Background

Birds are useful indicators of ecological change because they are highly mobile and generally conspicuous. As climate in a particular place changes, suitability may worsen for some species and improve for others. These changes in climate may create the potential for local extirpation or new colonization. This brief summarizes projected changes in climate suitability by mid-century for birds at Chaco Culture National Historical Park (hereafter, the Park) under two climate change scenarios (see Wu et al. 2018 for full results, and Langham et al. 2015 for more information regarding how climate suitability is characterized). The high-emissions pathway (RCP8.5) represents a future in which little action is taken to reduce global emissions of greenhouse gases. The low-emissions pathway (RCP2.6) is a best-case scenario of aggressive efforts to reduce emissions. These emissions pathways are globally standardized and established by the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change for projecting future climate change. The findings below are model-based projections of how species distributions may change in response to climate change. A 10-km buffer was applied to each park to match the spatial resolution of the species distribution models (10 x 10 km), and climate suitability was taken as the average of all cells encompassed by the park and buffer.

Results

Climate change is expected to alter the bird community at the Park, with greater impacts under the high-emissions pathway than under the low-emissions pathway (Figure 1). Among the species likely to be found at the Park today, climate suitability in summer under the high-emissions pathway is projected to improve for 12, remain stable for 19 (e.g., Figure 2), and worsen for 7 species. Suitable climate ceases to occur for 10 species in summer, potentially resulting in extirpation of those species from the Park. Climate is projected to become suitable in summer for 14 species not found at the Park today, potentially resulting in local colonization. Climate suitability in winter under the high-emissions pathway is projected to improve for 14, remain stable for 5, and worsen for 4 species. Suitable climate ceases to occur for 2 species in winter, potentially resulting in extirpation from the Park. Climate is projected to become suitable in winter for 44 species not found at the Park today, potentially resulting in local colonization.

We report trends in climate suitability for all species identified as currently present at the Park based on both NPS Inventory & Monitoring Program data and eBird observation data (2016), plus those species for which climate at the Park is projected to become suitable in the future (Figure 1 & Table 1). This brief provides park-specific projections whereas Wu et al. (2018), which did not incorporate park-specific species data and thus may differ from this brief, provides system-wide comparison and conclusions.

Important

This study focuses exclusively on changing climatic conditions for birds over time. But projected changes in climate suitability are not definitive predictions of future species ranges or abundances. Numerous other factors affect where species occur, including habitat quality, food abundance, species adaptability, and the availability of microclimates (see Caveats). Therefore, managers should consider changes in climate suitability alongside these other important influences.

Figure 1. Projected changes in climate suitability for birds at the Park, by emissions pathway and season.
Results (continued)

Potential Turnover Index
Potential bird species turnover for the Park between the present and 2050 is 0.25 in summer (41st percentile across all national parks) and 0.23 in winter (32nd percentile) under the high-emissions pathway. Potential species turnover declines to 0.12 in summer and 0.13 in winter under the low-emissions pathway. Turnover index was calculated based on the theoretical proportions of potential extirpations and potential colonizations by 2050 relative to today (as reported in Wu et al. 2018), and therefore assumes that all potential extirpations and colonizations are realized. According to this index, no change would be represented as 0, whereas a complete change in the bird community would be represented as 1.

Climate Sensitive Species
The Park is or may become home to 5 species that are highly sensitive to climate change across their range (i.e., they are projected to lose climate suitability in over 50% of their current range in North America in summer and/or winter by 2050; Table 1; Langham et al. 2015). While the Park may serve as an important refuge for 4 of these climate-sensitive species, one, the Northern Harrier (*Circus cyaneus*), might be extirpated from the Park in summer by 2050.

Management Implications
Parks differ in potential colonization and extirpation rates, and therefore different climate change adaptation strategies may apply. Under the high-emissions pathway, Chaco Culture National Historical Park falls within the high potential extirpation group. Parks anticipating high potential extirpation can focus on actions that increase species’ ability to respond to environmental change, such as increasing the amount of potential habitat, working with cooperating agencies and landowners to improve habitat connectivity for birds across boundaries, managing the disturbance regime, and possibly more intensive management actions. Furthermore, park managers have an opportunity to focus on supporting the 4 species that are highly sensitive to climate change across their range (Table 1; Langham et al. 2015) but for which the park is a potential refuge. Monitoring to identify changes in bird communities will inform the selection of appropriate management responses.

Caveats
The species distribution models included in this study are based solely on climate variables (i.e., a combination of annual and seasonal measures of temperature and precipitation), which means there are limits on their interpretation. Significant changes in climate suitability, as measured here, will not always result in a species response, and all projections should be interpreted as potential trends. Multiple other factors mediate responses to climate change, including habitat availability, ecological processes that affect demography, biotic interactions that inhibit and facilitate species’ colonization or extirpation, dispersal capacity, species’ evolutionary adaptive capacity, and phenotypic plasticity (e.g., behavioral adjustments). Ultimately, models can tell us where to focus our concern and which species are most likely to be affected, but monitoring is the only way to validate these projections and should inform any on-the-ground conservation action.
More Information

For more information, including details on the methods, please see the scientific publication (Wu et al. 2018) and the project overview brief, and visit the NPS Climate Change Response Program website.

References


Wu et al. (2018) Projected avifaunal responses to climate change across the U.S. National Park System. PLOS ONE.

Contacts

Gregor Schuurman, Ph.D.
Ecologist, NPS Climate Change Response Program
970-267-7211, gregor_schuurman@nps.gov

Joanna Wu
Biologist, National Audubon Society
415-644-4610, science@audubon.org

Species Projections

Table 1. Climate suitability projections by 2050 under the high-emissions pathway for all birds currently present at the Park based on both NPS Inventory & Monitoring Program data and eBird observation data, plus those species for which climate at the Park is projected to become suitable in the future. "Potential colonization" indicates that climate is projected to become suitable for the species, whereas "potential extirpation" indicates that climate is suitable today but projected to become unsuitable. Omitted species were either not modeled due to data deficiency or were absent from the I&M and eBird datasets. Observations of late-season migrants may result in these species appearing as present in the park when they may only migrate through. Species are ordered according to taxonomic groups, denoted by alternating background shading.

* Species in top and bottom 10th percentile of absolute change

° Species that are highly climate sensitive

- Species not found or found only occasionally, and not projected to colonize by 2050

x Species not modeled in this season

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Common Name</th>
<th>Summer Trend</th>
<th>Winter Trend</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cinnamon Teal</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ring-necked Pheasant</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pied-billed Grebe</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American White Pelican</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Bittern</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization°</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yellow-crowned Night-Heron</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White-faced Ibis</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization°</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northern Harrier</td>
<td>Potential extirpation°</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooper's Hawk</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>Improving</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Common Name</th>
<th>Summer Trend</th>
<th>Winter Trend</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Harris's Hawk</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Red-tailed Hawk</td>
<td>Stable</td>
<td>Improving</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sora</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Common Gallinule</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mountain Plover</td>
<td>Stable</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spotted Sandpiper</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greater Yellowlegs</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Least Sandpiper</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long-billed Dowitcher</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White-winged Dove</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Common Name</td>
<td>Summer Trend</td>
<td>Winter Trend</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mourning Dove</td>
<td>Stable</td>
<td>Improving</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inca Dove</td>
<td></td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yellow-billed Cuckoo</td>
<td>Improving</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greater Roadrunner</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barn Owl</td>
<td></td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Great Horned Owl</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>Worsening*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burrowing Owl</td>
<td>Stable*</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lesser Nighthawk</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Common Nighthawk</td>
<td>Stable</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black-chinned Hummingbird</td>
<td>Stable</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belted Kingfisher</td>
<td></td>
<td>Stable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gila Woodpecker</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ladder-backed Woodpecker</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northern Flicker</td>
<td>Worsening*</td>
<td>Improving</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gilded Flicker</td>
<td></td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Kestrel</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>Improving</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gray Flycatcher</td>
<td>Worsening</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black Phoebe</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Say’s Phoebe</td>
<td>Stable</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ash-throated Flycatcher</td>
<td>Improving*</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brown-crested Flycatcher</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cassin’s Kingbird</td>
<td>Improving*</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Kingbird</td>
<td>Improving</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loggerhead Shrike</td>
<td>Improving</td>
<td>Improving</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northern Shrike</td>
<td></td>
<td>Potential extirpation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Warbling Vireo</td>
<td>Potential extirpation</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Common Name</th>
<th>Summer Trend</th>
<th>Winter Trend</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pinyon Jay</td>
<td>Worsening</td>
<td>Worsening*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steller’s Jay</td>
<td>Potential extirpation</td>
<td>Worsening*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>California/Woodhouse’s Scrub-Jay (Western Scrub-Jay)</td>
<td>Stable</td>
<td>Stable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Common Raven</td>
<td>Potential extirpation</td>
<td>Worsening*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Horned Lark</td>
<td>Stable</td>
<td>Stable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Violet-green Swallow</td>
<td>Worsening*</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barn Swallow</td>
<td>Improving</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cliff Swallow</td>
<td>Stable</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Juniper Titmouse</td>
<td>Stable</td>
<td>Stable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verdin</td>
<td></td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bushtit</td>
<td>Stable</td>
<td>Improving</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rock Wren</td>
<td>Stable</td>
<td>Improving</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bewick’s Wren</td>
<td>Stable</td>
<td>Improving</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cactus Wren</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blue-gray Gnatcatcher</td>
<td>Potential extirpation</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black-tailed Gnatcatcher</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eastern Bluebird</td>
<td></td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Bluebird</td>
<td>Potential extirpation</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mountain Bluebird</td>
<td>Potential extirpation</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hermit Thrush</td>
<td></td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gray Catbird</td>
<td>Potential extirpation</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curve-billed Thrasher</td>
<td>Improving</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bendire’s Thrasher</td>
<td></td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crissal Thrasher</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Common Name</td>
<td>Summer Trend</td>
<td>Winter Trend</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sage Thrasher</td>
<td>Worsening*</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northern Mockingbird</td>
<td>Improving*</td>
<td>Improving</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bohemian Waxwing</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential extirpation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phainopepla</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chestnut-collared Longspur</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lucy's Warbler</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green-tailed Towhee</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rufous-crowned Sparrow</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canyon Towhee</td>
<td>Stable</td>
<td>Improving*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abert's Towhee</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rufous-winged Sparrow</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cassin's Sparrow</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chipping Sparrow</td>
<td>Potential extirpation</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brewer's Sparrow</td>
<td>Potential extirpation</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vesper Sparrow</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lark Sparrow</td>
<td>Stable</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black-throated Sparrow</td>
<td>Improving</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sagebrush/Bell's Sparrow (Sage Sparrow)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lark Bunting</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Savannah Sparrow</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lincoln's Sparrow</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swamp Sparrow</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White-crowned Sparrow</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Improving</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dark-eyed Junco</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>Stable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Tanager</td>
<td>Worsening</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pyrrhuloxia</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blue Grosbeak</td>
<td>Improving*</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eastern Meadowlark</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Meadowlark</td>
<td>Stable</td>
<td>Improving</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Great-tailed Grackle</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brown-headed Cowbird</td>
<td>Stable</td>
<td>Potential colonization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bullock's Oriole</td>
<td>Improving</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>House Finch</td>
<td>Improving</td>
<td>Improving</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lesser Goldfinch</td>
<td>Stable</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>