

Withdrawal/Redaction Sheet

Clinton Library

DOCUMENT NO. AND TYPE	SUBJECT/TITLE	DATE	RESTRICTION
001. email	Nancy McEldowney to Donald Bandler, et al., re: [GMOs] (5 pages)	06/29/1998	P1/b(1) v2 4/3/2020
002. email	Nancy McEldowney to Donald Bandler, re: [GMO Corn Update] (1 page)	07/17/1998	P1/b(1) v2 11/26/2019
003. email	Nancy McEldowney to Malcolm Lee and Deanna Behring, re: Jospin Letter on GMOs (3 pages)	07/20/1998	P1/b(1) v2 4/3/2020
004. email	Lawrence Butler to Nancy McEldowney, re: [GMO Corn] (5 pages)	07/20/1998	P1/b(1) v2 4/3/2020
005. email	Deanna Behring to Kerri Ann Jones, re: Jospin Letter on GMOs (4 pages)	07/21/1998	P1/b(1) v2 4/3/2020
006. email	Deanna Behring to Kerri Ann Jones, re: Jospin Letter on GMOs (3 pages)	07/21/1998	P1/b(1) v2 4/3/2020
007. email	Lawrence Butler to Deanna Behring, re: Jospin Letter on GMOs (3 pages)	07/21/1998	P1/b(1) v2 4/3/2020
008. email	Lawrence Butler to Nancy McEldowney, re: Bowles Letter on GMO Corn (2 pages)	07/27/1998	P1/b(1) v2 11/26/2019
009. email	Nancy McEldowney to Nancy Maxfield, re: Bowles Letter on GMO Corn [duplicate of 008] (2 pages)	07/28/1998	P1/b(1) v2 11/26/2019
010. email	Malcolm Lee to Nancy McEldowney, re: Bowles Letter on GMO Corn [duplicate of 008] (2 pages)	08/03/1998	P1/b(1) v2 11/26/2019
011. email	Leslie Davidson to Theodore Osius, re: [GMOs] (7 pages)	06/14/1999	P1/b(1) v2 4/3/2020

COLLECTION:

Clinton Presidential Records
NSC Emails
Exchange - Non-Record (Mar 97 - Jan 01) ([GMO...])
OA/Box Number: 630000

FOLDER TITLE:

[03/18/1998 - 12/22/1999]

2013-0836-F
ke3025

RESTRICTION CODES

Presidential Records Act - [44 U.S.C. 2204(a)]

P1 National Security Classified Information [(a)(1) of the PRA]
P2 Relating to the appointment to Federal office [(a)(2) of the PRA]
P3 Release would violate a Federal statute [(a)(3) of the PRA]
P4 Release would disclose trade secrets or confidential commercial or financial information [(a)(4) of the PRA]
P5 Release would disclose confidential advice between the President and his advisors, or between such advisors [(a)(5) of the PRA]
P6 Release would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy [(a)(6) of the PRA]

C. Closed in accordance with restrictions contained in donor's deed of gift.

PRM. Personal record misfile defined in accordance with 44 U.S.C. 2201(3).

RR. Document will be reviewed upon request.

Freedom of Information Act - [5 U.S.C. 552(b)]

b(1) National security classified information [(b)(1) of the FOIA]
b(2) Release would disclose internal personnel rules and practices of an agency [(b)(2) of the FOIA]
b(3) Release would violate a Federal statute [(b)(3) of the FOIA]
b(4) Release would disclose trade secrets or confidential or financial information [(b)(4) of the FOIA]
b(6) Release would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy [(b)(6) of the FOIA]
b(7) Release would disclose information compiled for law enforcement purposes [(b)(7) of the FOIA]
b(8) Release would disclose information concerning the regulation of financial institutions [(b)(8) of the FOIA]
b(9) Release would disclose geological or geophysical information concerning wells [(b)(9) of the FOIA]

Withdrawal/Redaction Sheet

Clinton Library

DOCUMENT NO. AND TYPE	SUBJECT/TITLE	DATE	RESTRICTION
012. email	Leslie Davidson to Theodore Osius, re: [Working Group on Genetically Modified Organisms] (3 pages)	11/17/1999	P1/b(1)
~~013. email~~	~~Leslie Davidson to Theodore Osius, re: Italy Considers the Ban of 7 GMO Varieties (7 pages)~~	~~12/22/1999~~	~~P1/b(1)~~ <i>re 4/3/2020</i>

COLLECTION:

Clinton Presidential Records
NSC Emails
Exchange - Non-Record (Mar 97 - Jan 01) ([GMO...])
OA/Box Number: 630000

FOLDER TITLE:

[03/18/1998 - 12/22/1999]

Kara Ellis
2013-0836-F
ke3025

RESTRICTION CODES

Presidential Records Act - [44 U.S.C. 2204(a)]

P1 National Security Classified Information [(a)(1) of the PRA]
P2 Relating to the appointment to Federal office [(a)(2) of the PRA]
P3 Release would violate a Federal statute [(a)(3) of the PRA]
P4 Release would disclose trade secrets or confidential commercial or financial information [(a)(4) of the PRA]
P5 Release would disclose confidential advice between the President and his advisors, or between such advisors [(a)(5) of the PRA]
P6 Release would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy [(a)(6) of the PRA]

C. Closed in accordance with restrictions contained in donor's deed of gift.

PRM. Personal record misfile defined in accordance with 44 U.S.C. 2201(3).

RR. Document will be reviewed upon request.

Freedom of Information Act - [5 U.S.C. 552(b)]

b(1) National security classified information [(b)(1) of the FOIA]
b(2) Release would disclose internal personnel rules and practices of an agency [(b)(2) of the FOIA]
b(3) Release would violate a Federal statute [(b)(3) of the FOIA]
b(4) Release would disclose trade secrets or confidential or financial information [(b)(4) of the FOIA]
b(6) Release would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy [(b)(6) of the FOIA]
b(7) Release would disclose information compiled for law enforcement purposes [(b)(7) of the FOIA]
b(8) Release would disclose information concerning the regulation of financial institutions [(b)(8) of the FOIA]
b(9) Release would disclose geological or geophysical information concerning wells [(b)(9) of the FOIA]

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 3/18/98 9:03:46 PM
FROM Bandler, Donald K.
CLASSIFICATION UNCLASSIFIED
SUBJECT FW: draft McCurry statement on GMO decision [UNCLASSIFIED]
TO Crowley, Philip J.
Dehqanzada, Yahya A.
Luzzatto, Anne R.
Rubin, Eric S.
Wozniak, Natalie S.

CARBON_COPY

TEXT_BODY fyi: Anne and Eric -- a possible approach.

-----Original Message-----

From: Bandler,
Donald K.

Sent: Wednesday, March 18, 1998 9:03 PM

To: @PLANNING

- Strat Plan & Comm

Cc: @EUROPE - European Affairs; @NSA - Natl
Security Advisor

Subject: FW: draft McCurry statement on GMO decision
[UNCLASSIFIED]

Importance: High

Tony - per our discussion,
here's an uncleared draft. We'll want to clear it with USTR and
State in the morning -- if you agree it would be useful. Let's stay
away from the Irish angle -- we may need it again!

TRANSLATED_ATTACHMENT

Doc12.doc

Draft press statement on European Commission decision on
Genetically modified
corn

Yesterday the European Union made a landmark decision on a
biotechnology issue of
high importance to transatlantic trade relations. The United States

welcomes the European Union's Agriculture Council action approving the import of bio-engineered corn from the United States. This has been an issue of high level concern for American business. The Administration has worked closely with industry during lengthy consultations with the European Union to ensure a decision based on scientific fact. The President raised this question affecting \$1.2 billion in exports during the December U.S.-EU Summit. We have been in constant touch with EU member states and the Commission since then.

The European Union based its approval on a process of thorough scientific review. The United States, which had reached the same conclusion concerning our own market, is gratified at the result. This demonstrates the vitality of the U.S.-EU relationship. It also establishes a model for cooperation in resolving trade issues involving new technologies that stand to benefit our societies, the international economy and the environment.

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 3/18/98 9:04:19 PM
FROM Bandler, Donald K.
CLASSIFICATION UNCLASSIFIED
SUBJECT RE: draft McCurry statement on GMO decision [UNCLASSIFIED]
TO Butler, Lawrence E.

CARBON_COPY

TEXT_BODY thanks -- you'll see i've prepositioned it tonight.

-----Original

Message-----

From: Butler, Lawrence E.

Sent: Wednesday, March
18, 1998 8:29 PM

To: Bandler, Donald K.

Cc: Butler, Lawrence E.

Subject: draft

McCurry statement on GMO decision [UNCLASSIFIED]

Importance: High

Don

-- do stay away from the Irish angle -- we may need it again! <<

File: Doc12.doc >>

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 3/18/98 10:27:54 PM
FROM Bandler, Donald K.
CLASSIFICATION UNCLASSIFIED
SUBJECT RE: draft McCurry statement on GMO decision [UNCLASSIFIED]
TO Blinken, Antony J.

CARBON_COPY Bandler, Donald K.
Bendick, Gordon L.
Braden, Susan R.
Brown, Keirn C.
Butler, Lawrence E.
Covey, James P.
Dowling, John N. (Nick)
Flanagan, Stephen J.
Marshall, Betty A.
Maxfield, Nancy H.
McEldowney, Nancy E.
Quinn, Mary E.
Sapiro, Miriam E.

TEXT_BODY good stuff! -- we'll have to work the query in the morning.
-----Original
Message-----
From: Blinken, Antony J.
Sent: Wednesday, March 18,
1998 9:46 PM
To: Bandler, Donald K.; @PLANNING - Strat Plan & Comm;
@EUROPE - European Affairs
Subject: FW: draft McCurry statement
on GMO decision [UNCLASSIFIED]
Importance: High

suggested change
and a query.

-----Original Message-----
From: Bandler, Donald
K.
Sent: Wednesday, March 18, 1998 9:03 PM
To: @PLANNING - Strat
Plan & Comm
Cc: @EUROPE - European Affairs; @NSA - Natl Security

Advisor

Subject: FW: draft McCurry statement on GMO decision [UNCLASSIFIED]

Importance: High

Tony

- per our discussion, here's an uncleared draft. We'll want to clear it with USTR and State in the morning -- if you agree it would be useful. Let's stay away from the Irish angle -- we may need it again! << File: Doc12.doc >>

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 3/19/98 8:05:04 AM
FROM Rubin, Eric S.
CLASSIFICATION UNCLASSIFIED
SUBJECT RE: draft McCurry statement on GMO decision [UNCLASSIFIED]
TO Bandler, Donald K.
Crowley, Philip J.
Dehqanzada, Yahya A.
Luzzatto, Anne R.
Rubin, Eric S.
Wozniak, Natalie S.

CARBON_COPY Bandler, Donald K.
Bendick, Gordon L.
Braden, Susan R.
Brown, Keirn C.
Butler, Lawrence E.
Covey, James P.
Dowling, John N. (Nick)
Flanagan, Stephen J.
Marshall, Betty A.
Maxfield, Nancy H.
McEldowney, Nancy E.
Quinn, Mary E.
Sapiro, Miriam E.

TEXT_BODY Thanks--let us know when this is cleared and whether you want it to go out as a WH statement or just to serve as guidance.

-----Original
Message-----
From: Bandler, Donald K.
Sent: Wednesday, March 18,
1998 9:04 PM
To: @PRESS - Public Affairs
Subject: FW: draft McCurry
statement on GMO decision [UNCLASSIFIED]
Importance: High

fyi:
Anne and Eric -- a possible approach.

-----Original Message-----

From: Bandler,
Donald K.
Sent: Wednesday, March 18, 1998 9:03 PM
To: @PLANNING
- Strat Plan & Comm
Cc: @EUROPE - European Affairs; @NSA - Natl
Security Advisor
Subject: FW: draft McCurry statement on GMO decision
[UNCLASSIFIED]
Importance: High

Tony - per our discussion,
here's an uncleared draft. We'll want to clear it with USTR and
State in the morning -- if you agree it would be useful. Let's stay
away from the Irish angle -- we may need it again! << File: Doc12.doc
>>

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 6/11/98 12:04:33 PM
FROM McEldowney, Nancy E.
CLASSIFICATION UNCLASSIFIED
SUBJECT RE: French GMO meeting [UNCLASSIFIED]
TO Bandler, Donald K.

CARBON_COPY Marshall, Betty A.
Butler, Lawrence E.

TEXT_BODY Excellent thought. Will give you and Larry sufficient time to do your corn question, then a trip run through sounds good.

-----Original

Message-----

From: Bandler, Donald K.

Sent: Thursday, June 11,
1998 11:56 AM

To: McEldowney, Nancy E.

Cc: Marshall, Betty A.

Subject: FW:

French GMO meeting [UNCLASSIFIED]

Importance: High

nancy -- shall

we also use this to go over Jospin issues.

-----Original Message-----

From: Butler,

Lawrence E.

Sent: Thursday, June 11, 1998 11:26 AM

To: Marshall,

Betty A.

Cc: Bandler, Donald K.; McEldowney, Nancy E.; Hendricks,
Lori A.

Subject: French GMO meeting [UNCLASSIFIED]

Importance: High

Betty

-- please invite French DCM Pernet to a meeting at Don's office for 4 p.m. tomorrow. Purpose is to discuss a trade issue in preparation for Prime Minister Jospin's visit. USTR's Peter Scher and an NSC notetaker will participate from our side.

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 6/11/98 2:35:00 PM
FROM Butler, Lawrence E.
CLASSIFICATION UNCLASSIFIED
SUBJECT RE: French GMO meeting [UNCLASSIFIED]
TO Hendricks, Lori A.

CARBON_COPY**TEXT_BODY**

I'll share the talkingpoints as soon as I see them (the Bandler-SRB e-mail never went forward.

-----Original Message-----

From: Hendricks,
Lori A.
Sent: Thursday, June 11, 1998 1:55 PM
To: Butler, Lawrence
E.
Subject: RE: French GMO meeting [UNCLASSIFIED]

Thank you,
Larry. I hope that you will attend. I'd like to know USTR's approach on this, given the changes over the past two weeks.

-----Original
Message-----

From: Butler, Lawrence E.
Sent: Thursday, June 11,
1998 1:13 PM
To: Hendricks, Lori A.
Subject: RE: French GMO meeting
[UNCLASSIFIED]

given the small size of the group, probably not.
I'm leaning towards having our France person here be the note takers since they are likely to cover all Jospin-related issues, not just corn. But we can talk before hand.

-----Original Message-----

From: Hendricks,
Lori A.
Sent: Thursday, June 11, 1998 12:43 PM
To: Butler, Lawrence
E.

Subject: RE: French GMO meeting [UNCLASSIFIED]

Larry, thanks.

Is there room for another notetaker?

-----Original Message-----

From: Butler,

Lawrence E.

Sent: Thursday, June 11, 1998 11:26 AM

To: Marshall,

Betty A.

Cc: Bandler, Donald K.; McEldowney, Nancy E.; Hendricks,

Lori A.

Subject: French GMO meeting [UNCLASSIFIED]

Importance: High

Betty

-- please invite French DCM Pernet to a meeting at Don's office for 4 p.m. tomorrow. Purpose is to discuss a trade issue in preparation for Prime Minister Jospin's visit. USTR's Peter Scher and an NSC notetaker will participate from our side.

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 6/29/98 11:30:39 AM

FROM McEldowney, Nancy E.

CLASSIFICATION ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

CLASSIFICATIONREASON 1.5(d)

DATECLASSIFIEDON 06/29/1998

DECLASSIFYON 06/29/2008

SUBJECT GMO'S: WHERE DOES FRANCE STAND? [~~CONFIDENTIAL~~]

TO Bandler, Donald K.
Braden, Susan R.
Brown, Keirn C.
Butler, Lawrence E.
Covey, James P.
Dowling, John N. (Nick)
Flanagan, Stephen J.
Marshall, Betty A.
Maxfield, Nancy H.
McEldowney, Nancy E.
Quinn, Mary E.
Sapiro, Miriam E.
Antholis, William J.
Boone, Sherman G.
Brainard, S. Lael
Hendricks, Lori A.
Lee, Malcolm R.
Marchick, David M.
Mitsler, Elaine M.

DECLASSIFIED
E.O. 13526, Sec. 3.5 (b)
White House Guidelines, September 11, 2006
By VT NARA, Date 11/16/10
7016-0524-m (3.34)

CARBON_COPY

TEXT_BODY

-----Original Message-----

From: WHSR

Sent: Friday, June 26,
1998 1:32 PMTo: Haines, Mary A.; Lee, Malcolm R.; McEldowney, Nancy
E.

Subject: GMO'S: WHERE DOES FRANCE STAND?

~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

T I A L PARIS 014579

STATE PASS USTR FOR SCHER AND MU@PHY
STATE
PASS USDA FOR GLICKMAN, SCHUMACHER, DRAZEK AND
GALVIN
STATE PASS
FDA FOR COMMISSIONER
GENEVA FOR USTR, AGRICULTURE AND RESSLER

E.O.
12958: DECL: 06/24/03
TAGS: ETRD, EAGR, TBIO, EUN, FR, KSCA
SUBJECT:
GMO'S: WHERE DOES FRANCE STAND?

REF: PARIS 14245

CLASSIFIED
BY DCM W. ROBERT PEARSON FOR REASONS 1.5 B AND D.

1. ~~(C)~~ INITIAL
CONTACTS WITH THE GOF AFTER THE JUNE 21-22
CONFERENCE OF CONSENSUS
ON GMO'S SUGGEST THAT IT WILL TAKE MORE
THAN A FEW DAYS FOR THE
GOVERNMENT TO SORT OUT ITS PLAN OF ACTION
WITH REGARD TO THE PENDING
APPROVAL OF THE TWO GMO CORN VARIETIES
AND A LONGER TIME TO DETERMINE
A MORE GENERAL GMO POLICY. WE
ANTICIPATE THAT DECISIONS ON THE
CORN APPROVALS WILL ONLY OCCUR
AFTER HIGH LEVEL INTER-MINISTERIAL
DISCUSSIONS, PROBABLY INVOLVING
THE PRIME MINISTER. THE KEY INTER-MINISTERIAL
PLAYERS ARE FINANCE
(TRADE), AGRICULTURE, HEALTH, AND ENVIRONMENT.
(ACCORDING TO A
DREE CONTACT, THE FIRST OF THESE DISCUSSIONS TOOK
PLACE JUNE 24.)
THE PM WILL TAKE INTO ACCOUNT HIS DISCUSSION WITH
PRESIDENT
CLINTON, THE MIXED RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE
CONFERENCE OF
CONSENSUS
(REFTEL), FRENCH ECONOMIC INTERESTS (INCLUDING THE

DESIRE
OF MANY
FARMERS TO USE GMO'S), AND THE INTERNAL POLITICS OF
THE
COALITION,
ESPECIALLY THE POSITION OF THE "GREEN" ENVIRONMENT
MINISTER
AND HER
PARTY.

2. ~~(C)~~ BOTH TRADE AND AGRICULTURE CONTACTS HINT
THAT A DECISION ON
THE TWO CORNS MAY HAPPEN IN JULY, BUT FOR NOW
NO ONE IS PREDICTING
ANY SPECIFIC DATES. HOWEVER, THE AGRICULTURAL
ADVISER TO THE PRIME
MINISTER IS HOPEFUL THAT THE ISSUE CAN BE RESOLVED
BY MID-JULY. HE
ALSO OPINED, PERSONALLY, THAT THE MATTER WILL LIKELY

BE RESOLVED
FOR IMPORTS BEFORE A FULL DECISION ON DOMESTIC
COMMERCIALIZATION,
SUCH
AS WAS DONE FOR NOVARTIS' BT CORN. HE BELIEVES THAT
IT WILL
BE
EASIER TO RESOLVE THE CORN APPROVALS THIS WAY THAN
BY WAITING TO
RESOLVE
ALL THE DOMESTIC ASPECTS. HE ALSO BELIEVES THAT THE
U.S.
WOULD
THEN BE ABLE TO EXPORT CORN TO THE EUROPEAN UNION
FOR AT
LEAST TWO
MONTHS OF THIS YEAR'S MARKETING SEASON. HOWEVER,
THE GOF
WILL NOT/NOT
MOVE ON ANYTHING BEFORE RECEIVING INQ
(INTERIM) GMO REPORT ON JUNE
LQ
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY'S OFFICE OF EVALUATION OF
SCIENTIFIC AND
TECHNOLOGICAL
CHOICES.

TRANSATLANTIC DISCUSSION: TEP OR BILATERAL OR BOTH

3.

~~(C)~~ A MINAG CONTACT HAS TOLD EMBASSY THAT THE PRIME MINISTER INTENDS TO TRY TO ESTABLISH A U.S.-FRENCH GROUP OF TECHNICAL EXPERTS TO STUDY THE GMO ISSUE. THE PRIME MINISTER'S AGRICULTURAL ADVISER CONFIRMED TO EMBASSY AGMINCOUNS 6/26 THAT THE PRIME MINISTER IS INTERESTED IN ESTABLISHING A GOVERNMENT TO GOVERNMENT EXPERTS GROUP TO DISCUSS THE SCIENTIFIC ASPECTS OF GMO'S AS WELL AS LABELLING ISSUES. THE PM'S ADVISER STATED THAT SUCH A DIALOGUE WOULD NOT INVOLVE TRADE ASPECTS OF GMO'S AND WOULD COMPLEMENT, NOT INTERFERE WITH, U.S.-EU POLICY DISCUSSIONS ON THE SUBJECT. TRADE POLICY OFFICER RAISED THIS MATTER WITH A SENIOR DREE OFFICIAL, NOTING THAT WHAT THE U.S. HAS IN MIND IS THE PROPOSED U.S.-EU TRANSATLANTIC ECONOMIC PARTNERSHIP (TEP) DISCUSSION OF BIOTECHNOLOGY (INCLUDING GMO) APPROVAL PROCESSES, NOT A BILATERAL U.S.-FRENCH DIALOGUE. DREE ALSO UNDERSTANDS THAT THE PRIME MINISTER IS INTERESTED IN A SEPARATE, COMPLEMENTARY (TO TEP) BILATERAL APPROACH.

4. ~~(C)~~ THE DREE OFFICIAL REITERATED THE GOF AND FRENCH PUBLIC'S CONCERNS ABOUT FOOD AND HEALTH SAFETY IN THE AFTERMATH OF VARIOUS SCANDALS OVER THE PAST 10 YEARS, ESPECIALLY THOSE INVOLVING TAINTED BLOOD AND BSE. HE CITED THESE SCANDALS AND DIMINISHED PLIC TRUST IN EUROPEAN REGULATORS AND GOVERNMENTS AS REASONS FOR THE GOF'S CURRENT COURSE OF ACTION.

5. ~~(C)~~ WE TOLD THE DREE OFFICIAL THAT THE U.S. WOULD CONTINUE

TO
INSIST ON
A SCIENCE-BASED APPROVAL PROCESS. NOTING THAT THE
CONFERENCE OF
CONSENSUS\$PANELISTS (ALL NON-SCIENTISTS) HAD
RECOMMENDED THAT THE
GOF NOT APPROVE GMO'S WITH ANTIBIOTIC GENE
MARKERS OR THOSE THAT
CAN SPREAD THEIR GENE CHARACTERISTICS TO
OTHER PLANT VARIETIES,
WE REMINDED HIM THAT CERTAIN GMO'S WHICH
HAVE MET THE SCIENTIFIC
CRITERIA FOR APPROVAL IN THE U.S. HAVE
THESE CHARACTERISTICS. WE
SUGGESTED THAT THE GOF BEAR OUR CONCERNS
ON SCIENCE-BASED APPROVAL
IN MIND AS IT MAKES DECISIONS.

ROHATYN

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 7/17/98 8:10:13 PM
FROM McEldowney, Nancy E.
CLASSIFICATION ~~TOP SECRET~~
CLASSIFICATIONREASON 1.5(c)
DATECLASSIFIEDON 07/17/1998
DECLASSIFYON 07/17/2008
SUBJECT GMO Corn Update -- For your discussion with Pearson and STR [~~TOP SECRET~~]
TO Bandler, Donald K.

CARBON_COPY
TEXT_BODY

This message contained an attachment that could not be written to a file

DECLASSIFIED
E.O. 13526
White House Guidelines, May 16, 2017
By 12 NARA, Date 11/26/2019
7076-0529-27

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 7/20/98 9:55:13 AM

FROM McEldowney, Nancy E.

CLASSIFICATION ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

CLASSIFICATIONREASON 1.5(d)

DATECLASSIFIEDON 07/20/1998

DECLASSIFYON 07/20/2008

SUBJECT Jospin Letter on GMO's Dear ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

TO Lee, Malcolm R.
Behring, Deanna M.

CARBON_COPY Bandler, Donald K.
Braden, Susan R.
Brown, Keirn C.
Butler, Lawrence E.
Covey, James P.
Dowling, John N. (Nick)
Flanagan, Stephen J.
Marshall, Betty A.
Maxfield, Nancy H.
McEldowney, Nancy E.
Quinn, Mary E.
Sapiro, Miriam E.
Schulte, Gregory L.

TEXT_BODY Malcom/Deanna: could I please get your chop on attached? If at all possible, would like to send forward tonight.

Larry: please
let me know if there are folks in NEC or USTR that should see this.

Thanks very much. Nancy

TRANSLATED_ATTACHMENT jospin letter.doc

DECLASSIFIED
E.O. 13526, Sec. 3.5 (b)
White House Guidelines, September 11, 2006
By VT NARA, Date 11/16/2019
2016-0524-M (3.32)

Dear Lionel:

Thank you for your kind letter. I too appreciated the opportunity to discuss with you some of the critical challenges that our two societies face as they enter the 21st century.

The accelerated pace of technological changes has created exciting new opportunities for increasing employment, raising incomes and addressing environmental and health problems. Advances in biotechnology are particularly impressive.

I know from our discussion that many in France remain concerned about products containing genetically modified organisms (GMOs). I was pleased, therefore, to learn that the preliminary report from the French Parliament's Conference of Consensus gave a positive assessment of the safety of the two GMO varieties that are currently awaiting French approval. I hope that the French Government will now give its approval the two outstanding GMO corn applications so that U.S. exports can enter the EU during these final weeks before Spain's import season closes. Looking to the future, I agree that we should work to improve our dialogue on GMOs and biotechnology issues, including through increased contacts between U.S., French and other European Union experts.

In the broader diplomatic arena, a vigorous U.S.-European partnership remains essential to addressing positively the difficult challenges ahead in Europe, the Middle East, Asia and Africa. The ties we are forging between the United States and France are helping to strengthen that transatlantic partnership and to make it more effective.

Hillary and I were delighted to be able to spend time with you and

Sylviane, and
I hope we will soon have the opportunity to meet again.

Sincerely,

His Excellency Lionel Jospin
Prime Minister of the
French Republic
Paris

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 7/20/98 10:44:07 AM

FROM Butler, Lawrence E.

CLASSIFICATION ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

CLASSIFICATIONREASON 1.5(d)

DATECLASSIFIEDON 07/20/1998

DECLASSIFYON 07/20/2008

SUBJECT RE: Jospin Letter on GMO's Dear ~~[CONFIDENTIAL]~~

TO McEldowney, Nancy E.

CARBON_COPY

TEXT_BODY

wilco

-----Original Message-----

From: McEldowney, Nancy E.

Sent: Monday,

July 20, 1998 10:27 AM

To: Lee, Malcolm R.

Cc: Butler, Lawrence

E.

Subject: RE: Jospin Letter on GMO's Dear ~~[CONFIDENTIAL]~~

Malcom:

Thanks. Does that mean you clear?

Larry: do you want to work
this with Peter and Kathy?

-----Original Message-----

From: Lee,

Malcolm R.

Sent: Monday, July 20, 1998 10:26 AM

To: McEldowney,

Nancy E.

Subject: RE: Jospin Letter on GMO's Dear ~~[CONFIDENTIAL]~~

Peter

Scher and kathy Novelli at USTR should see this. thanks ML

-----Original
Message-----

DECLASSIFIED E.O. 13526

White House Guidelines,

September 11, 2006

By KDE NARA, Date 3/13/15

2013-0834-F

From: McEldowney, Nancy E.
Sent: Monday, July 20,
1998 9:55 AM
To: Lee, Malcolm R.; Behring, Deanna M.
Cc: @EUROPE
- European Affairs
Subject: Jospin Letter on GMO's Dear ~~[CONFIDENTIAL]~~

Malcom/Deanna:
could I please get your chop on attached? If at all possible, would
like to send forward tonight.

Larry: please let me know if there
are folks in NEC or USTR that should see this.

<< File: jospin
letter.doc >>
Thanks very much. Nancy

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 7/20/98 12:02:31 PM

FROM McEldowney, Nancy E.

CLASSIFICATION ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

CLASSIFICATIONREASON 1.5(d)

DATECLASSIFIEDON 07/20/1998

DECLASSIFYON 07/20/2008

SUBJECT RE: Paris Cable on GMO Corn ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

TO Lawrence, Cynthia

CARBON_COPY

TEXT_BODY Thanks very much.

DECLASSIFIED E.O. 13526
White House Guidelines,
September 11, 2006

By KDE NARA, Date 3/13/15
2013-0836-F

-----Original Message-----

From: Lawrence,
Cynthia
Sent: Monday, July 20, 1998 11:59 AM
To: McEldowney, Nancy
E.; @VP - VP Natl Security Affairs
Subject: RE: Paris Cable on GMO
Corn ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

Has been sent to your intel viewers.

-----Original
Message-----

From: McEldowney, Nancy E.
Sent: Monday, July 20,
1998 11:51 AM
To: @WHSR - WH Situation Room
Cc: Bandler, Donald
K.; Butler, Lawrence E.
Subject: Paris Cable on GMO Corn ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

WHSR:
could you please track down and distro to us a cable from Embassy
Paris? The number is 16146 -- it is related to the Vice President's
call to PM Jospin tomorrow morning. Thanks.

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 7/20/98 12:03:56 PM
FROM McEldowney, Nancy E.
CLASSIFICATION ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~
CLASSIFICATIONREASON 1.5(d)
DATECLASSIFIEDON 07/20/1998
DECLASSIFYON 07/20/2008
SUBJECT GMO's [~~CONFIDENTIAL~~]
TO Bandler, Donald K.
Braden, Susan R.
Brown, Keirn C.
Butler, Lawrence E.
Covey, James P.
Dowling, John N. (Nick)
Flanagan, Stephen J.
Marshall, Betty A.
Maxfield, Nancy H.
McEldowney, Nancy E.
Quinn, Mary E.
Sapiro, Miriam E.
Schulte, Gregory L.

DECLASSIFIED E.O. 13526
White House Guidelines,
September 11, 2006

By KDE NARA, Date 03/13/15
2013-0836-F

CARBON_COPY

TEXT_BODY

This message contained an attachment that could not be written to a file

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 7/20/98 5:14:18 PM
FROM Butler, Lawrence E.
CLASSIFICATION ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~
CLASSIFICATIONREASON 1.5(d)
DATECLASSIFIEDON 07/20/1998
DECLASSIFYON 07/20/2008
SUBJECT FW: URGENT: BP on GMO Corn -- for comment asap. Tks.
[~~CONFIDENTIAL~~]
TO McEldowney, Nancy E.

CARBON_COPY
TEXT_BODY

DECLASSIFIED
E.O. 13526, Sec. 3.5 (b)
White House Guidelines, September 11, 2006
By VZ NARA, Date 11/7/2006
7016-0574-0000 (3.33)

-----Original Message-----

From: McEldowney, Nancy E.

Sent: Monday,

July 20, 1998 5:05 PM

To: Butler, Lawrence E.; Bandler, Donald K.

Subject: URGENT:

BP on GMO Corn -- for comment asap. Tks. [~~CONFIDENTIAL~~]

TRANSLATED_ATTACHMENT Doc1.doc
~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

VICE PRESIDENT'S TELEPHONE CALL TO
FRENCH PRIME MINISTER LIONEL JOSPIN

I. BACKGROUND

The primary purpose of your call is to press our case for export of genetically modified corn to Spain. The French have held up EU approval of two GMO varieties, with potential losses to American farmers running over \$220 million.

This politically sensitive issue has become highly charged in France and was the subject of discussion with the President during Jospin's recent visit to Washington. Before broaching the GMO issue, you will want to congratulate Jospin on France's victory in the World Cup. Time permitting, you may also wish to preview your upcoming visit to Ukraine and Russia, and inquire about Jospin's July 17 meeting with Hafiz al-Asad.

World Cup: France's unexpectedly overwhelming success in the final World Cup match against Brazil set a triumphant tone for celebrations of Bastille Day. The popularity of the multi-ethnic French team has also prompted calls throughout France to combat racism and to embrace multiculturalism. In response, Interior Minister Pasqua (a long-time Gaullist hardliner on immigration issues) called for over 70,000 illegal immigrants to be granted residency. Both Chirac and Jospin have stated publicly that the French victory underscores the opportunities for people of all races and backgrounds to succeed in France.

GMO Corn: Both U.S. and European companies have used genetic engineering to modify certain crops (corn, soybeans, cotton, potatoes, and rapeseed) to impart pest and/or herbicide resistance. These genetically modified -- or GMO -- varieties have increased yields, reduced pesticide and herbicide use, and proven very popular with U.S. and Canadian farmers, in particular.

GMO varieties have proven safe for human, animals, and the environment. Review of new GMO varieties in the U.S. is based on notification by companies to USDA, FSA, and EPA. If any of these agencies sees a problem with the application, marketing is withheld until all issues are resolved. While the review process in the U.S., Canada, and Japan takes six to eight months, it is taking an average of two years in the EU. EU delays are due both to a cumbersome regulatory process as well as political sensitivity to European consumer concerns about

GMO
technology.

U.S. applications for EU approval of GMO corn varieties have been pending since 1996. Earlier this year, a majority of EU countries approved the applications. However, France has held up final approval on two varieties, claiming public resistance to the technology. The President raised this issue with Jospin during their June 18 meeting and Jospin suggested a bilateral dialogue to address the broad question of GMO's. We are preparing a Presidential response to Jospin which indicates a willingness to enter into a dialogue with the Europeans, but nonetheless need approval of the two pending varieties. We understand the French are inclined to approve export of these two varieties, but are delaying a decision because of lack of consensus on an overall policy on GMO's.

RUSSIA/UKRAINE: INPUT FROM OVP

SYRIA: Syrian President Asad was in Paris last week, his first visit to Europe in 22 years. To French disappointment, he avoided endorsing the Franco-Egyptian initiative for a Middle East Peace Process conference, which Paris intends to pursue if the U.S. concludes our current efforts have reached a dead end. We understand that Asad did not engage actively on the French agenda, which included human rights, economic/political liberalization, and interest in using the Israeli acceptance of UNSCR 425 as a means of restarting the Israeli-Syrian and Israeli-Lebanese tracks of the peace process. Most of Asad's time in Paris was one-on-one meetings with Chirac or Jospin, and Jospin may want to offer his insights into Asad's thinking.

II. POINTS TO MAKE

WORLD CUP VICTORY

* Want to congratulate you on outstanding success in World Cup.
Delighted to see
such smashing victory as you celebrated Bastille Day.

* Understand diversity of French team has also rebounded positively
in social
debate of multiculturalism. Applaud your efforts to foster equity,
promote
understanding throughout society.

GMO CORN

* Was a pleasure to host you here in Washington. Thoroughly enjoyed
our
discussions.

* Would like to return to one issue you discussed with President --
U.S. exports
of genetically modified corn.

* Understand political sensitivity of this issue in France and know you
are
personally engaged in finding a good solution.

* Issue also very sensitive here, with timing becoming increasingly
tight. If we
are to export this summer, will require French approval in the next
few weeks.

* Failure to complete approval process for these two varieties could
cause loses
of over \$200 million in corn exports to Spain and Portugal. Especially
difficult
as corn exports are down due to Asian crisis.

* Know you have suggested dialogue to review GMO question
broadly. President is
considering proposal and believes a U.S.-European format offers
promise.

* But cannot hold up two pending cases any further -- farmers,
Congress seized
with issue.

* Understand your Citizens Conference (June 20-21) was largely
supportive of
moving forward in biotechnology area. Also am told that scientific
review by
French government and European Commission have shown these
varieties to be safe.

* As European Commission has voted approval, with only remaining step French agreement. Hope you can find way to positive decision soon.

RUSSIA/UKRAINE -- TO BE PROVIDED BY OVP

SYRIA

* Understand you had opportunity to meet with Asad last week in Paris. Did meetings give you any hope that a way could be found to restart the Syrian and Lebanese tracks of the peace process?

* (IF NEEDED): Concerning your proposal with Egypt on convening a Middle East Peace Conference: of course we would want to consult with you closely about the procedures and goals of such a conference. At this moment, we don't want to prejudge whether or not our current efforts will succeed or fail, so it's still early for such consultation

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 7/21/98 1:18:07 PM
FROM Behring, Deanna M.
CLASSIFICATION ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~
CLASSIFICATIONREASON 1.5(d)
DATECLASSIFIEDON 07/20/1998
DECLASSIFYON 07/20/2008
SUBJECT FW: Jospin Letter on GMO's Dear ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~
TO Jones, Kerri-Ann D.

CARBON_COPY
TEXT_BODY

DECLASSIFIED
E.O. 13526, Sec. 3.5 (b)
White House Guidelines, September 11, 2006
By 17 NARA, Date 11/26/2014
2016-0524-m (3.34)

KAJ:

FYI. I am checking with Cliff/Rachel on this.

-----Original

Message-----

From: Butler, Lawrence E.

Sent: Tuesday, July 21,
1998 12:44 PM

To: Behring, Deanna M.; McEldowney, Nancy E.

Subject: FW:

Jospin Letter on GMO's Dear ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

Importance: High

here

is my redraft, incorporating USDA's language on GMO cooperation.

Pls clear and I will get USDA, USTR and State to chop. Plan to
send up as a cable.

-----Original Message-----

From: McEldowney,
Nancy E.

Sent: Tuesday, July 21, 1998 9:44 AM

To: Behring, Deanna
M.

Cc: Butler, Lawrence E.

Subject: RE: Jospin Letter on GMO's

Dear ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

Deanna: believe did not go out. have passed

over to Larry Butler for action.

Larry: anything to add for
Deanna?

-----Original Message-----

From: Behring, Deanna M.

Sent: Tuesday, July 21, 1998 9:16 AM

To: McEldowney, Nancy E.

Subject: RE:

Jospin Letter on GMO's Dear ~~[CONFIDENTIAL]~~

Nancy:

Just am

seeing this today--was out yesterday. Did this go last night?

-----Original

Message-----

From: McEldowney, Nancy E.

Sent: Monday, July 20,

1998 9:55 AM

To: Lee, Malcolm R.; Behring, Deanna M.

Cc: @EUROPE

- European Affairs

Subject: Jospin Letter on GMO's Dear ~~[CONFIDENTIAL]~~

Malcom/Deanna:

could I please get your chop on attached? If at all possible, would
like to send forward tonight.

Larry: please let me know if there
are folks in NEC or USTR that should see this.

<< File: jospin

letter.doc >>

Thanks very much. Nancy

TRANSLATED_ATTACHMENT jospin GMO letter.doc

Dear Lionel:

Thank you for your kind letter. I too appreciated the opportunity to discuss with you some of the critical challenges that our two societies face as they enter the 21st century.

The accelerated pace of technological changes has created exciting new opportunities for increasing employment, raising incomes and addressing environmental and health problems. Advances in biotechnology are particularly impressive.

I know from our discussion that many in France remain concerned about products containing genetically modified organisms (GMOs). I was pleased, therefore, to learn that the preliminary report from the French Parliament's Conference of Consensus gave a positive assessment of the safety of the two GMO varieties awaiting final French approval. With the final obstacle to approval cleared away, I hope your government act on the two outstanding GMO corn applications so that U.S. exports can enter the EU during these final weeks before Spain's import season closes.

Looking to the future, I welcome your interest in transatlantic cooperation in expediting the future review and approval of biotechnology products. This would be hastened by France's action on the two pending applications.

In the broader diplomatic arena, a vigorous U.S.-European partnership remains essential to addressing positively the difficult challenges ahead in Europe, the Middle East, Asia and Africa. The ties we are forging between the United States and France are helping to strengthen that transatlantic partnership and to make it more effective.

Hillary and I were delighted to be able to spend time with you and Sylviane, and I hope we will soon have the opportunity to meet again.

Sincerely,

His Excellency Lionel Jospin
Prime Minister of the
French Republic
Paris

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 7/21/98 1:47:20 PM

FROM Behring, Deanna M.

CLASSIFICATION ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

CLASSIFICATIONREASON 1.5(d)

DATECLASSIFIEDON 07/20/1998

DECLASSIFYON 07/20/2008

SUBJECT FW: Jospin Letter on GMO's Dear ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

TO Jones, Kerri-Ann D.

CARBON_COPY

TEXT_BODY

Given NSC goals for this letter--I say we clear and let it go as is. Agree?

-----Original Message-----

From: Butler, Lawrence

E.

Sent: Tuesday, July 21, 1998 1:43 PM

To: Behring, Deanna M.

Cc: McEldowney,

Nancy E.

Subject: RE: Jospin Letter on GMO's Dear ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

at

stake in this letter is turning up heat on Jospin to deliver on 200 million of sales in midst of U.S. farm crisis; secondary, but important, is deflecting Jospin effort to lock us into a deathgrip of consultations on GMO ethics, etc. I'd leave FDA on the sidelines for the time being.

-----Original Message-----

From: Behring, Deanna M.

Sent: Tuesday,

July 21, 1998 1:24 PM

To: Butler, Lawrence E.; McEldowney, Nancy

E.

Subject: RE: Jospin Letter on GMO's Dear ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

Larry:

I

DECLASSIFIED
E.O. 13526, Sec. 3.5 (b)
White House Guidelines, September 11, 2006
By VL NARA, Date 11/26/2014
2016-0529-m (3.35)

have asked our Biotech expert--who has been working on these policy issues with her European counterparts through OECD and EU--to take a look at letter. I have asked her whether we could use the French interest in better exchanges on gmos/biotech to put more teeth in some existing fora.

I wonder if we should engage FDA as well as USDA??

I'll get back to you asap.

Deanna

-----Original Message-----

From: Butler,
Lawrence E.
Sent: Tuesday, July 21, 1998 12:44 PM
To: Behring,
Deanna M.; McEldowney, Nancy E.
Subject: FW: Jospin Letter on GMO's
Dear ~~[CONFIDENTIAL]~~
Importance: High

here is my redraft, incorporating
USDA's language on GMO cooperation. Pls clear and I will get USDA,
USTR and State to chop. Plan to send up as a cable.

<< File: jospin
GMO letter.doc >>

-----Original Message-----

From: McEldowney,
Nancy E.
Sent: Tuesday, July 21, 1998 9:44 AM
To: Behring, Deanna
M.
Cc: Butler, Lawrence E.
Subject: RE: Jospin Letter on GMO's
Dear ~~[CONFIDENTIAL]~~

Deanna: believe did not go out. have passed
over to Larry Butler for action.

Larry: anything to add for
Deanna?

-----Original Message-----

From: Behring, Deanna M.

Sent: Tuesday, July 21, 1998 9:16 AM
To: McEldowney, Nancy E.
Subject: RE:

Jospin Letter on GMO's Dear ~~[CONFIDENTIAL]~~

Nancy:

Just am
seeing this today--was out yesterday. Did this go last night?

-----Original

Message-----

From: McEldowney, Nancy E.

Sent: Monday, July 20,
1998 9:55 AM

To: Lee, Malcolm R.; Behring, Deanna M.

Cc: @EUROPE

- European Affairs

Subject: Jospin Letter on GMO's Dear ~~[CONFIDENTIAL]~~

Malcom/Deanna:

could I please get your chop on attached? If at all possible, would
like to send forward tonight.

Larry: please let me know if there
are folks in NEC or USTR that should see this.

<< File: jospin
letter.doc >>

Thanks very much. Nancy

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 7/21/98 2:22:41 PM
 FROM Jones, Kerri-Ann D.
 CLASSIFICATION ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~
 CLASSIFICATIONREASON 1.5(d)
 DATECLASSIFIEDON 07/20/1998
 DECLASSIFYON 07/20/2008
 SUBJECT RE: Jospin Letter on GMO's Dear ~~[CONFIDENTIAL]~~
 TO Behring, Deanna M.

DECLASSIFIED E.O. 13526

White House Guidelines,

September 11, 2006

By KDE NARA, Date 3/13/15
2013-0836-F

CARBON_COPY

TEXT_BODY

Deanna - - The letter looks great. Have you heard from Cliff?

-----Original

Message-----

From: Behring, Deanna M.

Sent: Tuesday, July 21,
1998 1:18 PM

To: Jones, Kerri-Ann D.

Subject: FW: Jospin Letter
on GMO's Dear ~~[CONFIDENTIAL]~~
Importance: High

KAJ:

FYI.

I am checking with Cliff/Rachel on this.

-----Original Message-----

From: Butler,
Lawrence E.

Sent: Tuesday, July 21, 1998 12:44 PM

To: Behring,
Deanna M.; McEldowney, Nancy E.
Subject: FW: Jospin Letter on GMO's
Dear ~~[CONFIDENTIAL]~~
Importance: High

here is my redraft, incorporating
USDA's language on GMO cooperation. Pls clear and I will get USDA,
USTR and State to chop. Plan to send up as a cable.

<< File: jospin
GMO letter.doc >>
-----Original Message-----
From: McEldowney,
Nancy E.
Sent: Tuesday, July 21, 1998 9:44 AM
To: Behring, Deanna
M.
Cc: Butler, Lawrence E.
Subject: RE: Jospin Letter on GMO's
Dear ~~[CONFIDENTIAL]~~

Deanna: believe did not go out. have passed
over to Larry Butler for action.

Larry: anything to add for
Deanna?

-----Original Message-----
From: Behring, Deanna M.

Sent: Tuesday, July 21, 1998 9:16 AM
To: McEldowney, Nancy E.
Subject: RE:
Jospin Letter on GMO's Dear ~~[CONFIDENTIAL]~~

Nancy:

Just am
seeing this today--was out yesterday. Did this go last night?

-----Original
Message-----
From: McEldowney, Nancy E.
Sent: Monday, July 20,
1998 9:55 AM
To: Lee, Malcolm R.; Behring, Deanna M.
Cc: @EUROPE
- European Affairs
Subject: Jospin Letter on GMO's Dear ~~[CONFIDENTIAL]~~

Malcom/Deanna:
could I please get your chop on attached? If at all possible, would
like to send forward tonight.

Larry: please let me know if there
are folks in NEC or USTR that should see this.

<< File: jospin
letter.doc >>

Thanks very much. Nancy

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 7/21/98 4:32:35 PM

FROM Butler, Lawrence E.

CLASSIFICATION ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

CLASSIFICATIONREASON 1.5(d)

DATECLASSIFIEDON 07/20/1998

DECLASSIFYON 07/20/2008

SUBJECT RE: Jospin Letter on GMO's Dear ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

TO Behring, Deanna M.

CARBON_COPY

TEXT_BODY

merci!

-----Original Message-----

From: Behring, Deanna M.

Sent: Tuesday,

July 21, 1998 2:47 PM

To: Butler, Lawrence E.

Cc: McEldowney, Nancy

E.

Subject: RE: Jospin Letter on GMO's Dear ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

Understood.

Letter looks fine as is. We'll work on other piece later.

-----Original

Message-----

From: Butler, Lawrence E.

Sent: Tuesday, July 21,

1998 1:43 PM

To: Behring, Deanna M.

Cc: McEldowney, Nancy E.

Subject: RE:

Jospin Letter on GMO's Dear ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

at stake in this letter

is turning up heat on Jospin to deliver on 200 million of sales in midst of U.S. farm crisis; secondary, but important, is deflecting Jospin effort to lock us into a deathgrip of consultations on GMO ethics, etc. I'd leave FDA on the sidelines for the time being.

DECLASSIFIED
E.O. 13526, Sec. 3.5 (b)
White House Guidelines, September 11, 2006
By VR NARA, Date 11/26/2004
2016-0529-m (336)

-----Original

Message-----

From: Behring, Deanna M.

Sent: Tuesday, July 21,
1998 1:24 PM

To: Butler, Lawrence E.; McEldowney, Nancy E.

Subject: RE:

Jospin Letter on GMO's Dear ~~[CONFIDENTIAL]~~

Larry:

I have asked

our Biotech expert--who has been working on these policy issues with her European counterparts through OECD and EU--to take a look at letter. I have asked her whether we could use the French interest in better exchanges on gmos/biotech to put more teeth in some existing fora.

I wonder if we should engage FDA as well as USDA??

I'll

get back to you asap.

Deanna

-----Original Message-----

From: Butler,

Lawrence E.

Sent: Tuesday, July 21, 1998 12:44 PM

To: Behring,

Deanna M.; McEldowney, Nancy E.

Subject: FW: Jospin Letter on GMO's

Dear ~~[CONFIDENTIAL]~~

Importance: High

here is my redraft, incorporating

USDA's language on GMO cooperation. Pls clear and I will get USDA, USTR and State to chop. Plan to send up as a cable.

<< File: jospin

GMO letter.doc >>

-----Original Message-----

From: McEldowney,

Nancy E.

Sent: Tuesday, July 21, 1998 9:44 AM

To: Behring, Deanna

M.

Cc: Butler, Lawrence E.

Subject: RE: Jospin Letter on GMO's

Dear ~~[CONFIDENTIAL]~~

Deanna: believe did not go out. have passed over to Larry Butler for action.

Larry: anything to add for Deanna?

-----Original Message-----

From: Behring, Deanna M.

Sent: Tuesday, July 21, 1998 9:16 AM

To: McEldowney, Nancy E.

Subject: RE:

Jospin Letter on GMO's Dear ~~[CONFIDENTIAL]~~

Nancy:

Just am seeing this today--was out yesterday. Did this go last night?

-----Original Message-----

From: McEldowney, Nancy E.

Sent: Monday, July 20, 1998 9:55 AM

To: Lee, Malcolm R.; Behring, Deanna M.

Cc: @EUROPE

- European Affairs

Subject: Jospin Letter on GMO's Dear ~~[CONFIDENTIAL]~~

Malcom/Deanna:

could I please get your chop on attached? If at all possible, would like to send forward tonight.

Larry: please let me know if there are folks in NEC or USTR that should see this.

<< File: jospin letter.doc >>

Thanks very much. Nancy

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 7/27/98 7:00:36 PM
FROM Butler, Lawrence E.
CLASSIFICATION ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~
CLASSIFICATIONREASON 1.5(d)
DATECLASSIFIEDON 07/27/1998
DECLASSIFYON 07/27/2008
SUBJECT FW: Bowles Letter on GMO Corn [~~CONFIDENTIAL~~]
TO McEldowney, Nancy E.

DECLASSIFIED
E.O. 13526
White House Guidelines, May 16, 2017
By 17 NARA, Date 12/2/2014
2016-0529-14

CARBON_COPY

TEXT_BODY my suggestions.

-----Original Message-----

From: McEldowney,
Nancy E.
Sent: Monday, July 27, 1998 6:58 PM
To: Lee, Malcolm
R.; Maxfield, Nancy H.; Butler, Lawrence E.
Subject: Bowles Letter
on GMO Corn [~~CONFIDENTIAL~~]

Malcom: could I please get you chop
on attached? It responds to a shameless attempt by the French Ambo
to link our GMO corn case to some French dispute with EPA over
herbicides.

Need to send forward tomorrow. Thanks very much.

Larry: memo
will go through you but if you want to fiddle now, pls have at it.

Nancy: could you please format and get ready to go forward?
I put original folder in your in-box. Thanks a lot.

TRANSLATED_ATTACHMENT Doc3.doc
Draft Letter from Bowles

Dear Ambassador Bujon:

Thank you for your recent letter conveying a copy of French
Parliamentarian Le
Deaut's report on Genetically Modified Organisms. This is an issue of
importance
to both our governments and I appreciate your efforts to provide
additional
information. We look forward to receiving the decision on the two
varieties of
American-produced GMO corn currently pending approval in France.

I also appreciate you bringing to my attention the deliberations of the
French
company Rhone-Poulenc with the Environmental Protection Agency.
I have forwarded
a copy of your letter to EPA Administrator Browner, to ensure that all
appropriate information is available as the deliberations proceed.

Sincerely,

Erskine Bowles

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 7/28/98 10:34:01 AM
FROM McEldowney, Nancy E.
CLASSIFICATION ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~
CLASSIFICATIONREASON 1.5(d)
DATECLASSIFIEDON 07/27/1998
DECLASSIFYON 07/27/2008
SUBJECT FW: Bowles Letter on GMO Corn [~~CONFIDENTIAL~~]
TO Maxfield, Nancy H.

DECLASSIFIED
E.O. 13526
White House Guidelines, May 16, 2017
By W NARA, Date 12/2/19
2016-0529 -m

CARBON_COPY

TEXT_BODY

Nancy: could you please give Malcolm a few more hours and then start bugging him? I have to send this forward as early as possible today (it is now overdue.) thanks very much.

-----Original Message-----

From: McEldowney,
Nancy E.
Sent: Monday, July 27, 1998 6:58 PM
To: Lee, Malcolm
R.; Maxfield, Nancy H.; Butler, Lawrence E.
Subject: Bowles Letter
on GMO Corn [~~CONFIDENTIAL~~]

Malcom: could I please get you chop on attached? It responds to a shameless attempt by the French Ambo to link our GMO corn case to some French dispute with EPA over herbicides.
Need to send forward tomorrow. Thanks very much.

Larry: memo
will go through you but if you want to fiddle now, pls have at it.

Nancy: could you please format and get ready to go forward?
I put original folder in your in-box. Thanks a lot.

TRANSLATED_ATTACHMENT Doc3.doc
Draft Letter from Bowles

Dear Ambassador Bujon:

Thank you for your recent letter conveying a copy of the French parliamentary report on Genetically Modified Organisms. This is an issue of importance to both our governments and I appreciate your efforts to provide additional information. We look forward to receiving the French decision on the two varieties of American-produced GMO corn currently pending approval within the EU.

I also appreciate you bringing to my attention the deliberations of the French company Rhone-Poulenc with the Environmental Protection Agency. I have taken the liberty of forwarding a copy of your letter to our EPA Administrator, Ms. Carol Browner, to ensure that all appropriate information is available as the deliberations proceed.

Sincerely,

Ersine Bowles

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 7/30/98 11:19:20 AM

FROM McEldowney, Nancy E.

CLASSIFICATION UNCLASSIFIED

SUBJECT GMO Corn: French Announcement Out [UNCLASSIFIED]

TO Butler, Lawrence E.

CARBON_COPY Bandler, Donald K.
Braden, Susan R.
Brown, Keirn C.
Butler, Lawrence E.
Covey, James P.
Dowling, John N. (Nick)
Flanagan, Stephen J.
Marshall, Betty A.
Maxfield, Nancy H.
McEldowney, Nancy E.
Quinn, Mary E.
Sapiro, Miriam E.
Schulte, Gregory L.

TEXT_BODY Larry: should be coming across fax now. Will pass to you asap.

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 7/31/98 1:42:28 PM
FROM Davidson, Leslie K.
CLASSIFICATION UNCLASSIFIED
SUBJECT MORE ON FRENCH GMO CORN APPROVAL [UNCLASSIFIED]
TO Fuerth, Leon S.

CARBON_COPY Saunders, Richard M.

TEXT_BODY

Actual read-out of the French approval of GMO corn.

-----Original

Message-----

From: WHSR

Sent: Friday, July 31, 1998 1:42 PM

To: Bandler,

Donald K.; Brown, Keirn C.; Butler, Lawrence E.; Davidson, Leslie K.; Haines, Mary A.; Lee, Malcolm R.; McEldowney, Nancy E.; Sapiro, Miriam E.

Subject: MORE ON FRENCH GMO CORN APPROVAL

UNCLAS PARIS

017245

USDA FOR O/SEC FOR GLICKMAN AND DRAZEK; U/S FOR SCHUMACHER;

FAS FOR OA/LHATAMIYA/TGALVIN;

ITP/DA/PSHEIKH; ITP/WEIAD/CTHORN/MCHESLEY;

OFSTS/LHARBERT;

CMP/DA/JPARKER; FAA/SEBRANEK;

APHIS/OA/CREED;FSIS/JPRUCHA

STATE

PASS USTR

STATE PASS FDA

GENEVA FOR USTR, ALSO AGRICULTURE

EU

POSTS PASS AGCOUNSELOR

CONGEN MILAN PASS ATO

BRUSSELS ALSO FOR

USEU

E.O. 12958: N/A

TAGS: EAGR, ETRD, EUN, FR
SUBJECT: MORE
ON FRENCH GMO CORN APPROVAL

REF: (A) PARIS 017062; (B) PARIS 014833

1.
THIS IS AN ACTION CABLE. SEE PARAGRAPH 5 FOR ACTION REQUEST.
2.
AS REPORTED REFTEL A, ON JULY 30, THE GOVERNMENT OF FRANCE (GOF) APPROVED THE AUTHORIZATION OF THE GMO CORN VARIETIES AGREVO TER 25 AND MONSANTO MON810 #WITHIN THE NEXT FEW DAYS." WHILE WE HAVE NOT BEEN ABLE TO TIE DOWN THE EXACT DATE, WE HAVE BEEN TOLD THAT AUTHORIZATION WILL BE FULLY GRANTED ONCE ALL DOCUMENTS HAVE BEEN SIGNED.
3.
THE DOCUMENTS COULD POSSIBLY BE SIGNED EARLY NEXT WEEK AFTER MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE LOUIS LE PENSEC'S RETURN TO PARIS ON SATURDAY, AUGUST 1, FROM CHINA. AUTHORIZATION OF THESE TWO CORN VARIETIES IS IN ADDITION TO THE NOVARTIS BT CORN WHICH WAS AUTHORIZED BY THE JOSPIN GOVERNMENT IN NOVEMBER.
4. ACCORDING TO THE PRESS, THE INTERMINISTERIAL MEETING, HELD AT THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE, INCLUDED BERNARD KOUCHNER, SECRETARY OF STATE FOR HEALTH, CLAUDE ALLEGRE, MINISTER OF EDUCATION, RESEARCH, AND TECHNOLOGY, DOMINIQUE VOYNET, MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT, DOMINIQUE STRAUSS-KAHN, MINISTER OF ECONOMY, FINANCE AND INDUSTRY AND PIERRE MOSCOVICI, MINISTER OF EUROPEAN AFFAIRS. AGRICULTURE MINISTER LE PENSEC WAS ABSENT DUE TO

HIS FOREIGN TRAVEL.

5. IN REVIEWING
THE GMO DOSSIER, THE GOF BASJD
ITS FINAL DECISION ON THE OVERALL
RECOMMENDATIONS
OF JEAN-YVES LE DEAUT'S JUNE 30, 1998 PRELIMINARY
REPORT
OF THE CONFERENCE D CONSENSUS (REF B).
HOWEVER, THE GOF DID NOT
FOLLOW LE DEAUT'S
RECOMMENDATION TO BAN GMO'S CONTAINING AN
ANTIBIOTIC
RESISTANCE GENE. THIS IS A MAJOR STEP
FOR APPROVAL OF GM0 PRODUCTS
IN THE PIPELINE,
ESPECIALLY, FOR EXAMPLE, FOR DEKALB'S CORN. THE
GOF
DID DECIDE, HOWEVER, TO CONVENE A WORKING
GROUP (SEE PARA 3, REFTEL
A) UNDER SECRETARY OF
STATE FOR HEALTH KOUCHNER TO EXAMINE IN GREATER
DETAIL
THE SCIENTIFIC BASIS OF ANTIBIOTIC
RESISTANCE. POST HAS BEEN IN
TOUCH WITH
KOUCHNER'S OFFICE TO OBTAIN MORE DETAILS ON THE
PROPOSED
WORKING GROUP. WITH WASHINGTON APPROVAL,
POST WOULD LIKE TO OFFER
TO THE WORKING GROUP A
SCIENTIFIC DIALOGUE INCLUDING U.S. VIEWS
ON THE
ANTIBIOTIC RESISTANCE QUESTION.

6. THE GOF ALSO DID NOT
SPECIFY A LABELING POLICY
FOR FOODSTUFFS DERIVED FROM GMO'S, WHICH
WAS VERY
STRONGLY RECOMMENDED IN THE LE DEAUT'S REPORT.
HOWEVER,
FRANCE, AS WELL AS ALL OTHER EU MEMBER
STATES, MUST IMPLEMENT THE
EU'S OVERALL GM0
LABELING POLICY ADOPTED ON MAY 26, 1998.

7.
WHILE THE INTERMINISTERIAL MEETING WAS ATTENDED
BY ALL KEY AGENCIES
CONCERNED IN REACHING THIS
DECISION, FURTHER DISCUSSIONS ON BIOTECHNOLOGY

CAN
BE EXPECTED IN THE FALL, PARTICULARLY DURING THE
PARLIAMENTARY
DISCUSSIONS OF THE FRENCH LOI
D'ORIENTATION (FARM BILL) IN OCTOBER.

8.
POST WILL CONTINUE TO GIVE THE HIGHEST
PRIORITY TO MONITORING THE
FINAL STAGES OF THE
APPROVAL PROCESS.
PEARSON

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 8/3/98 1:53:05 PM

FROM Lee, Malcolm R.

CLASSIFICATION ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

CLASSIFICATIONREASON 1.5(d)

DATECLASSIFIEDON 07/27/1998

DECLASSIFYON 07/27/2008

SUBJECT FW: Bowles Letter on GMO Corn [~~CONFIDENTIAL~~]

TO McEldowney, Nancy E.

DECLASSIFIED
E.O. 13526
White House Guidelines, May 16, 2017
By h NARA, Date 4/26/2017
2016-0524-12

CARBON_COPY

TEXT_BODY

I was out last week. Did you get the clearance? ML

-----Original

Message-----

From: McEldowney, Nancy E.

Sent: Monday, July 27,

1998 6:58 PM

To: Lee, Malcolm R.; Maxfield, Nancy H.; Butler, Lawrence E.

Subject: Bowles Letter on GMO Corn [~~CONFIDENTIAL~~]

Malcom:

could I please get you chop on attached? It responds to a shameless attempt by the French Ambo to link our GMO corn case to some French

dispute with EPA over herbicides. Need to send forward tomorrow. Thanks very much.

Larry: memo will go through you but if you want to fiddle now, pls have at it.

Nancy: could you please format and get ready to go forward? I put original folder in your in-box. Thanks a lot.

TRANSLATED_ATTACHMENT Doc3.doc
Draft Letter from Bowles

Dear Ambassador Bujon:

Thank you for your recent letter conveying a copy of the French parliamentary

report on Genetically Modified Organisms. This is an issue of importance to both

our governments and I appreciate your efforts to provide additional information.

We look forward to receiving the French decision on the two varieties of

American-produced GMO corn currently pending approval within the EU.

I also appreciate you bringing to my attention the deliberations of the French

company Rhone-Poulenc with the Environmental Protection Agency.

I have taken

the liberty of forwarding a copy of your letter to our EPA

Administrator, Ms.

Carol Browner, to ensure that all appropriate information is available as the

deliberations proceed.

Sincerely,

Erskine Bowles

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 6/14/99 6:13:48 PM

FROM Davidson, Leslie K.

CLASSIFICATION ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

CLASSIFICATIONREASON 1.5(b)(d)

DATECLASSIFIEDON 06/14/1999

DECLASSIFYON 06/14/2009

SUBJECT GMO'S: RAISING THE ISSUE WITH THE PRESIDENT AND
[~~CONFIDENTIAL~~]

TO Osius, Theodore G.

CARBON_COPY

TEXT_BODY

DECLASSIFIED
E.O. 13526, Sec. 3.5 (b)
White House Guidelines, September 11, 2006
By N NARA, Date 11/26/14
2016-0524-M (3.37)

-----Original Message-----

From: WHSR

Sent: Monday, June 14,
1999 1:18 PM

To: Blinken, Antony J.; Davidson, Leslie K.; Gordon,
Philip H.;

Hammonds, D. Holly; Holtzapple, Richard A.; Lee, Malcolm
R.; Moyn,

Samuel A.; Schaefer, Matthew P.; Wechsler, William F.

Subject:

GMO'S: RAISING THE ISSUE WITH THE PRESIDENT AND

~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

~~CONFIDENTIAL~~ SECTION 01 OF 02 PARIS 011314

FOR THE PRESIDENT,
VICE PRESIDENT, SECRETARY OF
AGRICULTURE AND U.S. TRADE REPRESENTATIVE
FROM THE
AMBASSADOR

STATE PASS AGRICULTURE FOR SECRETARY GLICKMAN
AND
FAS/OA/GALVIN
STATE PASS USTR FOR BARSHEFSKY, SCHER AND MURPHY

STATE
PASS FDA FOR COMMISSIONER
STATE FOR UNDER SECRETARY EIZENSTAT AND
A/S LARSON
RIGA FOR ASSISTANT SECRETARY GROSSMAN

E.O. 12958:
6/14/04
TAGS: EAGR, ETRD, PREL, FR, EUN
SUBJECT: GMO'S: RAISING
THE ISSUE WITH THE PRESIDENT AND
PRIME MINISTER

CLASSIFIED BY
AMBASSADOR FELIX ROHATYN FOR REASONS 1.5 B
AND D.

REF: (A) PARIS
10706; (B) PARIS 8090; (C) PARIS 6984;
(D) PARIS 6774

1. ~~(C)~~
SUMMARY AND COMMENT. SENIOR FRENCH LEADERS ARE
TAKING AN INCREASINGLY
HOSTILE PUBLIC LINE ON GMO'S. BOTH
PRESIDENT CHIRAC AND PRIME MINISTER
JOSPIN SEE DOMESTIC
POLITICAL ADVANTAGE IN AN ANTI-GMO APPROACH.
WE SHOULD DO
OUR BEST TO ENGAGE THEM ON THIS ISSUE IN A RATIONAL,
COOPERATIVE
MANNER -- AND DO IT QUICKLY, BEFORE THEY ARE
COMPLETELY LOCKED INTO
POSITIONS THAT WILL FORCE US INTO A
MAJOR TRADE DISPUTE. RE-ENGAGING
WITH JOSPIN ON HIS
SUGGESTION LAST YEAR FOR A BILATERAL DIALOGUE
COULD BE ONE
MEANS OF MOVING THE ISSUE FORWARD IN A POSITIVE WAY.

END
SUMMARY AND COMMENT.

2. (U) THE PUBLIC STATEMENTS OF PRESIDENT
CHIRAC AND PRIME
MINISTER JOSPIN ON GMO'S HAVE BECOME INCREASINGLY
HARD
LINE IN RECENT WEEKS. IN A DISCUSSION WITH THE FRENCH
AMERICAN
BUSINESS COUNCIL OF PROMINENT CEO'S ON JUNE 11,

PRESIDENT CHIRAC
SAID THAT THERE WOULD BE "ABSOLUTE
PROTECTION" ON MATTERS OF FOOD
SAFETY AND THAT FRANCE AND
EUROPE WOULD ACCEPT NO GMO'S OR BEEF
RAISED WITH HORMONES.
CHIRAC STATED THAT THE WTO HAS NO JURISDICTION
ON MATTERS
OF HEALTH. IN HIS SPEECH TO THE BUSINESS COUNCIL,
PRIME
MINISTER
JOSPIN STATED THAT EUROPEANS ARE DEMANDING STRICT
CRITERIA FOR SCIENTIFIC
ANALYSIS OF HEALTH RISKS. HE SAID
"WE MUST REFRAIN FROM FORCING
THE ISSUES AND RESIST THE
TEMPTATION TO ACT UNILATERALLY WITH INCONSIDERATE
RUTHLESSNESS
THAT WILL PROVE HARMFUL IN BOTH THE SHORT AND
LONG TERM. IT IS
UP TO GOVERNMENTS AND BUSINESS TO ENGAGE
IN DIALOGUE WITH CITIZENS
AND CONSUMERS TO FIND A
CONSENSUS THAT RECONCILES BUSINESS INTERESTS
WITH THE
DEMANDS OF OUR CONSUMERS AND CITIZENS."

3. (U) DANIEL
COHN-BENDIT, HAVING HELPED JOSPIN'S
COALITION-PARTNER GREENS WIN
A STRONG 9 PERCENT OF THE
FRENCH VOTE IN THE JUST-COMPLETED EUROPEAN
ELECTIONS,
STATED THAT THE GREENS WOULD PUSH FOR A
MORATORIUM ON
ALL
GMO'S. (SEE REF A FOR FRENCH ENVIRONMENT MINISTER
VOYNET'S
SIMILAR STATEMENT SEVERAL WEEKS AGO.)

4. (C) SENATOR PAT ROBERTS
OF KANSAS REPORTED TO ME THAT A
GROUP OF FRENCH FARM LEADERS TOLD
HIM THEY WERE VERY MUCH
OPPOSED TO ACCEPTING GMO'S. I MET THE SAME
STRONG
ANTIPATHY ON THIS ISSUE SEVERAL WEEKS AGO FROM
SIMILAR
FARM
LEADERS. FRENCH POLITICIANS, FOOD DISTRIBUTORS AND

CONSUMER GROUPS
HAVE BEEN TELLING US THAT NON-ACCEPTANCE
OF GMO'S IS A MATTER OF
CULTURE NOT SCIENCE. SECRETARY
DALEY, WHO ATTENDED THE BUSINESS
COUNCIL MEETINGS AND
HEARD THE LEVEL OF FRENCH OPPOSITION TOLD ME
HE HAS SENT A
MEMO ON GMO'S TO SANDY BERGER AND GENE SPERLING.
SENATOR
ROBERTS TOLD ME HE WILL TALK TO SECRETARY GLICKMAN
ABOUT
BRINGING
CONGRESSIONAL LEADERS TO FRANCE WHEN HE VISITS AT
THE END OF THE
MONTH. HE SAID THAT THIS IS AN ISSUE
CONGRESS WILL HAVE TO ENGAGE
ON WITH THE FRENCH.

5. ~~(C)~~ WE ARE HEARING THAT CHIRAC WILL RAISE
THE ISSUE OF
GMO'S AT THE G8 SUMMIT. HE THINKS THE ISSUE IS A
POLITICAL
WINNER FOR HIM. HIS PARTY AND THE CENTER-RIGHT
GENERALLY DID POORLY
IN THE EUROPEAN ELECTIONS. HE WILL
THEREFORE DO WHATEVER HE CAN
TO TRY TO SOLIDIFY HIS
TRADITIONAL SUPPORT FROM RURAL FRANCE. HE
WILL VIEW
OPPOSING GMO'S AS A TACTIC FOR HIM TO REACH OUT TO
DISAFFECTED
VOTERS, SUCH AS THOSE WHO GAVE THE FISHING AND
HUNTING PARTY A SURPRISING
6.5 PER CENT OF THE VOTE. WE
ARE ALSO TOLD THAT CHIRAC PERSONALLY
IS VERY MUCH OPPOSED
TO GMO'S.

6. ~~(C)~~ THE FRENCH PUBLIC'S CONFIDENCE
IN SCIENCE AND
FRENCH AND EUROPEAN FOOD AND HEALTH SAFETY
MECHANISMS
HAS
BEEN BATTERED BADLY BY THE BELGIAN DIOXIN SCARE,
THE
TAINTED
BLOOD SCANDAL TRIALS HERE AND THE MAD COW CRISIS.
I AM CONCERNED
THAT THE FRENCH LEADERSHIP APPEARS MORE

THAN WILLING TO ADOPT A
LUDDITE APPROACH TO BIO-TECHNOLOGY
IN AGRICULTURE IF THAT IS THE
POLITICALLY POPULAR OR SAFE
THING TO DO. WE URGENTLY NEED TO ENGAGE
WITH THE FRENCH
AT THE HIGHEST POLITICAL LEVEL IN ORDER TO DEVELOP
A
COOPERATIVE, RATIONAL, SCIENCE-BASED APPROACH TO
~~CONFIDENTIAL~~
~~CONFIDENTIAL~~ SECTION 02 OF 02 PARIS 011314

FOR THE PRESIDENT, VICE
PRESIDENT, SECRETARY OF
AGRICULTURE AND U.S. TRADE REPRESENTATIVE
FROM THE
AMBASSADOR

STATE PASS AGRICULTURE FOR SECRETARY GLICKMAN
AND
FAS/OA/GALVIN
STATE PASS USTR FOR BARSHEFSKY, SCHER AND MURPHY
STATE
PASS FDA FOR COMMISSIONER
STATE FOR UNDER SECRETARY EIZENSTAT AND
A/S LARSON
RIGA FOR ASSISTANT SECRETARY GROSSMAN

E.O. 12958:
6/14/04
TAGS: EAGR, ETRD, PREL, FR, EUN
SUBJECT: GMO'S: RAISING
THE ISSUE WITH THE PRESIDENT AND
PRIME MINISTER

BIOTECHNOLOGY.

7.
(C) FRANCE REMAINS POTENTIALLY OUR STRONGEST ALLY
IN
EUROPE IN THE
BIOTECHNOLOGY AREA. FRANCE IS EUROPE'S
BIGGEST AND MOST EFFICIENT
AGRICULTURAL PRODUCER. IT HAS
ALWAYS BEEN A LEADER IN USING SCIENTIFIC
ADVANCES. BUT ON
GMO'S WE RUN THE RISK OF LOSING FRENCH POLITICAL
WILL IN
THE FACE OF DETERMINED INTEREST GROUPS AND A
WORRIED

PUBLIC.
IF WE LOSE FRANCE, WE WILL LOSE EUROPE. THE
BRITISH AMBASSADOR,
AFTER HAVING HEARD CHIRAC, TOLD ME
BLUNTLY THAT "WE'LL BE AGAINST
YOU TOO."

8. (C) ON YOUR VISIT HERE THIS WEEK, I WOULD ENCOURAGE
YOU
TO LAY DOWN STRONG MARKERS WITH BOTH CHIRAC AND
JOSPIN ON
GMO'S.
THE PROBLEM OF PUBLIC INSECURITY ABOUT
AGRICULTURAL AND FOOD SAFETY
HAS BEEN IN LARGE PART
CREATED BY EUROPE'S INADEQUATE AND POLITICALLY
CONTROLLED
SAFETY MECHANISMS. THERE IS NO EUROPEAN FDA AND
THERE
IS
UNLIKELY TO BE ONE ANYTIME SOON. WE HAVE TO WORK
WITH
WHAT
EXISTS HERE NOW.

9. (C) I WOULD TELL CHIRAC AND JOSPIN THAT WE
WANT TO WORK
WITH THEM. OUR GOAL IS A COOPERATIVE DIALOGUE TO
ENCOURAGE
PUBLIC ACCEPTANCE OF SAFE NEW TECHNOLOGIES. IT
WAS JOSPIN WHO SUGGESTED
TO YOU LAST YEAR THAT WE PURSUE A
BILATERAL SCIENTIFIC DIALOGUE.
WHEN WE RESPONDED
POSITIVELY THE FRENCH LET THE MATTER DROP. USTR
BARSHEFSKY
RECENTLY RAISED THE SUGGESTION AGAIN WITH THE
FRENCH FINANCE MINISTER.
YOU SHOULD TELL JOSPIN THAT SUCH
AN APPROACH IS NEEDED SO THAT
WE CAN MOVE FORWARD
TOGETHER.

10. (C) YOU MIGHT TELL CHIRAC HOW
SURPRISED YOU WERE AT
HIS STATEMENT ON THE WTO'S LACK OF JURISDICTION
ON HEALTH
SAFETY ISSUES. THAT STATEMENT WOULD CERTAINLY
APPEAR
AT

ODDS WITH OUR MUTUALLY AGREED-UPON SPS AGREEMENT
AND THE
WTO
DECISION ON BEEF RAISED WITH HORMONES. SAFETY IS ONE
THING - BOWING
TO IRRATIONAL POPULAR OPINION ANOTHER. IN
THE LONGER TERM, EUROPEAN
CONSUMERS WILL BE BETTER SERVED
BY GOVERNMENTS THAT INSIST ON USING
SCIENCE-BASED RISK
ANALYSIS.

ROHATYN

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 7/6/99 3:58:36 PM
FROM Butler, Lawrence E. (EUR)
CLASSIFICATION UNCLASSIFIED
SUBJECT GENETICALLY-MODIFIED ORGANISMS (GMO) - OPUS
UNCLASSIFIED UNCLASSIFIED [UNCLASSIFIED]
TO Duncan, John D.
Hammonds, D. Holly (INTECON)
Hendricks, Lori A. (INTECON)
Holtzapple, Richard A.
Lee, Malcolm R.
McNamer, Bruce
Mitsler, Elaine M. (INTECON)
Schaefer, Matthew P. (INTECON)
Shah, Sonal R.

CARBON_COPY**TEXT_BODY**

-----Original Message-----

From: WHSR
Sent: Tuesday, July
06, 1999 1:25 PM
To: Blinken, Antony J. (EUR); Butler, Lawrence
E. (EUR); Davidson,
Leslie K. (VP); Gordon, Philip H. (EUR); Moyn,
Samuel A. (EUR/INTERN);
Sapiro, Miriam E. (EUR)
Subject: GENETICALLY-MODIFIED
ORGANISMS (GMO) - OPUS UNCLASSIFIED
UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLAS
SECTION 01 OF 06 ROME 004495

STATE PASS USDA FOR US/SCHUMACHER,
OA/GALVIN,
ITP/SHEIKH/MACKIE/SLUTSKY
STATE EB/TPP/ATT/ATP/MARILYN
BRUNO
GENEVA FOR USTR, ALSO AGRICULTURE

BRUSSELS ALSO FOR USEU
MILAN
FOR ATO

E.O. 12958: N/A
TAGS: EAGR, ETRD, TBIO, SENV, ECON, KSCA,
EU,
IT
SUBJECT: GENETICALLY-MODIFIED ORGANISMS (GMO)
- OPUS

UNCLASSIFIED
UNCLASSIFIED

REF: SECSTATE 113313

1.
INTRODUCTION AND SUMMARY: WHILE ITALY'S
OFFICIAL BIOTECH DECISION
MAKERS COULD BE
CHARACTERIZED AS PRO-BIOTECH, A SMALL BUT
POWERFUL
GREEN PARTY REPRESENTATION IN THE
D'ALEMA GOVERNMENT HAS ACTIVELY
SOUGHT TO
STALL THE USE AND TRADE OF GMOS AT BOTH THE
NATIONAL
AND EU LEVELS. THE THREE COMMITTEES
THAT HAVE BEEN ESTABLISHED
TO WORK ON BIOTECH
ISSUES (BIOSAFETY, NOVEL FOODS, AND
BIOSECURITY)
HAVE TAKEN A SCIENTIFIC APPROACH
TO THEIR WORK, ALTHOUGH THE NOVEL
FOODS
COMMITTEE IS ACUTELY AWARE OF CONSUMERS'
SENSITIVITIES AND
SUPPORTS THEIR DESIRE FOR
INFORMATIVE LABELING. WHILE ITALY HAS
BEEN A
CONSISTENTLY FAVORABLE VOTER ON BIOTECH
DOSSIERS PRESENTED
IN BRUSSELS, ANTI-BIOTECH
GROUPS WERE SUCCESSFUL IN CIRCUMVENTING
THE
OFFICIAL COMMITTEES AND GETTING ITALY TO JOIN
HOLLAND IN CHALLENGING
THE EU DIRECTIVE
ALLOWING FOR BIOTECH PATENTING. ALSO ANTI-

BIOTECH
ACTIVISTS ENGINEERED A PRESIDENTIAL
DECREE BANNING GMOS FROM BABY
FOOD THROUGH
THE MINISTRY OF SOCIAL WELFARE. MORE
RECENTLY, THE
MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT, A
GREEN, GLADLY SUPPORTED THE ENVIRONMENT
COUNCIL
DECLARATION ON BIOTECH REGULATION.
DESPITE THE FACT THAT NEWS COVERAGE
OF
BIOTECH HAS BEEN GENERALLY EVEN-HANDED,
PARTICULARLY IN THE
AGRICULTURAL AND
SCIENTIFIC PRESS, SEVERAL MAJOR FOOD
MARKETING
CHAINS HAVE ANNOUNCED INTENTIONS TO
CREATE "GMO-FREE" PRIVATE LABELS,
PERHAPS
ANTICIPATING A CONSUMER FUROR THAT HASN'T
CLEARLY EMERGED.
THERE HAS BEEN VERY LITTLE

UNCLASSIFIED
UNCLASSIFIED

PUBLIC
DIALOGUE ABOUT BIOTECH. THE EMBASSY
SPONSORED A SERIES OF MEETINGS
MAY 6 AND 7 TO
ENCOURAGE SUCH DIALOGUE. POST STRATEGY IS
OUTLINED
IN PARAGRAPH EIGHT.
END SUMMARY.

2. OVERVIEW OF GMO ISSUES IN
ITALY: ITALY
HAS A FIRM BASE OF SCIENTISTS, GOVERNMENT
OFFICIALS
AND AGRICULTURALISTS WHO SUPPORT
THE USE AND DEVELOPMENT OF GENETICALLY
MODIFIED
ORGANISMS (GMOS). HOWEVER, THIS
SUPPORT IS CHALLENGED BY A STRONG
ANTI-GMO
LOBBY LED BY GREENPEACE AND A SMALL BUT VOCAL
GREEN PARTY
WITHIN THE GOVERNMENT. (THE
GREENS ARE PART OF THE CURRENT GOVERNMENT

COALITION,
AS THEY WERE IN THE PRODI
GOVERNMENT.) MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT
RONCHI,
A GREEN, WAS CARRIED OVER FROM THE PREVIOUS
GOVERNMENT.
THE PRESIDENT OF THE
AGRICULTURAL COMMITTEE IS ALSO A MEMBER OF
THE
GREEN PARTY. ITALIAN CONSUMERS ARE NOT
NECESSARILY ADVERSE TO BIOTECHNOLOGY,
BUT
EXPECT HIGH QUALITY IN THEIR FOOD PRODUCTS.

THE LEADERS OF
THE OFFICIAL ITALIAN
BIOSAFETY, BIOSECURITY, AND NOVEL FOODS
COMMITTEES,
WHICH ARE RESPONSIBLE FOR THE
EVALUATION OF GMO PRODUCTS, ARE SUPPORTIVE
OF
BIOTECH DEV
ELOPMENT. BASED ON THE
UNCLAS SECTION 02 OF 06
ROME 004495

STATE PASS USDA FOR US/SCHUMACHER, OA/GALVIN,
ITP/SHEIKH/MACKIE/SLUTSKY
STATE
EB/TPP/ATT/ATP/MARILYN BRUNO
GENEVA FOR USTR, ALSO AGRICULTURE
BRUSSELS
ALSO FOR USEU
MILAN FOR ATO

E.O. 12958: N/A
TAGS: EAGR, ETRD,
TBIO, SENV, ECON, KSCA,
EU, IT
SUBJECT: GENETICALLY-MODIFIED ORGANISMS
(GMO)
- OPUS

RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE BIOSAFETY COMMITTEE,
ITALY
HAS VOTED IN FAVOR OF VIRTUALLY ALL THE
DOSSIERS FOR GMO PRODUCTS
SUBMITTED FOR EU
APPROVAL DESPITE POLITICAL PRESSURE FROM
GREEN

ELEMENTS WITHIN THE PARLIAMENT AND
COUNCIL OF MINISTERS. (ENVIRONMENT,
WHICH
SITS ON THE BIOSAFETY COMMITTEE IS NOT

UNCLASSIFIED
UNCLASSIFIED

PERMITTED TO VETO A PROPOSAL
WITHOUT
SCIENTIFIC JUSTIFICATION, WHICH IT HASN'T
BEEN PERSUASIVE
IN PRESENTING TO DATE.)
WHILE THE NOVEL FOODS COMMITTEE COULD BE
CHARACTERIZED
AS "PRO-BIOTECH", ITS LEADER,
THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH (WHICH IS RESPONSIBLE
FOR
CONSUMER LABELING) HAS EXPRESSED THE
DESIRE TO SEE ALL PRODUCTS
CONTAINING MORE
THAN 2 PERCENT GMOS IDENTIFIED AS
GENETICALLY
MODIFIED ON THE LABELS. MOH
ALSO OPPOSES A "NEGATIVE LIST" OF PROCESSED
PRODUCTS,
SUCH AS OIL, THAT WOULD NOT HAVE TO
BE LABELED. THE GOI HAS APPROVED
FIELD
TRIALS OF CORN AND TOMATOES AND IS PROMOTING
THE DEVELOPMENT
OF 13 BIOTECHNOLOGY CENTERS
THROUGHOUT ITALY IN AN EFFORT TO SEE
THAT
ITALY IS NOT LEFT BEHIND IN THIS GROWING
FIELD. HOWEVER,
A FEW REGIONAL GOVERNMENTS
HAVE BANNED GMO CROPS AND THE PRIME MINISTER
BOWED
TO PRESSURE FROM THE GREENS TO SUPPORT
THE NETHERLANDS EFFORTS TO
OVERTURN THE EU
REGULATION ALLOWING FOR PATENT PROTECTION OF
GMO
PRODUCTS. MORE RECENTLY, A PRESIDENTIAL
DECREE WAS ISSUED BANNING
THE USE OF GMOS IN
BABY FOOD.

WHILE PRESS ARTICLES ON BIOTECH
IN ITALY TEND
TO BE FAIRLY EVEN-HANDED, PARTICULARLY IN THE
AGRICULTURAL
AND SCIENTIFIC PRESS, ANTI-GMO
EDITORIALS AND ADVERTISEMENTS ARE
COMMON AND
SEVERAL LEADING ITALIAN SUPERMARKET CHAINS,
INCLUDING
COOP, HAVE ANNOUNCED THAT THEY WILL
AVOID THE USE OF GMO INGREDIENTS
IN THEIR
PRIVATE LABEL PRODUCTS. THE LOCAL INDUSTRY
AND THE U.S.
EMBASSY HAVE ACTIVELY WORKED
OVER THE LAST YEAR TO COUNTER THE
MISINFORMATION
AND BIAS THAT OFTEN IS FOUND

UNCLASSIFIED
UNCLASSIFIED

IN
THESE ARTICLES AND ANNOUNCEMENTS. BIOTECH
COMPANIES, SUCH AS MONSANTO,
HAVE DEVELOPED A
STRONG NETWORK OF INTERESTED JOURNALISTS AND
HAVE
BEEN SUCCESSFUL IN PLACING ARTICLES
PROVIDING OBJECTIVE INFORMATION
ON
BIOTECHNOLOGY. THE U.S. EMBASSY HAS PROVIDED
TRAINING FOR SCIENTISTS
AND JOURNALISTS ON
BIOTECHNOLOGY AND RECENTLY HOSTED A SERIES OF
MEETINGS
TO HELP INITIATE A DIALOGUE ON THE
ISSUE BETWEEN SCIENTISTS, CONSUMER
GROUPS,
AND THE FOOD INDUSTRY. THE CLOSING SEMINAR
WAS HOSTED
BY CONFAGRICULTURA, ONE OF ITALY'S
LEADING AGRICULTURAL CONFEDERATIONS,
WHICH
VIEWS BIOTECHNOLOGY AS AN IMPORTANT TOOL THAT
ITS MEMBERS
WILL NEED IN ORDER TO BE
COMPETITIVE IN THE FUTURE.

THE DEBATE

ON BIOTECHNOLOGY IN ITALY IS JUST
BEGINNING. CONSUMERS AND THE
FOOD INDUSTRY
ARE AWARE OF THE POSITIONS AND FEARS BEING
EXPRESSED
IN OTHER MEMBER STATES SUCH AS
UNCLAS SECTION 03 OF 06 ROME 004495

STATE
PASS USDA FOR US/SCHUMACHER, OA/GALVIN,
ITP/SHEIKH/MACKIE/SLUTSKY
STATE
EB/TPP/ATT/ATP/MARILYN BRUNO
GENEVA FOR USTR, ALSO AGRICULTURE
BRUSSELS
ALSO FOR USEU
MILAN FOR ATO

E.O. 12958: N/A
TAGS: EAGR, ETRD,
TBIO, SENV, ECON, KSCA,
EU, IT
SUBJECT: GENETICALLY-MODIFIED ORGANISMS
(GMO)
- OPUS

AUSTRIA AND THE UNITED KINGDOM, BUT AS A
WHOLE,
THEY HAVE NOT SHUT THE DOOR ON GMO
PRODUCTS. THE AVAILABILITY OF
OBJECTIVE
INFORMATION AND OPPORTUNITIES TO PROMOTE A
RATIONAL DISCUSSION
AMONG CONSUMERS AND THE
FOOD INDUSTRY IS CRITICAL TO ASSURING THAT
THE
BIOTECH PRODUCTS ARE VIEWED OBJECTIVELY.

3. A SERIES OF MEETINGS
WAS HELD ON MAY 6
AND 7, TO PROMOTE A DIALOGUE ON GENETICALLY
MODIFIED
ORGANISMS (GMO)S. THE PROGRAMS WERE
SPONSORED BY FAS, WITH THE
SUPPORT OF USIS,
AND INCLUDED: A GENERAL ROUND TABLE
DISCUSSION
FOR CONSUMER GROUPS AND THE FOOD
INDUSTRY; A LUNCHEON BRIEFING FOR
ABOUT 6

PARLIAMENTARIANS INVOLVED IN BIOTECHNOLOGY AND AGRICULTURE;
A ROUND TABLE FOR THE MEMBERS OF THE ITALIAN BIOSAFETY, NOVEL FOODS,
AND BIOSECURITY COMMITTEES; AND A SEMINAR HOSTED BY CONFAGRICULTURA, ONE OF
ITALY'S LEADING AGRICULTURAL CONFEDERATIONS. PRESS COVERAGE,
WHICH WAS MAINLY CONFINED TO THE CONFAGRICULTURA EVENT, WAS SCIENTIFICALLY ORIENTED
AND EVEN-HANDED. DR. BERNICE SLUTSKY AND SARA SCHWARTZ WERE THE GUEST
SPEAKERS AT ALL EVENTS AND WERE JOINED BY DR. JOHN LUPIEN
OF THE FAO CODEX ALIMENTARIUS COMMITTEE FOR THE FIRST THREE EVENTS.
DR. LEONARDO SANTI, PRESIDENT OF THE BIOSECURITY COMMITTEE (UNDER
THE COUNCIL OF MINISTERS), SERVED AS MODERATOR FOR THE DISCUSSIONS
WITH CONSUMER GROUPS AND PARLIAMENTARIANS, BOTH OF WHICH TOOK PLACE
AT THE U.S. EMBASSY. AS EXPECTED, MANY OF THE PARTICIPANTS FROM THE
PARLIAMENT AND THE CONSUMER GROUPS EXPRESSED CONCERNS OVER
THE USE OF GMO PRODUCTS. IN MANY CASES, IT WAS OBVIOUS THAT THE
GROUPS HAD NOT RECEIVED BALANCED INFORMATION ABOUT THE ISSUE.
THE PARTICIPANTS WERE INTERESTED IN THE VIEWPOINTS PROVIDED BY THE
EXPERTS AND TRULY APPRECIATIVE OF THE OPPORTUNITY FOR A
DIALOGUE. CONSUMER GROUP REPRESENTATIVES EXPRESSED THE HOPE THAT A MORE OPEN
DISCUSSION OF THE PROS AND CONS OF BIOTECHNOLOGY WILL GROW FROM THIS BEGINNING.

4.
GENERAL ROUND TABLE: THE SERIES OF
MEETINGS WAS KICKED OFF WITH
A ROUND TABLE
HOSTED BY PROFESSOR LEONARDO SANTI, PRESIDENT
OF
THE BIOSECURITY COMMITTEE, AND INCLUDED
REPRESENTATIVES FROM CONSUMER
GROUPS, THE
FOOD INDUSTRY, ASSOBIOTECH, A BIOTECH

UNCLASSIFIED
UNCLASSIFIED

ADVOCACY AGENCY
COMPRISED OF BIOTECH
INDUSTRIES, SELECTED "PRO-BIOTECH" PRESS, AND
REPRESENTATIVES
FROM THE ITALIAN SCIENTIFIC
COMMUNITY INVOLVED IN BIOTECHNOLOGY.
AS
EXPECTED, MANY OF THE CONSUMER AND INDUSTRY
REPRESENTATIVES
EXPRESSED CONCERNS OVER THE
USE OF FOOD PRODUCTS DERIVED FROM GMOS.
HOWEVER,
IT WAS CLEAR THAT THESE GROUPS HAD
BEEN EXPOSED TO A GOOD DEAL OF
MISINFORMATION.
THEY WERE EXTREMELY
INTERESTED IN DISCUSSING BIOTECH SAFETY
ISSUES
AND ACKNOWLEDGED THE U.S. EMBASSY'S
LEADERSHIP IN INITIATING A DIALOGUE
THAT
THEIR OWN GOVERNMENT HAS APPROACHED WITH SOME
TREPIDATION.
WHILE ALL OF THE CONCERNS WERE
FAR FROM RESOLVED, SOME DID APPEAR
TO BE MORE
UNCLAS SECTION 04 OF 06 ROME 004495

STATE PASS USDA
FOR US/SCHUMACHER, OA/GALVIN,
ITP/SHEIKH/MACKIE/SLUTSKY
STATE EB/TPP/ATT/ATP/MARILYN
BRUNO
GENEVA FOR USTR, ALSO AGRICULTURE
BRUSSELS ALSO FOR USEU

MILAN
FOR ATO

E.O. 12958: N/A
TAGS: EAGR, ETRD, TBIO, SENV, ECON, KSCA,
EU,
IT
SUBJECT: GENETICALLY-MODIFIED ORGANISMS (GMO)
- OPUS

OPEN
TO DISCUSSION AND EXPRESSED THE HOPE
THAT THE ENCOUNTER WILL BE
THE BEGINNING OF A
MORE PUBLIC DISCUSSION OF BIOTECH. A
HIGHLIGHT
OF THE MEETING WAS WHEN A
JOURNALIST HELD UP A PACKET OF CANDY COMMONLY
FOUND
IN ITALY AND ANNOUNCED THAT IT
CONTAINED GMO SOYPRODUCTS. HIS POINT
WAS
THAT GMOS ARE READILY AVAILABLE AND CONSUMED
IN ITALY WITHOUT
PROBLEMS AND THAT THE PRESS
AND CERTAIN GROUPS WERE FOCUSING ON
ANY
NEGATIVE ASPECT THEY COULD FIND, TO THE
DETRIMENT OF THE EDUCATION
OF THE CONSUMER.
(THE JOURNALIST WAS A RECENT PARTICIPANT IN
THE
USIS INTERNATIONAL VISITOR PROGRAM TO
VIEW THE U.S. APPROVAL SYSTEM.
HE HAS
PRODUCED A STEADY STREAM OF ARTICLES
ENCOURAGING THE ITALIAN
AGRICULTURAL
ESTABLISHMENT NOT TO "MISS THE BOAT" ON
BIOTECH.)

UNCLASSIFIED
UNCLASSIFIED

5. PARLIAMENTARIAN
LUNCH: THE LUNCH, ALSO
HOSTED BY PROFESSOR SANTI AT THE EMBASSY,
WAS
ATTENDED BY HALF A DOZEN PARLIAMENTARIANS.

PROFESSOR SANTI PROVIDED AN OVERVIEW OF THE BIOTECH ISSUE AS WELL AS THE STATUS OF BIOTECH RESEARCH IN ITALY. SLUTSKY AND SCHWARTZ PROVIDED A BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF THE GMO APPROVAL PROCESS IN THE UNITED STATES AND THE ECONOMIC BENEFITS FARMERS ARE REALIZING FROM THE USE OF THESE PRODUCTS. SEVERAL OF THE PARLIAMENTARIANS WERE WELL INFORMED ON THE ISSUE, AND WHILE THEY DID NOT EXPRESS STRONG SUPPORT FOR GMOS, THEY ASKED QUESTIONS THAT INDICATED A WILLINGNESS TO UNDERSTAND THE BENEFITS TO BIOTECHNOLOGY. HON. PECCARARO SCANIO, PRESIDENT OF THE PARLIAMENTARIAN AGRICULTURAL COMMITTEE, AND A GREEN PARTY MEMBER, AGREED THAT A SCIENTIFIC EVALUATION OF ANY POTENTIAL GMO PRODUCT WAS IMPORTANT, BUT ARGUED WARMLY THAT ITALY WOULD ALWAYS HAVE TO CONSIDER THE PRESERVATION OF TRADITIONAL PRODUCTS AND SMALL-SCALE AGRICULTURE IN ANY AGREEMENTS.

6. SCIENTIFIC ROUNDTABLE: A QUESTION AND ANSWER SESSION WAS HELD FOR THE MEMBERS OF THE BIOSAFETY, NOVEL FOODS, AND ETHICS COMMITTEES. THE MEETING WAS HOSTED BY DR. GIULIANO D'AGNOLO, CHAIRMAN OF THE BIOSAFETY COMMITTEE AND ATTENDED BY APPROXIMATELY 30 SCIENTISTS. DR. SLUTSKY HAD BRIEFED MOST OF THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS AT A SIMILAR MEETING A YEAR AGO, AND THEY WERE INTERESTED

TO HEAR HER UPDATE ON ACTIVITIES
IN THE UNITED STATES.

7. A
SEMINAR, HOSTED BY CONFAGRICULTURA,

UNCLASSIFIED
UNCLASSIFIED

ITALY'S
LEADING AGRICULTURAL CONFEDERATION,
WAS HELD ON MAY 7 FOR APPROXIMATELY
80
MEMBERS, REPRESENTATIVES FROM THE FOOD
INDUSTRY, AND MEMBERS
OF THE AGRICULTURAL
PRESS. THE MEETING WAS MODERATED BY THE
PRESIDENT
OF CONFAGRICULTURA AND WAS NOTABLE
IN THAT HE PUBLICALLY STATED
HIS SUPPORT FOR
BIOTECH, ALTHOUGH HE ADVOCATED MOVING AHEAD
UNCLAS
SECTION 05 OF 06 ROME 004495

STATE PASS USDA FOR US/SCHUMACHER,
OA/GALVIN,
ITP/SHEIKH/MACKIE/SLUTSKY
STATE EB/TPP/ATT/ATP/MARILYN
BRUNO
GENEVA FOR USTR, ALSO AGRICULTURE
BRUSSELS ALSO FOR USEU
MILAN
FOR ATO

E.O. 12958: N/A
TAGS: EAGR, ETRD, TBIO, SENV, ECON, KSCA,
EU,
IT
SUBJECT: GENETICALLY-MODIFIED ORGANISMS (GMO)
- OPUS

CAUTIOUSLY.
IN ADDITION TO PRESENTATIONS BY
SLUTSKY AND SCHWARTZ ON THE U.S.
APPROVAL
PROCESS AND ECONOMIC ADVANTAGES OF GMO
PRODUCTS, COMMENTS
WERE OFFERED BY 4 OTHER
SPEAKERS INCLUDING MEMBERS OF THE

CONFEDERATION
AND REPRESENTATIVES FROM
ACADEMIA. WHILE MOST COMMENTS URGED CAUTION
IN
MOVING AHEAD WITH GMOS, THE LAST 2
SPEAKERS FROM THE UNIVERSITY
OF BOLOGNA
DEPARTMENTS OF PHARMACOLOGY AND BIOCHEMISTRY
WERE CLEARLY
IN FAVOR OF BIOTECHNOLOGY AND
PROVIDED AN EXCELLENT COUNTERPOINT
TO THE
U.S. PRESENTATIONS, AND A GOOD CLOSING TO THE
PROCEEDINGS.
CONFAGRICULTURA'S SPONSORSHIP
OF THE SEMINAR IS VIEWED AS A STRONG
STEP IN
MAKING THE DEBATE ON BIOTECHNOLOGY MORE
PUBLIC.

8.
STRATEGIES. POST PLANS TO CAPITALIZE ON
THE MOMENTUM OF THE SERIES
OF MEETINGS BY
CONTINUING TO IDENTIFY AND WORK WITH GROUPS
AND
JOURNALISTS IN ITALIAN SOCIETY WHO CAN
INFLUENCE PUBLIC OPINION
ON BIOTECH. EMBASSY
LABOR COUNSELOR NOTES THAT ONE "VITAL"
DIMENSION
TO THIS ISSUE HAS TO DATE GONE
VIRTUALLY UNNOTICED. PLANTS THAT
HAVE BEEN
GENETICALLY MODIFIED TO PRODUCE THEIR OWN
PESTICIDE PROTECTION
LOWER COSTS TO FARMERS

UNCLASSIFIED
UNCLASIFIED

WHO
OTHERWISE MAY SPEND CONSIDERABLE SUMS FOR
AGRICULTURAL CHEMICALS.
SWITCHING FROM
CHEMICAL TO NATURAL PROTECTION, HOWEVER, IS
EVEN
MORE SIGNIFICANT FOR THE HEALTH AND WELL
BEING OF AGRICULTURAL WORKERS
OTHERWISE

EXPOSED TO THE RISKS OF HANDLING SUBSTANCES
THAT POISON
PEOPLE AS WELL AS PESTS. FOR
THIS REASON, HE PROPOSES THAT WASHINGTON
AGENCIES
PROVIDE BACKGROUND INFORMATION
RELEVANT TO THIS ISSUE, WHICH POST
CAN USE TO
ENCOURAGE ITALIAN TRADE UNIONS AND CONSUMER
GROUPS SENSITIVE
TO THIS CONCERN TO ENTER THE
DEBATE.

FAS AND USIS ARE ALSO EXPLORING
THE
POSSIBILITY OF FUNDING PROGRAMS OF A WEEK TO
10 DAYS FOR FOOD
INDUSTRY JOURNALISTS WHO
WRITE FOR TRADE-ORIENTED PUBLICATIONS,
SINCE
THE FOOD INDUSTRY SEEMS TO BE A PARTICULARLY
SENSITIVE PART
OF THE BIOTECH MOSAIC. (THE
PRIVATE SECTOR APPEARS TO BE WILLING
TO FUND
AIRFARE.) ADDITIONALLY, WE ARE CONSIDERING A
VIDEO CONFERENCE
THAT WOULD ALLOW ITALIAN
FOOD INDUSTRY EXECUTIVES TO DISCUSS CONSUMER
ACCEPTANCE
AND MARKETING ISSUES WITH THEIR
U.S. COUNTERPARTS. WE WILL CONTINUE
TO
NOMINATE BIOTECH DECISION-MAKERS TO VISIT THE
U.S. UNDER USIS
PROGRAMMING.

THIS YEAR, THREE HAVE BEEN APPROVED UNDER THE
VOLUNTARY
VISITORS PROGRAM, INCLUDING THE
UNDERSECRETARY OF HEALTH AND THE
HEAD OF THE
NOVEL FOODS COMMITTEE. ANOTHER TEAM OF 3
NOMINATED
BY FAS AND SCIENCE, WHO ARE MEMBERS
OF, OR PROVIDE RESEARCH FOR,
THE BIOTECH
COMMITTEES TRAVELED UNDER THE 3 WEEK
INTERNATIONAL
VISITORS PROGRAM. LAST YEAR A

UNCLASSIFIED
UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLAS
SECTION 06 OF 06 ROME 004495

STATE PASS USDA FOR US/SCHUMACHER,
OA/GALVIN,
ITP/SHEIKH/MACKIE/SLUTSKY
STATE EB/TPP/ATT/ATP/MARILYN
BRUNO
GENEVA FOR USTR, ALSO AGRICULTURE
BRUSSELS ALSO FOR USEU
MILAN
FOR ATO

E.O. 12958: N/A
TAGS: EAGR, ETRD, TBIO, SENV, ECON, KSCA,
EU,
IT
SUBJECT: GENETICALLY-MODIFIED ORGANISMS (GMO)
- OPUS

PRO-BIOTECH
JOURNALIST RECOMMENDED BY FAS
TRAVELED TO BRUSSELS AND THE U.S.
ON A USIS
PROGRAM, AND HAS SINCE PRODUCED A STEADY
STREAM OF POSITIVE
ARTICLES.

COMMUNICATION WITH THE PUBLIC IS PERHAPS THE
MOST DIFFICULT
AND MOST IMPORTANT ASPECT OF
THE EQUATION, AS GMO FOODS IN EUROPE
WILL BE
LABELED AND THE CONSUMERS WILL MAKE THE
ULTIMATE DECISION.
ANY INFORMATION THAT
WASHINGTON AGENCIES CAN ASSEMBLE
(PARTICULARLY
THAT BASED ON ACADEMIC RESEARCH
OR FINDINGS OF INTERNATIONALLY-RECOGNIZED
SCIENTIFIC
ORGANIZATIONS) THAT CAN BE
DISSEMINATED TO THE PRESS WOULD BE EXTREMELY
HELPFUL.
OBVIOUSLY, SUCH INFORMATION SHOULD

BE CLEAR, OBJECTIVE AND PRESS-READY.

9.

CONTACTS

DR. GIULIANO D'AGNOLO (CHAIRMAN
DIRECTOR, BIOLOGY
CELLULAR BIOSAFETY
LAB. SUPERIOR INSTITUTE OF COMMITTEE)
HEALTH
TEL.
(39-06) 4998-2528
FAX: (39-06)4938-7143

DR. GIUSEPPE BATTAGLINO
(VICE CHAIRMAN,
DIRECTOR GENERAL, BIOSAFETY
DEPARTMENT
OF PREVENTION COMMITTEE)
(MINISTRY OF HEALTH)
TEL: (39-06)
5994-4209
FAX: (39-06) 5994-4249

UNCLASSIFIED
UNCLASSIFIED

PROF.
LEONARDO SANTI (BIOSECURITY
CHAIRMAN,
COMMITTEE)
SCIENTIFIC DIRECTOR,
NATIONAL INSTITUTE FOR
CANCER
RESEARCH-GENOA
TEL: (39-06) 8598-2074
FAX: (39-06) 8598-2022

PROF.
ROMANO MARABELLI (CHAIRMAN,
DIRECTOR GENERAL,
NOVEL FOODS)
DEPARTMENT OF FOOD, NUTRITION COMMITTEE)
AND
HEALTH (MINISTRY OF HEALTH)
TEL: (39-06) 5994-3946
FAX: (39-06)
5994-3190

DR. AUGUSTO BOCCHINI
PRESIDENT,

CONFAGRICULTURA

TEL:

(39-06) 68521

FAX: (39-06) 687-9686.

CUNNINGHAM

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 7/8/99 1:45:13 PM

FROM Shah, Sonal R.

CLASSIFICATION UNCLASSIFIED

SUBJECT GMO and Biodiversity Readout from G8 Mtgs [UNCLASSIFIED]

TO Bartlett, L. June (EXSEC)
Davies, Glyn T. (EXSEC)
Dejban, Donna D. (NSA)
Gire, Cynthia L. (EXSEC)
Hilliard, Brenda I. (EXSEC)
Jacobson, Tracey A. (ADMIN)
Joshi, M. Kay (EXSEC)
Kerrick, Donald L. (NSA)
Millison, Cathy L. (EXSEC)
Powell, Elliott (WHSR/EXSEC)
Sargeant, Stephen T. (EXSEC)
Snip, Sarah E. (EXSEC/INTERN)
Wasserman, Elaine P. (DEFENSE)

CARBON_COPY

TEXT_BODY since Rick H. is not here, I am trying to get a copy of readouts of meetings that may have covered these issues. Any help/suggestions would be greatly appreciated. thank you.

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 7/23/99 10:50:22 AM
FROM Blinken, Antony J. (EUR)
CLASSIFICATION UNCLASSIFIED
SUBJECT RE: Mention of Dick Swett's successful outreach campaign on GMO's
[UNCLASSIFIED]
TO Davidson, Leslie K. (VP)
CARBON_COPY
TEXT_BODY thanks -- i'm e-mailing marc.

-----Original Message-----

From: Davidson,
Leslie K. (VP)
Sent: Friday, July 23, 1999 10:30 AM
To: Blinken,
Antony J. (EUR)
Subject: Mention of Dick Swett's successful outreach
campaign on GMO's [UNCLASSIFIED]

Tony --- finally remembered where
I heard this fact. From Marc Grossman during a presentation he made
to the Secretary last week.

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 7/30/99 9:58:00 AM
FROM Mitsler, Elaine M. (INTECON)
CLASSIFICATION UNCLASSIFIED
SUBJECT FW: NEC DC on GMO [UNCLASSIFIED]
TO Hammonds, D. Holly (INTECON)

CARBON_COPY

TEXT_BODY Sheba asked me flag this query for you [unless you have responded to her by now].

-----Original Message-----

From: Crocker, Bathsheba
N. (NSA)

Sent: Thursday, July 29, 1999 7:39 PM

To: @INTECON -

Economic Affairs

Cc: Hammonds, D. Holly (INTECON)

Subject: NEC

DC on GMO [UNCLASSIFIED]

@intecon:

wondering who is planning
to attend tomorrow's DC with Jim.

Please advise. Thanks, Sheba

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 9/29/99 3:21:24 PM
FROM Bowles, Ian A. (ENV)
CLASSIFICATION UNCLASSIFIED
SUBJECT RE: Cable for Cliff Gabriel on GMO labelling project [UNCLASSIFIED]
TO Epstein, Gerald L. (OSTP)

CARBON_COPY

TEXT_BODY thanks. will do in the future.

-----Original Message-----

From: Epstein,
Gerald L. (OSTP)
Sent: Wednesday, September 29, 1999 1:58 PM
To: Bowles,
Ian A. (ENV)
Subject: Cable for Cliff Gabriel on GMO labelling
project [UNCLASSIFIED]

I will give Cliff a copy of the cable you
forwarded. Please let me know via separate email when there is something
in my Intelligence folder that I need to pass on -- sometimes things
hide out there for a while before getting noticed.

Thanks.

Withdrawal/Redaction Marker

Clinton Library

DOCUMENT NO. AND TYPE	SUBJECT/TITLE	DATE	RESTRICTION
--------------------------	---------------	------	-------------

012. email	Leslie Davidson to Theodore Osius, re: [Working Group on Genetically Modified Organisms] (3 pages)	11/17/1999	P1/b(1)
------------	--	------------	---------

COLLECTION:

Clinton Presidential Records
NSC Emails
Exchange - Non-Record (Mar 97 - Jan 01) ([GMO...])
OA/Box Number: 630000

FOLDER TITLE:

[03/18/1998 - 12/22/1999]

2013-0836-F
ke3025

RESTRICTION CODES

Presidential Records Act - [44 U.S.C. 2204(a)]

Freedom of Information Act - [5 U.S.C. 552(b)]

P1 National Security Classified Information [(a)(1) of the PRA]
P2 Relating to the appointment to Federal office [(a)(2) of the PRA]
P3 Release would violate a Federal statute [(a)(3) of the PRA]
P4 Release would disclose trade secrets or confidential commercial or financial information [(a)(4) of the PRA]
P5 Release would disclose confidential advice between the President and his advisors, or between such advisors [(a)(5) of the PRA]
P6 Release would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy [(a)(6) of the PRA]

C. Closed in accordance with restrictions contained in donor's deed of gift.

PRM. Personal record misfile defined in accordance with 44 U.S.C. 2201(3).

RR. Document will be reviewed upon request.

b(1) National security classified information [(b)(1) of the FOIA]
b(2) Release would disclose internal personnel rules and practices of an agency [(b)(2) of the FOIA]
b(3) Release would violate a Federal statute [(b)(3) of the FOIA]
b(4) Release would disclose trade secrets or confidential or financial information [(b)(4) of the FOIA]
b(6) Release would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy [(b)(6) of the FOIA]
b(7) Release would disclose information compiled for law enforcement purposes [(b)(7) of the FOIA]
b(8) Release would disclose information concerning the regulation of financial institutions [(b)(8) of the FOIA]
b(9) Release would disclose geological or geophysical information concerning wells [(b)(9) of the FOIA]

Exchange Mail

DATE-TIME 12/22/1999 10:39:26 AM
FROM Davidson, Leslie K. (VP)
CLASSIFICATION UNCLASSIFIED
SUBJECT FW: : ITALY CONSIDERS THE BAN OF 7 GMO VARIETIES
[UNCLASSIFIED]
TO Osius, Theodore G. (VP)

CARBON_COPY
TEXT_BODY

-----Original Message-----

From: WHSR

Sent: Wednesday, December
22, 1999 6:25 AM

To: Blinken, Antony J. (EUR); Cables; Crawford,
Bernard T. (EUR/INTERN); Davidson, Leslie K. (VP); Duncan, John
D. (INTECON/DOS); Hammonds, D. Holly (INTECON); Kass, Nicholas S.
(EUR); Lee, Malcolm R. (NEC); Munter, Cameron P. (EUR); Norland,
Richard B. (EUR); vonLipsey, Roderick K. (SEE); Yee, Hoyt B. (EUR)
Subject: ITALY
CONSIDERS THE BAN OF 7 GMO VARIETIES

[---Message Text---]

UNCLAS

SECTION 01 OF 02 ROME 008858

STATE PASS USDA FOR FAS/OA/GALVIN;
ITP/SHEIKH/MACKE;
OFSTS/SLUTSKY;
STATE PASS USDA ALSO FOR
CMP/GFD/RIEMENSCHENEIDER;
CMP/COTS/BLUM;
FAA/GEERKEN
DEPT PASS USTR
POSTS FOR AGRICULTURE
MILAN
FOR ATO

SENSITIVE

E.O. 12958: N/A

TAGS: EAGR, ETRD, EU, IT

SUBJECT:
ITALY CONSIDERS THE BAN OF 7 GMO
VARIETIES

1. SUMMARY: IN A
PRESS RELEASE DATED
DECEMBER 17, THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH ANNOUNCED
THAT
THE USE OF 7 GENETICALLY MODIFIED
PRODUCTS WILL BE SUSPENDED TEMPORARILY
AS A
PRECAUTIONARY MEASURE BASED ON A PETITION
MADE BY THE ASSOCIATION
FOR A GREEN
ENVIRONMENT AND SOCIETY. THE REASON FOR THE
SUSPENSION
IS BASED ON ARGUMENTS THAT THE
VARIETIES SHOULD HAVE BEEN EVALUATED
BY THE
MEMBER STATES AS OPPOSED TO BEING ACCEPTED
UNDER A PETITION
OF SUBSTANTIAL EQUIVALENCE
UNDER EU REGULATION 258/97. DR. ROMANO
MARABELLI,
HEAD OF THE NOVEL FOODS COMMITTEE
ASSURED THE EMBASSY THAT THE PRESS
RELEASE
HAS "LITTLE CONNECTION TO REALITY" AND THAT
NO DECISION
ON WHAT ACTION TO TAKE HAS BEEN
MADE. MARABELLI, SAID THAT THE
MOH DOES
BELIEVE THAT THE MANNER IN WHICH THESE
PRODUCTS WERE APPROVED
DOES NEED TO BE
REVIEWED, BUT SUGGESTED THAT THE MINISTRY MAY
TURN
THE ISSUE OVER TO THE EU COMMISSION TO
MAKE A DETERMINATION. MARABELLI
STRESSED THAT
REACHING SUCH DECISION IS A TIME CONSUMING
PROCESS,
AND THAT THE CURRENT GOVERNMENT
CRISIS WILL MAKE ARRIVING AT A DECISION
EVEN
MORE DIFFICULT. IF THE MOH DOES BAN THE
IMPORT OF THE 7 PRODUCTS,
IMPORTS OF U.S.
PRODUCTS CONTAINING GMOS, PARTICULARLY IN
PROCESSED

FOOD, COULD BE SEVERELY RESTRICTED.
HOWEVER, AN ACCURATE ESTIMATE
OF ANY EFFECT
WILL DEPEND ON THE ULTIMATE DECISION TAKEN BY
THE
MOH. POST WILL FOLLOW THIS ISSUE CLOSELY
AND REPORT BACK AS INFORMATION
IS OBTAINED.
END SUMMARY.

2. ON DECEMBER 17, THE MINISTRY OF
HEALTH
RELEASED THE FOLLOWING PRESS STATEMENT:
"FOLLOWING THE RECOMMENDATION
OF THE SUPERIOR
HEALTH INSTITUTE AND THE SUPERIOR HEALTH
COUNCIL,
BASED ON A PETITION BY THE
ASSOCIATION FOR A GREEN ENVIRONMENT
AND
SOCIETY (VERDE), THAT THE PROCEDURES FOLLOWED
FOR MARKETING
SEVEN GENETICALLY MODIFIED
PRODUCTS WERE NOT APPROPRIATE, THE MINISTRY
OF
HEALTH, WITH THE CONCURRENCE OF THE
MINISTRIES OF ENVIRONMENT AND
AGRICULTURE,
WILL ADOPT A PROVISION TEMPORARILY SUSPENDING
THE
USE OF THESE PRODUCTS AS A PRECAUTIONARY
MEASURE IN ACCORDANCE WITH
THE MECHANISM
PROVIDED UNDER EU REGULATIONS". THE SEVEN
PRODUCTS
IN QUESTION ARE 4 CORN (MAIS BT11,
MAIS MON 810, MAIS MON809, AND
MAIS T25) AND
3 RAPESEEDS (RAPESEED GT 73, RAPESEED OIL MS1
RS1,
AND RAPESEED OIL RF2 MS1).

3. THIS PRESS RELEASE APPEARS TO HAVE
BEEN
BASED ON AN OPINION PROVIDED BY THE SUPERIOR
HEALTH COUNCIL,
AN ADVISING BODY TO THE
MINISTRY OF HEALTH, ON DECEMBER 16. THE
OPINION
ITSELF IS IN RESPONSE TO A PETITION

FROM VERDE, WITH SUPPORTING
DOCUMENTS FROM
THE BRITISH ASSOCIATION "FRIENDS OF THE
EARTH",
CLAIMING THAT THE SEVEN GMO PRODUCTS
WERE NOT PROPERLY APPROVED
FOR MARKETING AT
THE EU LEVEL. ACCORDING TO THE DOCUMENT, THE
SEVEN
PRODUCTS WERE TESTED AND SUBMITTED FOR
EU APPROVAL BY THE BRITISH
GOVERNMENT UNDER
THE SIMPLIFIED PROCEDURE FOR "SUBSTANTIALLY
EQUIVALENT"
PRODUCTS UNDER EU REGULATION
258/971. VERDE ARGUES THAT THE INSERTED
GENE
COULD HAVE A NEGATIVE EFFECT (ALLERGIC
REACTION, PRODUCTION
OF TOXINS, OR ACTIVATION
OF PREVIOUSLY DORMANT GENES, ETC.) AND
ARE
THEREFORE NOT SUBSTANTIALLY EQUIVALENT. AS A
RESULT, THE PRODUCTS
SHOULD HAVE BEEN
EVALUATED BY EACH MEMBER STATE PRIOR TO
APPROVAL.
THE SUPERIOR HEALTH COUNCIL
SUPPORTS THIS ARGUMENT AND RECOMMENDS
THAT
THE EU RULES REGARDING PRODUCTION AND
MARKETING OF NOVEL FOODS
BE MODIFIED IN
ACCORDANCE TO THE NEW SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH
UNCLAS
SECTION 02 OF 02 ROME 008858

STATE PASS USDA FOR FAS/OA/GALVIN;
ITP/SHEIKH/MACKE;
OFSTS/SLUTSKY;
STATE PASS USDA ALSO FOR
CMP/GFD/RIEMENSCHENEIDER;
CMP/COTS/BLUM;
FAA/GEERKEN
DEPT PASS USTR
POSTS FOR AGRICULTURE
MILAN
FOR ATO

SENSITIVE

E.O. 12958: N/A
TAGS: EAGR, ETRD, EU, IT
SUBJECT:
ITALY CONSIDERS THE BAN OF 7 GMO
VARIETIES

AVAILABLE ON THE ISSUE
OF SUBSTANTIAL
EQUIVALENCE.

4. DR. ROMANO MARABELLI, OF THE
MINISTRY OF
HEALTH AND THE CHAIRMAN OF THE NOVEL FOODS
COMMITTEE,
IN A CONVERSATION WITH THE
AGATTACHE, STRESSED THAT THIS PRESS RELEASE
"HAD
LITTLE CONNECTION TO REALITY" AND THAT
THE MOH WAS STILL STUDYING
THE ISSUE.
MARABELLI SAID THAT IT IS THE PRACTICE IN
EUROPE TO
INTRODUCE PRODUCTS THROUGH THE
SIMPLIFIED NOTIFICATION SYSTEM THAT
ARE
CONSIDERED TO BE SIMILAR TO TRADITIONAL
PRODUCTS. HOWEVER,
SOME PRODUCTS THAT HAVE
BEEN NOTIFIED MAY NOT BE EQUIVALENT OR MAY
NOT
HAVE HAD ADEQUATE RESEARCH DONE ON THEIR
POSSIBLE HEALTH AFFECTS.
MARABELLI ALSO SAID
THAT THERE COULD BE A PUBLIC PERCEPTION THAT
THE
PRODUCTS WERE NOT PROPERLY EVALUATED.
MARABELLI STRESSED THAT A
BAN ON THE PRODUCTS
WAS AN OPTION THAT SHOULD NOT EVEN BE
DISCUSSED
AT THIS TIME, AND THAT OTHER
OPTIONS, INCLUDING HANDING THE ISSUE
OVER TO
THE EU COMMISSION TO RESOLVE, ARE MUCH MORE
LIKELY TO HAPPEN.
MARABELLI ADDED THAT
REACHING ANY SUCH DECISION IS NORMALLY A TIME
CONSUMING
PROCESS, BUT THAT THE CURRENT

GOVERNMENT CRISIS WILL MAKE ARRIVING AT A DECISION EVEN MORE DIFFICULT. (NOTE: THE ITALIAN PRIME MINISTER RESIGNED ON DECEMBER 18 AND IS CURRENTLY TRYING TO FORM A NEW COALITION GOVERNMENT).

5. COMMENT: DR. MARABELLI HAD BEEN IN MEETINGS IN BRUSSELS SINCE LAST WEEK AND JUST RETURNED TO HIS OFFICE THE MORNING OF DEC. 21 WHEN HE TALKED WITH THE AGATTACHE. IT WAS APPARENT THAT HE WAS CAUGHT OFF GUARD, AND EMBARRASSED, BY THE PRESS RELEASE. MARABELLI GAVE THE IMPRESSION THAT HE PROBABLY AGREES THAT THE SIMPLIFIED PROCEDURES CURRENTLY FOLLOWED SHOULD BE REVIEWED, PARTICULARLY IN VIEW OF PUBLIC PERCEPTION THAT THERE MAY BE A PROBLEM. HOWEVER, HE HAS ALWAYS BEEN SUPPORTIVE, ALBEIT IN A CAUTIOUS WAY, OF BIOTECHNOLOGY, AND IT WOULD BE OUT OF CHARACTER FOR HIM TO GO ALONG WITH SUCH A KNEE-JERK PUBLIC ACTION. MARABELLI HAS OFTEN COAXED A MORE MODERATE LINE OUT OF HEALTH MINISTER ROSI BINDI, WHO LEANS TOWARD THE GREEN POINT OF VIEW. MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT, EDO RONCHI, IS A MEMBER OF THE GREEN PARTY AND CAN BE ASSUMED TO BE FULLY SUPPORTIVE OF A BAN OF THE PRODUCTS. IF THE MOH DOES BAN THE IMPORT OF THE 7 PRODUCTS, IMPORTS OF U.S. PRODUCTS CONTAINING GMOS, PARTICULARLY IN PROCESSED FOOD, COULD BE SEVERELY RESTRICTED. HOWEVER, AN ACCURATE ESTIMATE OF

ANY EFFECT WILL DEPEND ON THE
ULTIMATE DECISION TAKEN BY THE MOH.
POST
WILL FOLLOW THIS ISSUE CLOSELY AND REPORT
BACK AS INFORMATION
IS OBTAINED. END
COMMENT. FOGLIETTA