Overview of Treatment Guidelines and Clinical Practical Guidelines That Recommend the Use of Acupuncture: A Bibliometric Analysis

Stephen Birch, PhD,1 Myeong Soo Lee, PhD,2 Terje Alraek, PhD,1,3 and Tae-Hun Kim, PhD4

Abstract

Introduction: As positive evidence emerges for the use of an intervention to treat a health problem, the intervention gradually becomes incorporated into treatment guidelines (TGs) or clinical practice guidelines (CPGs) that are related to that health problem. To assess whether this general hypothesis can apply to acupuncture, 96 health problems were identified for which positive conclusions in systematic reviews and meta-analyses regarding the effectiveness of acupuncture have been made and then searched for TGs or CPGs that have recommended the use of acupuncture.

Methods: Through August 31, 2017, searches were performed in relevant medical databases and Google using “treatment guideline,” “clinical practice guideline,” and the names of the 96 medical conditions as search terms. A “snow-balling” search approach was adopted. All positive recommendations were added into the registry.

Results: A total of 1311 publications were found that recommended using acupuncture published between 1991 and 2017. The number per year reached 50 in 2005 and 100 in 2009. In addition, 2189 positive recommendations were found for the use of acupuncture. Of these, 1486 were related to 107 pain indications and 703 were related to 97 nonpain indications. These recommendations were made by a wide range of groups, such as government health institutions, national guideline, and medical specialty groups. The recommendations came from around the world but were especially abundant in North America, Europe, and Australasia.

Discussion and conclusion: Considerably more recommendations were found for the use of acupuncture than are known within the acupuncture or medical communities. A trend by year was also found; a rise in the number of positive statements about acupuncture was typically followed by a rise in the number of recommendations of acupuncture. Thus, the recommendations followed the emergent evidence for acupuncture. Better implementation plans need to be developed for the CPG/TG recommendations about acupuncture to be more effective/efficient.

Keywords: clinical practice guideline, treatment guideline, acupuncture, systematic review, recommendation, snowballing method

Introduction

When evidence of the effectiveness of a therapy emerges with evidence of the safety and cost-effectiveness of the therapy, medical treatment guidelines (TGs) or clinical practice guidelines (CPGs) should start to begin recommending the therapy, even when the evidence is not yet strong.1 Acupuncture has been tested in many clinical trials since the mid-1970s. In 2010, the Australian Department of Veterans Affairs found acupuncture to be effective for four conditions and trending toward effectiveness for one condition.2 A 2012 review of acupuncture for chronic pain conditions found it to be effective for a number of chronic pain conditions.3 In their 2014 synthesis of evidence for the

1Department of Health Sciences, Kristiania University College, Oslo, Norway.
2Clinical Medicine Division, Korea Institute of Oriental Medicine, Daejeon, Republic of South Korea.
3Department of Community Medicine, Faculty of Medicine, National Research Centre in Complementary and Alternative Medicine, UiT The Arctic University of Norway, Tromso, Norway.
4Korean Medicine Clinical Trial Center, Korean Medicine Hospital, Kyung Hee University, Seoul, Republic of Korea.
U.S. Department of Veterans Affairs, Hempel et al. found that acupuncture was effective for three conditions, trending toward effectiveness for 20 conditions and was mixed positive for another 23 conditions. In their 2017 review, McDonald and Janz found that acupuncture was effective for 8 conditions, trending toward effectiveness for another 38 conditions and was mixed positive for another 70 conditions. Acupuncture has also been found cost-effective for several pain conditions and several nonpain conditions. Over the past 30 years, researchers have consistently shown that acupuncture is a safe therapy, when administered by properly trained practitioners. However, little has been known about the number of CPGs and TGs that include acupuncture.

CPGs are defined as “systematically developed statements to assist practitioners and patients’ decisions about appropriate health care for specific clinical circumstances.” CPGs tend to be more scientific and involve much time and work to complete. TGs in contrast tend to be less scientific and focus on providing clinical recommendations directly to healthcare practitioners often using nonacademic media for dissemination such as Medical Society websites, medical journals, and medical expert websites. They may not present evidence for their recommendations, focusing instead on easier-to-use document format. Systematic reviews (SRs) and meta-analyses (MAs) examine the relative effectiveness of an intervention, CPGs/TGs compare this evidence and the evidence of relative safety and cost-effectiveness with the evidence for the other interventions used for the same medical condition. CPGs/TGs are usually developed by specialists who are experts in the medical condition and who try to examine all levels of evidence for each intervention to compare the interventions head to head, which allows more real-world assessments of each therapy. In 2012, Hughes and White briefly searched PubMed to determine how many clinical guidelines could be found that recommended acupuncture, these authors found 14 publications that recommended acupuncture for 10 different medical conditions. A recent article on acupuncture and pain suggested that the number of guidelines for acupuncture was underestimated. In a recent study, Cho et al. examined the extent to which CPGs reflected the actual evidence found in SRs and MAs for lower back pain. This review found six CPGs that recommended acupuncture and further concluded that current CPGs did not fully reflect the levels of evidence for acupuncture.

Given the emergent evidence base for the effectiveness, safety, and cost-effectiveness of acupuncture and contradictory claims about acupuncture and CPGs, the primary aim of this study is to explore the extent to which acupuncture has been recommended as a treatment option in TGs or CPGs. As a secondary aim, the timeline was examined for the CPGs/TGs that were found to explore whether they are related to the emerging evidence of effectiveness.

Methods

The term “acupuncture” was used to include the use of acupuncture needles applied manually or with electrical stimulation anywhere on the body and regardless of theoretical framework. Any publications that describe treatments using laser type acupuncture only, moxibustion only, or acupressure/ massage only were not included.

The first author reviewed his database of SRs, MAs, and other review articles to identify publications that concluded acupuncture to be effective or to show positive evidence of effectiveness (trend positive) for a particular condition. “Trend positive” review publications include those that found positive studies, especially related to the primary outcomes but of insufficient number or quality. They usually conclude that more research is needed to clarify their findings. Trend positive reviews are included since authors of guidelines may have little evidence of effective or available treatment options for a particular problem and may thus recommend those therapies at that time.

To locate TGs or CPGs that recommended the use of acupuncture treatment, searching core databases, including Medline, Cochrane library, and Embase, using a recommended searching strategy as for SRs was not productive since acupuncture was not listed as a search term alongside most published CPGs and TGs. Furthermore, many publications, especially TGs, can be found online and published for ease of public access rather than for academic purposes, and these publications usually were not listed through the mentioned medical databases. Thus, a search was conducted that was based mainly on the snow-balling approach, following links in one publication to other publications or websites and then searching those publications and websites.

After first identifying the 96 conditions shown in Appendix 1, TGs or CPGs related to each were then searched. These were located through electronic searching of the core databases and through hand searching of national guideline clearing houses or agencies for health technology assessment, such as GIN (www.g-i-n.net/), NICE (http://guidance.nice.org.uk), AHRQ (https://effectivehealthcare.ahrq.gov/), and SIGN (www.sign.ac.uk). Hand searching of Google was used to search for TGs or CPGs for each condition. For the 96 conditions, “condition (or disease)” and “clinical practice guideline” or “treatment guideline” were used as the search terms. For example, back pain was searched by “back pain” and “treatment guidelines” or “clinical practice guidelines.” As part of this snowballing search, publications with recommendations about the overall uses of acupuncture rather than specific to a particular symptom were also included. For CPGs/TGs in China and South Korea, experts were consulted to track down the few documents that have been published. All publications that were found were then examined to determine whether they were making treatment recommendations about the use of acupuncture. These were then carefully read to see whether the authors recommended acupuncture for use in treating any conditions. All positive recommendations for acupuncture are listed, and through this process, a specialized registry of CPGs/TGs for acupuncture was developed. All updates from the same source as separate publications were included. Many publications made multiple recommendations for the use of acupuncture.

Results

Tracking review publications of the effectiveness of acupuncture, by August 31, 2017, 96 conditions were identified for which reviews had found positive evidence or indications of emerging (trend) positive evidence. These positive or trend-positive statements were published between 1996 and 2017 (Appendix 1). The number per year can be seen as the line graph in Figure 1. Searching on the basis of these 96 conditions, 1311 TGs or CPGs were found that recommended...
the use of acupuncture. These TGs and CPGs were published between 1991 and 2017. The number per year reached 50 in 2005 and 100 in 2009. The bar graph in Figure 1 shows the number of recommendations by year and according to pain and nonpain conditions. A total of 2189 positive recommendations were found for the use of acupuncture. Of these, 1486 were related to 107 pain indications and 703 were related to 97 nonpain indications (Fig. 1).

The recommendations came from many sources: National Government Departments of Health or Ministries of Health, State Departments of Health, state reimbursement systems, national guideline groups, national expert groups, international expert groups, insurance companies, single or group authors, and on-line patient support groups. Appendix 2 gives examples with references for each source type.

It was observed that the number of recommendations in one year (2005) reached 50, when positive or trend-positive conclusions emerging in review articles were clearly increasing in number (see the black line charting these numbers in Fig. 1). In addition, ~87% of the 2189 recommendations were related to the 96 conditions in Appendix 1. The graphic in Figure 1 shows that the rise in the number of recommendations generally follows the rise in the number of positive or trend-positive statements about acupuncture effectiveness, which supports the notion that the recommendations follow the evidence. The recommendations came from around the world but were especially abundant in North America, Europe, and Australasia.

Discussion

To the authors' surprise, a considerable number of recommendations were found for the use of acupuncture. This search identified 1311 publications covering a 27-year period that have made 2189 positive recommendations for acupuncture for 204 health problems. Hence, the authors' findings are not in line with previous claims that the number of recommendations for acupuncture is less than the evidence suggests they should be and far exceed the earlier search the authors found.

Claims of publication bias in acupuncture-related research have been made, especially in Asia. It was found that only a small percentage of the guideline recommendations were published in Asia. The conventional medical communities that write CPGs in Korea and China, for example, do not generally include acupuncture in their considerations, and thus, the authors do not see this publication bias in the CPG/TG recommendations.

In this article, the authors have addressed the question of the extent to which medical groups have recommended the use of acupuncture. The authors did not include or specifically search for publications that recommend not to use acupuncture because it was not found effective or had insufficient evidence. This issue will be dealt with in later publications.

Moreover, the medical, research, and acupuncture communities are not aware of the extent to which acupuncture is recommended as a treatment in clinical guidelines, as evidenced by the few recommendations found in the 2012 search. It was found that the authors' regular search of relevant databases did not identify many publications and that more complex and innovative strategies were necessary to locate these publications. This difficulty suggests one possible reason for the lack of knowledge in the medical, research, and acupuncture communities. Another reason is likely to involve problems in guideline implementation. If the acupuncture...
Conclusions

Future Research Implications

The authors are currently examining the publications they found to extract detailed information on other parameters, such as the clinical questions, direction of the recommendation, funding agency, and development groups. In addition, the authors are planning to publish a registry of acupuncture-related CPGs/TGs. Furthermore, this registry will continuously be updated by systematically examining future publications.

Limitations

Although creative search strategies were employed, the availability of publications has been a problem. The primary language for the search was English. Publications in many countries were inaccessible due to this language constraint, and thus, it was hypothesized that there are more publications that recommend acupuncture than the authors have found. For example, in Israel, acupuncture is increasingly used in hospitals,

Limitations

The authors plan to start addressing this in future work.

Future Research Implications

The authors are currently examining the publications they found to extract detailed information on other parameters, such as the clinical questions, direction of the recommendation, funding agency, and development groups. In addition, the authors are planning to publish a registry of acupuncture-related CPGs/TGs. Furthermore, this registry will continuously be updated by systematically examining future publications.

Conclusions

This search has found a surprisingly large number of recommendations (2189) for the use of acupuncture for over 200 health problems. These recommendations are mostly related to the emergent evidence of the effectiveness of acupuncture (87%).

Considerably more recommendations for the use of acupuncture were found than is known within the acupuncture community or medical community. This suggests that medical healthcare providers around the world have begun incorporating or are seeking to incorporate acupuncture widely into healthcare but have not sought sufficient collaboration with the acupuncture community to enable the effectiveness of acupuncture. Thus, medical authorities need to develop better implementation plans to make the CPG/TG recommendations more effective.

Author Disclosure Statement

No competing financial interests exist.

References


Address correspondence to:
Stephen Birch, PhD
Department of Health Sciences
Kristiania University College
Oslo 0107
Norway
E-mail: sjbirch@gmail.com

Appendix 1

Positive or Trend Positive Conclusions in Favor of the Effectiveness for Acupuncture from Reviews of the Clinical Trial Literature

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Conditions</th>
<th>References</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Achilles tendinopathy</td>
<td>Cox et al.(^{A1})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Alcohol dependence</td>
<td>Shin et al.(^{A2}), Southern et al.(^{A3})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Allergic rhinitis</td>
<td>ADVA,(^{A4}) Feng et al.(^{A5}), McDonald and Janz,(^{A6}) Pfab et al.,(^{A7}) Roberts,(^{A8}) Xiao et al.(^{A9}) Zhou et al.(^{A10})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Alzheimer’s disease</td>
<td>Zhao et al.(^{A11}), McDonald and Janz,(^{A6}) Hempel et al.(^{A12})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Ambulatory anesthesia</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz,(^{A6}) Hempe et al.(^{A13}) Bae et al.(^{A14}) Lee et al.(^{A15}) Ma et al.(^{A16}) Manyande et al.(^{A17}) Pilkington et al.(^{A18}) Wang and Bao(^{A19})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Ankle pain</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz,(^{A6}) Bae et al.(^{A18}) Cheon et al.(^{A19}) Cheong et al.(^{A20}) Jo and Lee,(^{A21}) Kang et al.,(^{A22}) Shen et al.,(^{A23}) Zheng et al.,(^{A24}) Zhou et al.(^{A25})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Anxiety</td>
<td>Zhou et al.(^{A26}), McDonald and Janz,(^{A6})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Aromatase inhibitor arthralgia</td>
<td>Cheong et al.(^{A20}) Jo and Lee,(^{A21}) Kang et al.,(^{A22}) Shen et al.,(^{A23}) Zheng et al.,(^{A24}) Zhou et al.(^{A25})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Assisted fertility</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz,(^{A6}) NIH(^{A26})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Asthma</td>
<td>Quan et al.,(^{A27}) Vieira et al.(^{A28})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Atopic dermatitis</td>
<td>ADVA,(^{A4}) McDonald and Janz,(^{A6}) NIH,(^{A26}) AHRO,(^{A29}) Birch et al.(^{A30}) BMA,(^{A31}) Chou and Huffman,(^{A32}) Chou et al.,(^{A33}) Dalamakga,(^{A34}) Ernst,(^{A35}) Ernst and Lee,(^{A36}) Furlan et al.,(^{A37}) Furlan et al.,(^{A38}) Hopton and MacPherson,(^{A39}) Hutchinson et al.,(^{A40}) Keller et al.,(^{A41}) Liu et al.,(^{A42}) Melendez et al.,(^{A43}) Nahin et al.,(^{A44}) POCKET,(^{A45}) Rubinstein et al.,(^{A46}) Saramago et al.,(^{A47}) Trigkilidas,(^{A48}) van Tulder et al.,(^{A49}) Vickers et al.(^{A50}) Xu et al.(^{A51}) Yin et al.,(^{A52}) Yuan et al.,(^{A53}) Yuan et al.,(^{A54}) Zeng and Chung,(^{A55}) Dimitrova et al.,(^{A56}) Li et al.(^{A57})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Back pain</td>
<td>Verghese et al.(^{A58})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Bell’s palsy</td>
<td>Mangesi and Zakaria-Grkovic,(^{A59}) McDonald and Janz,(^{A6}) Hempe et al.,(^{A11}) Wang Bao,(^{A17}) Bao et al.,(^{A60}) Bardia et al.,(^{A61}) Cassileth and Yarrer,(^{A62}) Chiu et al.,(^{A63}) Choi et al.,(^{A64}) Dos Santos et al.,(^{A65}) Hu et al.,(^{A66}) Lau et al.,(^{A67}) Lian et al.,(^{A68}) Peng et al.,(^{A69}) Poder and Lemieux,(^{A70}) Standish et al.(^{A71})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Bladder pain (interstitial cystitis)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Breast engorgement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Cancer-related pain</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(continued)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Conditions</th>
<th>References</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Carpal tunnel syndrome</td>
<td>Cox et al., A1 NIH, A26 Dimitrova et al., A56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Chemotherapy-induced peripheral neuropathy</td>
<td>Standish et al., A71 Al-Atiyat and Obaid, A72 Cheng et al., A73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Chronic facial pain</td>
<td>Myers et al., A74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Chronic fatigue (including cancer related)</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Wang and Bao, A17 Dos Santos et al., A65 He et al., A75 Ling et al., A76 Tao et al., A77 Wang et al., A78 Wu et al., A79 Zeng et al., A80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Chronic pain</td>
<td>Hempel et al., A11 Hopton and MacPherson, A39 Vickers et al., A50 Yin et al., A52 Yang et al., A54 Lee and Ernst, A55 Tsoa et al., A56 Yeh et al., A83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Chronic pelvic inflammatory disease</td>
<td>Fan et al., A84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Chronic pelvic pain</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Chang et al., A85 Cohen et al., A86 Qin et al., A87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Chronic prostate pain</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Hempel et al., A11 Chang et al., A85 Cohen et al., A86 Qin et al., A87 Lee and Lee, A88 Liu et al., A89 Posadzki et al., A90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Chronic urinary retention</td>
<td>Wang et al., A91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Chemotherapy-induced nausea and vomiting</td>
<td>ADVA, A4 McDonald and Janz, A6 Wang and Bao, A17 Kang et al., A22 NIH, A26 Birch et al., A30 Ernst, A35 Cassileth and Yarret, A62 Choi et al., A66 Dos Santos et al., A65 Liu et al., A68 Poder and Lemeique, A70 Standish et al., A71 Wu et al., A79 Chao et al., A92 Chen et al., A93 Ernst and Lee, A95 Ezzo et al., A96 McKeon et al., A97 Garcia et al., A99 Moncton et al., A99 Richardson et al., A100 Linde et al., A101 Roberts and Moore, A102 Streiberger et al., A103 Tait et al., A104 Vickers et al., A105 Vickers et al., A106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Constipation</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Hempel et al., A11 Streiberger et al., A103 Lin et al., A107 Wang and Yin, A108 Zhang et al., A109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease</td>
<td>Coyne et al., A110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Craniotomy anesthesia</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Depression</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Hempel et al., A11 Lee et al., A13 Wang and Bao, A17 Bosch et al., A111 Chan et al., A112 Smith et al., A113 Sniejek and Siddiqui, A114 Stub et al., A115 Sun et al., A116 Wang et al., A117 Williams et al., A118 Wu et al., A119 Xiong et al., A120 Zhang et al., A121 Zhang et al., A122 Zhang et al., A123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Dermatology/pruritis/urticaria</td>
<td>Ma and Sivamani, A124 Yao et al., A125 Yu et al., A126 Dimitrova et al., A127 Chen et al., A128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Diabetic peripheral neuropathy</td>
<td>Tao et al., A177 NIH, A26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Diarrhea</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Ba et al., A128 Yang et al., A129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Drug dependence</td>
<td>Hempel et al., A11 NIH, A26 Chung et al., A130 Cho and Hwang, A131 Cunningham and Tan, A132 Kannan and Claydon, A133 Standish et al., A134 Lund and Lundeberg, A135 Lee and Ernst, A136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Dry eyes syndrome</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Yoo and Oh, A136 NIH, A26 Tait et al., A137 Cao et al., A138 Coe et al., A139 Goldie and Hogg, A140 Yang et al., A141 Han et al., A142 Kim et al., A143 Pang et al., A144 Zhou et al., A145 Daneshkazemi et al., A146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Dysmenorrhea</td>
<td>Yue et al., A147 Zhu et al., A148 Kwon et al., A149 Dimitrova et al., A150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>Dyspnea</td>
<td>Wang and Bao, A17 Cassileth and Yarret, A62 Santos et al., A65 Chiu et al., A151 Dos, Frisk et al., A152 Johns et al., A153 Lopes-Junior et al., A154 McDonald and Janz, A6 Li et al., A155 Zhao et al., A156 McDonald and Janz, A6 Chao and Zhang, A157 Li and Li, A158 Manheimer et al., A159 Pei et al., A160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>Endometriosis pain</td>
<td>Raith et al., A161 Savino et al., A162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>Endoscopy pain</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Hempel et al., A11 Lee et al., A13 Wang and Bao, A17 Bezzera et al., A162 Cao et al., A163 Chiu et al., A164 Choi et al., A165 Lee and Lim, A166 Shergis et al., A167 Yeung et al., A168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>Enhanced recovery from surgery</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Hempel et al., A11 Lee et al., A13 Wang et al., A17 Bezzera et al., A162 Cao et al., A163 Chiu et al., A164 Choi et al., A165 Lee and Lim, A166 Shergis et al., A167 Yeung et al., A168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>Fibromyalgia</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Hempel et al., A11 Lee et al., A13 Wang et al., A17 Bezzera et al., A162 Cao et al., A163 Chiu et al., A164 Choi et al., A165 Lee and Lim, A166 Shergis et al., A167 Yeung et al., A168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>Functional dyspepsia</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Hempel et al., A11 Lee et al., A13 Wang et al., A17 Bezzera et al., A162 Cao et al., A163 Chiu et al., A164 Choi et al., A165 Lee and Lim, A166 Shergis et al., A167 Yeung et al., A168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>Gag reflex</td>
<td>Raith et al., A161 Savino et al., A162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>Hiccups</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Hempel et al., A11 Lee et al., A13 Wang et al., A17 Bezzera et al., A162 Cao et al., A163 Chiu et al., A164 Choi et al., A165 Lee and Lim, A166 Shergis et al., A167 Yeung et al., A168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>Hip osteoarthritis</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Hempel et al., A11 Lee et al., A13 Wang et al., A17 Bezzera et al., A162 Cao et al., A163 Chiu et al., A164 Choi et al., A165 Lee and Lim, A166 Shergis et al., A167 Yeung et al., A168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>HIV-related peripheral neuropathy</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Hempel et al., A11 Lee et al., A13 Wang et al., A17 Bezzera et al., A162 Cao et al., A163 Chiu et al., A164 Choi et al., A165 Lee and Lim, A166 Shergis et al., A167 Yeung et al., A168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>Hot flashes in cancer</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Hempel et al., A11 Lee et al., A13 Wang et al., A17 Bezzera et al., A162 Cao et al., A163 Chiu et al., A164 Choi et al., A165 Lee and Lim, A166 Shergis et al., A167 Yeung et al., A168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>Hypertension</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Hempel et al., A11 Lee et al., A13 Wang et al., A17 Bezzera et al., A162 Cao et al., A163 Chiu et al., A164 Choi et al., A165 Lee and Lim, A166 Shergis et al., A167 Yeung et al., A168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>Irritable bowel syndrome</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Hempel et al., A11 Lee et al., A13 Wang et al., A17 Bezzera et al., A162 Cao et al., A163 Chiu et al., A164 Choi et al., A165 Lee and Lim, A166 Shergis et al., A167 Yeung et al., A168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>Infantile colic</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Hempel et al., A11 Lee et al., A13 Wang et al., A17 Bezzera et al., A162 Cao et al., A163 Chiu et al., A164 Choi et al., A165 Lee and Lim, A166 Shergis et al., A167 Yeung et al., A168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td>Insomnia</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Hempel et al., A11 Lee et al., A13 Wang et al., A17 Bezzera et al., A162 Cao et al., A163 Chiu et al., A164 Choi et al., A165 Lee and Lim, A166 Shergis et al., A167 Yeung et al., A168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td>Knee osteoarthritis</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Hempel et al., A11 NIH, A26 Dalamagka, A34 Ernst and Lee, A36 Hopton and MacPherson, A39 Nahin et al., A43 Saramago et al., A44 Vickers et al., A50 Yin et al., A52 Yuan et al., A54 Lee and Ernst, A55 Roberts and Moore, A102 Cao et al., A169 Corbett et al., A170 Ezzo et al., A171 Hou et al., A172 Kwon et al., A173 Manheimer et al., A174</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(continued)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Conditions</th>
<th>References</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td>Labor pain</td>
<td>Manyanga et al., A175 Selfe and Taylor, A176 Shengelia et al., A177 Shim et al., A178 Turner and Igo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td>Lymphoedema</td>
<td>Li et al., A185, Tsai et al., A186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56</td>
<td>Male sexual dysfunction</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Hempeal et al., A11 Chailliet et al., A180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>57</td>
<td>Menopausal hot flashes</td>
<td>Cho et al., A183 Jones et al., A182 Lee and Ernst, A183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58</td>
<td>Migraine</td>
<td>ADVA, A4 McDonald and Janz, A6 Hempeal et al., A11 NIH, A26 Birch et al., A26 BMA, A31 Dalamagka, A34 Saramago et al., A47 Vickers et al., A50 Yin et al., A52 Lee and Ernst, A81 Linde et al., A193 Linde et al., A194 Sun and Gan, A195 Yang et al., A196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59</td>
<td>Mild cognitive impairment</td>
<td>Deng and Wang, A197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60</td>
<td>Modulating sensory perception thresholds</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Jueckstock et al., A198 Matthews et al., A199 Wegrzyjniak et al., A200 NIH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>63</td>
<td>Neck pain</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Saramago et al., A47 Vickers et al., A50 Yin et al., A52 Yuan et al., A201 Lee and Ernst, A81, Fu et al., A201 Leaver et al., A202 Trinh et al., A203 Trinh et al., A204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64</td>
<td>Neonatal abstinence syndrome</td>
<td>Bagley et al., A205 Edwards and Brown, A206 Bower and Diao, A207 Bower et al., A208 Glazener et al., A209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65</td>
<td>Nocturnal enuresis</td>
<td>Huang et al., A210 Kiddoo, A211 Lu et al., A212 Kim et al., A213 Ruan et al., A214 Zhang et al., A215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>66</td>
<td>Obesity</td>
<td>Olivera et al., A216 Park and Hughes, A217 Lee and Lim, A218 Zhang et al., A219 Aquine and Nori, A220 Ren et al., A221 Mannix et al., A222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>67</td>
<td>Overactive bladder</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Hempeal et al., A11 NIH, A26 Birch et al., A30 BMA, A31 Ernst, A35 Cassileth and Yarret, A62 Ernst, A95 Garcia et al., A98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>69</td>
<td>Parkinson’s disease</td>
<td>NHI, A251 Birch et al., A30 BMA, A31 Ernst, A35 Vickers et al., A50 Linde et al., A101 Roberts and Moore, A102 Tait et al., A104 Cheong et al., A231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70</td>
<td>Polycystic ovary syndrome</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Chiu et al., A63 Cho et al., A224 Cho et al., A232 Kim et al., A233 Sun et al., A234 Tedesco et al., A235 Wu et al., A236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71</td>
<td>Phantom limb pain</td>
<td>Lee et al., A237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>73</td>
<td>Postoperative nausea and vomiting</td>
<td>Cheong et al., A231 McDonald and Janz, A6 Chiu et al., A63 Cho et al., A224 Cho et al., A232 Kim et al., A233 Sun et al., A234 Tedesco et al., A235 Wu et al., A236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>74</td>
<td>Postoperative dental pain</td>
<td>Lee et al., A237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75</td>
<td>Postoperative gastroparesis</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Chiu et al., A63 Cho et al., A224 Cho et al., A232 Kim et al., A233 Sun et al., A234 Tedesco et al., A235 Wu et al., A236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>76</td>
<td>Postoperative pain</td>
<td>Lee et al., A237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>77</td>
<td>Poststroke neurogenic bladder</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 ADVA, A4 McDonald and Janz, A6 Hempeal et al., A11 Selva Olid et al., A191 Close et al., A238 Ee et al., A239 Gutke et al., A240 Liddle and Pennick, A241 Stones and Vits, A242 Young and Jewell, A243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>78</td>
<td>Poststroke spasticity</td>
<td>Tsai et al., A186 Cooper et al., A244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>79</td>
<td>Pregnancy-related pelvic back pain</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Hempeal et al., A11 DVAAG, A245 Grant et al., A246 Kim et al., A257 Wahbeh et al., A248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80</td>
<td>Premature ejaculation</td>
<td>Tao et al., A249 Li et al., A250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>81</td>
<td>Post-traumatic stress disorder</td>
<td>Lee et al., A249 Li et al., A250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>82</td>
<td>Quality of life</td>
<td>Wang and Bao, A17 Cassileth and Yarret, A62 Standish et al., A71 Furness et al., A251 Hanchanale et al., A252 Lovelace et al., A253 Zhuang et al. A254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>83</td>
<td>Rheumatoid arthritis</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Hempeal et al., A11 DVAAG, A245 Grant et al., A246 Kim et al., A257 Wahbeh et al., A248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>84</td>
<td>Radiation-induced xerostomia</td>
<td>Bosch et al., A111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>85</td>
<td>Restless legs syndrome</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Ji et al., A255 Lewis et al., A256 Lewis et al., A257 Qin et al., A258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>86</td>
<td>Schizophrenia</td>
<td>Cox et al., A11 McDonald and Janz, A6 McDonald and Janz, A6 Vickers et al., A50 Yin et al., A52 Yuan et al., A54 Dong et al., A259 Green et al., A260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>87</td>
<td>Sciatica</td>
<td>Lv et al., A261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>88</td>
<td>Shoulder injuries</td>
<td>McDonald and Janz, A6 Hempeal et al., A11 Tahiri et al., A262</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 89  | Shoulder pain (including poststroke)           | (continued)
Appendix 2

Examples of Sources of Clinical Practice and Treatment Guideline Publications

National Government Department of Health or Ministry of Health


State Department of Health/State Reimbursement System

The Department of Health of South Australia has recommended acupuncture for five symptoms whereas the Department of Health of Western Australia has recommended acupuncture for two symptoms. The Canadian state of Alberta has recommended acupuncture for five symptoms whereas the British Columbia Cancer Agency has recommended the use of acupuncture for three symptoms in cancer care. In 2013, the Oregon Health Authority recommended acupuncture for at least nine different conditions. In 2009, the Malaysian Association for the Study of Pain recommended acupuncture for back pain.

National Guideline Group

A 2014 Austrian Health Technology assessment recommends acupuncture for 11 different conditions. In 2007, the Socialstyrelsen (Swedish National Board of Health and Welfare) recommended acupuncture for pregnancy-related back pain. In 1999, the Danish Institute for Health Technology Assessment recommended acupuncture for back pain. In 2013, the Scottish Intercollegiate Guideline Network recommended acupuncture for back pain and knee osteoarthritis in their clinical practice guideline on chronic pain.

International Expert Group

In 2014, the European Partnership for Action Against Cancer recommended acupuncture for seven symptoms in cancer patients. In 2015, writing on behalf of the European Academy of Allergy and Clinical Immunology, Nematian-Semani et al. recommended acupuncture for allergic rhinitis. In 2008, Vleeming et al. wrote European guidelines recommending acupuncture for pregnancy-related pelvic girdle pain. In their 2010 publication about pain treatment in low-resource countries, the International Association for the Study of Pain recommended acupuncture for eight different pain problems.

Insurance Company

In 2016, the U.S. insurance company AETNA recommended acupuncture for 11 symptoms and the Australian...
insurance company BUPA recommended acupuncture for six conditions in 2011.A312

Single or Group Authors


Online Patient Support Groups


Appendix References


