

RESEARCH ARTICLE

A. L. Lloyd and Reynardine: Authenticity and Authorship in the Afterlife of a British Broadside Ballad

Stephen D. Winick

Abstract

This paper presents new evidence concerning the broadside ballad "Reynardine," which became popular in the British folksong revival movement of the 1960s and 1970s. It argues that the revival versions of this ballad were not products of the folk tradition, but rather descendants of a text authored by A. L. Lloyd, who was both a singer and a folksong scholar. The paper goes on to suggest reasons why Lloyd might have authored the ballad, and reasons why he might have concealed that authorship, placing its evidence and observations in the context of folkloristic concerns about authenticity and authorship, folklore and fakelore.

Introduction

In Regina Bendix's foundational study of the concept of authenticity in folklore studies, she points out a remarkable semantic reversal. "Authentic derives from the Greek *'Authentes,'*" she tells us, "which carries the dual meaning of 'one who acts with authority' and 'made by one's own hand'" (Bendix 1997, 14). Yet, "authentic" in folklore has usually meant the opposite: that which is made by no discernable hand, imbued with no individual's authority, because it has been re-made by the forces of impersonal tradition (Bendix 1997, 15). While "authentic" and "author" share an etymological root, authorial practices are usually taken to produce inauthentic folklore; Richard Dorson famously coined the word "fakelore" for materials created by authors and passed off as products of folk tradition (Dorson 1969).

Since Dorson, folklorists have undermined the dichotomy of folk versus fake, especially in the context of music revivals. In the 1960s and 1970s, many scholars were attracted to folklore through the folksong revival. This helped to change folkloristic notions of authenticity. Sheldon Posen, writing in 1976, pointed out that the folk revival was itself a social context in which performances could be considered authentic, if one adhered to its "norms, rules and values." Within this community, he noted, even songs sung in fake English accents were authentic, because singers were expected to sing them that way. Nothing, in other words, is "inauthentic," except perhaps the most flagrant dishonesty (Posen 1993, 135).

In the past twenty years, following the volume by Hobsbawm and Ranger (1983), "the invention of tradition" has become a central concern in the study of culture. Folk music revivals, as Neil Rosenberg points out, do not so much

invent traditions as transform them (Rosenberg 1993, 20), but the result is similar: people claim that expressive behaviours are old, when they are really quite new. Aesthetics, musical practices, and individual songs and tunes are transformed by revivalist forces. The extent to which they remain “authentic” may vary with the observer’s theoretical outlook. Many would see ballads authored by revivalist singers as less authentic than those collected from oral tradition, others would locate their authenticity in their connection to their respective communities, while still others would reject the notion of authenticity entirely.

Bendix suggests that folklore’s historical orientation toward separating the authentic from the inauthentic is counterproductive in that it marginalises the discipline of folklore while it essentialises folklore materials as vestiges of a vanishing past. Yet, she suggests, “we can study the negotiation of authenticity once we cease to be a negotiating party, or once we admit to our participation in the negotiating process” (Bendix 1997, 23). In this theoretical context, the resurrection of the English ballad “Reynardine” (Roud 1994b, 397) in the English folk revival takes on considerable interest. Indeed, the creation, packaging and dissemination of the revival “Reynardine” can be seen as just such a process: a negotiation between authenticity and authorship.

Reynardine in British Tradition and British Revival

In “Reynardine,” a young woman meets a stranger in the mountains and is ensnared by his animal magnetism. In some versions she swoons and he kisses her until she revives, in others he professes to being captivated by her beauty. In almost all revival versions, the ballad ends with the woman following Reynardine as though in a trance while, the narrator tells us, “his teeth did brightly shine.” A text of this ballad recorded in 1969 by the English group Fairport Convention will serve as an example:

One evening as I rambled
Among the leaves so green,
I overheard a young woman
Converse with Reynardine.

Her hair was black, her eyes were blue,
Her lips as red as wine,
And he smiled to gaze upon her
Did that sly, bold Reynardine.

She said, “Kind sir, be civil
My company forsake,
For in my own opinion
I fear you are some rake.”

“Oh no,” he said, “no rake am I
Brought up in Venus’s train,
But I’m seeking for concealment
All along the lonesome plain.”

“Your beauty so enticed me
I could not pass it by,
So it’s with my gun I’ll guard you
All on the mountains high.”

“If by chance you should look for me
Perhaps you’ll not me find,
For I’ll be in my castle
Inquire for Reynardine.”

Sun and dark she followed him
His teeth did brightly shine,
And he led her over the mountains
Did that sly, bold Reynardine (Fairport Convention 1969; transcription mine).

The list of British and Irish revival singers who have recorded similar versions is impressive, including Shirley Collins, Fairport Convention, Archie Fisher, Anne Briggs, Bert Jansch, June Tabor, Martin Carthy, Isla St Clair, John Roberts and Tony Barrand, and Finbar and Eddie Furey (see *Discography*, p. 307). Judging from the number of revival recordings, we might be inclined to conclude that “Reynardine” had been common in pre-revival British singing tradition.

In fact, there is little evidence for this. An examination of Steve Roud’s broadside and folksong indexes (Roud 1994a; 1994b) reveals that in Britain and Ireland “Reynardine” was disseminated primarily through print, rather than through oral performance. Approximately twenty broadside printings are listed in the Roud index, and I have seen several not included there. By contrast, according to Roud’s *Folksong index*, “Reynardine” was collected from oral tradition only once in Britain or Ireland before the folk revival versions began to be recorded (Roud 1994b). That two-verse, fragmentary version was taken down by W. Percy Merrick in Sussex in 1889 and published in 1904 (Merrick 1904, 271–2). [1] The tune without words appeared in the Grieg–Duncan collection from Scotland (Shuldham-Shaw and Lyle 1983, 333), while a stray verse appeared here and there in the works of Irish composers and authors in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, and in the oral tradition in Ireland in the 1940s. [2] The apparent absence of any pre-revival collected text of longer than two verses, suggests, however, that “Reynardine” never featured strongly in the oral tradition in Britain or Ireland.

The presence of “Reynardine” in the repertoires of so many English revivalists appears instead to be the result of the authorial and authoritative influence of A. L. Lloyd, who was both a singer and a folksong scholar. As will be evident in the following discussion, Lloyd, who sang the song and passed it on to many of the younger revivalists in a new form, was apparently the source of all British revival versions. In a pioneering scholarly essay devoted to “Reynardine,” Douglas DeNatale—citing Stephen Sedley’s *The Seeds of Love* (1967, 89)—states that Lloyd collected the song during fieldwork from a singer called Tom Cook, of Eastbridge, Suffolk (DeNatale 1980, 43). In fact, it is unlikely that Lloyd had ever heard anyone sing “Reynardine” before he did so himself. A variety of evidence, both contextual and textual, suggests that Lloyd actually constructed his version from fragmentary texts learned from books, filling it out with

broadside stanzas. The evidence further suggests that Lloyd considered “Reynardine” a model of authentic folksong, and changed it only to make it better conform to his idea of its authentic essence.

Establishing Lloyd’s Authorship of “Reynardine” I: Contextual Evidence

There appears to be no direct evidence, as far as I am aware, to suggest that Lloyd actually collected the song from a Tom Cook of Eastbridge, Suffolk—or from any other individual in any part of Britain—as Sedley said he did, an ascription repeated by DeNatale in his 1980 article. It is not clear how Sedley came by that information and we can only conjecture that he might have got it from Lloyd himself, as Sedley thanks Lloyd for his expert help in the introduction to his songbook. Furthermore, in his own sleeve-notes to the song, Lloyd does not mention that he collected it from a Tom Cook or even that he collected it from oral tradition. It is unlikely, however, that Sedley invented a Suffolk singer of that name; Lloyd had already referred to a Tom Cook as a source of songs in the sleeve notes to his LP *English Drinking Songs* (Lloyd 1961)—an ascription that, as we shall see, raises queries about the accuracy of Lloyd’s source attributions, and is also relevant to the following discussion of the Reynardine ballad.

A fairly thorough search for information about a singer named Tom Cook of Eastbridge, Suffolk, has yielded nothing so far. According to the traditional discography maintained by Rod Stradling in *Musical Traditions* magazine, no recordings of such a singer have ever been issued (Stradling 2004). Although there was a well-known Cook family in Eastbridge, members of which Lloyd did record, there is no mention of a Tom Cook outside of Lloyd’s and Sedley’s writings. Furthermore, negative evidence from Keith Summers, who documented Suffolk traditional music in the 1960s and 1970s, also casts doubt on the Sedley attribution. Having checked all his notes about the Eastbridge area, Summers reported that the following Cooks had been interviewed by him or mentioned by his informants: “Albert (Diddy), Harry (Crutter), Syd and Walter. But no Tom.” He added, “I have never heard [‘Reynardine’] sung in this area or even mentioned by any singer or informant” (pers. comm. 17 March 2002). No other researcher working in Suffolk seems to have encountered either a singer called Tom Cook or the “Reynardine” ballad.

The fact that it has not proved possible to track down any singer in Eastbridge called Tom Cook or to find any other version of “Reynardine” from the area raises serious questions about the accuracy or even integrity of Lloyd’s declarations about the sources of some of his songs and his claims to have collected them from oral tradition. Indeed, Lloyd’s claims about the origins of his songs are widely regarded with suspicion these days, both in revival circles and within English folksong scholarship.

Serious questioning of Lloyd’s scholarship began shortly after his death (Meredith 1983, 13–15). More recently, Vic Gammon has written that Lloyd’s “unashamed love of the material made him a reassembler and tinkerer,” a trait he combined with “poor documentation” and “selective” use of evidence (Gammon 1986, 148–53). Dave Arthur is more specific, stating:

One finds in [Lloyd's] manuscripts informants' names crossed out and changed, unverifiable dates and places credited, and in the case of "One of the Has Beens," a very specific note. "I heard this from a Vaudeville actor, in hospital in Cowra, NSW, on New Year's Day," was changed on publication to "a teamster from Grenfell sang the song," which sounds more "authentic" than "a vaudeville actor" (Arthur 1999, 12).

In short, there is a fairly general consensus that Lloyd's desire to claim the authenticity of tradition for folksongs overcame his memory (or his honesty) on some occasions.

The most prominent example of this involves a song Lloyd called "The Recruited Collier" (Roud 1994b, no. 3503), whose fate in Lloyd's hands has resonances for my discussion of the ballad "Reynardine" in this article. In the 1940s and 1950s, Lloyd, a member of the British Communist Party, was politically committed to the idea of "industrial folk song." [3] In 1951, under the auspices of the National Coal Board, he sought examples of miners' industrial songs by running a contest, which he publicised to colliers through an industry magazine and newsreel film. In the book that resulted from that effort, Lloyd claimed that a man named J. T. Huxtable contacted him with a song he called "The Recruited Collier" (Lloyd 1952, 133).

Lloyd's claim is highly suspect, however. Like Tom Cook, Huxtable could not be located by later researchers, although some looked for him in Workington where Lloyd claimed he lived. [4] In addition, it is now relatively clear that Lloyd actually created the song himself by adapting a poem entitled "Jenny's Complaint," written by Robert Anderson, a Cumberland antiquarian and poet. Anderson, who wrote the original in 1803, never claimed that the ballad had come from oral tradition. Indeed, he was quite clear in the preface to his book, *Ballads in the Cumberland Dialect*, that he was the author of the poems in the volume, explaining that they were copied from life and "composed during the author's solitary rambles on the banks of his favourite stream" (Anderson 1828, vi). Lloyd himself was aware of Anderson's book, noting that it contained "a version" of the song (Lloyd 1952, 133). He must, therefore, have known that it was not a "folksong" in any accepted sense, nor a product of miners' culture. This poem, unlike some others in Anderson's collection, does not appear to have entered the oral tradition until long after Lloyd's publication of it. [5]

Assessing the available evidence about the life history of "The Recruited Collier," Roy Palmer concluded that Lloyd's ascription of it to Huxtable is untenable. He pointed out that "The Recruited Collier" is not only a spurious example of folksong, but a spurious instance of industrial culture as well, and concluded that Lloyd "silently (and brilliantly) remade the song" (Palmer 1986, 135-6). [6] Palmer does not say why Lloyd would make such changes, but the reasons seem clear enough: he was attracted to industrial folk songs and needed them to bolster his ideological position. To supplement his findings, he fashioned some himself out of literary models.

If Palmer, Gammon and Arthur are right, Lloyd's published recollections about some songs at least are incorrect, if not intentionally misleading. If he was the source of Sedley's assertion about the oral base of "Reynardine," then his recollection was also faulty in that instance. Furthermore, he seems to have previously adapted a literary text in order to produce an ideological "folksong"

about the mining industry. In this context, it is reasonable to ask whether the same sort of tinkering that apparently created J. T. Huxtable's "The Recruited Collier" was also behind the revival version of "Reynardine," which Lloyd so brilliantly popularised. In other words, was A. L. Lloyd actually the author of his own version of "Reynardine"?

Establishing Lloyd's Authorship II: Textual Evidence

"Absence of evidence is not evidence of absence," the scholarly proverb warns us. Only positive evidence that Lloyd created the revival "Reynardine" from versions published in books can constitute a convincing argument for his authorship of it. Luckily, there are three major pieces of direct textual evidence pointing to Lloyd's authorship of the ballad. First, there is the genealogy of the stanza containing the line "his teeth did brightly shine." DeNatale has shown that this line originated in a poem by Joseph Campbell [Seosamh MacCathmhaoil] based on a fragment of the ballad, and that it was further refined by Campbell's friend Herbert Hughes (DeNatale 1980, 44–5). To understand this argument, we need to revisit some of the song's complex earlier history. In 1907, an American folklorist named H. M. Belden sent a request to *Notes and Queries* looking for information about a song called "Rinordine." Hughes responded as follows:

In the summer of 1904, when I was on a holiday in Donegal, an old woman of Kilmacrenan sang me what was evidently a fragment of this ballad. She was nearly eighty years of age, and could remember only four lines:

If by chance you look for me,
Perhaps you'll not me find,
For I'll be in my castle:
Enquire for Reynardine (Hughes 1908, 33).

Hughes further recounted the old woman's claim that Reynardine was "a faëry in Ireland who turns into the shape of a fox."

Inspired by his friend's tale of fairies, Campbell expanded on the fragment in *The Mountainy Singer*, a book of original poetry published in 1909. His version of "Reynardine" contains Hughes's original fragment plus two new stanzas:

Sun and dark he courted me—
His eyes were red as wine:
He took me for his leman,
Did my sweet Reynardine.

Sun and dark the gay horn blows,
The beagles run like wind:
They know not where he harbours,
The fairy Reynardine (Campbell [MacCathmhaoil] 1909, 11).

Here is the origin of the "sun and dark" formula in the revival "Reynardine." But the story does not end there. Hughes, in turn, remade Campbell's version of

the song. His own 1909 work, *Irish Country Songs*, includes his original fragment plus one additional verse:

Sun and dark I followed him,
His eyes did brightly shine;
He took me o'er the mountains,
Did my sweet Reynardine (Hughes 1909, vol. 1, 4-6).

Hughes had stated explicitly the previous year that his source knew only four lines of the song. DeNatale concludes that the stanza came from Campbell, a friend and correspondent of Hughes. DeNatale has also recognised the obvious similarity between Hughes's second verse and the final verse of the revival versions, such as the one by the group Fairport Convention quoted at the outset of the present article:

Sun and dark she followed him,
His teeth did brightly shine,
And he led her over the mountains,
Did that sly, bold Reynardine (Fairport Convention 1969).

How did the "sun and dark" stanza get into the revival version? DeNatale speculates that on the strength of Hughes's book, it "entered oral circulation, eventually emerging as Tom Cook's version" (DeNatale 1980, 45).

As I will show, this is scarcely credible given the aforementioned stanzas from Hughes and Campbell. What DeNatale's analysis misses is that there is *another* typical revival verse, not in any pre-revival version of "Reynardine," that *also* owes a debt to these stanzas, namely:

Her hair was black, her eyes were blue,
Her lips as red as wine,
And he smiled to gaze upon her
Did that sly, bold Reynardine (Fairport Convention 1969).

Clearly, this is indebted to Campbell's quatrain:

Sun and dark he courted me—
His eyes were red as wine:
He took me for his leman,
Did my sweet Reynardine (Campbell [MacCathmhaoil] 1909, 11).

The relation of the two descriptions is evident in the line "his eyes were red as wine": this was simply changed and expanded to "her eyes were blue, her lips as red as wine." The revival version, therefore, appears to be derived from this stanza.

Significantly, "eyes as red as wine" occurs in Campbell's lines, but not in Hughes's; while "eyes did brightly shine" occurs in Hughes's, but not in Campbell's. Neither occurs in any broadside text. This is damaging to DeNatale's hypothesis, because the revival texts all contain versions of both lines. To maintain DeNatale's hypothesis one would have to imagine that verses based on "Reynardine" written by two different and relatively obscure Irish authors would have entered the oral tradition and interacted with the existing broadside text, to produce a new song with elements of all three versions. One would

further need to accept that this song was collected only once, in Eastbridge, by Lloyd.

This seems far-fetched indeed. A more plausible explanation is that an experienced researcher came across all three printed versions and combined them. Lloyd is a likely candidate; his sleeve notes to the song allude to the 1908 exchange about "Reynardine" in *Notes and Queries*. Lloyd, therefore, knew Hughes's version, and would have been able to find Campbell's by association.

The second piece of textual evidence is that Lloyd sang and recorded at least two very different versions of the song during his career. The earlier version appeared in the late 1950s, on the album *The Foggy Dew and other Traditional English Love Songs*. The text is as follows:

One evening as I rambled
Among the leaves so fine,
I overheard a young woman
Conversing with Reynardine

Her hair was black, her eyes were blue,
Her mouth as red as wine,
And he smiled to look upon her,
Did this sly bold Reynardine

He said if by chance you look for me,
Perhaps you'll not me find,
But I'll be in my castle,
Enquire for Reynardine

Sun and dark she followed him,
His eyes did brightly shine,
And he led her over the mountain,
Did this sly bold Reynardine (Lloyd 1956?; transcription mine).

As we can see, stanzas three and four are derived from Hughes, and the first half of stanza two from Campbell. The first half of the first stanza seems to be derived from the broadside ballad, whose first line is often "One evening as I rambled." This leaves the second half of the first and second stanzas, or the lines

I overheard a young woman
converse with Reynardine

and

And he smiled to look upon her
Did this sly bold Reynardine

as the only parts without analogue in printed versions of the song that were available to Lloyd.

Most versions of the ballad make Reynardine the narrator until a "come-all-ye" verse at the end, which is seemingly from the woman's point of view. This holds true in every orally collected version of the song that has been published (Merrick 1904, 271-2; Combs 1925, 165-6; Thomas 1931, 108-9; Chappell 1939, 84-5; Eddy 1939, 192-3; Belden 1940, 268-88; Brewster 1941, 171-2; Randolph

1946, 379–80; Creighton 1961, 112–3; Mackenzie 1963, 102–3; Gardener and Chickering 1967, 96–7), in addition to all the broadsides I have seen, the one manuscript text I am aware of (Huntington 1964, 222–3), and the songster texts as well. [7] Hughes's and Campbell's versions, by contrast, are told from the girl's point of view: "he courted me," "I followed him," and so on.

The revival version, then, is the only one told from the point of view of a third-person narrator who witnesses the meeting of the protagonists. This suggests a careful attempt to meld the first-person broadside opening (from Reynardine's point of view) with the first-person stanzas from Campbell and Hughes (from the girl's perspective) in a way that makes grammatical sense. It also strengthens the case for suggesting that this version is by Lloyd rather than a product of oral tradition. Finally, it accounts for the unique half-stanzas pointed out earlier; they must have been written by Lloyd to connect the diverse scraps into a coherent song.

As we can see from the aforementioned quatrains, Lloyd's original version did not contain the line "his teeth did brightly shine," but rather "his *eyes* did brightly shine," which is identical to Hughes's text. However, Lloyd's later recording of the song most definitely has Reynardine's *teeth* shining brightly, along with several additional verses derived from broadside texts. That version, which appeared on Lloyd's LP, *First Person*, is as follows:

One evening as I rambled
Among the springing thyme,
I overheard a young woman
Conversing with Reynardine.

Her hair was black, her eyes were blue,
And her mouth as red as wine,
And he smiled to look upon her,
Did the sly, bold Reynardine.

She said, "young man, be civil
And my company forsake,
For to my good opinion
I fear you are a rake."

He said, "My dear, I am no rake
Brought up in Venus's train,
But I'm searching for concealment
All from the judge's men."

Her cherry cheek and ruby lip
They lost their former dye,
And she fell into his arms there
All on the mountain high.

They hadn't kissed but once or twice
Till she come to again,
And modestly she asked him,
"Pray, tell to me your name."

He says if by chance you look for me
 Perhaps you'll not me find,
 But I'll be in my castle,
 Inquire for Reynardine

Day and night she followed him
 His teeth so bright did shine,
 And he led her over the mountain,
 Did this sly, bold Reynardine (Lloyd 1966; transcription mine).

On comparing Lloyd's two versions four things are revealed. First, Lloyd's original version from the 1950s bears scant relation to any orally collected or broadside version, containing instead lines mostly derived from Campbell and Hughes. The likelihood that this was ever part of the oral tradition of "Reynardine" is slim, since it shares only a single stanza with any other such version. Later, when Lloyd changed the song significantly, sometime between 1956 and 1966, [8] elements of the broadside text (which closely resembles the oral versions) began to appear; the song doubled in length, and the additional verses were all from broadside ballad versions. Thus, it appears that Lloyd created his first text mostly from Irish literary versions, and later added lines from broadsides.

Second, the change to "his teeth did brightly shine" occurred *after* Lloyd's first arrangement of the song, and was almost certainly made by Lloyd himself. Even if a Tom Cook had given him the song—which, as we have seen, is highly improbable—it would have been the earlier version, without the word "teeth."

Third, a simple perusal of the Fairport Convention text will show that it was based at least in part on Lloyd's second version. Although there are numerous small differences, the line "his teeth did brightly shine" was, as we have just seen, almost certainly Lloyd's creation. This line is practically ubiquitous in British revival versions of the song, which means that almost all such versions appear to derive ultimately from Lloyd's.

Fourth, in Lloyd's second version, he continued the practice of using the work of known poets in his song creations. His second line, "among the springing thyme," is apparently taken from A. E. Housman's well-known poem "Bredon Hill" (Housman 1938, 28). Like Anderson, Campbell and Hughes, Housman was heavily influenced by traditional ballads; Laws refers to Housman's work as "the romantic folk ballad in modern dress" (Laws 1972, 113). Using a work like Housman's, then, would fit Lloyd's *modus operandi* apparent in both the first version of "Reynardine" and "The Recruited Collier": Lloyd apparently took the work of a poet who was influenced by folk ballads and borrowed lines of his verse to create a new or refurbished ballad of his own. [9]

The third and final piece of textual evidence will, I think, lay to rest any claim that a Tom Cook sang "Reynardine" for Lloyd, by confirming Lloyd's direct authorship of the ballad and his use of Hughes's and Campbell's versions for that purpose. DeNatale notes that Anne Briggs's version of the song derived from an "Irish song" (DeNatale 1980, 45). But he neglects to quote the whole sentence from the note, which states that the "words and tune of this version are adapted by me from an Irish original" (Briggs 1971; 1999, 33). DeNatale may have assumed that Briggs wrote this sleeve note, but on both the 1971 LP and

the 1999 CD re-issue, the song notes are marked "written by A. L. Lloyd." In other words, in his notes to Briggs's 1971 version of "Reynardine," Lloyd finally stated the genesis of the song: he himself had adapted it from an Irish original (Briggs 1971; 1999, 33).

At the time Lloyd began tinkering with "Reynardine," there were four Irish texts published: a broadside by Healy of Cork (Roud 1994a), a single-verse fragment in Joyce's *Ancient Irish Music* (1873, 21), and Hughes's and Campbell's versions. Lloyd's adaptation almost certainly involved starting with Hughes's version as a base, and adding elements of other versions to create a new song.

Negotiating Authenticity: A. L. Lloyd and the Mystery of "Reynardine"

Having established that Lloyd created the revival "Reynardine," new questions arise: why did Lloyd revive the song, why did he change it as he did, and what were the effects of his changes? The answers lie in the conflicting conceptions of authenticity that troubled Lloyd's approach to folksong. Leslie Shepard beautifully summed up Lloyd's personality as "a romantic at odds with a scholar" (Shepherd 1986, 132), and it is precisely in their respective conceptions of authenticity that these two facets of Lloyd's personality were at variance.

The scholar in Lloyd subscribed to a view of authenticity common in nineteenth-century ballad studies, when it was standard practice for scholars to accord ballads that originated with broadside printers far less importance than older songs. The most authentic ballads, according to this theory, were anonymous products of the common muse. Francis James Child famously distinguished between true "popular ballads" and their broadside counterparts, making it his life's work to collect the former, and calling most of the latter "thoroughly despicable and worthless" (Child 1900, 466). Nevertheless, in his work, Child showed a more ambivalent attitude towards broadside ballads, considering some to be worthy, especially those "printed from oral tradition" (Child 1860, vol. 1, vii).

It was a similar ideological and aesthetic position that led Lloyd to resurrect "Reynardine" in the first place. Lloyd is generally disparaging toward broadside ballads, calling them, for example, "turgidly literary—if not always very literate" (Lloyd 1967, 28). Yet, as with Child, there were songs among the broadside stock that earned his praise, particularly ones he thought were old. Lloyd includes "Reynardine" in a group of such praiseworthy broadside ballads, characterising them as "songs lying deep in the tradition, the 'classical' pieces of folk song, that were issued by the street-paper press" (Lloyd 1967, 28). In other words, Lloyd felt that these songs were authentic products of the oral tradition rather than the individual work of professional writers. It was, to his mind, an accident of history that our first record of them is on broadsides. [10] From Lloyd the scholar's point of view, then, "Reynardine" was a natural song to revive; it was one of the few authentically folkloric pieces in the broadside repertoire, one that had fallen out of oral circulation in Britain.

The next obvious question is: why did Lloyd not simply sing the ballad as printed on broadsides? It is paradoxical that Lloyd, who mistrusted ballads of professional authorship, should nonetheless engage in the kind of surreptitious writing, editing and reliance on literary authors that produced his "Reynardine."

What, then, prompted Lloyd to put together this particular text of "Reynardine"?

The answer to this question, I believe, lies in the other facet of Lloyd's personality—the romantic. Lloyd was a romantic in the sense that he was prone to leaps of the imagination that glossed over the banalities of life. In Lloyd's mind, the lives of folk-song characters, and of the folk community itself, were more emotionally rewarding than the historical record suggested. This came out most strongly in his approach to erotic songs, on which topic he wrote effusively:

The erotic folklore of the soil ... with its clean joy and acceptance of the realities of virginity and desire, passion and pregnancy, belongs to a country people living an integrated deeply-communal life ... for whom all nature is sexualised and the closest relation exists between the fertility of seeds, beasts and humans. [...] Nowhere does this intimate consonance of nature show clearer than in the erotic folk songs. [...] (Lloyd 1967, 185).

By contrast, an analysis by Renwick, which catalogues thirteen ways in which traditional songs warn against tragic sexual experiences, shows that many of the erotic songs are about men trying to take advantage of women (Renwick 1980). Gammon generally agrees with Renwick on this point, stating that the songs often perform an "educative or warning function" for girls (Gammon 1982, 235). Both suggest that Lloyd's peasant world of happy sex with light consequences is highly romanticised, and Gammon uses that very word to describe Lloyd's approach (Gammon 1982, 238). The closing verse of "Reynardine" broadsides, in which the girl warns "beware of meeting Reynardine," puts the song in precisely the categories outlined by Gammon and Renwick, and Lloyd's failure to include that verse in his reconstruction is one example of the song's romanticisation.

Lloyd's changes went much further than the removal of one verse, however; he completely remade the song. This action was prompted by another approach to authenticity common both in the Romantic movement and among romantics generally: what we might term "experiential authenticity." In Bendix's characterisation this is "authenticity as ... a quality of experience: the chills running down one's spine during musical performances, for instance ..." (Bendix 1997, 13–14). For a romantic given to imagination and emotion, experiential authenticity is paramount. Thus, if Lloyd the scholar was concerned that a song be a true expression of the anonymous folk, Lloyd the romantic needed it to impart an aesthetic thrill.

As we will see, what thrilled Lloyd about "Reynardine" was a mystery about Reynardine's nature that had been brewing for a half century by the time Lloyd found the ballad. Ever since Hughes's 1908 note, the protagonist's essence had been in dispute. Was the character supernatural or mortal? The old woman who gave Hughes a stanza claimed that Reynardine was a fairy-fox. This certainly makes sense of Reynardine's name, which, from its morphological roots, should mean "fox-like," or perhaps "little fox."

For the most part, however, folksong scholars have been unenthusiastic about the idea that Reynardine is a supernatural being. Laws, who comments on the song several times in *American Balladry from British Broadside* (1957), never mentions a supernatural explanation for the ballad, preferring to interpret Reynardine as a recluse and possibly an outlaw. According to DeNatale, most

collectors working in North America, where the song had some currency in twentieth-century oral tradition, also do not ascribe a supernatural nature to Reynardine (DeNatale 1980, 45). Those who have asked their informants generally find that they consider Reynardine an ordinary person. In his admirable summary of this question, DeNatale notes "most singers apparently attach no supernatural significance to the song" (*ibid.*).

Hughes's informant aside, there is also no sound evidence from early texts that "Reynardine" was conceived of as a supernatural being. There is certainly no reason to make such an assumption on the basis of his name. The name "Reynardine" has been taken as the standard form by some folklorists for no very good reason, except that Hughes's informant connected the character with a fox. However, this name, which is the song's only obvious connection to foxes, does not actually appear in most of the texts from oral or broadside sources. More often, he is "Ranordine," "Rinordine," "Rinor Dine," "Ryner Dyne," "Rynadine," or even "Randal Rhin" or "Randal Rine." DeNatale asserts that "while 'Ranordine,' 'Randal Rine' or 'Rinordine' could have derived from 'Reynardine,' it is difficult to imagine a transition in the other direction" (DeNatale 1980, 48). But it need not be difficult. Holloway and Black believe the original name was "Randal Ryan," and "Reynold Ryan" is another plausible possibility (Holloway and Black 1975, 184). [11]

Even if "Reynardine" is the "real" name, and all the others are corrupted versions, there are many ways in which Reynardine may have fox-like characteristics without having supernatural powers. In English-language folksongs such as "Bold Reynard" (Roud 1994a, no. 190), "Reynard the Fox" (*ibid.*, no. 2349), "Tally Ho, Hark Away" (*ibid.*, no. 1182) and "John Peel" (*ibid.*, no. 1239), Reynard the fox has two major characteristics: he is tricky, and he is being hunted. Outlaws, too, are hunted, and live by their wits. Thus in the conceptual world of folksongs, the fox is a perfectly appropriate symbol of the outlaw trickster, and in this sense "Reynardine" is a fitting name for any outlaw hero, supernatural or mortal. [12]

Lloyd nevertheless seems to have encouraged the idea of a supernatural Reynardine. The ballad itself is called "The Mountains High" on most broadsides, and its standard academic name is "Rinordine." Lloyd actually used this latter title in his academic writings, but when singing and teaching the song he called it "Reynardine." There seems no other good reason to do this than to stress the character's possible connections to the supernatural. Furthermore, Lloyd liked to imply a connection between "Reynardine" and the brutal and bestial Mr Fox of English versions of *The Robber Bridegroom* (AT 955) (Briggs 1970, vol. 2, part A, 446–50; Arne and Thompson 1987). In the notes to the LP *First Person*, Lloyd wrote:

Reynardine: A vulpine name for a crafty hero. Mr. Fox is a disquieting figure in folk tales [...], an elegant witty lover with a cupboard full of bones and tubs of blood. The dread uncertainty is whether he is man or animal. A similar unease broods within this song. Some commentators have thought it concerns a love affair between an English lady and Irish outlaw, and have set its date in Elizabeth's time. Others believe the story is older and consider Reynardine, the "little fox" to be a supernatural, lycanthropic lover (Lloyd 1966).

Note that the "Mr. Fox" material is essentially extraneous, that it is apparently

introduced to set an uneasy mood and to suggest a supernatural interpretation for the ballad protagonist, Reynardine. Meanwhile, by also presenting the other view, that Reynardine is a mere mortal, an "Irish outlaw," Lloyd leaves the song open to either interpretation. He is, in other words, arguing for the song's ambiguity.

It was in this ambiguity, this mystery, that Lloyd the romantic located the song's essence. This is made perfectly clear in his sleeve note from the 1950s:

Who was Reynardine, with his irresistible charm, his glittering eye, his foxy smile? An ordinary man, or an outlaw maybe, or some supernatural lover? Is he the dreadful Mr. Fox in the English folk-tale, the elegant gentleman whose bedroom was full of skeletons and buckets of blood? The song does not say. It puts its fingers to its lips and preserves the mystery, letting the enigmatic text and dramatic tune hint at unspeakable things (Lloyd 1956?).

Lloyd here acknowledges at least four interpretive possibilities for the ballad's protagonist: ordinary man, outlaw, supernatural lover, or serial killer. But he prefers to "preserve the mystery" rather than select an interpretation.

Lloyd's desire for mystery might well have driven him to create his version of the song. Those predating Lloyd's were singularly lacking in mystery, as DeNatale points out (DeNatale 1980, 43). Consider this one, printed by Wood of Liverpool and housed at Oxford's Bodleian Library:

One evening in my rambles two miles below Pimroy,
I met a farmer's daughter all on the mountains high,
Her beauty so enticed me, I could not pass her by,
So with my gun I'll guard her, all on the mountains high.

I said my pretty creature I'm glad to meet you here,
On these lonesome mountains your beauty shines so clear.
She said kind sir, be civil, my company forsake,
For it is my opinion, I fear you are some rake.

Said he I am no rake, I'm brought up in Venus' train,
I'm seeking for concealment, all in the judge's name.
Oh! if my parents they did know your life they would destroy,
For keeping of my company, all on the mountains high.

I said my pretty creature don't let your parents know,
For if you do they'll ruin me and prove my overthrow.
This pretty little young thing she stood all in amaze,
With eyes as bright as amber, upon me she did gaze.

Her ruby lips and cherry cheeks, the lass of Firmadie,
She fainted in my arms there, all on the mountains high.
When I had kissed her once or twice, she came to herself again,
And said kind sir be civil and tell to me your name.

Go down in yonder forest, my castle there you'll find,
Well wrote in ancient history my name is Rynadine.
Come all you pretty fair maids a warning take by me,
Be sure you quit night walking, and shun bad company,

For if you don't you are sure to rue until the day you die,
Beware of meeting Rynadine all on the mountains high. (Bodleian Library [1273])

There is nothing tangibly supernatural in this typical broadside version of "Reynardine." [13] Here Rynadine carries a gun, hides from the law, and fears the girl's parents—hardly the attributes of a being with supernatural powers. The opposite is true of Campbell's version, in which Reynardine has red eyes, escapes with ease, and is recognised as a fairy. In neither version is there any real mystery surrounding the protagonist's nature.

Hughes's is the only text with inherent ambiguity, and it is probably for this reason that Lloyd chose it as the basis for his own. In Hughes's version, Reynardine's ease in seducing the girl, and his shining eyes, suggest a kind of hypnotic power. Furthermore, where the broadside ends with a typical "come-all-ye" verse warning girls against the seductive stranger, Hughes's ends with the girl following Reynardine over the mountain. Thus, in the broadside version, any power Reynardine had over the girl is gone by the end, but the conclusion of Hughes's text intensifies the feeling that he has some mesmeric hold on her. These elements helped Lloyd in his quest to create a disquieting, ambiguous song.

Lloyd's first version of the ballad, like Hughes's text, makes Reynardine more human than supernatural. The stranger has animal magnetism, but no other bestial quality. Lloyd does make one significant change from his sources, however: where Hughes's text has "my sweet Reynardine" (Hughes 1908, 33) and Campbell's "the fairy Reynardine" (Campbell [MacCathmhaoil] 1909, 11), Lloyd's has "the sly, bold Reynardine" (Lloyd 1956?); like the reference to teeth, this formulation is present only in revival versions of the song and therefore must have been added by Lloyd. "Sly" is an adjective generally used to describe foxes, and occurs frequently in folksongs about them, while "bold" is even more often used to characterise the fox in folksongs (see Williams 1923, 63; Kennedy 1975, 551; Holloway and Black 1979, 139). Lloyd's use of these adjectives in his version of "Reynardine" thus serves to strengthen the protagonist's resemblance to a fox, implying lycanthropy [14] rather than actually stating it. [15] So while Hughes's stanza has few supernatural elements, and Campbell's obviously has more, Lloyd's falls somewhere in between.

When he revised the song sometime before 1966, Lloyd obviously decided to intensify this lycanthropic quality in order to make "Reynardine" more ambiguous. He found a perfect way to achieve this: by changing Campbell's line "his eyes did brightly shine" to his own "his teeth did brightly shine," he subtly enhanced the ballad's lycanthropic undercurrents (Lloyd 1966). At the same time, he introduced factors that work subtly against the idea of supernatural powers. From broadside texts, he imported the line "I'm seeking for concealment, all from the judge's men," giving Reynardine rather mundane concerns. Thus, he could be just a sly, bold outlaw and his teeth could be all shine and no bite. These changes can be seen as Lloyd's final steps in a progressive mediation between natural and supernatural readings, motivated by a desire to impart the sense of mystery that he craved.

Lloyd's sleeve note from the 1950s provides evidence that his romantic side did indeed consider mystery the most essential characteristic of "Reynardine."

He compliments the song for “*preserving* the mystery” (Lloyd 1956?; italics added). Yet no extant text prior to Lloyd’s has a particularly mysterious quality. [16] Given that Lloyd believed the song to be a product of the oral tradition, his wording hints that “the mystery” is an essential quality of the ballad, but that it had dropped out of the tradition by the time it was written down. By means of this linguistic subtlety Lloyd locates part of the song’s authentic essence in the emotional and aesthetic trait of mystery. Since this mystery had been lost in other texts, Lloyd believed that authorial mediation was necessary to preserve the essence of the ballad. In this sense, his authorial interventions served, in his own mind, to create an emotionally authentic text.

This tension between scholar and romantic may sound fanciful, but it has not been uncommon in the history of folklore. The brothers Grimm displayed a similar tension: they collected folktales from the lips of peasant informants, but edited the products extensively to produce emotionally satisfying texts. Bendix suggests that the Grimms divided authenticity in two: the “external authenticity” of the peasant’s words and the “internal authenticity” of the tale’s aesthetic and emotional content (Bendix 1997, 54). It was to increase the latter, to “restore [the tales] to their original beauty” or, in other words, to *preserve* what they believed to be essential qualities that had been eliminated from the oral versions they collected, that the Grimms edited their tales (Bendix 1997, 54).

In another important regard, however, the Grimms and Lloyd differed. As I have already indicated, Lloyd did *not* collect “Reynardine” orally. Thus his song, while filled with the romantic’s internal authenticity, was almost completely devoid of the scholar’s external authenticity. One of the most fascinating aspects of Lloyd’s “Reynardine,” then, is the fact that he probably lied about it. If he did indeed tell Stephen Sedley that he had collected “Reynardine” from Tom Cook, then Lloyd was once again trying to renegotiate the song’s authenticity.

As I suggested earlier, Lloyd the scholar inherited notions of authenticity from Child and other nineteenth-century scholars. To Lloyd the scholar, then, the text that had the least mark of authorial intervention, that was a creation of spontaneous nature rather than professional authorship, was the most authentic. If internal, emotional authenticity required that he should compose the ballad himself, external scholarly authenticity required him to deny authorship. And so he did ... at least some of the time.

To his credit, Lloyd recognised that his editing embodied what Bendix calls “the practical paradoxes of the search for authenticity” (Bendix 1997, 54); in the sleeve notes to *The Bird in the Bush*, he quoted his mentor and collaborator Ralph Vaughan Williams: “the practice of re-writing a folk-song is abominable, and I wouldn’t trust anyone but myself to do it” (Discography, Lloyd, Briggs and Armstrong 1966).

Conclusion

Rather than affirming or denying the authenticity of “Reynardine” based on Lloyd’s authorial mediations, the foregoing analysis is an attempt to understand the negotiations of authenticity in which Lloyd himself engaged. Every stage of Lloyd’s interaction with “Reynardine,” from deciding that the ballad was worthy of being revived, to cobbling together his first text from poems by Campbell and Hughes in the 1950s, to emending that text by adding broadside

stanzas in the 1960s, to interpreting the resulting songs in his sleeve notes, and perhaps on to claiming to have collected the song orally, formed part of this negotiation. Authenticity, of one type or another, was central to Lloyd's whole project.

A scholarly position on the song's authenticity is entirely dependent on one's theoretical perspective. Some scholars, like Dorson, might reject the text as "fakelore." Others might agree with Lloyd, who locates the song's authenticity in its aesthetic and emotional content. John Niles, for example, is of the opinion that there is "nothing illegitimate" about the Child A text of "Tam Lin," although Robert Burns had a hand in that text's creation, arguing that Burns acted much as a good folk singer does, creating an aesthetically pleasing text by selecting from, omitting from, and adding to the tradition (Niles 1977, 156). Frankie Armstrong makes a similar argument about Lloyd's "refurbished" ballads (Armstrong 1997, 256). Still other scholars, like Posen, might locate the song's authenticity in its connection to community. According to this argument, the song met the needs of the folk revival community, as it circulated widely in oral tradition within that community and underwent considerable changes, thus acting as an authentic folksong of the revival (Posen 1993, 136).

The more troubling fact of Lloyd's occasional dishonesty might lead some to reject his actions as unethical. But in later years especially, Lloyd did try to separate his revival activities from his academic writings, and to leave the latter relatively free of embellishment. For example, despite Lloyd's 1952 claim that he collected *The Recruited Collier* from J. T. Huxtable, which would make it a fascinating piece of miners' culture were it true, and despite the fact that it was clearly one of his favourite songs in the genre, he never mentioned it in the ninety-five-page chapter on industrial songs in his 1967 book *Folk Song in England*. He probably omitted the song precisely because it was not a genuine example of oral industrial folksong, and he wished that book, his most important scholarly work, to be as accurate as possible. Similarly, the song he called "Reynardine" in the revival arena is given its standard title "Rinordine" in *Folk Song in England*, and none of Lloyd's fanciful connections to Mr Fox, or to Tom Cook of Eastbridge, is mentioned there.

In his dealings with revivalists like Sedley, on the other hand, Lloyd appears not to have considered himself a scholar bound by rules of academic integrity. He was instead an unrepentant revivalist whose goal was to make folksongs popular. In this he succeeded brilliantly, making "Reynardine" a leading ballad of the folksong revival movement, despite its having been well and truly dead in English oral tradition for the better part of a century. In this context, Lloyd's lie, if he did deceive Sedley, was less an attempt to falsify the past than a shot at improving the future, a gambit that happens to have succeeded. [17]

Lloyd's negotiations of authenticity, in fact, contributed to Reynardine's success in two ways. In the first place, I believe that his song is an improvement on the other available versions, creating a more emotionally satisfying experience. Campbell's story of a red-eyed fairy is pretentious, and Hughes's tale is short and very vague. The broadside text, meanwhile, is bland and melodramatic. The various revival versions are superior to all of these, and derive much of their appeal from the mysterious elements Lloyd himself introduced. Lloyd's

authorial vision, not the impersonal effects of oral tradition, produced a captivating song, which became popular partly on its own artistic merits. [18]

Furthermore, Lloyd's search for internal authenticity had secondary effects. Not only was the emotional power of the song he created appealing, the specific trait of ambiguity, which Lloyd emphasised, has enabled "Reynardine" to fit the repertoires and ideologies of many singers and listeners. People are able to interpret the song in their own way, which is crucial to their appreciation of it. A perusal of folk revival sleeve notes reveals that all four possible interpretations suggested by Lloyd in the 1950s (ordinary man, Irish outlaw, supernatural lover, and serial killer) were current in the 1960s and 1970s revival. In his sleeve note to "Reynardine," Martin Carthy states:

To the country person everything around him has its place in the pattern of nature but the fox seems the odd man out. [...] He was believed to have magical powers, and there are many stories of foxes appearing to people and threatening them in some evil way (Little Red Riding Hood is one related). The same theme in a very debased form was made famous by Lon Chaney Jr.'s many appearances as the Werewolf on film (Carthy 1969).

Carthy thus interprets the character as supernatural, and suggests that the belief in such figures was a reflection of rural people's feelings about foxes (despite the inconvenient fact that both of his examples actually involve wolves). He sings the song, thus, as an authentic expression of rural supernatural folk belief. [19] By contrast, June Tabor selects the interpretation that Reynardine is a mysterious but ordinary man, "Errol Flynn rather than Lon Chaney," because "for [her] the romance and mystery outweigh the horror of the werewolf implication" (Tabor 1976). Roberts and Barrand compare Reynardine with Mr Fox, "dismembering the young girls he has seduced away to his forest mansion" (Roberts and Barrand 1977). The Furey Brothers, interested in Irish politics, opt for a creative adaptation of the "Irish outlaw" theory:

[Reynardine is a] traditional song about a young man on the run from the redcoats. They can never catch him, so they spread the story about that he is a werewolf. While hiding from them he meets and seduces a young girl (Furey and Furey 1972).

Clearly, preserving the song's mystery made it not only an artistic success, but a mirror in which revivalists found reflections of their own concerns, ideologies and fears.

Finally, Lloyd's version of "Reynardine" operates as another sort of mirror as well, this one showing a pleasant reflection of Lloyd's authorial self. After all, like the song he so lovingly authored, Lloyd preserved his own mysteries, remaining to his friends "something of an enigma" (Shepard 1986, 132). With his bold emendations of the song, and his sly hints and innuendoes in the sleeve notes, Lloyd managed to negotiate the minefield of authenticity and authorship with a twinkle in his eye, ultimately appearing just as tricky and mysterious as his own ballad hero. It is tempting to wonder: if Lloyd could hear the way his song is still sung, and if he could read this paper theorising on his motives, would his teeth shine as brightly as Reynardine's?

Acknowledgements

Thanks to Rod Stradling, the late Keith Summers, Malcolm Douglas, Ian Russell, Paul Adams, Roger DeV. Renwick, David Atkinson and Regina Bendix for references, comments and texts

Notes

- [1] For detailed information on broadside and songster texts of “Reynardine” and those from North American oral tradition, see DeNatale (1980).
- [2] A fragmentary song in English with stanzas of “Reynardine” was collected in 1941 from Máire Ní Chinnéide (76 years), Annascaul, County Kerry, Ireland (*Irish Folklore Collection*, vol. 744, 109–10). She had heard it in the 1880s from her mother. “Reynardine” has also been collected once in more recent times in Ireland, from Andy Cash in 1973 (Roud 1994b). This last version is likely to have been learned from the revival, although as the text is unpublished it is hard to be sure.
- [3] For biographical details on Lloyd, see Shepard (1986), Arthur (1999), and Harker (1985, 231–53).
- [4] Paul Adams never succeeded in locating Huxtable despite looking for him in his own home town of Workington where Lloyd claimed Huxtable also lived (pers. comm. 2003).
- [5] Roud’s Broadside and Folksong databases (Roud 1994a; 1994b) confirm these claims. Several of Anderson’s songs, including “Sally Gray” (Roud 1994b, no 1365) and “Barbary Bell” (ibid., no. 2521), entered the singing tradition. There is no such evidence for “The Recruited Collier” until long after Lloyd’s intervention; folksinger Fred Jordan, who often borrowed revival material, sang it.
- [6] Keith Gregson made a similar point, wondering whether the manuscript reportedly sent to Lloyd by Huxtable (which has since vanished) was already reworked into “The Recruited Collier,” or whether it contained Anderson’s original. He pointed out that if it contained the original, “the reworking is probably recent,” politely not mentioning that in that case it must have been done by Lloyd (Gregson 1983, 338).
- [7] George Sigerson wrote “The Mountains of Pomeroy” on the model of “Reynardine.” I consider that a different song, though.
- [8] The LP *The Foggy Dew* is undated but must be from the late 1950s. I propose 1956 as the earliest date for Lloyd’s subsequent changes. The LP *First Person* was released in 1966.
- [9] Malcolm Douglas pointed out the use of “Bredon Hill” (pers. comm. 6 June 2003). He obtained the reference from Georgina Boyes.
- [10] As I have stated, Lloyd’s assumption seems unlikely. What concerns us, however, is Lloyd’s belief about the song, which is clearly articulated in his book.
- [11] Consideration of possible relationships between the name “Reynardine” and three older names, already associated with outlawry when the ballad emerged, might prove fruitful: “Reynoldyn” is a traditional name for a ballad outlaw associated with Robin Hood (Dobson and Taylor 1997, 90), “Rinaldo Rinaldini” is the name of a literary outlaw (Vulpius 1800) and “La Renaudie” was the alias of a sixteenth-century French rebel and outlaw (Balteau vol. IX, 1961, 960).
- [12] Walt Disney understood this, and made Robin Hood a fox.
- [13] Most broadsides give “they lost their former dye” rather than “the lass of Firmadie.” The aural similarity of the two lines is a tantalising indication of early oral transmission.

- [14] Lycanthropy strictly refers to werewolves, but like Lloyd I use it to refer to animal transformation.
- [15] This mode of reference, in which Lloyd's new song borrows resonances of meaning from the pre-existing system of signification of folk songs, is precisely what Julia Kristeva referred to as *intertextuality* (Kristeva 1980, 15).
- [16] The obscure broadside line "brought up in Venus's train" could qualify as mysterious, but Lloyd omitted it from the 1950s version he praised for "preserving the mystery!"
- [17] Lloyd's doubtful claims about sources for some of his songs could have been worse; by claiming he had written songs he had actually collected, he could have falsely laid claim to royalties.
- [18] These are personal opinions, but I suspect that they would be shared widely in both revival and scholarly circles.
- [19] At least in the 1970s. In 2002, he said: " 'Reynardine ... never convinced me. Too much Bert Lloyd!" (Hinton and Wall 2002, 126).

References Cited

- Aarne, Antti and Stith Thompson. *The Types of the Folktale*. F F Communications 184. 4th printing. Helsinki: Academia Scientarium Fennica, 1987. First published 1961.
- Anderson, Robert. *Ballads in the Cumberland Dialect, With Notes and a Glossary and an Essay on the Manners and Customs of the Cumberland Peasantry, by Thomas Sanderson*. Carlisle: H. K. Snowden, 1828.
- Armstrong, Frankie. "On Singing Child Ballads." In *Ballads into Books*, ed. Sigrid Rieuwerts and Tom Cheeseman. 249–58. Bern: Peter Lang, 1997.
- Arthur, Dave. "A. L. Lloyd in Australia." *Root & Branch* 1 (1999): 10–13.
- Balteau, J., M. Barroux, and M. Prévost, ed. *Dictionnaire de Biographie Francaise*. Vol. 1–. Paris: Letouzey et Ané, 1933–.
- Belden, H. M. "'Rinordine,' Irish Song." *Notes and Queries* 10 S. VIII (1907): 468.
- Belden, H. M., ed. *Ballads and Songs Collected by the Missouri Folk-Lore Society*. Columbia, Missouri: University of Missouri, 1940.
- Bendix, Regina. *In Search of Authenticity*. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1997.
- Bodleian Library. *Bodleian Ballad Catalogue*. Harding B 25 [1273]. Oxford: Bodleian Library.
- Brewster, Paul G. "More Indiana Ballads and Songs." *Southern Folklore Quarterly* 5, no. 3 (1941): 169–90.
- Briggs, Katharine M. *A Dictionary of British Folk-Tales. Part A. Folk Narratives*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1970.
- Campbell, Joseph [MacCathmhaoil, Seosamh]. *The Mountainy Singer*. Dublin: Maunsel, 1909.
- Chappell, Louis W., ed. *Folk-songs of Roanoke and the Albemarle*. Morgantown, W. Virg.: The Ballad Press, 1939.
- Child, Francis James, ed. *English and Scottish Ballads*. vol. 1. Boston: Little, Brown and Company, 1860.
- . "Ballad Poetry." In *Johnson's New Universal Cyclopaedia*, ed. Rossiter Johnson. vol 1. 464–8. New York: Alvin Johnson and Son, 1900.

- Combs, Josiah, ed. *Folk-Songs du Midi des Etats-Unis*. Paris: Les Presses Universitaires de France, 1925.
- Creighton, Helen, ed. *Maritime Folk Songs*. Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1961.
- DeNatale, Douglas. " 'Reynardine': A Broadside Ballad of Seduction." *Western Folklore* 39, no. 1 (1980): 40–51.
- Dobson, R. B., and J. Taylor, ed. *Rymes of Robin Hood: An Introduction to the English Outlaw*. Stroud, Gloucestershire: Sutton Publishing, 1997.
- Dorson, Richard M. "Fakelore." *Zeitschrift für Volkskunde* 65 no. 1 (1969): 56–64.
- Eddy, Mary O., ed. *Ballads and Songs from Ohio*. New York: J. J. Augustin, 1939.
- Gammon, Vic. "Song, Sex, and Society in England, 1600–1850." *Folk Music Journal* 4, no. 3 (1982): 208–45.
- . "A. L. Lloyd and History: A Reconsideration of Some Aspects of Folk Song in England and Some of His Other Writings." In *Singer, Song and Scholar*, ed. Ian Russell. 147–65. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1986.
- Gardner, Emelyn, and Geraldine Chickering, ed. *Ballads and Songs of Southern Michigan*. Hatboro, Penns.: Folklore Associates, 1967.
- Gregson, Keith. "The Cumberland Bard: An Anniversary Reflection." *Folk Music Journal* 4, no. 4 (1983): 333–67.
- Harker, Dave. *Fakesong: The Manufacture of British "Folksong" 1700 to the Present Day*. Milton Keynes: Open University Press, 1985.
- Hinton, Brian and Geoff Wall. *Ashley Hutchings: The Guv'nor and the Rise of Folk-Rock*. London: Helter Skelter Publishing, 2002.
- Hobsbawm, E., and Terence Ranger, ed. *The Invention of Tradition*. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Holloway, John, and Joan Black, ed. *Later English Broadside Ballads*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1975.
- , ed. *Later English Broadside Ballads, Volume 2*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1979.
- Housman, A. E. *A Shropshire Lad*. New York: The Heritage Club, 1938.
- Hughes, Herbert. " 'Rinordine,' Irish Song." *Notes and Queries* 10 S. IX (1908): 33.
- , ed. *Irish Country Songs*. 4 vols. London: Boosey and Hawkes, 1909.
- Huntington, Gale, ed. *Songs the Whalemen Sang*. Barre, Mass.: Barre Publishers, 1964.
- Joyce, P. W., ed. *Ancient Irish Music*. Dublin/London/Edinburgh: McGlashan and Gill/Simpkin, Marshall/John Mennzies, 1873.
- Kennedy, Peter, ed. *Folksongs of Britain and Ireland*. New York: Schirmer, 1975.
- Kristeva, Julia. *Desire in Language: A Semiotic Approach to Literature and Art*, ed. Leon S. Roudiez. New York: Columbia University Press, 1980.
- Laws, G. Malcolm. *American Balladry From British Broadside*. Philadelphia, Penns.: American Folklore Society, 1957.
- . *The British Literary Ballad: A Study in Poetic Imitation*. Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 1972.
- Lloyd, A. L. *Come All Ye Bold Miners*. London: Lawrence and Wishart, 1952.
- . *Folk Song in England*. New York: International Publishers, 1967.
- Mackenzie, William Roy, ed. *Ballads and Sea Songs from Nova Scotia*. Hatboro, Penns.: Folklore Associates, 1963.

- Meredith, John, ed. "The Lloyd Controversy: A Depreciation of A. L. Lloyd." *Stringybark and Greenhide* 4, no. 3 (1983): 13–15.
- Merrick, W. Percy. "Sussex Songs." *Journal of the Folk-Song Society* 1, no. 5 (1904): 268–76.
- Niles, John D. "A Traditional Ballad and Its Mask: Tam Lin." In *Ballads and Ballad Research*, ed. Patricia Conroy. 147–59. Seattle: University of Washington, 1977.
- Palmer, Roy. "A. L. Lloyd and Industrial Song." In *Singer, Song and Scholar*, ed. Ian Russell. 133–47. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1986.
- Posen, I. Sheldon. "On Folk Festivals and Kitchens: Questions of Authenticity in the Folksong Revival." In *Transforming Tradition: Folk Music Revivals Examined*, ed. Neil V. Rosenberg. 127–36. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1993 (written 1976). First published in *Canada Folk Bulletin* 2, no. 3 (1979): 3–11.
- Randolph, Vance, ed. *Ozark Folksongs*. Columbia, Miss.: The State Historical Society of Missouri, 1946.
- Renwick, Roger deV. *English Folk Poetry: Structure and Meaning*. Philadelphia, Penns.: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1980.
- Rosenberg, Neil V. Introduction to *Transforming Tradition: Folk Music Revivals Examined*, ed. Neil V. Rosenberg. 1–26. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1993.
- Roud, Steve. *Broadside Index* CD ROM [cited 20 May 2004]. Maresfield, East Sussex. 1994a. Self-published.
- . *Folk Song Index* CD ROM [cited 5 June 2004]. Maresfield, East Sussex. 1994b. Self-published.
- Sedley, Stephen, ed. *The Seeds of Love*. London: Essex Music, 1967.
- Shepard, Leslie. "A. L. Lloyd: A Personal View." In *Singer, Song and Scholar*, ed. Ian Russell. 125–33. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1986.
- Shuldham-Shaw, Patrick, and Emily Lyle, ed. *The Grieg–Duncan Folksong Collection*. vol. 2. Aberdeen: Aberdeen University Press, 1983.
- Stradling, Rod. "Traditional Music Discography." *Musical Traditions* online magazine [cited 8 June 2004]. <http://www.mustrad.org.uk/discos/tradisco.htm>; INTERNET.
- Thomas, Jean. *Devil's Ditties: Being Stories of the Kentucky Mountain People, Told With the Songs They Sing*. Chicago: W. W. Hatfield, 1931.

Discography

- Briggs, Anne. *Anne Briggs*. Topic 12T207. 1971.
- . *A Collection*. Topic TSCD504. 1999.
- Carthy, Martin, and Dave Swarbrick. *Prince Heathen*. Topic TSCD344. 1969.
- Collins, Shirley, and Davy Graham. *Folk Roots, New Routes*. Topic TSCD819. 1965.
- Fairport Convention. *Liege & Lief*. Island IMCD291. 1969.
- Fisher, Archie. *Archie Fisher*. Celtic Music CMCD007. 1968.
- Furey, Finbar, and Eddie Furey. *The Dawning of the Day*. Dawn Records. 1972.
- Jansch, Bert. *Rosemary Lane*. Transatlantic TACD 900784O. 1971.
- Lloyd, A. L. *The Foggy Dew and Other Traditional English Love Songs*. Tradition Records TLP1016. no date (1956?).
- . *English Drinking Songs*. Topic TSCD496. 1961.
- . *First Person*. Topic 12T118. 1966.
- , Anne Briggs, and Frankie Armstrong. *The Bird in the Bush*. Topic 12T135. 1966.
- Roberts, John, and Tony Barrand. *Dark Ships in the Forest*. Folk-Legacy DC-65. 1977.

St Clair, Isla. *Murder & Mayhem*. Highland Classics REHCD533. 2000.

Tabor, June. *Airs and Graces*. Topic 12TS298. 1976.

Vulpus, Christian August. *Rinaldo Rinaldini, Captain of Banditti: A Tale of the Last Century*. London: The Romancist and Novelist's Library, 1800.

Williams, Alfred, ed. *Folk-songs of the Upper Thames*. London: Duckworth [1923].

Biographical Note

Stephen D. Winick is director of the Delaware Valley Folklife Center in Camden, N.J., USA. He is a graduate of the programme in Folklore and Folklife at the University of Pennsylvania, and an adjunct instructor in that programme. He is also a contributing editor to the folk music magazine Dirty Linen.