**Norms & MS Teams Tools**

**Collaborative Norms**
- Stay muted when not speaking.
- Turn your camera on when speaking, if preferred.
- Use the hand-raise feature to gain the attention of the presenter.
- Be an active participant.

**MS Teams Tools**
- Turn camera on/off
- Turn microphone on/off
- View participant list
- View and use the chat
- Use the hand-raise feature
DQI 2021
Supporting the Use of Data in CLNAs

Perkins 101
10/5/21 2-4pm ET

Connect Session
10/7/21 2-3pm ET

Session 1:
Data Driven Decision Making
10/12/21 2-3:30pm ET

Session 2:
Using Labor Force Data
10/14/21 2-3pm ET

Session 3:
Equity Gap Analysis
10/19/21 2-3pm ET
Equity Gap Analysis

Participants will learn how states support local recipients in identifying and addressing equity gaps among CTE students.

Supporting the Use of Data in CLNAs
Adam Flynn-Tabloff
Chief, PAAB

Training and Resources
Leah Amstutz (OH)
Director of the Office of Career-Technical Education

Identifying Root Causes
Robb Lowe (MN)
CTE Pathways Director
Supporting the Use of Data in CLNAs

Adam Flynn-Tabloff
Chief, Program Administration and Accountability Branch (PAAB)
Comprehensive Local Needs Assessments (CLNAs)

Section 134(c)(1-2) of Perkins V

To be eligible to receive financial assistance, an eligible recipient shall -

(A) conduct a comprehensive local needs assessment (CLNA) related to career and technical education and include the results of the needs assessment in the local application submitted for funding; and

(B) not less than once every 2 years, update such CLNA
Supporting the Use of Data in CLNAs

What support or resources do states provide to local districts on data analysis and data-driven decision making?

What strategies are states employing to support local staff in using labor market data to analyze alignment with CTE programs?

What tools and assistance do states provide to district staff on conducting equity gap analysis?
Equity Gap Analysis

What tools and assistance do states provide to district staff on conducting equity gap analysis?

What **training and resources** are offered to local recipients to assist them in identifying and addressing equity gaps?

How do states support **identification of root causes** - both immediate and deeply-rooted?
Equity Gap Analysis
Training and Resources

Criteria for identifying a “gap analysis indicator” for each Perkins metric.

Guides to help locals apply an “equity lens” when analyzing data and how policies/trends may impact different demographic groups.

Conduct full-day regional “Perkins V Equity Labs”
Data Quality Institute Session 3: Equity Gap Analysis

#CareerTechOhio

Leah Amstutz
Director of Career-Technical Education
Local subrecipients will be required to identify barriers to access and enrollment for members of special populations. Additionally, local subrecipients will be required to identify gaps in student outcomes for special populations and will be responsible for implementing strategies to address these gaps. Ohio will support implementation at the state and local levels using the following strategies and activities:

- Facilitate secondary equity labs and postsecondary workshops with local recipients to identify gaps in access, engagement and outcomes for special populations. These labs will support recipients by:
  - Providing local recipients with data regarding enrollment and performance measures, disaggregated by special populations and subgroups;
  - Aiding local recipients in ensuring all students, including those who are members of special populations, have equitable access to and are enrolling in career-technical education programs aligned to their individual preferences, interests, needs and strengths;
  - Identifying barriers to experiential and extended learning experiences, such as work-based learning, career and technical student organization participation, and articulated credit, for all students, including special populations and subgroups.
Equity Workgroup Purpose

Provide input on Equity Labs, data and supports needed at the local level to enact equity provisions in the law.

Representatives collaborated with other workgroups to ensure equity provisions are being carried throughout the State plan.
Equity Lab

Structure for District Equity Labs 2020
- Equity Warm up, definitions, activity with surprising statistics for Ohio
- Notice and Wonder Activity
- Root Causes Analysis
- Planning strategies/aligning work to Comprehensive Local Needs Assessment

Structure for Virtual Equity Labs 2021
- Warm up introduction – activity
- Becoming an equity-oriented change agent
- Discovering Inequities through data
- Strategies for removing barriers, creating supports and inclusion
- Planning for change
Equity Lab Intended Outcomes

1. Advance each district’s equity competency
2. Develop data analysis skills for use in data-driven equity decisions
3. Initiate data-driven goal setting for improvements in gaps
Who Participated?

District Teams of 5-10

Administrators  Counselors  Teachers
Data Support

Develop data analysis skills for use in data-driven equity decisions

- Disaggregated Equity Data Report
- Notice & Wonder Data Activity
- Root Cause Analysis for Data Gaps
District Data Report

- Reading & Language Arts Proficiency
  - Subgroup
- Mathematics Proficiency
  - Subgroup
- Technical Skill Attainment
  - Subgroup
  - Special Population
- Post Program Placement
  - Subgroup
  - Special Population
- 4/5 Year Graduation Rate
  - Subgroup
  - Special Population

- Nontraditional Program Placement
  - Subgroup
  - Special Population
- Career-Technical Planning
- District Enrollment
  - Subgroup
  - Special Population
  - Member District
  - Grade Level
  - Course Type
- Course Instructor
  - Gender
  - Race
Example of Report

2018

Lowest: 51.6%
All Students: 77.3%
Highest: 82.9%
Notice & Wonder Exercise

**Step 1**
- Notice
- Facts
- Numbers
- Gaps

**Step 2**
- Wonder
- Why…
- If…
- How…

**Step 3**
- Narrative
- Reveal useful information.
Percent of Career-Technical Concentrators who left secondary education in 2018 who scored proficient or higher on the summative technical assessments aligned to their program

Technical Skill Attainment by Subgroup

- English Learners: 51.6%
- Black, Non-Hispanic: 60.5%
- Students with Disabilities: 61.2%
- Economic Disadvantage: 71.8%
- Male: 73.8%
- Hispanic: 74.2%
- Multiracial: 74.3%
- Single Parent: 74.9%
- Asian or Pacific Islander: 76.6%
- All Students: 77.3%
- White, Non-Hispanic: 80.0%
- Female: 81.5%
- American Indian or Alaskan Native: 82.9%
Notice and Wonder

I notice...

...that 77.3% of all students scored proficient or higher, but only 51.6% of English learners did.

I wonder...

...if English learners had access to program resources and assessments in their native language?
Defining Meaningful Progress

Think Big, Start Small, Scale Fast

– Changes should aim to make a universal impact;
– But recognize that progress is often incremental;
– Success should be celebrated and replicated as often as possible.
Set Reasonable Goals

Reduce the gap by half: “We will improve proficiency by 15% by 2023.”

**Remember**: Consider the student impact of this percentage. Is it reasonable?

(i.e., Is your goal strategy realistically capable of making this amount of impact in this amount of time? Does this amount of impact reflect meaningful progress for underserved or underperforming groups?)

**Adjust as necessary**: “We will improve proficiency by 7%/23% by 2023.”
Education Community Feedback

Need examples of tangible strategies to improve equity

Need local liaisons to help with equity work

Need pathway level data

Need a community of practice to share best practices
Equity Lab Follow Through

- Root Cause Analysis
  - Affinity Maps
- Need for Local Support
- Strategies for Virtual Equity Labs
- Equity Ambassador Program

Informed
Equity Lab Follow Through

Need for more data

Best Practices

Contract with American Institute for Research

Equity for Each Grant
Equity Ambassador Program

• Open for registration
• One representative from each Career-Technical Planning District
• Invited to two professional development events each school year
• Quarterly Equity Newsletter
• Career-Technical Education Equity Community of Practice
• Act as a local equity expert and advocate
American Institute for Research Contract

• American Institute for Research
• Six internal workshops
• Two Equity Ambassador workshops
• Material resources for improving equity in Career-Technical Education
• Equity Data Story for Career-Technical Education in Ohio by December 2021
Comprehensive Local Needs Assessment
Comprehensive Local Needs Assessment

- Interactive reports will be developed to included data to support users in completing the questions of the Comprehensive Local Needs Assessment for their districts.
Landing Page

Career-Technical Education Reports
Four-Year Longitudinal Graduation Rate by Career-Technical Planning District
Trends in Four-Year Graduation Rates

4-Year Longitudinal Graduation Rate (CTPD) - Trend

Choose a Subgroup: Gender
Choose a Pathway: All

4-Year Graduation Rate for Selected Career Technical Planning Districts by All Students

Class of 2018: 96.8%
Class of 2019: 97.2%
Class of 2020: 97.2%

4-Year Graduation Rate for Selected Career Technical Planning Districts by Gender

Subgroup: Female, Male

Class of 2018: Female 97.4%, Male 96.3%
Class of 2019: Female 97.8%, Male 96.6%
Class of 2020: Female 98.0%, Male 96.6%
Career and Post-Secondary Readiness Percentage by Subgroup

- All Students: 70.3%
- Female: 80.6%
- Male: 78.0%
- American Indian or Alaskan Native: 72.1%
- Asian or Pacific Islander: 52.9%
- Black, Non-Hispanic: 67.9%
- Hispanic: 75.0%
- Multiracial: 76.7%
- White, Non-Hispanic: 81.3%
- Economic Disadvantaged: 72.6%
- English Learner: 67.7%
- Students with Disabilities: 69.1%
- Homeless Students: 64.0%
- Migrant Students: 70.8%
- Military Students: 71.0%
- Foster Students: 70.3%
- Single Parent: 36.1%

Cohort Year Subgroup:
- All Students
- Female
- Male
- African American
- Asian or Pacific Islander
- Black, Non-Hispanic
- Hispanic
- Multiracial
- White, Non-Hispanic
- Economic Disadvantaged
- English Learner
- Students with Disabilities
- Homeless Students
- Migrant Students
- Military Students
- Foster Students
- Single Parent

Career and Post-Secondary Readiness (CTPD) - Demographic Overview

Choose a Graduation Cohort:
- Class of 2020

Choose a Career Tech Planning District:
- All

Choose a Pathway:
- All
Career and Post-Secondary Readiness Details and Demographics
Career Tech and Advanced Coursework
Work-Based or Service Learning
Lasting Considerations for Equity

**Equity work is additive.**
Continue with all the great things you are already doing; we are simply adding tools to the toolbox!

**Don’t forget student voice!**
As you continue to engage stakeholders, remember to recognize and include those this work is intended to serve.

**Numbers tell you what, they will not tell you why.**
Continue doing the work to inform the data you are observing.
Lasting Considerations for Equity

Barriers can be real and perceived.

- Our goal is to ensure each child is challenged, prepared, and empowered.

Equity work is not about determining the outcomes.

- Students will always be able to make their own choices. Our efforts are to ensure we have provided them what they need in order to make those choices.
Next Steps

• Providing more data is important to making accurate data-driven decisions. American Institute for Research is contracted to develop an interactive Data Story for Career-Technical Education in Ohio.

• American Institute for Research is contracted to develop a series of resources for the state of Ohio to assist in cataloguing best practices for improving disproportionate gaps.

• Exploring innovative strategies to improve equitable supports and remove barriers for students who represent more than one historically marginalized groups and creating a balance for these students.

• Collaborating with student and family/caregiver voice for improvements.
Equity Gap Analysis
Identifying Root Causes

CLNA guide that includes instructions on how to apply root cause analysis.

Guidance on developing goals to prioritize strategies addressing equity gaps that have the most impact and chance of success.
Minnesota’s Process

• Addressing Equity Gaps
• Guidance and Training
• Developing Goals and Strategies

October 19, 2021
Does Not Occur in a Vacuum

• Guidance and Training
  • A series of Scaffolding Experiences
    • Workshops
    • Webinars
    • Examples
    • Practical Application
    • Individualized Technical Assistance
    • Peer Interaction
  • Reinforced / Integrated with System Initiatives
• Review of Perkins Legislation
  • Comprehensive Local Needs Assessment
• Advance CTE Equity Gap Pilot
  • Advanced CTE 2 Part Equity Gap Training
• Change Management
• Design Thinking
• Equity Minded Practices / Humanizing Data
• Power BI
• Individualized Technical Assistance / Peer Discussion
• Support and Integration

• Minnesota State Colleges and Universities
  • Equity by Design (Perkins Leaders Involved)
  • Equity 2030

• Minnesota Department of Education
  • One MDE
Advance CTE: Equity Gap Analysis Root Cause
Change Management

Conditions in/of a System

- Policies
- Practices
- Resource Flows
- Relationships & Connections
- Power Dynamics
- Mental Models
Change Management

Conditions in/of a System

DATA
- Gather
- Gaps
  - Creating measurements
  - Ghost victories-gaming
  - 5 tests for avoiding gaming

AWARENESS
- Root Causes
  - System influencers
  - Barriers to Upstream Thinking
  - Upstream thinking planning questions
  - Equity by design

PLANNING
- Smart goal action planning
- Quarterly implementation planning

Powerful Questions and Mindset
- Based on data, identify 2-3 priority areas within special populations
- What partners are not involved?
- What new/existing resources can be utilized or created to support key goals?
- What professional development or targeted assistance is still needed to support your team?
Equity Minded Practices / Humanizing Data

• Address the limits of data
• Ensure positivity in approach
• Inclusion of learner context
  • Student experience
  • Historical participation,
  • Trauma,
  • Marginalization, etc.
• React and act to disruption of status quo
• Agenda
  • Requesting access to Power BI (Perkins Reports)
  • Logging in to Power BI from Office 365
  • Finding the Perkins V Reporting app
  • Reports available in the app
  • Time for Q & A
• **Individualized Approach**
  
  • Technical Assistance in Regard to Data and Equity Gaps
  
  • Communities of Practice
  
  • Technical Assistance with the CTE Equity Specialist
Mission

• The mission of the Black Men in Teaching program is to recruit and support Black, African American, and African men into Elementary and Secondary Education pathways. Our program seeks to empower black men in education to have a positive impact on all students especially those from similar backgrounds.
**Logic Model**

**INPUTS**
- Program Coordinator
- Volunteers in Mentor Program
- BMIE Advisory Board
- MOUs/agreements with community partners

**Support from:**
1. Normandale Education Dept.
2. Normandale Admissions and Counseling Team
3. Normandale Tutoring Center

**ACTIVITIES**
- Leadership Training
- Professional Support
- Cultural Competency Training
- Academic Support

**OUTPUTS**
- Clifton Strengths 2.0
- Leadership Retreat
- Mock Interviews
- Resumé Building
- Mentorship Program
- Sociocultural Excursions
- Int. Summer Experience
- Case Studies/Literary Reviews
- Tutorials
- Transfer Campus Visits
- Praxis Preparation
- BMIT Awards Gala

**OUTCOMES**
- Strong Black, African American, and African Elementary/Secondary Education male teachers
- Achieve Cultural Competency
- Eliminate the diversity gap among Minnesota’s K-12 teachers
- Metric: transfer to a 4 year (immediate) Measure Resilience

**Closing the equity gap**
Robb Lowe
Director of CTE Pathways
Minnesota State Colleges & Universities
robb.lowe@minnstate.edu
Questions?

Please email adam.flynn-tabloff@ed.gov
Jamboard Collaboration

1. Click on the Jamboard link in the Chat.
2. Post a sticky-note (with your State name) in response to the question:
   How can OCTAE support equity work that is underway in your State? What are you struggling with as you work to ensure equitable access and outcomes for all CTE students?

Click on the sticky note icon
Enter information and click “Save”
DQI 2021
Supporting the Use of Data in CLNAs

Perkins 101
10/5/21 2-4pm ET

Connect Session
10/7/21 2-3pm ET

Session 1:
Data Driven Decision Making
10/12/21 2-3:30pm ET

Session 2:
Using Labor Force Data
10/14/21 2-3pm ET

Session 3:
Equity Gap Analysis
10/19/21 2-3pm ET

Office of Career, Technical, and Adult Education