FOIA Number: 2017-1095-F

FOIA MARKER

This is not a textual record. This is used as an administrative marker by the William J. Clinton Presidential Library Staff.

Collection/Record Group: Clinton Presidential Records

Subgroup/Office of Origin: Council of Economic Advisers

Series/Staff Member: Jeffrey Frankel

Subseries:

OA/ID Number: 13722

FolderID:

Folder Title:
Climate Change visitor/speaker

Stack:	Row:	Section:	Shelf:	Position:
S	20	4	10	3

Kydo valixayas

JF 8/14/97

Economist candidates to invite to Oct. White House conference on GCC

more senior experts on GCC 2300

some other eminent economists of 2300

lead signers of letter

Bill Nordhaus
Dale Jorgenson

Ken Arrow *
Paul Krugman
Robert Solow *

other signers of letter

Richard Schmalensee

other eminent who didn't sign
Bill Cline, IIF
Richard Cooper, Harvard

William Baumol, NYU
Max Corden, SAIS
Gerard Debreu, UCB *
Frank Fisher, MIT
Claudia Goldin, Harvard
Ned Gramlich, U.Mich/ FRB nom.
Lawrence Klein, U.Penn *
Anne Krueger, Stanford
Larry Katz, Harvard
Robert Litan, Brookings
Van Ooms, CED
Jeff Sachs
James Tobin *

John Harsanyi *
Wassily Leontief *
Franco Modigliani *

Stephen DeCanio
Robert Repetto

experts in GCC
not quite as senior/big name

signed letter
Stavins

couldn't find name on list
Goulder
Rutherford
McKibbin
Wilcoxen
Richels
Toman

former Admin
Alan Blinder
Laura Tyson
Alicia Munnell
Ev Ehrlich
Joe Stiglitz

ECONOMISTS WHO WORK ON CLIMATE CHANGE

NAME	UNIVERSITY	EMAIL	TELEPHONE
Bill Nordhaus	Yale	nordhaus@econ.yale.edu	203-432-3587
Richard Schmalensee	MIT		617-253-2957
		POC: Cahty	617-253-5991
V Kerry Smith	Duke	vks@duke.edu	919-660-1805
Dale Jorgenson	Harvard	djorgenson@harvard.edu	617-495-4661/0883
Robert Stavins	Harvard	robert_stavins@harvard.edu	617-495-1820
Larry Goulder	Stanford	goulder@leland.stanford.edu	415-723-3706
Tom Rutherford	Univ of Colorado	out of town til 8/4/97	303-492-5169
Charles Kolstad	UC-Santa Barbara	kolstad@econ.ucsb.edu	805-893-2108
Mike Toman	ResourcesforFuture	toman@rff.org	202-328-5000
Ian Perry	ResourcesforFuture	perry@rff.org	202-328-5151
Peter Bohm	Univ of Stockholm		
Robert Mendelsohn	Yale	robert.mendelsohn@yale.edu	203-432-5128
Brent Sohngen	Ohio State	sohngen.1@osu.edu	614-688-4640
Rich Adams	Oregon State		541-737-1435
Gary Yohe	Wesleyan	gyohe@wesleyan.edu	860-685-2722
Peter Wilcoxen	UT-Austin	wilcoxen@eco.utexas.edu	512-475-8531
W. McKibbin	Brookings		202-797-6118
Robert Hahn	AEI	hahnr@erols.com	202-862-5000
Rich Richels	EPRI		
Tom Tietenberg	Colby	thtieten@colby.edu	207-872-3143
Michael Grubb	UK		
Alan Manne			
Robert Kaufmann	Boston U	kaufmann@bu.edu	617-353-3940

Jae Edmonds

Weyant

Francine P. Obermiller
07/11/97 11:24:01 AM

Record Type: Record

To: Jeffrey A. Frankel/CEA/EOP, Jason Shogren/CEA/EOP

cc: Lisa D. Branch/CEA/EOP

Subject: CLIMATE CHANGE ECONOMISTS FOR FUTURE BREAKFAST MEETINGS

climatec.eco

ATTACHED IS THE LIST OF ECONOMISTS FOR FUTURE BREAKFAST MEETINGS, WITH TELEPHONE NUMBERS AND EMAIL ADDRESSES.

RUTHERFORD'S VOICEMAIL SAID THAT HE WOULD BE BACK ON AUGUST 4. I LEFT A MESSAGE.
RICH ADAMS WAS GONE. I LEFT A MESSAGE
I DID NOT CALL PETER BOHM, SINCE HE IS INS TOCKHOLM.
W. MCKIBBIN. I LEFT A MESSAGE
JAY DID NOT HAVE THE LICATION OF MICHAEL GRUBB OR ALAN MANNE YET.

LISA: IF ANY OF THE ABOVE CALL BACK, PLEASE ADD INFO TO LIST AND SEND TO ME

United States Department of State

Under Secretary of State
for Global Affairs

Washington, D.C. 20520-7250

June 23, 1997

Dear Jeffrey,

We are now through the first list of invited luncheon speakers and are looking ahead to the next five months. It is time for an evaluation of the luncheon series, and I would appreciate your comments on the questions below:

1. Do you think the luncheon group has been worthwhile and should continue? Yes
2. Would you like to be taken off the invitation list? No
3. What changes would you recommend in the format?
4. Would it be helpful to allow substitutes when you cannot come? probably
5. Do you have suggestions for future speakers? (A copy of the list of our guests is attached.) Do you want more economists?

Thank you for your attention and continuing interest. I look forward to hearing from you. JF

With best regards,

Sincerely yours,

Tim Wirth

Timothy E. Wirth

Mr. Jeffrey Frankel
Council of Economic Advisors
315 OEOB
Washington, DC 20501

Talking Points for Calls to Potential Economist Validators

- Wanted to talk to you about global climate change and the Kyoto agreement.

- Know you have been following issue, and wanted to provide our perspective on the economics involved:

    - As the letter from 2,500 economists [which you signed] on this issue indicates, "The most efficient approach to slowing climate change is through market based policies. In order for the world to achieve its climate objectives at minimum cost, a cooperative approach among nations is required -- such as an international emissions trading program."

    - The treaty we agreed to in Kyoto, and the Administration's overall approach to climate change, emphasize this market-based approach. The Kyoto agreement includes provisions for international trading, for a Clean Development Mechanism, and for other sources of flexibility. We prevailed on these and other key points against very broad opposition.

      At same time, the treaty did not bring developing countries on board and that is the next great hurdle. Without it, treaty will never get ratified and the global problem won't get solved.

- I think it is extremely important that economists start pointing out that if the provisions of the Kyoto agreement are fully implemented, the costs are likely to be quite modest. In particular, international trading and other aspects of the treaty (e.g., six gases, sinks) dramatically reduce the costs involved, and many outside studies are neglecting to reflect the institutional details of what was actually agreed.

- The opposition, as you may have seen, is already on the field. [WEFA]

- What I would like to do is start to engage thoughtful leaders like yourself on this issue. I would like to get your best thoughts on how we should be proceeding in analyzing the issue and making our case with the public. And I would hope to enlist your moral support for our efforts to deal with this issue in a sound and sober manner.

    - We will also need your help in thinking through many of the important questions as we move forward. For example, if we ratify the Kyoto agreement, designing an effective cap-and-trade system for carbon emissions will be one of our most important public policy challenges over the next decade, and we will need the help of people like you to make sure we get it right.

- We are trying to organize a dinner with the Vice President, Deputy Secretary Summers, and Chair Yellen in the near future to focus on the economic aspects of climate change, and I hope you'll be available to join us.

Randall W. Lutter
02/27/98 02:15:50 PM

Record Type: Record

To: Janet L. Yellen/CEA/EOP, Jeffrey A. Frankel/CEA/EOP, Joseph E. Aldy/CEA/EOP, Peter R. Orszag/OPD/EOP

cc:
Subject: Stavins on Kyoto

--------------------- Forwarded by Randall W. Lutter/CEA/EOP on 02/27/98 02:11 PM ---------------------------

Richard P. Theroux
02/27/98 02:01:42 PM

Record Type: Record

To: Randall W. Lutter/CEA/EOP, Eric M. Haxthausen/OMB/EOP, Richard B. Belzer/OMB/EOP

cc:
Subject: Stavins on Kyoto

--------------------- Forwarded by Richard P. Theroux/OMB/EOP on 02/27/98 02:14 PM ---------------------------

BNA
Daily Report for Executives

No. 39
Friday February 27, 1998

Regulation, Law & Economics

Climate Change
Kyoto Protocol Flawed But Fixable, Harvard Professor Tells Capitol Briefing

The Kyoto Protocol is flawed but should not be rejected out of hand because it can be fixed, a Harvard University professor told a Capitol Hill briefing Feb. 26.

Lacking in the new climate change treaty are emission control commitments by large developing countries, workable rules for international trading of emission allowances, a compliance mechanism, and long-term environmental goals, he said.

Robert Stavins, professor of public policy and chair of the environment and natural resources program at Harvard's Kennedy School of Government, likened the new climate change treaty to a foundation for a house.

Some renounce the Kyoto Protocol as too flawed to build future climate change policy upon, he said. Others declare it a firm basis for future action, Stavins continued. But he differed with both of those positions, saying that the treaty's problems must be remedied, but can be, at which point the protocol will provide a good foundation for future global policy.

Developing Countries

To improve the Kyoto Protocol, at least four developing countries need to accept greenhouse gas emission limitations, Stavins said. The four that must be included in the international effort to control these emissions are China, Brazil, India, and South Korea, he said.

Stavins said that, contrary to some arguments, economic analysis indicates that lack of developing country emission controls is unlikely to have significant impact on U.S. competitiveness. Instead, it is likely to drive up the costs of developing countries' future emission controls, he said.

If the industrialized world accepts emission controls but developing countries do not--as is the case currently under the Kyoto Protocol--energy-intensive industries are likely to shift to the developing world, Stavins said. Because these energy-intensive industries would be powered by fossil fuels, a major source of the greenhouse gas carbon dioxide, it would be harder and more expensive for developing countries to curb their emissions in the future, he said.

Emissions Trading Rules

Stavins said countries need to establish workable rules for international trading of greenhouse gases. The Kyoto Protocol provides for but does not lay out details of such a trading system.

Emissions trading among all industrialized nations would cut the cost of U.S. compliance with the Kyoto Protocol in half, Stavins said. Nations of the former Soviet bloc, especially Russia, are expected to have many offsets to sell since their greenhouse gas emissions have fallen along with their economies.

If the European Union makes good on its pledge not to participate in international emission trades while allocating emission rights among EU member states, U.S. compliance costs would be cut further, Stavins said. Trading among industrialized countries without EU participation would lower U.S. costs by 60 percent to 75 percent, he said.

In addition to the lowered price of compliance with the Kyoto Protocol due to emission trading among industrialized countries, U.S. costs will be cut by another 55 percent if key developing countries joined the trading system, Stavins said.

Claims that emission trading could cut U.S. compliance costs by 90 percent are "reasonable," he said.

Auction or Allocate Allowances?

Under the Kyoto Protocol's trading system, the U.S. government will have to distribute greenhouse gas allowances to domestic sources of these emissions. Policymakers will have to decide whether to auction the allowances or simply allocate them for free, Stavins said.

He suggested auctioning the allowances and using the revenues to reduce federal taxes on labor and investment.

Policymakers will feel pressure from organizations that will require many allowances to distribute these emission permits for free, Stavins acknowledged. But it is possible for a constituency favoring lower taxes to support government auction of allowances, he said.

Stavins spoke at a briefing for Capitol Hill staff members that was sponsored by the University Corporation for Atmospheric Research, a nonprofit corporation managed by more than 60 North American universities.

Francine P. Obermiller
07/01/97 04:52:45 PM

Record Type: Record

To: Jeffrey A. Frankel/CEA/EOP

cc:
Subject: Rob Stavins' Reply

SINCE YOU REALLY WANT HIM TO DO A BREAKFAST MEETING BUT DIDN'T WANT TO COME RIGHT OUT AND SAY IT, HOW DO YOU WANT ME TO RESPOND TO HIM?

---------------------- Forwarded by Francine P. Obermiller/CEA/EOP on 07/01/97 04:49 PM ---------------------------

Robert_Stavins/FS/KSG @ ksg.harvard.edu
07/01/97 03:08:00 PM

Record Type: Record

To: Francine P. Obermiller

cc:
Subject: Re: Message from Jeff Frankel

Francine,

I am tentatively scheduled to be in Washington on Friday, July 25th. I will be tied up from 8:30 am to about noon. If it works on Jeff's calendar, perhaps we might set a tentative meeting in his office for 1:00 pm. Let me know, please, if that's OK, and also how much time I should block out on my calendar.

Rob Stavins

Francine_P._Obermiller@oa.eop.gov on 07/01/97 04:55:00 PM

To: robert_stavins@harvard.edu
cc: (bcc: Robert Stavins/FS/KSG)
Subject: Message from Jeff Frankel

Message Creation Date was at 1-JUL-1997 15:55:00
If you're going to be in Washington in the near future, Jeff Frankel would like to talk to you concerning climate change. He may have some questions that
he would need to seek your advince on.
Please call me at 202-395-5046 if you will be traveling to Washington.
Thanks.

Name	Title/Affiliation	Background	Phone #	Fax #	Status
General/Nation-wide					
Kenneth Arrow **P**	Stanford University; Nobel Laureate	Economists' Statement	415/723-9165 (CA)		YES (JG)
Stephen DeCanio **PR**	UC Santa Barbara	Organized Economists' Statement; staff at CEA during Reagan Admin.	805/893-3130 (CA)	805/ 893-8830	YES (JG)
Dan Dudek **PRT**	Environmental Defense Fund	Emissions trading proponent	203/938-3392 (CT)	203/ 938-4172	YES (JG)
Ev Ehrlich **PRT** (also General)	President, ESC Company; directed Administration's economic analysis	Ex-Undersecretary of Commerce	202/347-3200 (DC)	202/ 347-4334	YES (JG)
Paul Krugman **PRT**	MIT	One of the crafters of the Economists' Statement	617/253-1551 (MA)	617/ 253-4096	left msg (JG)
John Palmisano **PR**	Enron Corp.	Emissions trading proponent	(TX)		in Bonn (JG)
Paul Portney	President, Resources for the Future, Washington, D.C.	Resource economist	202/328-5103 (DC)	202/ 939-3460	YES (JG)
Robert Repetto **PRT**	Senior Economist, World Resource Institute	Economists' Statement; authorized report explaining economic models related to climate	202/638-6300 (DC)	202/ 638-0036	YES (JG)
Richard Sandor **PRT**	President, Centre Financial; Vice chair, Chicago Board of Trade	Emissions trading of sulfur and carbon dioxide	(IL)		YES (JG, DF)
Robert Solow **PRT**	MIT, Cambridge MA; Nobel Laureate	Economists' Statement	617/253-5268 (MA)	617/ 253-0560	YES (JG)
Joseph Stiglitz **PRT**	Chief Economist, World Bank	Ex-chair of CEA; involved in economics section of IPCC; emissions trading, JI			
New England (CT, ME, MA, NH, RI, VT)					
Dan Dudek **PRT** (also in nation-wide)	Environmental Defense Fund	Emissions trading proponent	203/938-3392 (CT)	203/ 938-4172	YES (JG)
~~A. Myrick Freeman III~~	~~Bowdoin College~~	~~Economists' Statement; Air pollution benefits through the CAACC~~	(ME)		

1990
→
2010
peak
2015

Name	Title/Affiliation	Background	Phone #	Fax #	Status
Paul Krugman (also in nation-wide)	MIT	One of the crafters of Economists' Statement	617/253-1551 (MA)	617/ 253-4096	left msg (JG)
Richard Schmalensee	MIT	Economic benefits of action	617/253-2957 (MA)	617/ 258-6617	YES (JG)
Robert Solow (also in nation-wide)	MIT; Nobel Laureate	Economists' Statement	617/253-5268 (MA)	617/ 253-0560	YES (JG)
Robert Stavins	Harvard University, Kennedy School of Government	Economists' Statement; market-based approaches, likes taxes	617/495-1820 (MA)	617/ 495-1635	
~~Robert Evenson~~	~~Yale University~~	~~CEA, Economists' Statement~~	~~(CT)~~		
Paul Schultz Judi	Yale University	CEA, Economists' Statement	(CT)		
W. Kip Viscusi Judi	Harvard Law School	CEA, Economists' Statement; cost-benefit analyses	(MA)		
Gary Yohe	Wesleyan University	CEA, Economists' Statement; student of Nordhaus	(CT)		
New York/New Jersey:					
William J. Baumol	New York University	Economists' Statement	(NY)		
Alan Blinder	Princeton University, NJ Ex-member CEA		609/258-3358 (NJ)		YES (JG)
Mid-Atlantic (DE, DC, MD, PA, VA, WV)					
Maureen Cropper Jay	U of Maryland; Chair of Clean Air Act Compliance Analysis Council	Economists' Statement	(MD)		
Peggy Duxbury	Program Manager, Redefining Progress	Organization sponsored Economists' Statement; contact for other economists	202/588-8900 (DC)	202/ 588-9711	(JG)
Ev Ehrlich PRT (also in General & nation-wide)	President, ESC Company; directed Administration's economic analysis	Ex-Undersecretary of Commerce	202/347-3200 (DC)	202/ 347-4334	YES (JG)
Paul Faeth	World Resources Institute	Economists' Statement	(DC)		
Irving Mintzer PRT (also in General)	Ex-WRI and Center for Global Change; Washington D.C.	Generalist	301/587-8714 (MD)		YES (JG)
Paul Portney (also in nation-wide)	President, Resources for the Future, Washington, D.C.	Resource economist	202/328-5103 (DC)	202/ 939-3460	YES (JG)

Fwd by 2/10

Name	Title/Affiliation	Background	Phone #	Fax #	Status
Robert Repetto **PRT** (also in nation-wide)	Senior Economist, World Resource Institute	Economists' Statement; authorized report explaining economic models related to climate	202/638-6300 (DC)	202/ 638-0036	YES (JG)
Southeast (AL, FL, GA, KY, MS, NC, SC, TN)					
Philip J. Cook Judi	Duke University	CEA, Economists' Statement	(NC)		
Industrial Midwest (IL, IN, MI, MN, OH, WI)					
Richard Sandor (also in nation-wide)	President, Centre Financial; Vice chair, Chicago Board of Trade	Emissions trading of sulfur and carbon dioxide	(IL)		YES (JG, DF)
Paul N. Courant Judi	U of Michigan	CEA, Economists' Statement	(MI)		
Terry L. Roe Jay	U of Minnesota	CEA, Economists' Statement; resources, agriculture, water	(MN)		
Vernon W. Ruttan Jay	U of Minnesota	CEA, Economists' Statement; agriculture	(MN)		
South Central (AR, LA, NM, OK, TX)					
John Palmisano **PR** (also in nation-wide)	Enron Corp.	Emissions trading proponent	(TX)		in Bonn (JG)
Agricultural Midwest (IA, KS, MO, NE)					
John A. Miranowski Jay	Iowa State University	CEA, Economists' Statement; former USDA official	(IA)		
Southwest (AZ, CA, HI, NV, AS, GU)					
Kenneth Arrow (also in nation-wide)	Stanford University; Nobel Laureate	Economists' Statement	415/723-9165 (CA)		YES (JG)
Stephen DeCanio **PR** (also in nation-wide)	UC Santa Barbara	Organized Economists' Statement; staff at CEA during Reagan Admin.	805/893-3130 (CA)	805/ 893-8830	YES (JG)
Richard B. Norgaard	UC Berkeley	Economists' Statement	(CA)		
Trudy Ann Cameron Judi	UCLA	CEA, Economists' Statement	(CA)		
Robert T. Deacon Jay	UC Santa Barbara	CEA, Economists' Statement	(CA)		
Anthony Fisher Jay	UC Berkeley	CEA, Economists' Statement	(CA)		
Jack Hirshleifer Jay	UCLA	CEA, Economists' Statement	(CA)		
Gordon Rausser Judi	UC Berkeley Dean of Ag School	CEA, Economists' Statement; econometrics	(CA)		
Northwest (AK, ID, OR, WA)					

1990 by 2010
peak in 2015

Name	Title/Affiliation	Background	Phone #	Fax #	Status
Gardner Brown	U of Washington	Economists' Statement; biodiversity, endangered species	(WA)		
Emery N. Castle	Oregon State University	CEA, Economists' Statement	(OR)		
Uncertain					
Dallas Burtraw	Resources for the Future	Economists' Statement; emissions trading, market mechanisms			
Joseph Stiglitz **PRT** (also in nation-wide)	Chief Economist, World Bank	Ex-chair of CEA; involved in economics section of IPCC; emissions trading, JI			

Validators

Plan of attack • foreign policy types

SE call list
Sandalow + Anthony

VP - Sec State dinner

Ideal Committee to support —

- scientists
- economists
- public policy

Esty

JF 8/14/97

Economist candidates to invite to Oct. White House conference on GCC

more senior experts on GCC ~~2300~~

lead signers of letter

Bill Nordhaus
Dale Jorgenson

other signers of letter

Richard Schmalensee

other emininent who didn't sign
Bill Cline, IIF
Richard Cooper, Harvard

experts in GCC
not quite as senior/big name

signed letter
Stavins

couldn't find name on list
Goulder
Rutherford
McKibbin
Wilcoxen
Richels
Toman

some other eminent economists of 2300

Ken Arrow *
Paul Krugman
Robert Solow *

William Baumol, NYU
Max Corden, SAIS
Gerard Debreu, UCB *
Frank Fisher, MIT
Claudia Goldin, Harvard
Ned Gramlich, U.Mich/ FRB nom.
Lawrence Klein, U.Penn *
Anne Krueger, Stanford
Larry Katz, Harvard
Robert Litan, Brookings
Van Ooms, CED
Jeff Sachs
James Tobin *

John Harsanyi *
Wassily Leontief *
Franco Modigliani *

Stephen DeCanio
Robert Repetto

former Admin
Alan Blinder
Laura Tyson
Alicia Munnell
Ev Ehrlich
Joe Stiglitz

JF 8/14/97

<u>Economist candidates to invite to Oct. White House conference on GCC</u>

more senior experts on GCC some other eminent economists **of 2300**

lead signers of letter

Bill Nordhaus
Dale Jorgenson

Ken Arrow *
Paul Krugman
Robert Solow *

other signers of letter

Richard Schmalensee

William Baumol, NYU
Max Corden, SAIS
Gerard Debreu, UCB *
Frank Fisher, MIT
Claudia Goldin, Harvard
Ned Gramlich, U.Mich/ FRB nom.
Lawrence Klein, U.Penn *
Anne Krueger, Stanford
Larry Katz, Harvard
Robert Litan, Brookings
Van Ooms, CED
Jeff Sachs
James Tobin *

John Harsanyi *
Wassily Leontief *
Franco Modigliani *

Stephen DeCanio
Robert Repetto

other emininent who didn't sign
Bill Cline, IIF
Richard Cooper, Harvard

experts in GCC
not quite as senior/big name

signed letter
Stavins

couldn't find name on list
Goulder
Rutherford
McKibbin
Wilcoxen
Richels
Toman

former Admin
Alan Blinder
Laura Tyson
Alicia Munnell
Ev Ehrlich
Joe Stiglitz