that we know and we want to make sure that our students get all of it. There isn't much time for sitting around debating and discussing issues. We will tell our students facts because we deal with reality, not imagination. But suppose that–once in a while–you have an opportunity to talk with students in a different way. Imagine that you, the professor, are outside, sitting down with several students. No powerpoint, no computer, no smart phone. Just air and sunshine. You are telling stories about your language and life–teaching while the students are imagining.

I was with Ken Pike once when he did this in Lae, PNG. We were at the home of a lawyer who had invited a number of students from the local university to meet Dr Pike. Pike sat on the floor with the students and he told stories–of Mexico, language, his struggles, his life. The students never forgot it–they imagined the scenes with him. Here was a distinguished professor who was not discussing theory, not even current TV shows, sports, or politics. He was telling his stories and God was the featured, even if background, character.