HIGH STAKES TESTING IN K-12 SCHOOLS
AN ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY
TEACHERS AND TEACHING FOCUS

Introduction

This bibliography begins an ongoing effort to develop a resource for those interested in research on high stakes testing in K-12 schools. The bibliography is a work in progress, is not exhaustive, focuses primarily on empirical research, includes mostly references in the past decade, and includes multiple perspectives on the issues.

Feedback or suggestions for other entries (please send complete citation) for this bibliography should be sent to Sandra Mathison at smathison@louisville.edu.

Note: A number of people have contributed substantially to the preparation of this bibliography. They include Sandra Mathison, University of Louisville; Melissa Freeman, Kristen Wilcox, Lynee Sauer, University at Albany, SUNY. Preparation of this publication was supported under Grant # ESI-9911868 from the National Science Foundation. The contents do not necessarily reflect the position or policies of NSF.

Bibliography


This study poses the questions: "What perceptions do teachers hold about mandated standards and related tests, and how do teachers make instructional decisions given these mandates?" 59 teachers from two states, one southern and one northern, are interviewed. Most of them are students in graduate literacy programs. Portions of interviews are included in this article and reflect teacher frustration related to current policies and assessment practices. Parents’ perceptions are also addressed in this study.

- Category: Teachers and Teaching
- Keywords: Teacher/parent perceptions; instructional decisions; accountability


The teacher-author discusses changes in her pedagogy—changes she refers to as "holistic teaching"—and how those changes have resulted in scoring improvements on the Texas Assessment of Academic Skills (TAAS). Bussert-Webb points out that her changes in teaching are an effort to reach the entire child—not to simply teach testing material.

- Category: Teachers and Teaching
- Keywords: TAAS; teaching to the test


The belief that state-mandated assessments drive teaching is widespread. Cimbricz conducts a review of the empirical literature to explore the relationship between state testing and teachers’ beliefs and practices. She found that while state-mandated testing does influence what teachers do, so do other factors suggesting that there is no consistent or predictable pattern of influence. Other factors influencing teachers’ work are teachers’ knowledge of a subject matter, their views on learning, their status in the school organization, and their personal philosophies of education. Cimbricz recommends further studies to better understand how teachers interpret and apply state mandates.

This study examines how test-based standards are affecting the teacher-learner relationship. 43 elementary and secondary teachers from three Middle Atlantic districts were interviewed on their perceptions of how these policies affect their work. Five effects are described: altered curriculum emphasis, teaching students how to take tests, having less time to teach, and feeling under pressure. Competency-based education, competency-based teacher certification, and testing for certification are discussed as well as appropriate teacher evaluation and accountability measures. The authors suggest drawing from the effective schools’ research to untangle the accountability dilemma.
of the test on students, teachers, and schools. Interviews of twenty survey respondents were conducted to gather in-depth data on teacher perceptions of the TAAS. The study found that high stakes testing has become the object rather than the measure of teaching and learning with negative side effects on curriculum, teacher decision-making, instruction, student learning, school climate and teacher and student self-concept and motivation.

- Category: Teachers and Teaching; Curriculum and Instruction
- Keywords: TAAS; at-risk students; student motivation; teacher motivation


There is considerable attention on defining higher standards for students but little is known about how teachers are responding to the challenge of helping their students meet them. This study uses focus group data collected over two years to explore how elementary and secondary New York State teachers are responding to the state mandated tests and perceive the state mandated changes. Three themes are discussed: the nature and content of the tests, the value of professional development opportunities to learn about the standards and tests, and the rationales for and consequences of the state tests.

- Category: Teachers and Teaching; Curriculum and Instruction
- Keywords: Teacher perception; professional development; elementary and secondary education


This study looks at the effects of standardized testing on teaching and learning processes in upper elementary classrooms in eleven districts in nine states. Survey responses received from 341 teachers on such items as the pressure teachers feel to improve test scores and the amount of time teachers spend on test preparation. The authors conclude that the presence of standardized testing has a substantial effect on the kinds of teaching and learning that goes on in schools especially in schools that serve low-SES students.

- Category: Teachers and Teaching; Student Achievement/ Special Populations; Curriculum and Instruction
- Keywords: Teacher attitudes; instructional practices; social class


Hilliard believes that quality, skilled teachers are being sidelined in favor of a high stakes testing curriculum. Hilliard contends that high standards in public education are important and necessary; however, he does not believe that high standards equate to high stakes. He argues that abuses of minorities and the poor, especially through the constructs of IQ and intelligence, are still very much alive in our culture. Also examined in this article are the effects of teacher certification testing—overwhelmingly teachers who score lower on certification tests are the teachers working in the poorest, lowest scoring districts.

- Category: Teachers and Teaching; Curriculum and Instruction
- Keywords: Intelligence; minorities; social class; teacher certification tests


This study examines the ways the Texas Assessment of Academic Skills (TAAS) has effected the practices of professional educators and whether the presence of high-stakes assessment was thought to threaten or compromise good teaching. The participants include teachers, curriculum supervisors, and reading specialists who are all members of the Texas State Reading Association (TSRA). A survey covering topics ranging from general attitudes, test preparation, to the effects of TAAS on students was sent to 750 participants. The analysis is based on the survey data from 200 returned surveys. The overall findings support other studies that report the negative effects of high-stakes testing on teaching and learning. Specific steps are offered to
recapture excellence in teaching and to challenge high-stakes reform efforts, especially with regards to reading.

- Category: Teachers and Teaching; Curriculum and Instruction
- Keywords: Texas; TAAS; reading assessment; negative effects


North Carolina’s ABCs of Public Education is outlined in this report. The focus is science reform and instruction in grades K-8. Also included is an overview of the words which define the acronym “ABC”: Accountability; Basic (subjects); and Control (of curriculum and instruction at the local level.) Rewards and punishments—the stakes—for teachers associated with the New ABCs are examined, as are issues of equity surrounding science education and issues of excellence. It is the belief of the authors that science educators, nationally, should take notice and take warning of the New ABC’s program.

- Category: Teachers and Teaching; Curriculum and Instruction
- Keywords: North Carolina; New ABCs of Public Education; rewards and punishments; equity and excellence


A survey was sent to 1,220 Maryland high school teachers on their attitudes toward the Maryland Writing Test. The authors conclude that overall (97%) teachers have favorable attitudes toward the test but that English language arts teachers place significantly more importance on the test than do teachers of mathematics, science, and social studies. Teachers generally agree, however, on characteristics they consider most important and least important suggesting that fairness is of prime importance to all high school Maryland teachers.

- Category: Teachers and Teaching
- Keywords: Maryland; Maryland Writing Test; high school; teachers’ attitudes


The public school system in North Carolina and their high-stakes testing environment are focused on in this piece. The focus of this plan is improving student performance through high stakes testing; school-based accountability (through a reward system); and increased local control. Researchers conducted a statewide survey of the opinions of teachers affected by this new legislation. The survey addresses how pedagogy has changed since the implementation of the latest reforms.

- Category: Teachers and Teaching; Curriculum and Instruction
- Keywords: North Carolina; accountability


Under the Kentucky Education Reform Act (KERA) schools are expected to achieve predetermined levels of improvement on state-mandated assessments or face sanctions. On the other hand, teachers who raise scores beyond the goal set by the state are eligible for financial rewards. This longitudinal study tracked the implementation of KERA in 20 Kentucky schools in four rural school districts from 1990-2000. School observations as well as open-ended interviews were used to gather how accountability measures were influencing school practices and how educators and parents perceived KERA. School effects were noticed such as more writing in classrooms and more use of open-response questions on classroom tests. Another
effect was the addition of an arts and humanities curriculum rarely covered in rural schools but assessed on the Kentucky Instructional Results Information System (KIRIS). However, the primary effect was that educators were more interested in bringing test scores up than in promoting higher level learning and that the use of rewards and punishments may have decreased rather than increased teacher motivation.

- **Category:** Teachers and Teaching; Curriculum and Instruction
- **Keywords:** Kentucky; KERA; KIRIS; teacher rewards; accountability measures; student achievement


Teachers are intrinsically involved in the high-stakes testing movement. Therefore, understanding how they perceive the high-stakes testing efforts and how they understand their role and the principal’s role in these efforts is important. In this study, 700 Virginia teachers were surveyed on their perceptions of the effects of high-stakes testing on teaching and learning. The results suggest that teachers have mixed feelings about the high-stakes testing movement. Teachers were more likely to show support for standards-based, high-stakes testing when instructional best practices exist, when assessment is built in to instruction, and when weaker students are given support and opportunities to learn. Teachers were less likely to support standards-based, high-stakes testing when they felt their leaders were ambivalent and/or when they valued more authentic learning experiences for students.

- **Category:** Curriculum and Instruction; Teachers and Teaching
- **Keywords:** Teachers’ perceptions; survey; Virginia


This study examines the impact of a direct writing assessment on two high school English classes. The Maryland Writing Test (MWT) has been a mandated graduation requirement since 1990. Through observations and interviews, this study examines how the test influences the teachers’ beliefs about writing instruction as well as their strategies for teaching writing. It also explores how students who did not pass the test respond to these instructional strategies. The authors conclude that an emphasis on the test minimizes teachers’ ability to respond effectively to individual students’ inability to understand the test questions and reinforce a narrow, limited writing curriculum.

- **Category:** Teachers and Teaching; Student Achievement/ Special Populations
- **Keywords:** Maryland; writing instruction; narrowing the curriculum


This study focuses on student teachers’ perceptions of test preparation practices used in schools, specifically in terms of the frequency and appropriateness of their use. Responses on close-ended questionnaires from 268 pre-service teachers are analyzed in terms of whether or not participants felt likely to use a particular strategy and whether they thought it was appropriate to do so. The authors found a strong correlation between the likelihood of use and the ethicalness of a strategy.

- **Category:** Teachers and Teaching
- **Keywords:** Pre-service teachers; score enhancing strategies; ethics

**Landman, J. (2000).** *A state-mandated curriculum, a high-stakes test: One Massachusetts high school history department's response to a very new policy context.* (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED440915)

This is a case study of one high school’s history department’s response to the new Massachusetts’ history and social studies standards and tests. Over a period of a year, several teachers and administrators were interviewed so that responses were given before and after test administration and before and after test score releases. The study describes the teachers and administrators responses and the changes implemented in the
Landman highlights the positive and negative consequences of the history department’s attempts to align their curriculum with the Massachusetts’ state standards.

- Category: Teachers and Teaching; Curriculum and Instruction
- Keywords: Massachusetts; MCAS; history; social studies; teacher perception; case study


This chapter is a comprehensive description of testing in schools and the power of testing to influence curriculum, teaching, and learning. A number of commonly used terms in discussions of high stakes testing are defined, including low and high stakes testing, norm and criterion referenced scores, internal and external testing programs. The current issues related to the impact of high stakes testing were anticipated by this descriptive and historical account.

- Category: Curriculum and Instruction; Teachers and Teaching
- Keywords: Impact of testing; reform; tests as administrative controls


A growing body of evidence suggests that assessment is a policy that allows officials at higher levels of government to exert leverage over what happens in classrooms. Negative consequences include a widening gap in opportunities available to different kinds of students, a narrowing of the skills and content taught, a centralization of educational decision-making, and a depprofessionalization of teachers. Policymakers rely on the same assessments for multiple purposes and fail to recognize the tension between informational or persuasive objectives of assessment policy and its regulatory or accountability uses. Strategies for amalgamating professional and political perspectives include recognition of the limits of assessment data as objective sources of information, attachment of capacity-building instruments to assessment policies, and deliberation in government.

- Category: Teachers and Teaching
- Keywords: Policy instruments; accountability; California; CLAS


This is a report of a study on the link between state-mandated assessments and teaching practices in Kentucky and North Carolina, two states implementing very different assessment approaches. In 1993-1994, data was gathered through personal and phone interviews with 139 teachers and administrators with follow-up interviews a year later with 60 of the initial participants. A daily log was also kept and collected by 23 teachers in each state to compare their instructional practices with desired state goals. The authors found that while the states had different goals, there was little difference in how the teachers in each state implemented those goals in their instructional practices. The authors concluded that the link between assessment and instruction is neither rapid nor uniform.

- Category: Teachers and Teaching; Curriculum and Instruction
- Keywords: Kentucky; North Carolina; teaching practices; curricular goals


Based on the premise that standardization reduces the quality and quantity of what is taught and what is learned in schools, this book traces the educational costs of reform on three Texas magnet schools. The impact of Governor Mark White’s decision to involve H. Ross Perot in educational reform is viewed through the “collateral damage” to students and teachers. Curricular content is trivialized and teachers are de-skilled
as a result of the emphasis on accountability, a “one-size-fits-all” approach, and a test-driven curriculum. While more and more students are passing the TAAS, fewer and fewer are actually reading. The gap between minority and privileged students widens. McNeil notes that Texas illustrates what can happen when good intentions, limited resources, and the desire for a quick fix intersect.

- Category: Curriculum and Instruction; Teachers and Teaching; Student Achievement/ Special Populations
- Keywords: Texas; TAAS; magnet schools; accountability; inequity; proficiency; minorities


This report focuses on one aspect of a larger study on the effects of the Arizona Student Assessment Program (ASAP) on teaching and learning. This paper looks specifically at the rationale and assumptions of including a performance-based test mandate in ASAP and its effects on teaching and learning. The authors conclude that there is an inherent contradiction between performance-based learning and assessment and mandated, behaviorist views of school reform that work against teachers developing the desired capacity and competence that the reform efforts are striving to achieve.

- Category: Teachers and Teaching; Curriculum and Instruction
- Keywords: Arizona; ASAP; performance-based assessment; cognitive-constructivist learning; mandates; professionalization of teachers


In this chapter, Paris first makes a distinction between formative and summative assessment. Formative assessments are usually connected to the curriculum and are used for diagnostic purposes to improve teaching and learning. Summative assessments are usually externally imposed and provide high-stakes measures for accountability. Paris believes that the emphasis on the latter is undermining good formative assessment practices in classrooms. Paris describes several unintended consequences of high-stakes’ assessment practices such as a narrowed curriculum, test pollution, and cheating. He then provides a series of recommendations for implementing learner-centered assessment practices that support and encourage student learning and motivation.

- Category: Curriculum and Instruction; Teachers and Teaching
- Keywords: Formative assessment; summative assessment; learner-centered teaching; portfolios; authentic assessment; test pollution; cheating


This paper examines the policies of some states incorporating high stakes testing programs. Of particular focus are the effects of high stakes testing patterns on teachers in certain states—how they perceive high stakes; how they prepare their students for testing; as well as how valid they believe high stakes testing to be. The paper also incorporates perspectives from administrators and parents. The authors believe there are serious problems with the current environment of high stakes, and they suggest policies that might minimize the negative consequences of testing, without getting rid of high stakes testing all together.

- Category: Teachers and Teaching; Curriculum and Instruction
- Keywords: Michigan; MEAP; negative consequences; Golden Apple awards


This is a case study of the impact of high-stakes assessment policies on the pedagogy of one fifth grade
teacher in a large, mid-western school district. Passman argues that high-stakes testing conflicts with good teaching and has "a chilling effect on the implementation of student-centered, constructivist practices in the classroom." He asks the question, "Who is benefiting?"


Teachers are the fundamental focus of this paper, but also of interest is if high stakes testing actually leads to better instruction and greater achievement. The study concentrates on four elementary schools, each with bilingual classrooms, that demonstrate “exemplary” performance on the TAAS. How those schools have developed and tailored reading programs to conform to the TAAS is also looked at. In addition, the author is specifically concerned with how the development of these programs has effected teachers. Sloan’s data suggests that teachers and administrators demonstrate a “continuous flow of conduct” regarding the TAAS. Further suggested is; “the way in which the structural elements were configured at these four schools as a result of TAAS did indeed preclude the teachers from acting otherwise.”


This article explores the effects of external testing programs on elementary schools’ curriculum and instruction. Based on extensive case studies in two elementary schools in one district in Arizona, Smith and Rottenberg outline some of the unintended consequences high stakes testing has on teaching and learning.


The Kentucky Education Reform Act (KERA) implemented in 1990 is often cited as a model that other states can learn from. These authors ask: “What lessons can be learned from Kentucky’s experiences?” The authors contend it is too early to determine if KIRIS has improved student learning. There are, however, certain unintended effects that require further research. KIRIS has jeopardized good teacher-student relationships; limited instructional practices; decreased teacher morals; and undermined the performance-based assessment approaches it was intended to promote.


This study examined the relationship between high-stakes testing and the teaching of science in 10 districts in British Columbia, Canada in regards to policy decisions at the district and school levels, teaching strategies in 8th, 10th, and 12th grades and the impact of high-stakes tests on curriculum and instruction. Data were obtained through classroom observations of 56 teachers in grades 8, 10, and 12 as well as through interviews of teachers, principals, district staff, and ministry officials. The authors concluded that high-stakes testing was leading teachers away from “exemplary” science teaching strategies by narrowing the range of
instructional practices offered in the classroom.

- Category: Curriculum and Instruction; Teachers and Teaching
- Keywords: Authentic; active learning; constructivism; secondary level education