

MORE ABOUT THE STRATEGY USED IN THIS CASE STUDY: Public transportation access and quality

At-a-Glance



Summary

- Between 2008 and 2015, King County increased public transit fares six times. The increases
 disproportionately affected low-income residents, fifty-six percent of whom relied on public
 transit for most or all of their transportation needs. In 2015, the County's community engagement
 efforts revealed that transit costs were negatively impacting low-income residents' mobility.
- Later that year, King County Metro, in partnership with Sound Transit, launched ORCA LIFT, a
 subsidized transit fare program. The program offered residents with incomes 200 percent or
 less of the federal poverty line a roughly half-price discount on fares for most transit routes.
 After extensive community engagement revealed that cost was still a barrier for many residents,
 in 2020, the transit agencies launched a fully subsidized pass for residents with incomes below
 80 percent of the federal poverty line.
- Keys to ORCA LIFT's success include a commitment to reducing racial disparities, which created buy-in for transit subsidies; an existing unified payment system for the region's transit providers; partnerships with local and state social services agencies to enroll eligible residents; a focus on outcomes and evidence, which allows for continuous learning; and robust efforts to engage stakeholders to better understand transit barriers and needs.
- Challenges the program faces include confusion around eligibility requirements, the logistics behind
 distributing physical transit cards, issues reaching all eligible residents, limited ability to address
 barriers to transit access beyond fares, and reduced enrollment due to the COVID-19 pandemic.

Results and Accomplishments

In a pilot study, fullysubsidized passes more than doubled the number of rides low-income residents took on public transit, compared to those who paid a reduced fare of \$1.50.

6,000

Residents have enrolled in the subsidized annual pass program as of August 2021, despite the COVID-19 pandemic.

Fully-subsidized fares had less of an impact on residents who did not have a bus stop in their neighborhood, suggesting that the subsidized annual pass may be more effective in combination with other attributes of the transit system, such as route availability and scheduling.

- Improved regional access to transit for low-income residents: Prior to the public launch of the fully subsidized annual pass, a randomized control trial of a pilot found that recipients of a fullysubsidized transit pass more than doubled their transit usage compared to individuals using the reduced-fare ORCA LIFT program. The majority of fully-subsidized rides occurred during off-peak hours, meaning that transit systems' busiest routes were not overwhelmed. The study was conducted with researchers at LEO at the University of Notre Dame and the University of California-Irvine.
- Improved transit access for all kinds of riders: Increases in the number of trips occurred both among pre-existing riders and those who previously did not use public transit, and effects were similar across demographic groups.
- Early success for riders holding the new subsidized annual pass for riders: Despite being launched during the COVID-19 pandemic, in its first quarter of operation, the subsidized annual pass allowed over 3,000 residents to take over 100,000 individual transit trips. As of August 2021, 6,000 residents have enrolled, with over 60% of enrollees identifying as Black, Indigenous, or as a person of color.
- Serving as a national model: Jurisdictions across the United States have developed communitycentered mobility plans and income-based fares using many of the components of the King County model, like partnering with human service agencies for recruitment, enrollment, and pass distribution.

Overview



What was the challenge?

- A regional affordability crisis: Starting in the early 2010's, housing price increases in King
 County began to accelerate. Residents with low incomes were increasingly displaced and
 forced to move further from job centers to access affordable housing, increasing commute
 times and transportation costs for families. Black, Indigenous, and other people of color are
 over-represented among people with low incomes, making this a significant racial and economic
 equality issue.
- Rising public transit fares: Between 2008 and 2015, King County raised transit fares six
 times, in compliance with a <u>policy</u> mandating that passenger fares recover at least 25% of
 system costs. The increases disproportionately affected riders with low-incomes, both because
 transportation costs eat up a higher percent of their incomes and because people with low
 incomes rely more on public transit for their mobility.
- Reliance on public transit among residents with low-incomes: In Washington State, residents
 with incomes below the poverty line are seven times less likely to own a car. In King County, <u>56%</u>
 of residents with low-incomes rely on public transit for most or all of their transportation needs,
 including getting to work, attending school, and accessing essential health services. People of
 color in King County are nearly 70% more likely to be reliant on public transportation for their
 mobility than White people.
- Significant cost barriers to ridership: In 2015, King County Metro conducted a substantial
 community engagement process to learn more about how transit costs were impacting mobility
 for many residents with low incomes. In response, the County launched ORCA LIFT, a reducedfare program for riders with low incomes. A second robust community engagement process
 revealed that the reduced <u>ORCA LIFT</u> fares were still too expensive for nearly a third of riders,
 particularly those with the lowest incomes.

What was the solution?

- A new subsidized annual pass: Recognizing that reduced ORCA LIFT fares were still too
 expensive for many riders, King County Metro, in partnership with Sound Transit (another
 regional transit authority) launched a <u>subsidized annual pass program</u>. It allows residents with
 low incomes to travel fare-free on both Metro and Sound Transit's bus, light rail, subway, and
 water taxi systems, among others. The transit agencies subsidize fares by providing eligible
 customers with smart cards that are preloaded with annual passes.
- Subsidized passes available for residents with low incomes: The subsidized annual pass is available to residents at or below 80% of the federal poverty level and who are enrolled in one of six state benefit programs. Approximately 107,000 people across the region are currently eligible.

- Transit pass distribution via public benefits agencies: To provide subsidized annual passes
 to eligible riders, King County Metro partners with Public Health Seattle & King County, the
 Washington State Department of Social and Health Services, and Catholic Community Services.
 When interacting with clients on other public benefits matters, staff members at these agencies
 are able to instantly inform participants of their program eligibility, help them enroll, distribute
 physical passes, and connect them with other benefits for which they may qualify.
- Focusing on racial disparities leads to reform: The creation of the subsidized pass was largely
 the result of the 2016 implementation of a countywide equity framework, the <u>Equity and Social</u>
 <u>Justice Strategic Plan</u>. This plan leads with race to embed an equity framework throughout all
 aspects of County government, of which Metro is a department. It calls for equity-enhancing
 investments over a six-year period. Influenced by the County plan, King County Metro convened
 an <u>Equity Cabinet</u> in 2019, which served as a driving force behind the push for subsidized annual
 passes.

What factors drove success?

- Commitment to reducing racial disparities among local leaders: For over a decade, County
 Executive Dow Constantine and many members of County Council have championed an
 inclusive approach to county decision making. The 2016-2021 King County Equity and Social
 Justice Strategic Plan created a blueprint for investments in economic mobility across county
 government and created urgency for departments across government (including Metro) to center
 reducing disparities in their policies, programs, and operations. The push for subsidized annual
 transit passes came largely as a result of this countywide focus on increasing economic mobility.
- Community co-creation: At multiple points, King County Metro <u>engaged</u> and convened large groups of stakeholders to better understand transit barriers and needs. Alongside these broader engagement efforts, the Metro Equity Cabinet provided focused feedback and recommendations to policymakers. All of these efforts led to better-tailored services and increased uptake among residents.
- Recruitment and enrollment partnerships with state and local agencies: By partnering
 with human service partners (Public Health Seattle & King County, the Washington State
 Department of Social and Health Services (DSHS), and Catholic Community Services) to enroll
 residents, Metro dramatically increased its ability to reach riders, particularly people of color.
 Processes created during the implementation of the Affordable Care Act have enabled human
 service providers to efficiently check eligibility, enroll, and distribute physical cards to clients.
- Unified regional payment systems and collaboration among transit providers: In 2009, transit
 providers across the Puget Sound region collaborated to create a unified payment system, the
 One Regional Card for All (ORCA). This provided a critical foundation for both the ORCA LIFT
 program, which includes six of seven regional transit providers, and the subsidized annual pass,
 which currently includes King County Metro and Sound Transit.

Continuous learning approach: King County Metro has increased its focus on outcomes and
evidence building over the course of the rollout of ORCA LIFT and the subsidized annual
pass. The programs have led to King County Metro creating stronger data infrastructure and
processes for program improvement, as well as new partnerships with communities, researchers
and human service agencies.

What were the major obstacles?

- Barriers to transit access beyond fares: Community engagement, surveys, and the evaluation of King County Metro's fully-subsidized fare pilot have demonstrated that even with fully subsidized fares, many other factors inhibit mobility and transit use for residents with low incomes, including transit route availability, route timing and reliability, and safety concerns.
- Logistics of distribution: The process of providing physical transit cards to customers is labor intensive. Limited technological capacity related to fare tracking exacerbates the problem; however, new technology investments scheduled for next year may mitigate the problem.
- Confusion around eligibility: Because transit systems in the region offer multiple types of fare
 discounts and programs, customers are often confused about which fares they are eligible for, which
 slows the enrollment and uptake process. ORCA LIFT is available to anyone with incomes at or below
 200% of the federal poverty level, but the subsidized annual pass is only available to recipients of
 certain state benefit programs. This makes communication about eligibility challenging.
- Reaching eligible residents: Metro needed to go beyond a traditional marketing plan to ensure
 that eligible individuals were aware of the subsidized annual pass, with a particular engagement
 focus on communities of color and communities where English is not the primary language
 spoken at home. Advertising and outreach at libraries and food banks and through community
 partners are seen as a more effective way to reach eligible populations and are underway.
- Pandemic hampers enrollment: The subsidized annual pass launched in October 2020, in the midst of the COVID-19 pandemic, hindering in-person enrollment efforts. As of August 2021, roughly 6,000 residents have enrolled--far below pre-COVID projections.

Timeline





2012-2013

Fare increases lead to creation of Low-Income Fare Options Advisory Committee

After four fare increases between 2008-2011, the King County Council establishes the Low-Income Fare Options Advisory Council. Composed of community members and human service providers, the Committee is tasked with researching barriers to transit access and providing recommendations for subsidized fare programs. The Committee's recommendations are published in 2013.

2015

King County Metro launches ORCA LIFT program

Drawing from the recommendations of the Low-Income Fare Options Advisory Council, Metro launches <u>ORCA LIFT</u>, a means-tested subsidized public transportation fare program. The program offers a roughly half-price fare discount, at \$1.50 per ride for residents with an income 200% or less of the federal poverty level.

2016

King County publishes Equity and Social Justice Strategic Plan

The <u>plan</u>, a collaboration between public sector leaders and community partners, provides all county agencies with a blueprint to guide decision-making, planning, and workplace practices to advance economic mobility and social justice. It prioritizes "investments that address the root causes of inequities, ultimately leading to better quality of life and greater prosperity in all of our communities."

NOVEMBER 2018

County Council mandates creation of Metro mobility framework

King County Council, seeking to execute on the Equity and Social Justice Strategic Plan, unanimously passes <u>Motion 15253</u>, which calls on Metro to convene a group of community leaders and stakeholders from underrepresented groups to inform transit offerings. The goal is, "to ensure that innovations in mobility put people first, use public space equitably and efficiently, and are coordinated with transit policies and regional funding strategies."

2019

Mobility Equity Cabinet identifies additional barriers to transit access

Several meetings of the Metro Mobility Equity Cabinet <u>reveal</u> continued barriers to transit access, including cost-related and non cost-related barriers. From these meetings, Metro decides to launch a pilot of fully-subsidized fares for very low-income residents.

MARCH 2019

Fully subsidized fare pilot begins

To launch the fully-subsidized transit pilot, King County partners with Notre Dame's Wilson Sheehan <u>Lab for Economic Opportunities</u> (LEO) and UC-Irvine to evaluate the impact of providing six months of fully-subsidized transit to residents earning less than 200% of the federal poverty line. The study includes two cohorts of 1,797 participants and informs the development of the subsidized annual pass.

2019

County Council mandates community engagement and development of a new program

King County Council issues a budget provision requiring Metro to convene partners and evaluate options to increase affordability, with an income-based approach. Metro and community partners determine that to reach people with the greatest needs, the focus of the new program should be people with the lowest incomes, access should be tied to other benefit programs, and that the new program should be a component of the existing ORCA LIFT program.



MARCH 2020

Metro adopts mobility framework

The King County Council adopts the <u>Mobility Framework</u> co-created with Metro's Mobility Equity Cabinet, which recommends that Metro makes fares more affordable; invests in increased safety, speed, and service to areas with unmet needs; and continues to evaluate program impacts and outcomes.

OCTOBER 2020

Metro launches new fully subsidized annual pass

With promising evaluation results from the program pilot, King County Metro partners with Sound Transit to enhance the ORCA LIFT program by adding a fully subsidized option. The new program provides low-income residents (earnings below 80% of the federal poverty line) who are enrolled in certain state benefit programs with annual, renewable transit passes at no cost. The County estimates 107,000 residents across a three-county region are eligible for the program. Metro partners with Notre Dame's Wilson Sheehan Lab for Economic Opportunities (LEO), UC-Irvine, and UPenn Medicine to lead an impact evaluation of the program.

2021

Metro rolls out reforms to address non-cost barriers to transit access

Evidence from King County indicates that low-income riders face significant non-cost barriers to transit. King County Metro is pursuing new initiatives to address these barriers, including engagement with Somali and Filipino community groups to begin designing a program that would offer personalized assistance to navigate public transit.

Implementation Process



How did leaders confront the problem?

- An increasingly unaffordable region: Starting in the early 2010's, housing price increases began
 to accelerate across King County. Residents with low incomes face increasing displacement, with
 many people moving further away from job centers in search of affordable housing. As the housing
 crisis worsens, county leaders increasingly focus on issues of affordability and racial disparities.
- Fare increases lead to ultimatum: Alongside rising housing prices, losses in sales tax revenue
 that support the King County Metro system (caused largely by the 2007 financial crisis) lead to
 four fare increases between 2008 and 2011. County Executive Dow Constantine vows that fares
 will not rise for low-income riders again.

- Low-income Fare Options Advisory Committee is created: In response to rising fares, the King
 County Council creates the Low-Income Fare Options Advisory Committee, which recommends
 income-based transit fare discounts for King County residents earning less than 200% of the
 federal poverty line. The Council adopts the Committee's recommendations, and the program,
 known as ORCA LIFT, becomes a significant step in reducing racial disparities in access to
 transportation. ORCA LIFT is the largest income-based reduced fare program in the country at the
 time.
- Community engagement reveals need for greater affordability: After ORCA LIFT is
 implemented, an advisory board convened by King County Metro and other community voices
 identify additional barriers to transit access. Metro finds that even at discounted rates, reduced
 fares remain too expensive for many riders, among other findings.

How was the strategy designed?

- Fare reform recognized as feasible and high impact: With the original mandate to improve
 transportation access, local leaders and community partners identified subsidized fares as
 having the potential to significantly reduce racial and economic disparities while also remaining
 financially feasible. The strategy was seen as having a high return on investment when
 compared to other approaches, like creating new transit infrastructure.
- Creating regional buy-in: Metro leadership recognized that improving transit access demanded
 coordinated action from several providers across the region. To secure this buy-in, King County
 Executive Constantine, County Councilmembers, and Metro leadership championed the
 importance of reducing racial disparities across government and in public forums. For ORCA
 LIFT, six of the region's seven transit providers agreed to partially subsidize fares. For the
 subsidized annual pass, Metro and Sound Transit are currently participating.
- Incorporating learnings from ORCA LIFT: Many aspects of the subsidized annual pass's design
 were informed by learnings from ORCA LIFT's rollout. While analysis of ORCA LIFT focused on
 traditional performance measures like enrollment, for the subsidized annual pass, Metro leaders
 shifted to a focus on rider outcomes and community impact.
- Metro plays a central coordinating role: King County Metro distributes cards to enrollment
 partners, purchases transit passes that get loaded onto those cards, provides customer service,
 and manages cards in the ORCA system. Metro also develops and implements procedures
 around the fully subsidized pass, provides outreach material, and convenes partners to
 troubleshoot barriers.
- Crucial partnerships with human service agencies: In designing both ORCA LIFT and the
 subsidized annual pass program, Metro leaders identified the distribution of physical cards as
 a potential barrier to success. To address this, Metro formed partnerships with state and local
 human service agencies, which had the ability to instantly verify client incomes. Cards are
 distributed by human service agency staff--when interacting with clients, these staff verify
 income based-eligibility, enroll residents in the program, and distribute physical ORCA cards.

How was the approach funded?

- County covers the cost of the subsidized annual passes: King County and Sound Transit cover
 all of the costs associated with the subsidized annual pass. In its first year of operations, the total
 cost of the subsidized annual pass program was approximately \$2.9 million. The majority of this
 cost has been for the subsidized annual passes themselves, which cost \$756 per pass per year.
 The program's first year operating costs were \$442,000. King County covers all of these costs.
- Contract with enrollment partner to manage the ORCA LIFT program and regional network:
 Metro contracts with Public Health Seattle & King County for \$900,000 per year to cover
 dedicated staff costs and two Seattle storefronts that conduct ORCA LIFT program recruitment
 and enrollment. The Washington State Department of Social and Health Services (DSHS) and
 Catholic Community Services currently support the subsidized annual pass program without
 financial compensation.

How was the plan implemented?

- Building on ORCA LIFT: Much of the rollout for the subsidized annual pass was built
 on processes created for the implementation of ORCA LIFT. Launching ORCA LIFT took
 approximately 9 months between June 2014 and March 2015, requiring four full-time staff
 members to develop the rollout plan, prepare social service providers to distribute cards, and
 conduct outreach and public engagement.
- Implementing subsidized annual passes: King County announced the launch of the subsidized annual pass in October 2020. Metro's engagement strategies were focused on intentional outreach to individuals who would qualify for the pass. Metro also provided partner human service agencies with a communications toolkit they could use to explain the subsidized annual pass to their staff and to clients.
- COVID-19 demands unconventional outreach approaches: With in-person enrollment slowed by the pandemic, enrollment for programs has moved to phone and online. King County Metro revamped its existing neighborhood pop-up series, which provides information about fare options, to a virtual model. Metro also revamped its web pages to help customers more easily identify fare options and eligibility. The site includes an online tool where visitors can answer five questions to find the option that is best for them and an online portal for customers to apply for fare programs remotely.
- A pathway to expansion: As part of its scaling plan, King County Metro will consider expanding
 enrollment locations and eligibility as early as next year, as well as begin recruiting additional
 transit agencies to participate in the program.

How was the approach measured and refined?

- Prioritizing evaluation of the subsidized annual pass program: ORCA LIFT was implemented
 with a focus on traditional performance measures like enrollment. In strengthening its evidencebuilding approach, Metro partnered with a team of researchers from Notre Dame's LEO, UCIrvine, and UPenn to evaluate the impact of the subsidized annual pass program on outcomes
 like mobility, employment, and health, disaggregated by race. Metro aims to adjust this program
 based on evaluation findings, and to consider additional changes to ORCA LIFT to increase
 access and affordability.
- Short- and long-term impacts: The initial randomized control trial evaluation of fully subsidized
 transit passes focused on rider behavior, finding increased transit ridership and predominantly
 off-peak ridership. LEO and UC Irvine continue to evaluate program impacts on outcomes such
 as financial stability, employment and earnings, as well as a range of measures related to
 personal well-being.
- Addressing non-cost barriers: The findings from the study suggest that proximity to transit stations, in addition to fare affordability, is a determinant in access to transit. Recognizing that cost is only one aspect of the transit accessibility landscape, King County Metro is in the process of creating new services, like a community-informed pilot to provide community-based "Transit Navigators" who can provide personalized guidance to riders.

Acknowledgments

Results for America would like to thank the following individuals for their help in the completion of this case study: Carrie Cihak, Chief of Policy at King County Metro Transit; Lindsey Greto, Chief of Reduced Fare Programs at King County Metro Transit, Maria Jimenez-Zepeda, ORCA Reduced Fare Project Program Manager at King County Metro Transit; Sean Hawks, Strategic Communications and Brand Manager at King County Metro Transit; De'Sean Quinn, Capital Program Manager at King County Metro Transit; David Phillips, Associate Research Professor of Economics at the University of Notre Dame; and Matthew Freedman, Professor of Economics at the University of California, Irvine.

Learn more

- Wilson Sheehan Lab for Economic Opportunities "Lessons Learned: ORCA LIFT"
- ORCA LIFT overview
- King County Equity and Social Justice Strategic Plan
- King County Metro: Mobility Framework
- · Income-based fares public engagement report

