Marbury v. Madison / Who Should Decide?

Directions: Read the scenario below and answer the Questions to Consider.

The United States Congress passes a law that says all citizens who were not born in this country must return to their country of birth within one month. The president signs the law and says he will have the armed forces help to enforce compliance.

Questions to Consider

1. In the United States, courts have the power to review decisions of other branches and determine their constitutionality, but the final power of judicial review rests with nine appointed justices on the Supreme Court. In England, the decisions of the highest court are subject to review by the legislature. Who is best suited to have this authority? Explain and defend your answer.

2. Is a workable system of government possible without judicial review? How would such a system be organized?

3. Do the people have any recourse in the scenario above? In other words, can anything be done about this? If so, what?

4. Does the fact that the Supreme Court currently has the power to review actions of the legislative and executive branches relieve these two branches of the obligation to review their own decisions to be certain they are constitutional?