An Exploration into Comparing WBCs and their Performance

May 1, 2015

Prepared by students of Carnegie Mellon’s Heinz College of Public Policy:
Roxanna Cisneros, Nichole Hoeflich, John Lira, Cory Misley,
Yalan Qin & Natalie Sabadish
AGENDA

- Introductions
- Background
- Project Objectives
- Project Methodology
- Results
- Recommendations
TEAM MEMBERS

Natalie Sabadish
Nichole Hoeflich
Cory Misley
John Lira
Roxanna Cisneros
Yalan Qin
ADVISORY BOARD MEMBERS

Thu Stubbs
CEO and Owner
Technology Science Corporation

Dr. Monique Morrisey
Economist
Economic Policy Institute

Marshall Contino
Program Manager
Booz Allen Hamilton

Antonella Pianalto
Acting Executive Director
Association of Women’s Business Centers

Eleanor “Ellie” Thornton
President and CEO
Visionary Consulting Partners, LLC
BACKGROUND

The Clients:

Office of Women’s Business Ownership (OWBO)  National Women’s Business Council (NWBC)
BACKGROUND

- 105 Women’s Business Centers (WBCs)
- WBCs provide training and counseling for entrepreneurs and women business owners to support them in starting and growing small businesses.
PROJECT OBJECTIVES

The Research Questions

- How can the SBA’s OWBO & NWBC define performance at WBCs?
- What factors contribute to the performance of WBCs focusing on the interactions with other local organizations, resources & economic conditions?
PROJECT OBJECTIVES

Project Goals

- To achieve a better understanding of the internal and external factors that influence the capabilities and performance of WBCs;

- To provide guidance that will assist OWBO in future decision making for WBCs regarding grant language, support offered to new WBCs, and additional services for existing WBCs.
PROJECT METHODOLOGY

Logical Flow of Project

- Data Gathering
- Data Analysis
- Data Synthesis
- Survey & Interviews
- WBC Spotlights
- Results & Recommendations
PROJECT METHODOLOGY

DATA COLLECTION

**Internal Data Sources**
- **Source**: SBA’s Office of Women’s Business Ownership (OWBO)
- **Data Collected**: contact information, demographic information, and performance measures.

**External Data Sources**
- **Source**: a variety of public sources, mostly federal government agencies
- **Data Collected**: unemployment rate, employment, small business tax climate, median income, education level, population by gender, local colleges/universities, existence of other business assistance programs, local chambers of commerce, access to capital, fair market rent, family budget

**Primary Data Sources**
- **Source**: WBC Directors Survey & Interviews
- **Data Collected**: service population, performance measures, basic WBC information; WBC history, host structure & cohort characteristics, program services, funding, resource partnerships
PROJECT METHODOLOGY

DATA CHALLENGES

**Internal Data**
- Missing values
- Inconsistent reporting of internal performance measures

**External Data**
- Limited to larger geographic areas
- Variable data years

**Primary Data**
- Inconsistent and incomplete survey responses
- Wide range of responses to open-ended questions
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td><strong>Choose WBC from drop-down menu below:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td><strong>TN-1093- Bright Bridge WBC</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td><strong>TN-1093- Bright Bridge WBC</strong></td>
<td><strong>TN-1094- Nashville WBC/Southeast Community Capital Corporation/Path</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td><strong>TN-1095- BiGAUSTIN Women’s Business Center</strong></td>
<td><strong>TX-1096- RGV Women’s Business Center</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td><strong>TX-1097- Women’s Business Border Center</strong></td>
<td><strong>TX-1098- Houston-Galveston Women’s Business Center</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td><strong>TX-1099- ACCION Women’s Business Center</strong></td>
<td><strong>UT-1100- The Women’s Business Center</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td><strong>Chattanooga, TN 37403</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**DATABASE SCREENSHOTS**

**Contact Information**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name &amp; Address</th>
<th>Director</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bright Bridge WRC</td>
<td>Mary Salmeti</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>530 Chestnut Street, Suite 100</td>
<td><a href="mailto:mgs@brightbridgewrc.org">mgs@brightbridgewrc.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chattanooga, TN 37405</td>
<td>423-624-2109</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Website:**
http://www.brightbridgewrc.org/

**Demographics Information**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year Founded</th>
<th>Age of Client</th>
<th>WBC Region</th>
<th>DOOR</th>
<th>WBC Clinic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>401</td>
<td>Nashville</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Chattanooga, TN-CA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Data Highlights**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>External</th>
<th>Performance</th>
<th>Survey</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Population:</strong> 150,287</td>
<td><strong>Total clients served:</strong> 120</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of clients served: 10</td>
<td>Non-sustaining: item needed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median household income: $50,742</td>
<td>Total clients served: 120</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family budget for a 4-person family: $24,467</td>
<td>Share of clients that are women: 31.1%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Share of women with bachelor's degree or higher: 74%</td>
<td>New business starts: 5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployment rate: 7.6%</td>
<td>Access to capital: 80</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Please see the Notes & Sources sheet for all sourcing information, data years, and assumptions.
PROJECT METHODOLOGY

DATA ANALYSIS

Population Analysis
Cohort Identification
Survey Results
Interview Spotlights
WBC POPULATION ANALYSIS

Total Clients Served by Area type
- A majority of WBCs serve urban populations;
- WBCs serving urban populations have a higher average of total clients served

Average Age of WBCs
14 years old

90.1% WBCs have a Facebook account

Source: SBA OWBO
WBC POPULATION ANALYSIS

Average Total Clients Seen by Tenure of WBC directors

Average Total Clients Seen by Experience of WBC directors

Source: Survey results

Source: SBA OWIBO and Survey results
WBC POPULATION ANALYSIS

Technical Services Offered

- Webinars: 17.4%
- Online training and counseling: 15.1%
- Skype counseling: 12.8%
- Software and technology: 11.6%
- Web design: 8.1%
- Social media: 8.1%
- GoToMeeting: 7.0%
- QuickBooks workshops: 5.8%
- Ed2Go: 4.7%
- Google applications: 4.7%
- Excel: 3.5%

Source: SBA OWBO

Training Courses Offered

- Government Contracting Assistance: 73.5%
- Mentoring program: 64.3%
- Microloans: 45.9%
- ENCORE/Senior women: 37.8%
- International trade/ export: 33.7%
- Programs for youth/ young women: 25.5%
- Veteran-specific programs: 24.5%
- Manufacturing: 18.4%

Source: SBA OWBO
COHORT IDENTIFICATION

Factor Selection

Graph & Identify Outliers

Factor Analysis

Performance Composite Index

Six Cohorts
COHORT IDENTIFICATION

Step 1: Factor Selection:
Similar WBCs that share characteristics of two to three of chosen factors.

Step 2: Factor Analysis:
Hosted vs. Stand-Alone; Unemployment Rate; Population; Age of WBC

Step 3: Six Cohorts:
## Cohort Characteristics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cohort</th>
<th>Characteristics</th>
<th>Number of WBCs in cohort</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>High unemployment, population over 1 million, founded before 2010</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>High unemployment, population between 250,000 and 1 million, hosted</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Low unemployment, population less than 250,000, founded before 2010</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Founded after 2010, hosted</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Low unemployment, population between 250,000 and 1 million, hosted</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Founded before 2010, population between 250,000 and 1 million, stand-alone</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: SBA OWBO, BLS, and ACS
COHORT IDENTIFICATION

Step 4: Performance Composite Index

\[
\text{Total Performance Composite Index} = 4 \times \left[ \left( \frac{TCS_i}{\text{Avg}(TCS)} \right)^* \left( \frac{1}{n} \right) \right] + \left[ \left( \frac{NBS_i}{\text{Avg}(NBS)} \right)^* \left( \frac{1}{n} \right) \right] + \left[ \left( \frac{ATC_i}{\text{Avg}(ATC)} \right)^* \left( \frac{1}{n} \right) \right]
\]

*Where:* TCS = total clients served  
NBS = new business starts  
ATC = access to capital  
For n WBCs in each cohort
COHORT IDENTIFICATION

Step 5: Graph and Identify Outliers

Figure A2. Cohort 2 performance composite index

Source: SBA ONVBO, BLS, and ACS
## Non-Funding Resources

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Resource</th>
<th>Number of mentions</th>
<th>Share of total mentions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Technology and online support</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>35.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training and curriculum for clients</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>29.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing and promotion</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>20.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff support and training for WBCs</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>19.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Best practice and standardized resources for WBCs</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>16.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partnerships and collaboration</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>15.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Survey results
SURVEY RESULTS

Partnerships

Number of partnerships with WBCs

Source: Survey results
ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AGENCY PARTNERSHIPS

National
- Small Business Development Centers (SBDC)
- SCORE
- National Association of Women Business Owners (NAWBO)

Local
- Business improvement districts
- Community development centers
- Workforce development agencies
- Economic development councils
INTERVIEW SPOTLIGHTS

1. BrightBridge Women’s Business Center
   Chattanooga, TN

2. Denver Women’s Business Center
   Denver, CO

3. Entrepreneurial Center University of Hartford
   Hartford, CT

4. Queens Women’s Business Center
   Queens, NY

5. WBC at Old Dominion University
   Norfolk, VA

6. Women Business Partners Program
   San Luis Obispo, CA

7. Wyoming Women’s Business Center
   Laramie, WY
INTERVIEW RESULTS

- **Data Collection**
  - WBCs interpret and report data inconsistently
  - Only counts businesses started and jobs created that result from counseling
  - Difficult to use/time consuming, and doesn’t capture the full impact of their work

- **Association of Women’s Business Centers (AWBC)**
  - In general, positive interactions with the AWBC and benefits their work
  - WBCs would welcome more interaction and networking opportunities

- **General Support**
  - More support for new WBCs and WBC director transitions
  - Facilitate sharing of best practices
RECOMMENDATIONS

Data Collection Strategies

Performance Assessment Techniques

Programmatic Changes
RECOMMENDATIONS

Data Collection Strategies
1. Standardize data collection procedures and provide clarification of data reporting definitions and statistics.
2. Revise the EDMIS data collection tool in order to better capture the full impact of WBCs.
3. Track additional performance and demographic metrics.
RECOMMENDATIONS

Performance Assessment Techniques

1. Implement the cohort identification process discussed in the report with other defining factors, potentially leading to an alternate comparison analysis.

2. Research alternative performance comparison frameworks to apply to the WBC network.

3. Incentivize WBCs to use more program evaluation techniques.
RECOMMENDATIONS

Programmatic Changes

1. Expand resources and curriculum made available to new WBCs and during transitions between WBC directors.

2. Provide enriched opportunities for WBCs to engage in sharing best practices.

3. Offer a centralized database of automated templates and resources.

4. Increase technological software and hardware updates available to WBCs.
Q & A
CONCLUSION

Project Deliverables:

- Comprehensive database with summary sheet highlighting key information for each WBC
- Raw survey data files on 81 survey respondents
- Audio files of 7 calls with WBC directors
- A series of recommendations to provide guidance on future decision making for WBC grant language, support offered to new WBCs, and adjustments to resources provided to existing WBCs
THANK YOU!