

FIGHTING FOR THE FUNDAMENTALS OF THE FAITH

The Rise of Liberalism and the Fundamentalist Response¹

Liberalism vs. Princeton Theology

The Context for the American Debate

- Mostly in New England.
- Southern religion was pietistic, conservative, and resistant to anything from the Northern schools.
- Frontier churches (Methodists and Baptists) were either oblivious or uninterested in Eastern developments.
- Most Lutheran and Reformed groups were culturally and creedally insulated.
- Debate focused on three major figures:
 1. Nathaniel Taylor of Yale
 2. Charles Hodge of Princeton
 3. Horace Bushnell, a Connecticut pastor.

New Haven Theology (Taylorism)

- Introduction
 1. For those who found Old Calvinism hard to embrace.
 2. It modified historical Calvinism to fit the religious revivalism of the time (Second Awakening)
 3. Defended the Revival.
- Nathaniel Taylor (1786–1858)—his ministry
 1. Congregational educator who was trained under Timothy Dwight at Yale College.

¹ Material for this lecture comes from Dr. Michael Vlach's class syllabus.

2. Appointed Professor of Didactic Theology at Yale Divinity School in 1822, and according to Ebenezer Porter of Andover, soon thereafter “volunteered to shed darkness on the world.” Was at Yale until his death.

- Taylor’s theology

1. Rejected the doctrine of imputation “I do not believe that the posterity of Adam are, in the proper sense of the language, guilty of his sin, or that the ill-desert of that sin is truly their; or that they are punished for that sin” (*Consis ad Clerum*, 1828, 14).

Thus, Adam’s sin is not our sin. People choose to sin or not sin.

2. Taught a kind of “mediate imputation”

- a) Man’s nature “is the occasion, or reason of their sinning; --that such is their nature, that in all the appropriate circumstances of their being, they will sin and only sin.”

- b) Men sin as soon as they become moral agents since it is a part of their nature to do so.

- c) Doesn’t mean that nature was itself wicked, only the occasion for sinning.

3. Accepted the governmental theory of the atonement

4. Taught free will with real human ability

5. Denied efficacious grace.

6. Taught election via foreknowledge

7. Said that conversion was a result of education

8. “After Dwight came Taylor, and in the teaching of the latter the downward movement of the New Divinity ran out into a system which turned, as on its hinge, upon the Pelagianizing doctrines of the native sinlessness of the race, the plenary ability of the sinner to renovate his own soul, and self-love or the desire for happiness as the spring of all voluntary action” (B. B. Warfield, *Biblical and Theological Studies*, 536).

9. Overall, his theology was similar to Finney’s (although he did not teach perfectionism).

10. Charles Hodge opposed him.

11. He was accused of being Arminian, even Pelagian. He was also accused of being a heretic.

- Results of the New Divinity and New Haven Theology

1. New understanding of evangelism

- a) Soteriology is humanized to the place that one's salvation is not a miracle.

- (1) All that makes faith extraordinary is that it is first.

- (2) Motives for conversion come not from God, but rise from within the individual.

- (3) New life in Christ is not much more than virtuous habits.

- (4) Similar to Finney

- b) One's understanding of sin and the atonement will impact the presentation of the gospel.

2. Infiltration into Presbyterianism

- a) Presbyterians and Congregationalists formed the Plan of Union in 1801 in order to work together on the frontier.

- b) As a result of this union, New Haven theology penetrated into the Presbyterian church.

- c) The Presbyterians who adopted New Haven Theology became known as New School Presbyterians

- d) In 1837-38, Presbyterianism split into New School, Old School.

- (1) New School was the heir of New Haven theology

- (2) The Old School was the bearer of European, scholastic Calvinism.

- (3) This split lasted until 1869 when the two groups merged in the North, creating the Presbyterian Church in the U. S. A.

- (4) New School Presbyterianism was dominant in this new denomination.

3. The establishment of Hartford Seminary, 1834.
 - a) About the only thing that Congregationalists could do to get rid of heretics was to establish new seminaries.
 - b) Hartford was organized “for the defense of the truth and the suppression of heresy.”
 - c) Hartford received the support of the Old School Presbyterians and Yale the New School.

Progressive Orthodoxy

- Horace Bushnell (1802–1876)
 1. Graduated from Yale College in 1827.
 2. Conversion experience in 1831, and then entered Yale Divinity School when the struggle over New Haven Theology was at its height.
 3. Studied under Nathaniel Taylor.
 4. Concluded that the system of his teacher, was unsatisfactory—too metaphysical and not enough life in it.
 5. Departed enough from New England and New Haven Theology to be considered the founder of the Liberal School of Theology in America.
 6. “Out of this conflagration and because of it, Horace Bushnell emerged. Bushnell, a man of striking intuition, a lively imagination, and considerable poetic flair, successfully pioneered the way to a different kind of theology. . . . Thus Nathaniel Taylor became the stepping stone from Hodge’s stringent orthodoxy to Bushnell’s ‘progressive orthodoxy,’ which actually contained within it most of the elements of classical liberal theology” (Wells, “The Debate Over the Atonement,” *Bib.Sac.*, 246).
 7. Author of *God in Christ* (1849), *Christ in Theology* (1851), and *Christian Nurture* (1847).
- Features of “Progressive Orthodoxy”
 1. Tendency towards Sabellianism in the doctrine of God in his earlier works.

- a) The Trinity is a trinity of revelation, not actuality.
 - b) But in his later works, seems to be orthodox.
2. Taught the Moral Influence Theory of the atonement
- a) Don't look to the agonies of Christ on the cross for the ground of forgiveness, but to that divine love that is declared there.
 - b) As a person sees the love of God demonstrated on the cross, he will love God (and others).
 - c) It is the response of love to love.
 - d) Purpose of the atonement is reformatory for Bushnell; for Hodge, it was retributive because of the holy nature of God; for Taylor, it was deterrent.
3. Developed a new approach to Christian education
- a) Before Bushnell, children raised in Congregational homes were taught to think of themselves as morally depraved until a conversion experience.
 - b) Bushnell didn't believe in total depravity.
 - c) He insisted that a child is susceptible to good even though he is plagued by sinful tendencies from birth.
 - d) Children should grow up not knowing themselves to be anything other than a Christian.
 - e) Based on the organic nature of the family—Home the channel of God's grace. Grace is essentially hereditary.
 - f) "The great liberalizer of mid-nineteenth century American theology was Horace Bushnell, from whom the social gospel of Washington Gladden and others was to stem directly. Bushnell's Christian Nurture did more than any single factor to break down the extreme individualism of the old Puritanism" (Charles Hopkins, *Rise of the Social Gospel*, 5).

Princeton Theology

- Princeton theology was "a scholarly, logical, luminous and warmhearted reproduction of the Calvinism of the seventeenth century as laid down in the Westminster

standards of 1647, and revised in America, 1788,” (Philip Schaff, *Theological Propedeutic*, 390).

- “The Princeton theology sprang from the minds of its exponents, but it flowed outward from Princeton through institutions which vastly transcended those individuals” (Mark Noll, *The Princeton Theology*, 18).
- Princeton Seminary
 1. Founded in 1812 as the second major American theological seminary, only four years after Andover (Trinitarian Congregational).
 2. By 1844, there were six Presbyterian seminaries associated with Old School and six associated with New School.
 - a) Princeton’s 110 students and four faculty made it the largest of the Presbyterian institutions.
 - b) Andover, with 153 students was the largest of all denominations (Yale Divinity—72; Harvard Divinity—27).
 - c) By Princeton’s centennial in 1912, had enrolled over 1000 more students than any other seminary in the U. S.
- The Princeton theologians
 1. **Archibald Alexander** (1772–1851), the “father of Princeton Theology”
 - a) First professor in the chair of systematic theology at Princeton
 - b) Apparently a very earnest, spiritual man, known for his godly counsel, moving preaching, and balanced character.
 - c) Constructed the framework which shaped the theology of the seminary, stressing devotion to the Bible, concern for religious experience, Presbyterian creeds, and systematic theology.
 - d) Used Francis Turretin’s theology book for a textbook.

2. **Charles Hodge** (1797–1878)

a) His early ministry

- (1) Named Professor of Oriental and Biblical Literature in 1822.
- (2) Married a great grand-daughter of Benjamin Franklin in 1822.
- (3) 1826-1828, studied in Germany at Halle under Tholuck, Hengstenberg, and Neander, and gained a new appreciation for the benefits of intellectual effort and a new concern about the dangers of rationalism, mysticism, and ritualism.
- (4) Professor of Exegetical and Didactic Theology in 1844, taking much of Alexander's teaching responsibilities.
- (5) "Although rigid in his views, he was tender-hearted and affectionate and given to strong emotions. His goodness and kindness made him universally beloved" (*Dictionary of American Biography*).

b) Founded the distinguished *Biblical Repertory and Princeton Review* in 1825.

- (1) Used it to attack New Haven Theology, Charles Finney's revivalistic New Measures, and Germany's liberals.
- (2) "read with enthusiasm in Old School manses and seminaries throughout the country, with both delight and some exasperation in other Reformed communities, and with mingled amazement and wrath at N. W. Taylor's Yale, Edwards Amasa Park's Andover, John Williamson Nevin's Mercersburg, and Charles Finney's Oberlin" (Noll, 22).
- (3) Articles in the journal were usually responses to published essays, sermons, or articles in other periodicals.
- (4) Format "ideally suited the Princetonians' image of themselves as theological guardians responsible not so much for expounding a theology as defending traditional Calvinism."

- (5) After Hodge, the name changed to *Presbyterian Quarterly* and *Princeton Review*.
- c) Moderator of the General Assembly (Old School) in 1846
 - (1) Very much a denominational man.
 - (2) Against independent missionary societies, and other kinds of para-church organizations. (See his defense of church boards against voluntary societies in Smith, Handy, Loetscher, II, 88ff.)
- d) Classic work—*Systematic Theology*, 1872
- e) He said at his semi-centennial celebration as professor, “a new idea never originated in this seminary.”

3. **Archibald Alexander Hodge** (1823–1886)

- a) Not as impressive as his father, but had the greatest ability for precise and concise expression among the major Princetonians.
- b) Served as a missionary to India and a pastor in younger years.
- c) Served 12 years at Allegheny Seminary as Professor of systematic theology.
- d) 1877, associate with his father in theology at Princeton.
- e) 1878, became professor of systematic theology when his father died.
- f) Co-author with B. B. Warfield of an important essay on inerrancy in 1881.
- g) Published *Outlines in Theology* in 1878.
- h) Co-edited with Charles Briggs *The Presbyterian Review* the last six years of his life.

4. **Benjamin Breckinridge Warfield** (1851–1921) |

- a) 1876, Warfield graduated from Princeton, then was married, traveled in Europe, and served as an assistant pastor.
- b) 1878, began to teach New Testament Literature and Language at Allegheny Seminary.
- c) Succeeded A. A. Hodge as Professor of Didactic and Polemic Theology at Princeton in 1887.
- d) Much more aloof, and not active in the denomination—partly because he had to care for his invalid wife.
- e) Wrote “an incredible number of articles, review, and monographs for both popular and scholarly forums (perhaps half of them collected in ten substantial volumes after his death), yet he did not produce a magnum opus on the order of Hodge’s *Systematic Theology*. . .” (Noll, 15).
- f) Machen wrote in a letter describing Warfield’s funeral, February 19, 1921: “It seemed to me that the old Princeton—a great institution it was—died when Dr. Warfield was carried out” (Noll, 16).

- Themes of the Princeton Theology

- 1. Inspiration and inerrancy of Scripture

- a) “Inspiration extends to everything which any sacred writer asserts to be true,” including “incidental circumstances, or facts of apparently minor importance, as e.g., that Satan tempted our first parents in the form of a serpent” (C. Hodge, *Systematic Theology*, I, 163).
 - b) Noll, 26: “Unlike some of their successors in defense of the inerrancy of Scripture, Warfield and the Hodges wrote on this subject with care, precision, learning, careful qualifications, and notable absence of pietistic anti-intellectualism.”

- 2. Creation of the universe

a) Charles Hodge

(1) 1874, at the age of 77, C. Hodge published a popular exposition on the theme that theism and natural selection could not be reconciled.

(2) Entitled, *What is Darwinism?* It proclaimed that acceptance of evolution inevitably leads to atheism and loss of morals.

b) A. A. Hodge accepted the possibility of some evolution if it were not defined naturalistically. Evolution with God.

c) B. B. Warfield eventually allowed for a thorough-going theistic evolution.

3. Covenant Theology

a) Covenant of Works:

(1) God entered into a covenant with Adam as the head and representative of the whole race.

(2) Everything promised or granted to Adam, or threatened against him, has a bearing on the whole race.

b) Covenant of Grace

4. Calvinism: Infralapsarianism. God permitted the fall of man, but He is not the cause of it (C. Hodge, II, 313).

5. Salvation of infants—All who die in infancy are saved (I. 26).

6. “We have reason to believe . . . that the number of the finally lost in comparison with the whole number of the saved will be very inconsiderable” (III, 879).

7. Pietism—Talk of “heart religion,” and the inner ministry of the Holy Spirit.

8. Eschatology

- a) Postmillennialism. Modern day postmillennial eschatology had been invented by Daniel Whitby (1638–1726).
- b) Postmillennialism nicely accompanied the scientific age.
- c) Postmillennialism had been adapted by theological liberals—evolutionary, optimistic about society. But also, evangelicals had also taught it. (It is incorrect to make a necessary connection between liberalism and postmillennialism.)

9. Apologetics

- a) Scottish Common Sense Realism
- b) Theology is a science and Christianity can be proven by inductive reasoning (Evidentialism).
- c) “Truth and reason are so intimately connected, that they can never, with propriety, be separated. Truth is the object, and reason the faculty by which it is apprehended, whatever be the nature of the truth, or the evidence by which it is established. . . . In receiving, therefore, the most mysterious doctrines of revelation, the ultimate appeal is to reason” (A. Alexander, “A Brief Outline of the Evidences of the Christian Religion” [1823]).
- d) Charles Hodge was less of an evidentialist than others and tended to rely on the internal testimony of the Holy Spirit somewhat, but still teaches man’s ability to know God through reason and observation (Old Princeton).
- e) B. B. Warfield seems to be the most rationalistic: “Inspiration is not the most fundamental of Christian doctrines, nor even the first thing we prove about the Scriptures. These we first prove authentic, historically credible, generally trustworthy, before we prove them inspired” (*Inspiration and Authority of the Bible*, 210).

“Historians who have written about fundamentalism and evangelicalism have not always seen the significance of this [nineteenth century] debate. In a sense, the fundamentalist-modernist debates of the 1920’s and 1930’s were a foregone conclusion, given the extraordinary conflagration between the new School and Old School in the previous century” (Wells, 245).

American Fundamentalism

The Period of Conception (1875–1919)

- Roots. A number of earlier movements come together to form the fundamentalist movement.
 - Protestant Orthodoxy and Fundamentalism
 - We can trace fairly directly the basic theology of fundamentalism back through the evangelicals, Puritans and Pietists, to the Reformation, and even back to the ancient creeds.
 - Justification by faith (Protestant Reformation), regeneration/conversion (evangelicalism), Bible is inspired (creeds and confessions), Trinity (back to ancient creeds); etc.
 - However, there are different emphases:

<u>Protestant Orthodoxy</u>	<u>Fundamentalism</u>
1. Less consistent hermeneutics	1. Literal hermeneutics
2. Bible plus the historic creeds	2. Bible plus no creeds
3. Usually Amil or Postmil	3. Usually Premillennial
4. Less personal separation	4. Stricter personal separation
5. Usually Covenant Theology	5. Closer to Dispensationalism
6. Less stress on evangelism	6. More stress on evangelism
7. Accepts the fundamentals	7. Accepts the fundamentals
8. Began with the Reformation	8. Roots in the Bible conferences
9. More Calvinistic	9. Less Calvinistic
10. European beginning	10. American beginning
11. Denominationally oriented	11. Interdenominationally oriented

- Scottish Common Sense Realism
 - Francis Bacon (1561-1626)—scientific method, inductive reasoning.

- Thomas Reid (1710-96)
 - Things really exist that we distinctly perceive by our senses and are what we perceive them to be. That is, we may rely on our natural faculties to distinguish truth from error. It's just common sense that our observations are correct.
 - Theologians in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries often followed this methodology. Thought that they were being scientific when they did theology.
 - Arthur T. Pierson: "I like a biblical theology that does not start with the superficial Aristotelian method of reason, that does not begin with an hypothesis, and then warp the facts and the philosophy to fit the crook of our dogma, but a Baconian system, which first gathers the teachings of the word of God, and then seeks to deduce some general law upon which the facts can be arranged."
 - Also leads to semi-rational apologetics and stress on evidences.
 - Greatly impacted the Princeton theologians: Archibald Alexander, Charles Hodge, A. A. Hodge, B. B. Warfield.
 - Marsden proposes that this scientific Baconianism with its quest for the precise evidences, scientific inductivism, is the philosophical framework for the rise of fundamentalism.
 - It is a new paradigm, a kind of theological rationalism. Had impact on Dispensationalism—numbers, charts, divide, kingdom of God v. kingdom of heaven (cf. Marsden, 57). Some say it had an influence on the inerrancy of Scripture issue. But the concept of inerrancy existed long before the Princeton theologians, or even before the Protestant scholastics. And dispensationalists were not the first ones to talk about numbers, detailed prophecy, etc.
- American Revivalists
 - Won thousands to Christ, emphasizing personal salvation rather than social salvation.
 - Generally preached the fundamentals of the faith.
 - Generally opposed some of the liberal developments.

- They upheld the meetings of other conservative revivalists and Bible teachers—developed a network.

- **Dwight L. Moody** (1837–1899)
 - a) Moody was born in East Northfield, Massachusetts and later moved to Boston. He was reared a Unitarian and became a Christian as a teenager when his Sunday school teacher, Edward Kimble, came to the shoe shop where Moody worked. Moody had been attending Kimble’s class at the Mount Vernon Congregational Church only because his employer had insisted.

 - b) In 1856, Moody moved to Chicago and joined the Plymouth Congregational Church where he began teaching a children’s Sunday school class. He also became active in the YMCA, which at that time was evangelical and evangelistic in nature. The mission Sunday school in which Moody was ministering grew until by 1862, there were 450 children attending. In early 1864 a new building was completed with an auditorium seating 1,500. By the end of 1864, the Sunday school officially organized as the Illinois Street Church with Moody as its pastor. The church was non-denominational, though evangelical and sympathetic with the Congregational distinctives. Moody also became president of the Chicago YMCA and soon had opportunities to address large conventions.

 - c) In 1867, Moody went to England where he attended some YMCA meetings and met Charles Spurgeon and George Mueller. He also visited Dublin, Ireland, where he became acquainted with the “boy preacher,” Harry Moorehouse. Moorehouse and Moody eventually became close friends, and Moody gave Moorehouse credit for teaching him how to preach biblical sermons. While in England, he began to preach with amazing results. While preaching at a church in north London, he finished his sermon and invited all who would like to become Christians to stand to their feet, and he would pray for them. It seemed as though the whole audience arose and Moody was so taken aback that he told all who were really in earnest to meet the pastor there the next evening. There were more inquirers there on Monday night than had been there on Sunday.

 - d) The great Chicago fire devastated Moody’s property in 1871. The YMCA building, the Illinois Street Church, and his home were all

burned to the ground. The church was later rebuilt and named the Chicago Avenue Church, or simply, “Moody’s church.”

- e) In 1870, Moody began to preach some revival crusades, including England (1871), Brooklyn (2000 saved), and Philadelphia (4000 saved). His methods included five meetings a day, an inquiry room, sermons by subjects rather than texts, and genuine compassion.
- f) Ira D. Sankey was his musician.
- g) In the middle 1870’s, Moody moved his permanent home to Northfield where he began to organize schools and conferences, including:
 - (1) Mount Hermon School for Boys (1881)
 - (2) The first World’s Student Conference (1886)
 - (3) Northfield Training School for Girls (1890)
 - (4) Northfield Bible Conference.
 - (5) Moody was also involved in the founding of a Bible institute in Chicago in the late 1880s.

- **Sam Jones** (1847–1906)

- a) A Georgia lawyer, excessive drinker, left legal career.
- b) Converted in 1872 at his father’s death bed.
- c) Eventually went into a lay ministry with the southern Methodists.
- d) Became a circuit rider in Georgia.
- e) In 1884, he began full-time revival ministry.
- f) Not a theologian, but placed an emphasis on hell, heaven, sin, salvation.
- g) Many people came to hear his southern hill country stories.
- h) Large meetings especially in the South.
- i) Traveled with his musician, E. O. Excell.

- **Rodney “Gypsy” Smith** (1860–1947)

- a) Born in England of Gypsy parents.
- b) Converted as a teenager in a little Primitive Methodist Church (after a visit to John Bunyan's home).
- c) Joined the Salvation Army and served as a Captain until 1882.
- d) Began evangelistic ministry, and in 1889, went to America on an evangelistic tour.
- e) Joined Manchester Wesleyan Mission, and later worked with the YMCA.
- f) Made 40 campaigns in the U.S. until he was 85.
- g) Also held revival services in Australia, South Africa, France, Great Britain.
- h) For example, in one of his last visits to the U.S., the San Antonio meeting, 10,000 plus decision cards; Winston-Salem—27,500 decision cards.
- i) One biographer said that he "was the world's most popular preacher for more than seventy years."
- j) Not too much negative: Persuasive, soft emotionalism, kind of a romantic originality, even poetic.
- k) Preached the love of Christ for sinners, the need of repentance, the need of spirituality for Christians.

- **William (Billy) A. Sunday** (1862–1935)

- a) A professional baseball player, converted at the Pacific Garden Missions in Chicago in 1886.
- b) Became an assistant secretary in the YMCA.
- c) In 1893, he joined the organization of J. Wilbur Chapman as his “advance man,” in charge of arrangements.
- d) In 1895, he held a revival service in Iowa and then continued with more campaigns.
- e) In the “teens” of the twentieth century, he preached in the big cities of America.
- f) For example, he claimed 98,000 converts in a New York City campaign.
- g) Usually held in huge wooden tabernacles.
- h) Olmstead: “Undoubtedly the most accomplished showman among revivalists . . .” (456).
- i) Major attacks on “booze,” dancing, and tobacco.
- j) Theologically “was a thoroughly conservative Presbyterian” (Olmstead, 456).
- k) After 1909, he was accompanied by the song leader, Homer Rodeheaver.

- Influential Pastor-Teachers

- **A. J. Gordon** (1836–1895)

- a) Clarendon Street Church, Boston. Unsaved musicians. Drama.
 - b) In his ministry, membership grew from 358 to 1000.

- c) Founded and edited a periodical, *The Watchword*.
 - d) Wrote several books: *Ecce Venit, The Ministry of the Holy Spirit*
 - e) Boston Missionary Training School, 1889
 - (1) Later renamed Gordon Bible College
 - (2) Today, Gordon College in Wenham, Mass.
 - f) He was an inconsistent dispensationalist.
 - g) Held to the imminency of the rapture, at least until near the end of his life.
 - h) Was premillennial, but interpreted Revelation historically.
 - i) In pneumatology, thought that it was possible not to accept the baptism of the Holy Spirit.
 - j) Miracles possible today.
 - k) Upheld vigorously the fundamentals of the faith.
- **James H. Brookes** (1830–1897)
 - a) From Pulaski, Tenn.
 - b) Grandfather was president of Hampden Sidney College.
 - c) His father died with James was 3 years old.
 - d) Was a school teacher in his teens.
 - e) At 21, he headed off to Princeton but stopped in Ohio and was persuaded to attend Miami University at Oxford.
 - f) While at Miami, he also studied at the United Presbyterian Seminary at Xavier.

- g) Later studied at Princeton.
- h) Pastored First Presbyterian Church of Dayton, Ohio.
- i) Pastored the Second Presbyterian church of St. Louis.
- j) Pastored the Washington and Compton Avenue Presbyterian Church in St. Louis.
- k) During his ministry, 2,754 people added to the membership.
- l) Founder and editor of The Truth.
- m) Published more than 200 tracts and books: Maranatha, May Christians Dance, God Spake All These Words, The Holy Spirit, Israel and the Church, Mystery of Suffering.
- n) Founder of the Niagara Bible Conference.
- o) Was a consistent dispensationalist.
- p) Was the teacher of C. I. Scofield.
- q) Was a defender of conservative Presbyterianism. He was a member of the committee of 15 that brought charges against Charles Briggs in 1893. He was also a member of the committee of 5 that reviewed the case.

- **C. I. Scofield** (1843–1921)

- a) A rough early life, a soldier in the Confederate army.
- b) Lawyer after the war, and eventually elected to the state legislature in Kansas.
- c) President Grant appointed him the United States Attorney for the District of Kansas and the Indian Territory when he was 29.
- d) Was an alcoholic.
- e) Converted at 36, and his Roman Catholic wife soon left him and divorced him (finalized in 1883).

- f) Studied under Brookes and became a part time pastor of Hyde Park Congregational Church in St. Louis in 1880.
- g) Pastored the First Congregational Church of Dallas.
 - (1) First sermon preached to 11 women and 1 man.
 - (2) Two accepted Christ, and one of these, Hettie Wartz, he married in 1884.
- h) Pastored the East Trinitarian Church in East Northfield, Mass. (Preached Moody's funeral).
- i) 1902, back to the Dallas church, later renamed, Scofield Memorial Bible Church.
- j) Scofield separated from Congregationalism in 1908.
- k) Helped found Philadelphia Bible Institute.
- l) Was a prolific writer.
- m) Active at Niagara conference.
- n) A moderate Calvinist, and well-known for his Dispensationalism.

- o The Bible Conference Movement

- Conducted by evangelicals
- Offered a sounding board for the proclamation of the fundamental doctrines of Scripture.
- Was a base for the development of Dispensationalism which became a part of Fundamentalism.
- Provided opportunities for friendship among conservatives.
- Provided an opportunity for leadership to develop.
- Contributed to the spirit of interdenominationalism, a basic characteristic of fundamentalism. Retarded ecclesiastical separation for early fundamentalism.

○ **The Niagara Bible Conference**

- Began with a small bible study in 1875 near Chicago, led by J. H. Brookes.
- The next year, the Bible study took the name, the Believers' Meeting, and met at Swampscott, Mass.
- Met in different places: Watkins Glen, New York; Clifton Springs, New York; Old Orchard, Maine; Mackinaw Island, Michigan; 1893-97, Niagara-on-the Lake, Ontario, Canada; Point Chautauqua, N.Y.; and ended in 1900 at Asbury Park, New Jersey.
- After 1897, the Conference declined for several reasons:
 - a) Death of Brookes
 - b) Proliferation of Bible conferences
 - c) Internal dissensions over pretribulationism and posttribulationism.
 - d) Aftermath: A. C. Gaebelein, Sandy Cove, NY—the Sea Cliff Bible Conference.
 - e) Typical program: Opened with an evening prayer meeting on Wednesday; for the following seven days, heard two messages in the morning, two in the afternoon, one in the evening. On Sunday, there was a gospel message in the morning, often at a local church, a communion service in the afternoon, and a missionary message in the evening.

○ **Northfield Conferences**

- Started in 1880 by D. L. Moody, and continued to 1902.
- Well attended because of the popularity of Moody.
- Most of the leading Bible teachers of the day spoke there: Gordon, Munhall, Needham, etc.
- More emphasis on the power of the Spirit—Keswick like—2nd line of fundamentalism.
- One conference saw over 100 volunteers come forward for foreign missionary service.

○ **Other Summer Bible Conferences**

- Many, such as Winona Lake with J. Wilbur Chapman; Rocky Mountain Bible Conference, and dozens of smaller conferences.
- The First American Bible and Prophetic Conference, 1878.
 - a) Dollar: “But annual summer bible conferences would have had a small effect on national Christian thinking if they had not spawned two larger conferences at which definitive tenets were enunciated—the conference of 1878 in New York, and in Chicago in 1886. With them the Fundamentalists die was cast: indeed, these cities deserve to be hailed as the birthplace of American Fundamentalism.”
 - b) Held October 30 to November 1, 1878, at the Episcopal Church of the Holy Trinity in New York City.
 - c) Practically all denominations represented at the Conference, including many great scholars: 47 Presbyterians, 26 Baptists, 16 Episcopalians, 7 Congregationalists; 6 Methodists, 5 Adventists, 4 Dutch Reformed, 1 Lutheran, 10 not identified.
 - d) Publication of the addresses in *Premillennial Essays of the Prophetic Conference*.
 - e) Meeting came to national attention partly through the New York Tribune, that published an extra edition of 50,000 copies containing many of the addresses of the conference. In the following years, the religious journals and magazines discussed and amplified the messages of the conference.
 - f) Sandeen, 157: “The conveners of the 1878 conference, thus, succeeded beyond their expectations in alerting American Protestants to the nature of their movement. Whether they had anticipated the volume of criticism that would accompany the publicity . . . is not known. But once initiated into the struggle, these leaders of millenarianism did not flinch or turn back . . . They were utterly convinced that they were right.”

○ **The Second American Bible and Prophetic Conference, 1886**

- Held November 16-21, 1886, at the Farwell Hall in Chicago.
- One of the city’s leading newspapers, Inter Ocean, printed the addresses.

- Purpose was to promote and solidify conservative Protestantism.
- Session dominated by Presbyterians and Baptists though all of the major denominations were represented.
- Participants included A. J. Gordon, James H. Brookes, Nathaniel West, George C. Needham, W. R. Nicholson (Reformed Episcopal), L. W. Munhall (Methodist), W. G. Moorehead (Presbyterian), W. J. Eerdman (Congregational), D. W. Whittle (Congregational), etc.
- Conference reaffirmed the 1878 confession.
- Published the addresses in *Prophetic Studies of the International Prophetic Conference*.

Fundamentalist Literature in the Period of Conception

- *Scofield Reference Bible* (1909, 1917)
 - Scofield thought about the project for several years.
 - In 1902, at the second Sea Cliff Bible conference, plans began for its construction.
 - The First Congregational church in Dallas relieved him of minor pastoral duties so he could have time to work on the notes.
 - Consulted with various other Bible students (“consulting editors”) as to dates of books and interpretations of difficult passages.
 - Influential Oxford Press published in 1909, and a second edition in 1917.
 - Extraordinarily influential in promoting orthodoxy and dispensationalism.

- *Jesus is Coming* (1898)
 - Authored—W. E. B. (Blackstone).
 - Explanations and Bible readings on the Second Coming.
 - Blackstone was a Methodist lay worker, superintendent of the Chicago Jewish Mission.

- Later became a pastor in Oak Park, Illinois.
 - Lyman Stewart paid for a free copy of this book to thousands of pastors, professors, missionaries, and theological students (pp. 3, 78, 72).
- Religious Periodicals
- *The Truth*, Brookes
 - *The Watchword*, Gordon
 - *The Watchword and Truth*, Robert Cameron
 - *Our Hope*, A. C. Gaebelein
 - *Moody Monthly*, J. M. Gray
 - *Bibliotheca Sacra* Oldest continuing theological quarterly in America (1844).
 - *Princeton Theological Review* (for Princeton Theologians)
- *The Fundamentals* (1910–1915)
- A series of 12 volumes on the major doctrines of the Bible, apologetic in nature.
 - Financed by Lyman and Milton Stewart (primarily Lyman), two wealthy business men, chief stockholders in the Union Oil Company.
 - Sent the book free to thousands of Christian workers—about 3 million volumes distributed at a cost of about \$200,000.
 - Organization of the project was entrusted to A. C. Dixon, pastor of Moody Church in Chicago.
 - As an editorial committee, Dixon chose 3 laymen and 3 clergymen, including R. A. Torrey.
 - 64 authors wrote the articles:
 - a) Millennialists include A. C. Gaebelein, James M. Gray, C. I. Scofield, R. A. Torrey, etc.
 - b) English clergy: H. C. G. Moule, G. Campbell Morgan, W. H. Griffith Thomas, James Orr, etc.
 - c) Non-millennialists: B. B. Warfield, etc.

- Approach: Not academic, but rather practical, pastoral, and apologetic—Semi-rational.
- Content devoted to three major areas:
 - a) 29 articles devoted to safeguarding the Bible.
 - b) 31 articles were apologetics for other doctrinal fundamentals of the faith.
 - c) 30 articles were devoted to personal testimonies, attacks upon heretical beliefs, discussions of the relationship of science and religion, appeals for missions and evangelism.
- Evaluation: Orthodox, but not really the first statement of American fundamentalism.
 - a) Millennialism not emphasized.
 - b) Moderate style in comparison to later fundamentalist writings.
 - c) Included non-Americans.
 - d) Sandeen: “Although the series is often viewed as the first shot in the Fundamentalist controversy, there is little evidence of this in the pamphlets themselves” (206-07).
 - e) George Dollar: “Fundamentalist fellowships never used this as a complete statement of their faith, since literalism in prophecy, imminency of the Lord’s Coming, and a premillennial stand are not found in them. These booklets should be hailed as the Fundamentals of orthodoxy” (175).

The Bible School (Institute) Movement

- Reasons for the movement
 - Negative
 - a) The continual secularization of the major denominational colleges.

- b) An increase in the teachings of anti-biblical doctrines in church colleges.
 - c) The fall of theological seminaries to liberalism (Andover, Union, Univ. of Chicago Divinity School, etc.)
 - d) College/seminary took too long to prepare missionaries.
- Positive
 - a) To evangelize the large cities.
 - b) To promote foreign missions, particularly the faith missions movement.
- Early American Bible Institutes
 - Missionary Training College
 - a) Founded in 1882 by A. B. Simpson
 - b) Now known as Nyack Missionary College
 - Union Missionary Training Institute
 - a) Founded in 1884 by Lucy Drake Osborn
 - b) In 1916, merged with the National Bible Institute in New York City.
 - Moody Bible Institute
 - a) Originally founded as Chicago Bible Institute.
 - b) Initiated in 1886, though did not have a full program until 1889.
 - c) Moody was involved with the school from the beginning, and the name was later changed to Moody Bible Institute.
 - Boston Missionary Training School
 - a) Founded in 1889 by A. J. Gordon
 - b) Later named changed and today called Gordon College
 - Northwestern Schools
 - a) Started by W. B. Riley in 1902
 - b) Later, college and seminary added

- Bible Institute of Los Angeles in 1907
- Philadelphia School of the Bible—1914 (Scofield and Pettingill)

The Heresy Trials

- The setting Conservative Presbyterians, in particular, thought that by keeping a strong doctrinal statement and by bringing to trial the major liberals, they could preserve orthodoxy in the denomination. Three Presbyterian liberals were thus either brought to ecclesiastical trial, or nearly so, and forced out of the denomination.

- **Charles A. Briggs** (1841–1913)
 - From 1874-1913, was professor of Hebrew at Union Seminary in New York, and later Professor of Biblical theology.
 - Held liberal views of the Bible, including the JEDP theory and Errancy, though he was a conservative in Christology.
 - The General Assembly defrocked Briggs for heresy in 1893 over his doctrine of inspiration.
 - Union Seminary separated from the General Assembly at that time and became an independent Presbyterian seminary. Briggs continued teaching there.
 - In 1899, Briggs became a priest in the Protestant Episcopal Church.

- **Henry Preserved Smith** (1847–1927)
 - Professor of church history at Hebrew at Lane Theological Seminary.
 - 1875, ordained into the Presbyterian ministry.
 - Published several important books: *Age of Reformation*, *Biblical Scholarship and Inspiration*, *Bible and Islam*, etc.
 - 1893, charged with heresy on inspiration and suspended from the Presbyterian ministry.
 - 1899, ordained in the Congregational church.

- 1898, Professor of biblical Literature at Amherst.
- 1913-1925, Professor and Librarian at Union.
- **A. C. McGiffert** (1861–1933)
 - Scholar in church history—studied under Adolf von Harnack.
 - Professor at Lane Seminary, 1888-93, and Union Seminary, 1893-1926.
 - In 1897, published *A History of Christianity in the Apostolic Age*.
 - a) Criticized as containing teachings incompatible with the Westminster Confession.
 - b) Matter brought to the General Assembly in 1898.
 - c) No definite action taken, but the controversy prompted McGiffert to withdraw from the Presbyterian Church in 1900.
 - Later became a Congregationalist.
- Was this a good way to keep a church or school from going liberal? Later in the 1930's the Presbyterian Church was defrocking fundamentalist Presbyterians.

Results of the Period of Conception

- The nucleus of an aggressive conservative group had been identified in the period of conception.
- But these embryonic fundamentalists had not really won conclusive positions, although they were successful in the heresy trials.