October 6, 2022

The Honorable Kathy Hochul Governor of New York State NYS State Capitol Building Albany, NY 12224

Re: Support for signature of S.6486-D/A.7389-C,

Dear Governor Hochul:

We, the undersigned organizations, businesses, labor, and faith groups, write today to urge you to sign A.7389-C (Kelles)/S.6486-D (Parker) into law without delay. This legislation would place a two-year moratorium on the issuance of new air permits and air permit renewals for electric generating facilities that use fossil-fuels that provides in whole, or in part, energy used for Proof-of-Work cryptocurrency mining, and directs the Department of Environmental Conservation (DEC) to conduct an environmental review.

We thank you and DEC for the important, and precedent-setting decision to deny the Title V Air Permit for the Greenidge Generation power station. This decision aligns with New York's Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act, and the natural next step to build upon this decision and adhere New York's climate mandates is to swiftly sign A.7389-C/S.6486-D into law.

Allowing for the life of dying fossil fuel power plants to be extended for cryptocurrency mining would take New York backwards in meeting the goals and mandates established under the Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act. Cryptocurrency mining's energy consumption must be reviewed to see if the practice can align with New York's climate law. Attached you will find a letter sent to you in October 2021 that further details environmental concerns with cryptocurrency mining.

This legislation takes a very measured approach to this emerging concern with two simple provisions:

- 1. Establishes a two-year pause on the issuance of new air permits and air permit renewals filed after the effective date for electric generating facilities that use fossil-fuels that provides in whole, or in part, energy used for proof-of-work cryptocurrency mining.
- 2. Requires the Department of Environmental Conservation to issue a final generic environmental impact statement after close of the public comment and public hearing period no later than one year after the effective date.

This bill does NOT:

- 1. Stop all crypto mining activities in New York.
- 2. Impact existing mining facilities, mining that plugs directly into the grid (which is how most mining takes place currently), mining utilizing renewable energy sources, or other validation methods
- 3. Prevent the purchase, selling, trading, holding or use of cryptocurrencies in any manner.

Opposition states that this bill unfairly targets a specific industry and technology. It does not for two key reasons:

1. Other industries are not repowering fossil fuel power plants, and most entities do not require the level of energy needed to demand a whole power plant. New York should not support the repowering of fossil fuel plants for any purpose, given our climate law mandates and the local, statewide, and national impacts burning fossil fuels has on the environment and public health. But

- we *know* <u>crypto miners have been repowering fossil fuel plants</u> in NY and across the country, which is why it's important this bill hones in on that
- 2. Should fossil-fueled crypto mining activities expand as has been projected, this industry could single-handedly jeopardize New York's climate goals due to their energy demand. Based on current, in construction, and proposed crypto mining facilities, energy demand from this industry would be enough to power 750,000 homes twice the size of Buffalo. We are already seeing this play out in Texas. According to Texas grid operator ERCOT, cryptocurrency miners in Texas will be using an estimated 6 gigawatts of electricity by 2023—the equivalent of what it takes to power every home in the state's largest city, Houston. This is why the environmental review that comes with this legislation is of particular importance.

Additionally, there are very few jobs created by crypto mining, with profits accruing to the few, but the environmental impacts affect us all, particularly low-income communities that are often located near fossil fuel power plants and have been disproportionately affected by ongoing and legacy contamination. Considering the millions, and billions, of dollars being invested by proof-of-work crypto mining operations in rural and often times, economically distressed areas, and how lucrative mining just one Bitcoin has historically been (currently valued at roughly \$20,000, down 57% year-to-date), one would imagine the jobs at these facilities would number in the hundreds, similar to the emerging electric vehicle manufacturing industry. Instead:

"A \$1.9 billion facility by FX Solutions and Atlas Power near Williston, ND would create around 100 temporary construction jobs and support only 30 employees over the long-term. Meanwhile, the first stage of the project would draw 240 MW of electricity — roughly, the amount of energy needed to power the city of Fargo — and eventually ramping up to a powerhouse 700-megawatt scale."

AboutBit's \$50 million facility in Sullivan County, IN - which will extend the life of the Merom Generating Station (a coal-fired power plant), would create 15 high-tech jobs.⁴

Additionally, BIPOC and low-income communities are often near polluting peaker plants – these polluting facilities could be kept online longer if crypto mining continues to ramp up statewide energy demands.

Signing A.7389-C/S.6486-D is critical to ensure New York doesn't undercut its landmark climate law and protects communities. We urge you to keep up New York's momentum following the Greenidge decision to address the hugely energy consumptive proof-of-work cryptomining industry by signing this bill into law

Thank you for your time and consideration of our comments.

¹ U.S. House of Representatives, Committee on Energy & Commerce Staff, *Memorandum, Hearing on "Cleaning Up Cryptocurrency: The Energy Impacts of Blockchains"* (Jan. 17, 2021),

 $[\]frac{https://energycommerce.house.gov/sites/democrats.energycommerce.house.gov/files/documents/Briefing\%20Memo_OI\%20Hearing_2022.01.20.pdf.$

pdf.

² Tanaya Macheel, Arjun Kharpal, "Bitcoin bounces back after falling to new 2022 lows over the weekend," CNBC, June 20, 2022, https://www.cnbc.com/2022/06/20/bitcoin-btc-rebounds-but-struggles-to-hold-above-20000-.html

³ Adam Willis, Large-scale crypto mining data center planned for western North Dakota oil patch, In Forum (Jan. 26, 2022), https://www.inforum.com/business/large-scale-crypto-mining-data-center-planned-for-western-north-dakota-oil-patch.

⁴ Alex Brown, Startup to Establish Crypto Mining Facility in Sullivan County, Inside Indiana Business (May 11, 2022), https://www.insideindianabusiness.com/articles/startup-to-establish-crypto-mining-facility-in-sullivan-county.

Sincerely,

Todd Hobler

Executive Vice-President Upstate Division 1199 Service Employees International Union, United Healthcare Workers East

Jordan Dale Secretary 350 NJ-Rockland

Sara Gronim Co-leader 350Brooklyn

Dorian Fulvio

Steering Committee member

350NYC

Michele Gilliam

Deputy Political Director

Action Center on Race and the Economy

Raul J. Aguirre

Deputy Executive Director Adirondack Council

George Povall Executive Director All Our Energy

Andra Leimanis

Communications & Outreach Director Alliance for a Green Economy

Dean Rios-Gomez Executive Director

Atlantic Climate Justice Alliance

Judith Zingher Green Team Chair

Bet Am Shalom Synagogue, White Plains, NY

Judith Enck President Beyond Plastics

Jerone Gagliano

CEO

Bright Building LLC

Jennifer Scarlott Coordinator

Bronx Climate Justice North

Brian Eden Vice-Chair

Campaign for Renewable Energy

Brian Eden Vice President

Cayuga Lake Environmental Action Now

(CLEAN)

Bob Cohen

Policy and Research Director Citizen Action of New York

Bryan L Swift

State-level Action Team member

Citizens' Climate Lobby – New York State

(CCL-NY)

Laurie Konwinski

Member

Citizens' Climate Lobby SouthernTier/FingerLakes

Tracy Frisch

Co-Founder, Board Member

Clean Air Action Network of Glens Falls

Bridge Rauch

Environmental Justice Organizer Clean Air Coalition of WNY

Laurel Tumarkin

Co-lead

Climate Families NYC

Thomas Hirasuna

Co-Chair

Climate Reality Finger Lakes Greater Region

NY Chapter

Joseph Pepe Climate Leader

Climate Reality Project

Ken Dolsky Organizer

Coalition Against Pilgrim Pipeline - NJ

Joseph Wilson Coordinator

Coalition for Outreach, Policy & Education

Maura Stephens Co-founder

Coalition to Protect New York

Arthur Kopelman

President

Coastal Research and Education Society of Long

Island

Abi Buddington Secretary

Committee to Preserve the Finger Lakes

Ruth Foster Board Member

Community Advocates for a Sustainable

Environment

Michel Lee Chair

Council on Intelligent Energy & Conservation

Policy

Robert Schloss

Circle Core Team Leader

Dayenu Rockland Westchester: A Jewish Call to

Climate Action

Ken Dolsky Co-leader

Don't Gas the Meadowlands Coalition

Elizabeth Moran

New York Policy Advocate

Earthjustice

Colleen Boland Co-Founder

Elmirans & Friends Against Fracking

Conor Bambrick

Director of Climate Policy Environmental Advocates NY Marisa Rodriguez

Member Relations & Communications

Coordinator

Federated Conservationists of Westchester

County

Eric Weltman Senior Organizer Food & Water Watch

Brahvan Ranga Political Director For the Many

Mark Laster Co-Chair

Forest Hills Green Team

Irene Weiser Coordinator

Fossil Free Tompkins

Mary Finneran Co-Founder FrackBusters NY

Yvonne Taylor Vice President Gas Free Seneca

Patricia Wood Executive Director

Grassroots Environmental Education

Joseph Naham Chairperson

Green Party of Nassau County

Manna Jo Greene Environmental Director Hudson River Sloop Clearwater

Judith M Wiltberger

Owner

Keuka Spring Vineyards

Tawn Feeney

Little Lakes Sustainability Network

Lisa Tyson

Executive Director

Long Island Progressive Coalition

Sheila Out

Organizing Member

Mothers Out Front Tompkins

Guy Jacob

Conservation Chair

Nassau Hiking & Outdoor Club

Daniel Chingyu Chu Energy Planner

New York City Environmental Justice Alliance

Ruth Foster Director

New York Climate Advocacy Project

Alice Hu

Climate Campaigner

New York Communities for Change

Patrick McClellan Policy Director

New York League of Conservation Voters

Cari Gardner Vice Chair

New York Progressive Action Network

Melissa Iachetta Program Manager

New Yorkers for Clean Power

Tamsin Hollo

Steering Committee Member Newburgh Clean Water Project

Jerry Rivers

Environmental Scientist

North American Climate, Conservation and

Environment (NACCE)

Lisa Adamson Partner

North Country Earth Action

Sue Abbott-Jones Co-Director

North Country NYPAN

Richard Schrader

Policy and Legislative Director

NRDC

Ruth Foster Director

NY Climate Advocacy Project

Natalie Polvere

Environment Committee Co-Chair

NYCD-16 Indivisible

Cari Gardner
Directror

NYPAN Greene

Sandra Kissam

Chair

Orange RAPP

Tanya Dwyer President

Parish House Inc.

Mark A Dunlea Convenor

PAUSE (People of Albany United for Safe

Energy)

Doug Couchon President

People for a Healthy Environment

Laurel Tumarkin Organizer

Peoples Climate Movement – NY

Vicki Michela

Steering Committee Member Progressive Schenectady

Victoria Adler Co-Founder

Queens Climate Project

Gerri Wiley

Co-Founder, Facilitator

RAFT (Residents Allied for the Future of Tioga)

Raju Rajan President

ReWild Long Island

Jeremy Cherson

Senior Manager of Government Affairs

Riverkeeper

Nancy Vann President

Safe Energy Rights Group (SEnRG)

Andy Bicking

Director of Government Relations & Public

Policy

Scenic Hudson

Joseph Campbell

President

Seneca Lake Guardian, A Waterkeeper Alliance

Affiliate

Roger Downs

Conservation Director Sierra Club Atlantic chapter

Fred Pfeiffer

Executive Board Member

Solidarity Committee of the Capital District

Brien Weiner President

South Shore Audubon Society

Bill Kish Organizer

Stop Cricket Valley

Suzannah Glidden Co-Founder

Stop the Algonquin Pipeline Expansion (SAPE)

Gay Nicholson President

Sustainable Finger Lakes, Inc.

Carol Baum Organizer

Syracuse Peace Council

Lynn Bailey Saxton

Co-Chair

The Climate Reality Project, Western New York

Chapter

Laura Faulk Co-chair

The Climate Reality Project: Capital Region,

NY Chapter

Peter Bardaglio Coordinator

Tompkins County Climate Protection Act

Regi Teasley

Chair

Tompkins County Environmental Management

Council

Amy R Kletter

Chair, Environment Committee

Ulster Activists

Ling Tsou Co-founder United for Action

Wes Ernsberger

Chair

UU Congregation of Binghamton, Green

Sanctuary

Colleen Boland

Founder

Veterans for Climate Justice

Sonal Jessel Director of Policy

WEACT for Environmental Justice

Nada Khader Executive Director

WESPAC Foundation, Inc.

Caitlin Chang Steering Committee

Westchester Alliance for Sustainable Solutions

(WASS)

Kurt Krumperman

Public Policy Committee Chair Zero Waste Capital District

Finger Lakes Business Coalition:

12th Moon Astrology 17th Century Suds A Holism In Sync A Stone's Throw B&B Abelson Law Office Acorn Designs

Admiral Peabody's Lakeside Lodging

Advanced Remodeling
Airy Acres Vineyard
AKS Apartments, LLC
Aligned Business Concepts
Amazing Grace Bed & Breakfast

American Canoe Association, Atlantic Division

Ann Cain Crusade, R.N., M.S., L.Ac

Ann Sheldon, Life Coach Another Time Antiques Anthony Road Wine Company

Applegate Toys Area Records

Argetsinger Vineyards Atwater Vineyards

Autumn Leaves Used Books B&B: 448 East Broadway LLC Bagley's Poplar Ridge Vineyard

Barnstormer Winery Barry Family Vineyards

Bear Meadow Folk Instruments

Beef N' Brew Bella Stone Massage Bellwether Cidery

Benedict Accounting and Tax Service

Berta's Cafe Bill Carini Gardens Billsboro Winery Bitterwind Hop Farm

Bl.ink

Blackberry Inn B&B Blecher Electric

Bloomer Creek Vineyard Boathouse Beer Garden Bob and Dee

Bob and June's Organic Coffee

Bostwick House B&B Bottomless Brewing Boundary Breaks Vineyard

Bout Time B & B

Bramble: Community Herbalism

Bread 'N' Roses Brian Grafstein LMT Brian Keeler, Artist Bumble & Co. B & B Bunnell Associates Burdett House B&B Burford Books

Buried Treasures Organic Farm Buttonwood Creek Tree Farm

Calm Reflections
Camp Seneca Lake

Cappy's

Capricorn Hill Farms

Captain Bill's & Seneca Harbor Station Cash and Caring Auction Services

Castle Creek Kombucha Catherine Cottages Cathy Emilian Design

Cayuga Chiropractic & Wellness Cayuga Morning Star B & B

Caywood Vineyards Charles Limousine Service Chateau Lafayette Reneau Chefs for the Marcellus Cherry Orchard B & B

Church Creative Flooring, Inc.

Cindy Lane-Newcomb; Raven's Landing

Clean Team

Clear Path Healing Arts Center

Climbing Bines Hop Farm and Brewery

Cloud 9 Wellness Compost International

Cortland Beer Company, LLC

Cottage Views B & B

Cotton Club at the Windmill

Cowlick Farms Creating Change

Creativelink Photo/Graphics Services

Creekside Cafe Crestwood Pools Inc. Crooked Lake Winery Cummins Nursery Curry Creek Vineyards Custom Care Pharmacy D. Bordwell Editorial Services

Damiani Wine Cellars Dan Rapaport Consulting

Dano's Heuriger Daphne's Delights

Darlene Bordwell Photography David Mooney-State Farm Insurance

Deep Lake Industries DeMarco Vineyards Derek's Diner Dewitt Park Inn Digital Wires **DigitalWires DigitialWires**

Discovery Massage Dixie O'Connor, Fine Arts Down to Earth Markets

Dr. Konstantin Frank Vinifera Wine Cellars

DS Hoffman, Luthier

Dundee Scottish Festival of the Finger Lakes Eagle Crest Vineyards/ O-Neh-Da Vineyard

Earthgirl Flowers Earthgirl Pottery East Side Dog Services Echoes of the Glen B & B Edible Finger Lakes Eli Thomas Art Ely Fruit Farms **Emery Vineyards**

Eminence Road Farm Winery Enigma Skin Care Studio

Eremita Winery Eve's Cidery **Evolving Studios** Exercise Enterprise

Factivist

Faith Muirhead, Educational Consultant

Farm Kind

Farmer Ground Flour Farmshed CNY

Finger Lakes Clean Waters Initiative, Inc

Finger Lakes Concierge Finger Lakes Distilling

Finger Lakes Estate and Auction Company

Finger Lakes Florist Finger Lakes Foie

Finger Lakes Food Company, LLC Finger Lakes Gifts and Lounge Finger Lakes Mill Creek Cabins Finger Lakes Natural Health Finger Lakes Soap Company

Finger Lakes Transport and Tours Finger Lakes Vacation Rental Finger Lakes Waterfall Resort Finger Lakes Website Services

Fingerlakes Angling Zone Guide Service

FingerLakes1.com Firehouse Distillery

Fleur De Lys of the Finger Lakes

FLX Best Wine Tours

FLX Table FLX Wienery

Forever Green Tree Care Services

Forge Cellars

Fork & Gavel Cafe at Cornell

Fossil and Till Fox Pond Products Fox Run Vineyards, Inc

Fox Trot Stables

Free Spirit Design Glass

Free to Be Me Coalition for Peace

Frisch Kitchen Frog Hollow Marina

Frontenac Point Vineyard and Winery

Fruit Yard Winery Geneva Bicycle Center Gentle Giants B&B GentlyBorne Midwifery George's Prosound Gil's Honeybees Gimme! Coffee Inc. Ginger Cat B&B

Glacier Ridge Vineyards Glen Mountain Market

Glendale Farms

Glenhaven Farm Winery Glenora Wine Cellars

Global Taco

Golden Knight Inn & Suites Golden Orb Tattoos and Piercings

Good Earth Health Foods Good Karma Candles Good to Go! Market Goose Watch Winery Graceful Arts Fiber Studio

GRACES (Grass Roots Accomodations Coalition for Energy Sustainability)

Graphic Connections

Greensprings Natural Cemetery GreenStar Cooperative Market

Gryphon Construction Halsey's Wood Fire Bistro Harvest Cafe

Hayward House B&B Hazelnut Kitchen Hazlitt 1852 Vineyards

Heart & Hands Wine Company

Heart to Heart Yoga

Heavily Brewing Company

Hector Handmade

Hector Logging Company

Hector Wine Co.

Hemlock Hills Alpaca Farm Hermann J. Wiemer Vineyard

Heron Hill Winery Hipshot Products, Inc.

Hotel Groton

Humble Hill Farm and Lodge Hunt Country Vineyards Idol Ridge Winery

Ileen Kaplan Piano Service

Indian Creek Farm Inner Decisions

Interludes

International Climbing Machines

Irish Carpentry Italy Hill Produce

Ithaca Acupuncture- Integrative Medicine

Center

Ithaca Soap/17th Century Suds

IthacaDomains.com

J & D Landscape Construction

Jabberwock

JCC of Greater Rochester Jeremy and Erica Crytzer Jesi Turner, Musician

Joe's Hots

Joseph M Rao Inc. Journeyman Services JR Dill Winery

Just a Few Acres Farm

Just Desserts Kali Herbs

Kate Gustin, CPC - Joy of Living Health and

Life Coach

Keep in Touch Therapeutic Massage

Keuka Artisan Bakery & Deli

King Ferry Winery King's Garden Vineyards

Kingbird Farm

Kirton's Farm Market

Knapp Winery

Krys Cail, Farm and Food Business

Development Consulting Kurtz Construction Lake City Hobby Lakehouse B&B Lakeland Winery

Lakeside Refrigeration Service Lamoreaux Landing Wine Cellars

Larson Publications

Lawrence Reverby - Attorney at Law

Leaf Kitchen Restaurant Leidenfrost Vineyards Lilly Broadcasting

Linda Parks, CPA and Financial Advisor

Linda Ruth Astrology

Live Well Upstate: Massage Therapy and

Natural Medicine

Locke's Glen, LLC Vacation Rentals

Macro Mamas

Magnolia Place B & B Main Street Bike Shop

Manndible Cafe at Cornell/ Fork and Gavel Cafe

at Cornell

Marmalade Cat B & B McGregor Winery Medleys Cafe & Catering

Michael Turback-Food and Wine Writer

Moon Heart Studios Moosewood Restaurant Mother Earth Natural Foods Muddy Fingers Farm Native Plant Nurture

Natural Health Family Chiropractic

Nautical Nights B & B

Newell Farm No Man Services

North East Organic Farming Assoc. of NY

Northeast Band Supply Northstar Public House

O'Shaughnessy Antiques and Fine Arts Gallery

Odessa Coffee Depot

Old Fashioned Flowers from Fernville Farm

Owl Gorge Productions Paradise on the Lake B and B

Parker's Grille
Passport Creations
Penguin Bay Winery
Perennial Evolution Farm
Peter Drobny - Glass Consultant

Pi Truck

Pine Tree Farms

Pioneer Printing Plowbreak Farm Pompous Ass Winery Preliminaires Chocolat

Privacy on the Lake B & B Quality Wine Tours

QWIK Solar QwikSolar

Rasta Ranch Vineyards Ravines Wine Cellars

Reagan's Canoe and Kayak Livery

Reality Realty
Red Dove Tavern
Red Jacket Orchards
Red Newt Cellars
Red Tail Ridge Winery
Regional Access
Relax Inn

RENOVUS Energy, Inc. Rising Sun Reiki

Robinia Redux Locust Fencepost Plantation

Rooster Fish Brewing

Roots and Wings Performing Arts Academy

Rustic Log Cabins Sabol Farm Salubrious Farms

Sapsquatch Pure Maple Products Sawmill Creek Vineyards

Schank Companies Seneca BioEnergy

Seneca Chief Guide Services

Seneca General Store Seneca Harbor Station

Seneca Harbor Wine Center Seneca Lake General Store

Seneca Lake Vacation Rentals

Seneca Lodge Seneca Lodge Craft Brewing Seneca Lodge Lake House

Seneca Physical Therapy of the Finger Lakes,

PC

Seneca Sailing Adventures Seneca Shore Wine Cellars Seneca Springs Resort

Seneca Strategic Consulting, LLC

Seneca Sunrise Coffee Seneca Wine Boat Tours

SenecaLakeVacationRentals.com Senecayuga Properties, LLC. September Hill Midwifery Shalestone Vineyards Shaw Vineyards

Sheldrake Point Vineyards Showboat Motel and Restaurant

Silver Springs Winery Silver Thread Vineyards

Six Circles Farm Skyland Gallery Skyland Guest House

Snug Planet and Snug Solutions Solar Systems Unlimited Southern Tier Hops

Squires Accounting and Tax Services Inc.

Stalks and Stones
Standing Stone Vineyard
Staving Artist Woodwork
Stick and Stone Farm
Stomping Grounds
Stone Pillow Pottery

StoneBoat Computing Solutions

Stonecat Cafe

Stony Lonesome Farms LLC

Studio West

subject2change Media

Summit to Stream Adventures

Sun Dance Creations
Sun Garden Grille
Sunrise Hill Vineyards
Sunrise Landing B & B
Sunset on Seneca B&B
Sunshine Natural Foods

Sustainable Viticulture Systems-Proprietor

Suzanne's Fine Regional Cuisine

Swamp Road Baskets

Swedish Hill, Goose Watch, and Penguin Bay

Wineries

Sweet Chariot Livery Sweet Mother Nature Tabora Vineyards

TAITEM Engineering PC

Tchotchke

The Black Sheep Inn
The Burns Sisters
The Elf in the Oak
The Good Life Farm
The Keep at Newell Farm

The Last Word

The Pearl of Seneca Lake B & B

The Piggery
The Soap Garden
The Water Cottage
The White Gazebo

Themis and Thread

Think Topography

Thomas Merrill Professional Land Surveyor

Three Brothers Wineries

Three Swallows Farm

Three Tree Inn B & B

Thunder Mountain Foods

Thyme Stands Still Fruit and Vegetables

Tim McKinney,

Photographer/Writer/Woodworker

Tim Regan

Tim Wells- Furniture Maker

Tom Blecher

Tom Weidemann

Tree Gate Farm

Turbo Taxi

Two Goats Brewing

Two Sisters Cottage on Seneca Lake

Unique Pool Service

Upstate Energy Solutions

Vaping Bad

Ventosa Vineyards

Villa Bellangelo

Waterloo Container

Waterloo Custom Apparel and Gifts

Watkins Glen Massage

Watkins Glen Wine and Spirits

Wayne Schutz

West Haven Farm

West Main Kitchen

West Side Wine and Spirits

White Gazebo Inn

White Wizard Consulting, LLC

Wide Awake Bakery

Wild Flower Cafe

Wine a Bit and More

Wine Forward

Wine on Ice

Wixom Farm

Wolf Tree Farm

Zero to Go LLC