

FOIA MARKER

**This is not a textual record. This is used as an
administrative marker by the William J. Clinton
Presidential Library Staff.**

Collection/Record Group: Clinton Presidential Records
Subgroup/Office of Origin: Council on Environmental Quality
Series/Staff Member: Kathleen (Katie) McGinty
Subseries:

OA/ID Number: 2892
FolderID:

Folder Title:
Tatshenshini

Stack:	Row:	Section:	Shelf:	Position:
S	61	5	11	2



PRIME MINISTER • PREMIER MINISTRE

January 22, 1993

PERSONAL

Dear Al,

Congratulations again on your remarkable achievement.

I write to report pursuant to your letter of September 30 expressing concern over the proposed Windy Craggy copper mine in the Alsek Tatshenshini Rivers' region of northern British Columbia.

While he was Canada's Ambassador to the United States, Mr. Derek Burney informed Senator Wirth that the Province of British Columbia has suspended its review of the proposed mine while a land use study is undertaken by the British Columbia Resources and Environment Commissioner. The study will determine whether mining is compatible with the wilderness character and other land uses in the region. No new claims or mine developments will be allowed in the region while the study goes forward.

The Commissioner's mandate includes full public consultation with all interested parties. On a recent visit to Washington, the Commissioner made it clear in briefings on Capitol Hill that your contribution would be most welcome. This process should be given the opportunity to function. Accordingly, in my view any decision on further action or review, including a possible reference to the International Joint Commission, is premature.

The Honorable Al Gore, Jr.
Vice-President of the United States of America
Washington, DC

Thank you for bringing your concerns to my attention. The Government will be watching closely the progress of the British Columbia land use study.

Yours sincerely,

*And wish every good wish
Budi - black water*

file

MEMORANDUM FOR THE PRESIDENT

FROM: KATIE MCGINTY

SUBJECT: THE WINDY CRAGGY COPPER MINE PROJECT ON THE TATSHENSHINI RIVER.
2-5-93

The Tatshenshini is considered the "most wild" river in North America. The river's headwaters are in the Yukon and it flows through British Columbia into Glacier Bay, Alaska.

The river supports a spectacular variety of wildlife, including the Glacier Grizzly bear, that is found only in this area. The river is currently threatened by a proposal by the Geddes Mining Company to open the largest open pit copper mine in the world on the banks of the Tat in British Columbia, at the "Windy Craggy" summit.

Over the past two years, Vice President Gore has played an active role in trying to stop the proposed mine. He has written to PM Mulroney expressing his concerns about the potential environmental impact of the mine. (Acid mine drainage would threaten fish species and a plan has not been developed that could ensure that toxic tailings could safely be contained. Moreover, to operate the mine, a road would have to be cut through this pristine area.)

Recent Developments:

On Dec. 14, Glacier Bay National Park and Preserve was designated by UNESCO's World Heritage Committee as a World Heritage Site. (Vice President Gore issued a statement commending this action and expressing his hope that this would mean an end to further consideration of the Geddes copper mine). Although this is essentially a superficial designation that expresses UNESCO's sense that this area is worthy of preservation for its beauty and cultural importance, this designation potentially affects the Windy Craggy project through obligations accorded governments who are signatories to the World Heritage Convention of 1972. Article 6 of that convention says that "Each States Party to this Convention undertakes not to take any deliberate measure which might damage directly or indirectly the cultural or natural heritage referred to in Articles 1 and 2 situated on the territory of other State Parties to this Convention".

Moreover, the British Columbia Resources and Environment minister recently undertook an assessment of the Geddes copper mine project and its potential environmental impacts. The Commission on Resources and Environment (CORE) Report on Tatshenshini/Alsek Land Use was issued on Jan 20. Among the

findings were:

- o International fisheries are at severe risk. U.S. and Canadian salmon runs were defined to be at severe risk from tailing and acid drainage, if the holding areas for exposed rock were disturbed. The report stated, "Exposed tailings left along stream and river banks after such a breach would continue to generate acidity and metals in solution indefinitely. Destruction of fish habitat would be essentially permanent."
- o Abandonment hazards. The report found that during long term abandonment at similar large scale mines, there is often no long term monitoring and maintenance of the site. As a result, the report concluded that, "It is not at all clear that the proposed long term mitigation will occur, as postulated, and the risk of acid rock drainage may well increase over time."
- o Watershed contamination. During sorting of the copper from wastes, the report found a high probability of acid waste reaching the Alsek river and leading to "chronic contamination of the Frobisher/Alsek watershed".
- o Costs versus benefits. The study undertook a benefit/cost analysis to assess the economic return to BC of the various land use options for the Tat area. The expected return to the province from the preservation of the area was \$410 million; the return of the mining alternative was \$360 million.

The conclusion of the report was that "the current mining plan poses substantial environmental risks." The Commissioner of this report has asked for a six month public comment period, to include both US and Canadian government and citizen's input on possible options for the BC government.

Your meeting has been receiving a considerable amount of press in Canada, much of which has focused on the Tat issue. Speculation is high among both the press -- especially in Canada -- and environmental groups over whether the Tat will be discussed in today's meeting with Prime Minister Mulroney. I understand that Mulroney has been extensively briefed on the Tat and may well mention the issue himself. I am attaching a recent letter from him on this subject.

Talking Points:

- o I understand the complex issues that surround the Windy Craggy copper mine proposal. Vice President Gore, our Environmental Protection Agency, and the Department of Interior have expressed concerns about the potential environmental impacts of the proposal.
- o PM Mulroney has been very responsive to those concerns, and I certainly appreciate the cooperation of the Canadian government

in this matter.

- o Most recently, the BC government issued a report on this project and called for a 6 month comment period to begin. They have invited our participation in this process.

- o I look forward to participating in this process and I will ask the Secretary of Interior, the Administrator of the EPA and other members of my team to make it a top priority.

fe

TO: The Vice President

FROM: Katie

SUBJECT: Possible Mention of Tatshenshini River in Mulroney Mtg.
2-4-93

Speculation is high among both the press -- especially in Canada -- and environmental groups over whether the Tat will be discussed in tomorrow's meeting with Prime Minister Mulroney. I understand that Mulroney has been extensively briefed on the Tat and may well mention the issue himself. I am attaching a recent letter from him on this subject.

You should know some of the latest details of the Tat. On Dec. 14, Glacier Bay National Park and Preserve was designated by UNESCO's World Heritage Committee as a World Heritage Site. (You issued a statement commending this action and expressing your hope that this meant an end to further consideration of the Geddes copper mine). Although this is essentially a superficial designation that expresses UNESCO's sense that this area is worthy of preservation for its beauty and cultural importance, this designation potentially affects the Windy Craggy project through obligations accorded governments who are signatories to the World Heritage Convention of 1972. Article 6 of that convention says that "Each States Party to this Convention undertakes not to take any deliberate measure which might damage directly or indirectly the cultural or natural heritage referred to in Articles 1 and 2 situated on the territory of other State Parties to this Convention".

Moreover, the British Columbia Resources and Environment minister recently undertook an assessment of the Geddes copper mine project and its potential environmental impacts. The Commission on Resources and Environment (CORE) Report on Tatshenshini/Alsek Land Use was issued on Jan 20. Among the findings were:

o International fisheries are at severe risk. U.S. and Canadian salmon runs were defined to be at severe risk from tailing and acid drainage, if the holding areas for exposed rock were disturbed. The report stated, "Exposed tailings left along stream and river banks after such a breach would continue to generate acidity and metals in solution indefinitely. Destruction of fish habitat would be essentially permanent."

o Abandonment hazards. The report found that during long term abandonment at similar large scale mines, there is often no long term monitoring and maintenance of the site. As a result, the report concluded that, "It is not at all clear that the proposed long term mitigation will occur, as postulated, and the risk of acid rock drainage may well increase over time."

o Watershed contamination. During sorting of the copper from wastes, the report found a high probability of acid waste reaching the Alsek river and leading to "chronic contamination of the Frobisher/Alsek watershed".

o Costs versus benefits. The study undertook a benefit/cost analysis to assess the economic return to BC of the various land use options for the Tat area. The expected return to the province from the preservation of the area was \$410 million; the return of the mining alternative was \$360 million.

The conclusion of the report was that "the current mining plan poses substantial environmental risks." The Commissioner of this report has asked for a six month public comment period, to include both US and Canadian government and citizen's input on possible options for the BC government.

Environmental groups are VERY concerned with the huge amount of press your meeting has been receiving in Canada. They fear that if the river is not mentioned in the President's discussion with Mulroney, this signals a retreat by Clinton from your earlier positions. They would like either you or the President to at least mention your continuing concern over the issue. Further, they would very much like to see a suggestion of bilateral negotiations to designate the Tat/Glacier Bay/Kuane National Park in the Yukon as the world's largest wilderness area.

Recommendation:

If the Tat does come up in the meeting, you should voice your support for the six month public comment period -- with the understanding that the US is still very concerned over the Tat and will fully participate and submit comments on the CORE report. A separate statement on this issue at a press conference is not advised.

Canadian Embassy



Ambassade du Canada

501 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20001

February 3, 1993

Mr. Roy Neel
Special Assistant to the President and
Chief of Staff to the Vice President
Office of the Vice President of the United States
Old Executive Office Building, Room 272
17th Street and Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20501

Dear Mr. Neel,

I am pleased to transmit to you the advance text of a letter from the Right Honourable Brian Mulroney, Prime Minister of Canada, to the Vice President of the United States regarding the proposed Windy Craggy mine. The original will follow shortly.

Further to the attached, one additional development has occurred which may be of interest. An interim report issued by the British Columbia Resources and Environment Commission on January 20 reviews the wilderness values and mining potential in the concerned area. It analyses the environmental, technical, economic and regulatory implications of three land use options identified - wilderness preservation, mining and a delayed decision. The Commissioner has recommended six months of public consultation, to include relevant United States interests, prior to the British Columbia Government making a decision on land use for the area.

We would be pleased to respond to any additional concerns about this issue.

Yours sincerely,

A handwritten signature in dark ink, appearing to read 'Marc A. Brault', followed by a horizontal line.

Marc A. Brault
Charge d'affaires, a.i.

Canadian Embassy



Ambassade du Canada

501 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20001

February 3, 1993

Mr. Roy Neel
Special Assistant to the President and
Chief of Staff to the Vice President
Office of the Vice President of the United States
Old Executive Office Building, Room 272
17th Street and Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20501

Dear Mr. Neel,

I am pleased to transmit to you the advance text of a letter from the Right Honourable Brian Mulroney, Prime Minister of Canada, to the Vice President of the United States regarding the proposed Windy Craggy mine. The original will follow shortly.

Further to the attached, one additional development has occurred which may be of interest. An interim report issued by the British Columbia Resources and Environment Commission on January 20 reviews the wilderness values and mining potential in the concerned area. It analyses the environmental, technical, economic and regulatory implications of three land use options identified - wilderness preservation, mining and a delayed decision. The Commissioner has recommended six months of public consultation, to include relevant United States interests, prior to the British Columbia Government making a decision on land use for the area.

We would be pleased to respond to any additional concerns about this issue.

Yours sincerely,

A handwritten signature in dark ink, appearing to read 'Marc A. Brault', written over a horizontal line.

Marc A. Brault
Charge d'affaires, a.i.



PRIME MINISTER • PREMIER MINISTRE

January 22, 1993

PERSONAL

Dear Al,

Congratulations again on your remarkable achievement.

I write to report pursuant to your letter of September 30 expressing concern over the proposed Windy Craggy copper mine in the Alsek Tatshenshini Rivers' region of northern British Columbia.

While he was Canada's Ambassador to the United States, Mr. Derek Burney informed Senator Wirth that the Province of British Columbia has suspended its review of the proposed mine while a land use study is undertaken by the British Columbia Resources and Environment Commissioner. The study will determine whether mining is compatible with the wilderness character and other land uses in the region. No new claims or mine developments will be allowed in the region while the study goes forward.

The Commissioner's mandate includes full public consultation with all interested parties. On a recent visit to Washington, the Commissioner made it clear in briefings on Capitol Hill that your contribution would be most welcome. This process should be given the opportunity to function. Accordingly, in my view any decision on further action or review, including a possible reference to the International Joint Commission, is premature.

The Honorable Al Gore, Jr.
Vice-President of the United States of America
Washington, DC

Thank you for bringing your concerns to my attention. The Government will be watching closely the progress of the British Columbia land use study.

Yours sincerely,

*And with every good wish
Budi - H. H. H. H. H.*

Canadian Embassy



Ambassade du Canada

501 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20001

February 3, 1993

Mr. Roy Neel
Special Assistant to the President and
Chief of Staff to the Vice President
Office of the Vice President of the United States
Old Executive Office Building, Room 272
17th Street and Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20501

Dear Mr. Neel,

I am pleased to transmit to you the advance text of a letter from the Right Honourable Brian Mulroney, Prime Minister of Canada, to the Vice President of the United States regarding the proposed Windy Craggy mine. The original will follow shortly.

Further to the attached, one additional development has occurred which may be of interest. An interim report issued by the British Columbia Resources and Environment Commission on January 20 reviews the wilderness values and mining potential in the concerned area. It analyses the environmental, technical, economic and regulatory implications of three land use options identified - wilderness preservation, mining and a delayed decision. The Commissioner has recommended six months of public consultation, to include relevant United States interests, prior to the British Columbia Government making a decision on land use for the area.

We would be pleased to respond to any additional concerns about this issue.

Yours sincerely,

A handwritten signature in dark ink, appearing to read 'Marc A. Brault', followed by a horizontal line.

Marc A. Brault
Charge d'affaires, a.i.



American Rivers

BY FAX

M E M O R A N D U M

To: Pam McElwee
From: Tom Cassidy
Date: February 2, 1993
Subject: Alsek-Tatshenshini River system

Enclosed is Tatshenshini Wild's preliminary extract of material from the new British Columbia Commission on Resources and Environment (CORE) Report of Tatshenshini / Alsek Land Use. The material is devastating to the proposed project.

Note that the risk to fisheries is identified as unavoidable, permanent or large-scale salmon habitat destruction once every 12 years. By itself, that prediction indicates probable violations of the Boundary Waters Treaty of 1909 and the World Heritage Convention of 1972, not to mention being contrary to spirit, if not the law of the Pacific Salmon Treaty.

As I mentioned, two copies of the report are on their way to me and I would be pleased to provide you with one of the reports.

If you have any questions about any of these Tatshenshini matters, please don't hesitate to give me a call. I have extensive background materials on all elements of the project, as well as analyses of the Boundary Waters Treaty's provisions for references to the International Joint Commission and a report on the legal ramifications of World Heritage Site designation.

Have fun.

enclosure

Post-It™ brand fax transmittal memo 7671		# of pages > 8
To Pam McElwee	From Tom Cassidy	
Co. The White House	Co. American Rivers	
Dept.	Phone # 542-6900	
Fax # 456-6231	Fax # 543-6142	

801 PENNSYLVANIA AVE., S.E.
SUITE 400
WASHINGTON, DC 20003
(202) 547-6900
(202) 543-6142 (FAX)



PHOTOCOPY
PRESERVATION

January 1993

**BRITISH COLUMBIA COMMISSION
ON RESOURCES AND ENVIRONMENT (CORE)
REPORT ON TATSHENSHINI / ALSEK LAND USE**

- Key Findings -

The following quotes highlight the findings of the B.C. Government's recently released CORE Interim Report on the Tatshenshini-Alsek. (Volume One - Report and Recommendations; Volume Two - Appendices) These indicate that the risks associated with the proposed transboundary Windy Craggy copper mine project are major and severe, and that exceptional resource and preservation values would be placed in jeopardy in Canada and the U.S. should the project be allowed to proceed by the B.C. Government. (Note: Bolding of key text has been added.)

PART I: RISKS OF PROPOSED WINDY CRAGGY PROJECT

1. International Fisheries At Severe Risk From Tailings Dams

"[The] estimate of risks of impacts on salmon indicate that events leading to severe impacts [would be expected] once every 12 years. These severe impacts would be associated with tailings dam failures ...they indicate a high probability of severe impacts in the watershed that could affect both Canadian and U.S. fish resources ..." (P. 98, Vol. I)

"Severe consequences on the environment [are defined as]:

- permanent or large-scale habitat destruction
- lethal to significant portion of population
- avoidance not possible" (P. 2-6, Vol. II)

"The risk assessment process identified 86 potential sources of environmental risk, of which 12 were considered to have potentially severe consequences... All 12 were associated with a potential breach of the tailings dam." (P. 76, Vol. I)

"The tailings and waste rock impoundment would be designed to store 124 million tonnes of tailings and 100 million tonnes of acid waste rock under four

metres of water. The impoundment would be created by the construction of two embankments [350' and 150' high in Upper Tats Creek valley, 15 miles east of the U.S. border]" (P. 59, Vol. I)

"A breach of the dams as a result of either earthquakes or other reasons (flooding and erosion) would cause tailings and water to flow into Tats and/or Noisy Creek and from there into the Tatshenshini or Alsek River. Exposed tailings left along stream and river banks after such a breach would continue to generate acidity and metals in solution indefinitely. Destruction of fish habitat would be essentially permanent." (P. 67, Vol. I)

"Although perpetual water cover prevents oxidation of acid-generating material, given the variety of natural forces characterizing the project area, it would remain a perpetual hazard in terms of dam stability and potential for tailings escaping through a breach." (P. 76, Vol. I)

2. Earthquake Hazards

PHOTOCOPY
PRESERVATION

"Historically, the area has registered some of the largest earthquakes in the history of the planet. Today it remains the most seismically active zone in Canada ..." (P. 28 & 29, Vol. I)

"In terms of both size and frequency of earthquakes, the Windy Craggy vicinity ranks among the most seismically active parts of the world." (P. 3-2, Vol. II)

3. Acid Rock Drainage (ARD) Hazards

"40% of the waste rock produced at the minesite would be acid generating because of its exceptionally high sulphide content." (P. 55, Vol. I)

"ARD is an accelerated form of metal leaching from rock...the potential high metal concentrations associated with ARD can be toxic to aquatic and terrestrial life... a detailed understanding of all relevant processes is probably decades or even centuries away. As a result, mining companies must depend on the relatively imperfect understanding now available for the prevention, prediction and control of ARD.

The potential release of contaminated water into the environment is the main risk presented by the open pit and underground components of the Windy Craggy project. A failure of the water management system to collect and handle sufficient water moving through the mine could lead to the release into the watersheds of acid-rock drainage (ARD) or metal-laden water, spilled hydrocarbons, or nutrients from explosives. Of particular concern is acid rock drainage, which occurs when sulphides in rock are exposed to the air (for example, by blasting) and oxidize, resulting in the release of low pH drainage, often high in dissolved heavy metals.

The [risk assessment] team identified the possibility that the system for collecting water and pumping it to the portal could fail as a result of human error, equipment failures, geologic events such as earthquakes, or contaminated water escaping through fractured rock." (P. 53, Vol. I)

"[The risk assessment process as undertaken for CORE] does not include possible detrimental actions, such as human errors, that have occurred during accidents with other technologies." (P. 2-2, Vol. II)

PHOTOCOPY PRESERVATION

4. Abandonment Hazards

"Some key components of the project must continue to perform their intended function in perpetuity. In particular, the tailings dams must remain perpetually functional in retaining both tailings and water if long term confinement of the tailings and prevention of ARD are to be assured. Perpetuity is indeed a very long time ..." (P. 2-13, Vol. II)

"As some key components of the Windy Craggy project, such as the tailings dams, must continue to function in perpetuity, it is recognized that some predictions of likelihood must be entirely speculative. For example the longevity of materials such as concrete is unknown, and biological, climatic, and geological forces may change significantly over time." (P. 50, Vol. I)

"During long term abandonment at mines, there is often no day-to-day monitoring and maintenance of mine walls and sump and pump equipment. Because of steep pit walls, slope unraveling will likely occur and continually expose fresh rock to potential oxidation. As a result, there is a higher potential for problems to develop and continue for some time during long term abandonment.

Geddes Resources Limited expects certain natural remediation events to occur which are critical to long term containment, such as the freezing of pit walls and the flooding of the lower pit and the eventual establishment of a glacier in the abandoned pit. The team did not find technical information to confirm whether these events will take place as postulated.

Geddes Resources Limited intends to place a plug in the underground portal to control water flow and initiate flooding ...In the past, portal plugs generally have had poor success due to leaks at the plug, leaks through enhanced fractures around the plug, and redirection of water flow to other discharge points. " (P. 5-5, Vol. II)

"It is not at all clear that the proposed long term mitigation will occur, as postulated, and the risk of acid rock drainage may well increase over time. (P. IV, Vol. II)

"Regular inspection and periodic repair of the dam after abandonment would likely mean that neither the impoundment site nor the access road for the Haines Highway could be abandoned as long as heavy equipment was needed for these tasks; and without abandonment, neither the site nor the transportation corridor would recover their wilderness character." (P. 76, Vol. I)

5. Glacier Waste Rock Dump Hazards

"It [is] most probable that some acid waste could reach the glacier dumps as a result of improper sorting. Any significant quantity of acid waste included in the dumps, which are approximately nine kilometers from the Alsek River, could generate acid and lead to chronic contamination of the Frobisher/Alsek watershed." (P. 55, Vol. I)

6. Transportation Corridor Problems

"The team noted that the following external conditions all contribute to the difficulty of building and operating the transportation corridor."

- i) **Rough Terrain:** *"...the team recognized a number of sections where grade and slope instability could create unfavourable conditions for both construction and operation of the road. It is believed that an average grade of 8% or 14% may be at, or close to, a safe limit. (P. 4-11, Vol. II) [NB. "The road is designed to a top grade of 12% or 21%"] (P. 4-10, Vol. II)*
- ii) **Remote Location:** *This will place a premium on self-sufficiency during construction and operation and will mean it may be difficult to marshal personnel and equipment to respond to any spills.*
- iii) **Seismic Conditions:** *In all areas of the corridor, especially in areas of active faults, design of bridges and burial of pipes must accommodate expected seismic activity to approved 'worst case' limits."* (P. 4-11, Vol. II)

7. Geddes Project Proposal is Unacceptable

"The current mining plan poses substantial environmental risks... Discussions with [B.C.] ministry representatives for the provincial mining review process suggest that the current plan would be unlikely to gain provincial approval. A dramatic redesign would likely be needed." (P. 65, Vol. II)

PHOTOCOPY
PRESERVATION

PART II: INTERNATIONAL IMPLICATIONS

1. United States Has Veto

"The United States government effectively has a veto power over this project because of the requirements for project licensing in the United States. Taken at face value, the potential benefits to the US seem to be low (one study estimated 17 jobs in Haines, Alaska as the benefits accruing to the United States.) The perceived risks of the project, however, are likely high, given concerns over acid rock drainage and the effects of seismic activity on the tailings dams." (P. 67, Vol. II)

The international implications are of major significance given the concerted opposition to mine development, together with broad-based Congressional and now Administration opposition." (P. 5, Vol. I)

2. World Heritage Convention & Glacier Bay National Park

"The lower Alsek River flows through Glacier Bay National Park, which in December 1992 was designated a World Heritage Site by the World Heritage Site Committee of UNESCO. This designation potentially affects regulatory approval of the Windy Craggy project through obligations placed on the Canadian government. As a signer of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, Canada is subject to Article 6, which provides that

"each State Party to this Convention undertakes not to take any deliberate measure which might damage directly or indirectly the cultural or natural heritage referred to in Articles 1 and 2 situated on the territory of other State Parties to this convention. "

This provides an opportunity for arguments to be made that potential environmental risks - for example, risks to fish habitat and migratory bears - associated with the Windy Craggy project may threaten attributes of Glacier Bay National Park, thus creating the possibility of breach of Article 6." (P. 83, Vol. I)

PHOTOCOPY
PRESERVATION

PART III: TATSHENSHINI / ALSEK PRESERVATION VALUES

1. International Significance

"Internationally and provincially significant special features include:

- *The Tatshenshini River, ranked one of the top wilderness rafting rivers in the world; no other river in British Columbia or Canada provides a similar length of wilderness experience from an interior to coast landscape.*
- *High numbers of grizzly bears, supported by an unusually lush habitat.*
- *Mount Fairweather, the highest point with the greatest topographic relief in British Columbia, and world-class mountaineering area.*
- *Several rare [bird and mammal] species to the province, and 45 of British Columbia's 600 rare plant species.*
- *The Blue Glacier Bear, a rare colour phase of the black bear, which may only occur in the lower Alsek River area.*
- *Fisheries resources, including salmon populations that support a commercial fishery in Alaska and are a critical food source for the area's high population of grizzly bears."* (Pages 36 & 37, Vol. I)

2. Biodiversity

PHOTOCOPY PRESERVATION

"The Coast Mountain range, through which the Alsek and Tatshenshini rivers flow, contains the largest non-polar icecap in the world and some of the biggest valley glaciers in Canada. The combination of the mild Pacific influence and the glacial history of the area has produced an exceptionally diverse range of biophysical conditions...the region contains habitats not found anywhere else in Canada." (P. 26, Vol. I)

"The Tatshenshini/Alsek area comprises three ecosections, including part of the Icefield Ranges, 90 percent of the Tatshenshini Basin, and the Alsek Ranges. There is currently no representation of any of these ecosections in British Columbia's protected areas..." (P. 26, Vol. I)

3. Grizzlies

"The Tatshenshini/Alsek area is one of the last strongholds of a thriving grizzly population in North America ...One of the best habitats for grizzlies in B.C. and Canada is Tats Creek... [i.e. the location of the proposed mine/mill site]" (P. 29, Vol. I)

4. Scenic Features

"The Tatshenshini River, Haines Highway corridor, Fairweather Mountain, Tarr Inlet and Turnback Canyon have been ranked as "Outstanding" in the B.C. Parks special features inventory, indicating provincial or international significance." (P. 28, Vol. I)

5. Tourism

"The overall tourism capability class for the Tatshenshini and Alsek river valleys is 'very high'" (P. 35, Vol. I)

PART IV: BENEFIT/COST VALUES: Preservation Vs. Mining Options

One of the studies contracted by CORE undertook a benefit/cost values study to assess the economic return to British Columbia of the various land use options for the Tatshenshini-Alsek. The conclusions of this assessment were:

- *"The expected return [to the province] from selecting the preservation alternative is \$410 million." (P. 55, Vol. II)*
- *"The overall expected value of the mining alternative [to the province] is estimated at -\$360 million." (P. 59, Vol. II)*

**PHOTOCOPY
PRESERVATION**

Post-It™ brand fax transmittal memo 7671		# of pages ▶ 2
To	Katie / Pam	From Tom Cassidy
Co		Co.
Dept.		Phone # 547 6900
Fax # 456-6231		Fax # 543 6142

BY FAX

M E M O R A N D U M

PHOTOCOPY
PRESERVATION

To: Katie McGinty, Pam McElwee
From: Tom Cassidy
Date: February 4, 1993
Subject: Friday's Meeting: End of the Day Update

Rumors fly and it is hard to know what to believe. If anything.

However, it is my understanding that the Prime Minister has been extensively briefed on Tatshenshini. The Prime Minister may well raise Tatshenshini himself, and take the position that British Columbia is undertaking a thorough review of the proposal, that governmental responsibility for the matter rests at the Provincial level, and that if the Province decides that mineral development is an appropriate land use for the area, then the Federal government will ensure that all international agreements will be fully honored.

The problem that remains with this explanation is that every governmental review of the fisheries and water quality impacts of the project has concluded that severe impacts to US downstream resources can be expected. Of course, the most recent, not to mention extensive analysis of project impacts is the BC CORE study, released on January 20. I have previously FAXED to Pam the extracts from the CORE report prepared by Tatshenshini Wild and Ric Careless. Perhaps the most important fact highlighted in that analysis is that unavoidable, permanent or large scale habitat destruction of salmon populations can be expected every 12 years as a result of tailings dam failures. By itself, that prediction demonstrates a clear violation of the Boundary Waters Treaty, and probable violations of both the Pacific Salmon Treaty and World Heritage Convention. The unavoidable reality is that the proposed Windy Craggy mine remains "an environmental nightmare."

Ideally, tomorrow's meeting presents the Clinton / Gore administration with an opportunity to initiate a truly historic process of cooperation between the two nations to create a landmark international protected area. The world-class values of this area are increasingly well-known, though we perhaps too often forget that this is not merely an "issue," the Tatshenshini is a spectacular and special wild land. The Alsek / Tatshenshini could become "the world's largest international wilderness area,"

McGinty, McElwee
February 4, 1993
Page 2

PHOTOCOPY
PRESERVATION

the "world's largest World Heritage Site," or the "first international biodiversity reserve." Whatever we may choose to call it, the first step is for Canada and the United States to agree that the internationally significant values of this spectacular region should be protected.

And, finally, on a very personal note, I'm very excited that Vice-President Gore has stepped forward on this issue. I remember when I first learned about this unpronounceable river over beer and Mexican food at a Juneau restaurant more than three years ago. Since then, American Rivers has invested significant resources into preserving the Tatshenshini, including naming it as one of the "Ten Most Endangered Rivers" each of the past three years. A key moment in the issue came last April when Senator Gore announced the introduction of SJR 290 at American Rivers' Endangered Rivers press conference.

Tomorrow promises to be another key day in our efforts to preserve the Tatshenshini. We are all fortunate to be involved in this issue. And I am confident that our efforts will result in preserving the Tatshenshini. The only question is whether the process will last years with persistent and unresolved threats to this spectacular natural area or whether governments can move forward with a creative vision of a future that will preserve this magnificent land of glaciers and grizzlies for future generations.

Thanks for all your efforts. Good luck. Have fun. Call on me if you need any additional assistance.

Katy M^c Ginty
Office of the Vice President

Re: Tatshenshini



URGENT
RIC CARELESS
Executive Director

Box 673, Gibsons, B.C. V0N 1V0
(604) 886-4632 Fax 886-3768

PROTECT NORTH AMERICA'S WILDEST RIVER

Katy:

PHOTOCOPY
PRESERVATION

This wasn't our doing. Canadian national press has come alive with speculation whether Tat will be raised when Clinton & Mulroney talk on Friday. Lot's of attention on it.

Now that this is happened if Tat isn't at least mentioned its going to be a major set-back for us with Federal Canada & B.C. Cabinets. T.V. (National) is saying this will determine U.S. especially Al's commitment.

Sorry it's happened this way, but is there anything you can do. Hope you can!
Ric.

(P.S. Tom Cassidy tells me CNN screening 5 minute piece on Tat on Friday Headline News + Earth Matters.)

Was
filmed down on 1st

Facsimile Cover Sheet

To: KATIE MCGINTY
: OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
Phone: (202) 456-6614
Fax: (202) 456-6231

From: Peter M. Enticknap
: TATSHENSHINI INTERNATIONAL
Phone: 907-766-2240
Fax: 907-766-2240

Date: 02/03/93
Pages including this ONE

**PHOTOCOPY
PRESERVATION**

Comments: I WAS ADVISED THE PRESIDENT WILL MEET WITH MULRONEY ON FRIDAY. CANADIAN PRESS REPORTS TAT ON AGENDA. OUR CREDIBILITY IS ON THE LINE IF THE ISSUE IS NOT RAISED. WOULD HELP ENORMOUSLY FOR PERMANENT PROTECTION IF PRESIDENT EXPRESSES CONCERN OVER THE ISSUE. CNN TO SHOW TAT FILM WE PRODUCED ON FRIDAY.
GEDDES RESOURCES LOBBYIST MEETING WITH STATE DEPT. AND OTHERS FOR SUPPORT. B.C. "CORE" REPORT VERY

upon himself to attend the conference on the taxpayer's behalf. "One of the things I come away with from here," Mr. Rae mused to our reporter, "is that Canada generally, Canadian governments, have to do a much better job."

Never let it be said that Mr. Rae has not done his part. The Premier left home with two avowed objectives: to pitch Ontario as a place to do business, and to shoot holes through the North American Free Trade Agreement. The possibility that the two might conflict — that it might not be the best token of your competitiveness to dwell upon the catastrophe Mr. Rae believes free trade has brought down upon the province — does not seem to have entered his mind.

Indeed, Mr. Rae did not flinch at engaging in a public slanging match with a

Mr. Rae is now back on native soil, where the province's deficit has grown to \$10.9 billion in the latest official count, more than cancelling out whatever slim progress the federal government has made against its own deficit. When not raising personal income taxes the feds have just finished lowering, or standing in the way of federal efforts to cut down interprovincial trade barriers, or demanding the federal government borrow more money so that his own government can borrow less, Mr. Rae plans to campaign across the country in coming months against federal economic policies in general.

We have just one piece of advice for the Premier. If you want to be Prime Minister, run for the job. Meantime, try to do better at the one you have.

Uxbridge, Ont., and has run it for approximately 100 years, first in Toronto and then in Uxbridge. Its solicitor is William Markle. Some of the Toronto Brothers taught and still teach at Uxbridge.

The article states that "The Archdiocese of St. John's is home to the infamous Mount Cashel orphanage, where hundreds of allegations of child abuse by the lay order that ran the institution resulted in eight convictions."

Farther down it states: "If [The Congregation of the Brothers of the Christian Schools, based in Toronto] ran the Uxbridge school [and Mount Cashel] and has neither agreed to join Ontario's Helpline fund nor set up any compensation package as the result of sexual abuse alleged to have been committed at Uxbridge."

These statements are outrageous. The Toronto Brothers have never had anything to

fortunate" (letter — Jan. 22). As a Grade 10 student, I already experience this phenomenon in many of my classes, and when de-streaming goes into effect next year, the new Grade 9 class will undoubtedly experience it to a far greater extent. Ms. Diamond also says that "everybody gains" from brighter students helping others. With this I vehemently disagree.

When a brighter student helps a less fortunate one, both students lose out. The student who receives help from her classmate does not receive the benefit of learning from the teacher, a trained professional who is wholly familiar with the topic. The brighter student does learn from teaching others, but she has as much right as any other student to learn new and challenging topics at school rather than rehashing old ones. (This is not to say, however, that one student helping another is not beneficial; it is when

Both the United States and Canadian governments have failed to develop high-quality publicly funded child-care systems. In Western Europe, in contrast, child care is widely available and used extensively by families from all social classes. The United States and Canada will both continue to miss the boat on constructing humane, productive societies until their governments recognize that all children require high-quality child care, which exploits neither families, children, nor those who care for them.

It will be interesting to note whether the message that U.S. President Bill Clinton's government's first embarrassment was created by Ms. Baird's need for child care will be taken seriously.

Martha Friendly, Chairwoman, Child Care Committee, National Action Committee on the Status of Women
Toronto

PHOTOCOPY
PRESERVATION

This has resulted in a media avalanche JEFFREY SIMPSON

How a tucked-away corner of B.C. may get on Friday's Washington agenda

OTTAWA

FIVE weeks after becoming Vice-President of the United States, Al Gore made his first pronouncement on his field of specialty, the environment. His target: a proposed Canadian mine in the northwestern corner of British Columbia.

Mr. Gore was hailing the designation of Glacier Bay National Park on the Alaskan panhandle as a world heritage site. A moment later, he suggested this designation should encourage Canada to designate the Tatshenshini and Alsek river basins as a wilderness area.

By implication, such a designation would kill prospects for a copper mine at Windy Craggy mountain. That mine has been proposed by Geddes Resources, which claims the ore body is among the richest anywhere, enough to supply 1 per cent of the world's copper needs for two decades.

Windy Craggy will not be formally on the agenda Friday when Prime Minister Brian Mulroney meets President Bill Clinton. But given Mr. Gore's interest in it, and his role as the administration's top environmental spokesman, Mr. Mulroney should not be surprised if the issue comes up.

Windy Craggy sits in an uninhabited corner of B.C., as far from Vancouver and the Alberta border as you can get. Just south of Yukon, it is almost surrounded on three sides by Alaska. Most Canadians have never heard of the area, let alone visited it. Each year, about 1,000 rafters head down the Tatshenshini River, and that's the way a Vancouver-based group called Tatshenshini Wild wants things to remain.

With other environmental groups in Canada, and big U.S. groups such as the Sierra Club, Tatshenshini Wild has tried to pressure the federal and provincial governments to keep the area pristine. U.S. groups now

list preservation of the Tatshenshini watershed as one of their top three priorities in North America (killing James Bay 2 in northern Quebec being another).

Al Gore is, of course, the environmentalists' champion. Last spring, while still a senator, he co-sponsored a resolution in Congress urging reference of the Windy Craggy development to the International Joint Commission. If the northwestern corner of B.C. were declared wilderness, he claimed, it could be combined with Kuane National Park in Yukon and the Wrangell-St. Elias and Glacier Bay national parks in Alaska to create the world's largest wilderness park.

The Windy Craggy promoters, however, say their development will require only a small portion of the land in dispute. They claim their road and pipeline can be built without damaging the environment. And, of course, they point to jobs in northern B.C., southern Yukon and Alaska — espe-

cially the town of Haines, where the ore would be transhipped.

The Alaskan government and Alaska's representatives in the U.S. Senate and House agree with Geddes. They want development to proceed, partly for the potential benefits and partly for the precedent of developing other mine sites along the Alaska panhandle.

Windy Craggy's biggest headache is how to dispose of masses of excess rock left behind after the ore is extracted. Exposed to oxygen, this rock leaks acid that can wind up in rivers, killing fish kilometres downstream. Windy Craggy also sits in a seismic area between two major fault systems.

Geddes claims it can store the rock, covered by many feet of water, behind huge restraining walls. Under water, air can't get at it to start the acid leaching. Doubters, who include NDP MP Jim Fulton (Skeena), say similar efforts at another mine in

northern British Columbia have failed.

The B.C. government, caught between mining interests and environmentalists, has sent the proposal for a year-long land-use study. A preliminary report outlined the obvious options: a wilderness area, mining, or further delay. Chances are the final report will steer a middle path, leaving the government with the option of declaring the area a wilderness zone — and compensating the company — or authorizing a federal-provincial environmental assessment.

If B.C. chooses the assessment route, it will be a five-ringed circus with Ottawa, B.C., the United States, Geddes and the environmentalists all pitching in. Given the passions involved and the labyrinthine assessment procedures in Canada, my guess is that Windy Craggy will be fought every step of the way.

Who knows? Maybe even Al Gore himself might like to make a submission.

CANADA'S NATIONAL NEWSPAPER

THE GLOBE AND MAIL

149th year, No. 44,665 ©1993

Toronto, Wednesday, February 3, 1993

50 cents GST included in price Higher outside rates apply ☐ Sunny periods. High 3

JEFFREY SIMPSON

How a tucked-away corner of B.C. may get on Friday's Washington agenda

OTTAWA

FIVE weeks after becoming Vice-President of the United States, Al Gore made his first pronouncement on his field of specialty, the environment. His target: a proposed Canadian mine in the northwestern corner of British Columbia.

Mr. Gore was hailing the designation of Glacier Bay National Park on the Alaskan panhandle as a world heritage site. A moment later, he suggested this designation should encourage Canada to designate the Tatshenshini and Alsek river basins as a wilderness area.

By implication, such a designation would kill prospects for a copper mine at Windy Craggy mountain. That mine has been proposed by Geddes Resources, which claims the ore body is among the richest anywhere, enough to supply 1 per cent of the world's copper needs for two decades.

Windy Craggy will not be formally on the agenda Friday when Prime Minister Brian Mulroney meets President Bill Clinton. But given Mr. Gore's interest in it, and his role as the administration's top environmental spokesman, Mr. Mulroney should not be surprised if the issue comes up.

Windy Craggy sits in an uninhabited corner of B.C., as far from Vancouver and the Alberta border as you can get. Just south of Yukon, it is almost surrounded on three sides by Alaska. Most Canadians have never heard of the area, let alone visited it. Each year, about 1,000 rafters head down the Tatshenshini River, and that's the way a Vancouver-based group called Tatshenshini Wild wants things to remain.

With other environmental groups in Canada, and big U.S. groups such as the Sierra Club, Tatshenshini Wild has tried to pressure the federal and provincial governments to keep the area pristine. U.S. groups now

list preservation of the Tatshenshini watershed as one of their top three priorities in North America (killing James Bay 2 in northern Quebec being another).

Al Gore is, of course, the environmentalists' champion. Last spring, while still a senator, he co-sponsored a resolution in Congress urging reference of the Windy Craggy development to the International Joint Commission. If the northwestern corner of B.C. were declared wilderness, he claimed, it could be combined with Kuane National Park in Yukon and the Wrangell-St. Elias and Glacier Bay national parks in Alaska to create the world's largest wilderness park.

The Windy Craggy promoters, however, say their development will require only a small portion of the land in dispute. They claim their road and pipeline can be built without damaging the environment. And, of course, they point to jobs in northern B.C., southern Yukon and Alaska — espe-

cially the town of Haines, where the ore would be transhipped.

The Alaskan government and Alaska's representatives in the U.S. Senate and House agree with Geddes. They want development to proceed, partly for the potential benefits and partly for the precedent of developing other mine sites along the Alaska panhandle.

Windy Craggy's biggest headache is how to dispose of masses of excess rock left behind after the ore is extracted. Exposed to oxygen, this rock leaks acid that can wind up in rivers, killing fish kilometres downstream. Windy Craggy also sits in a seismic area between two major fault systems.

Geddes claims it can store the rock, covered by many feet of water, behind huge restraining walls. Under water, air can't get at it to start the acid leaching. Doubters, who include NDP MP Jim Fulton (Skeena), say similar efforts at another mine in

northern British Columbia have failed.

The B.C. government, caught between mining interests and environmentalists, has sent the proposal for a year-long land-use study. A preliminary report outlined the obvious options: a wilderness area, mining, or further delay. Chances are the final report will steer a middle path, leaving the government with the option of declaring the area a wilderness zone — and compensating the company — or authorizing a federal-provincial environmental assessment.

If B.C. chooses the assessment route, it will be a five-ringed circus with Ottawa, B.C., the United States, Geddes and the environmentalists all pitching in. Given the passions involved and the labyrinthine assessment procedures in Canada, my guess is that Windy Craggy will be fought every step of the way.

Who knows? Maybe even Al Gore himself might like to make a submission.

PHOTOCOPY
PRESERVATION

PHOTOCOPY
PRESERVATION

PHOTOCOPY
PRESERVATION

Post-It™ brand fax transmittal memo 7671		# of pages ▶ 4
To	Katie / Pam	
From	Tom Cassidy	
Co.	Co.	
Dept.	Phone # 547 6900	
Fax # 456-6231	Fax # 543-6142	

American Rivers

BY FAX

MEMORANDUM

**PHOTOCOPY
PRESERVATION**

To: Katie McGinty, Pam McElwee
 From: Tom Cassidy
 Date: February 4, 1993
 Subject: Friday's Meeting Between President Clinton and Prime Minister Mulroney

Enclosed is a copy of a column that appeared on the editorial page of yesterday's Globe and Mail, Canada's leading newspaper, concerning Vice-President Gore's views on Windy Craggy and Friday's meeting. As I described to Pam yesterday, I have received several calls from Canadian press seeking additional information and statements related to Friday's meeting. I have not yet received any press clips from today's Canadian newspapers, but I am working on that. I know that at least one story is being prepared for tomorrow's papers by Canada's leading wireservice.

Also, as I described to Pam, purely by coincidence, CNN will run an "Earth Matters" segment on Tatshenshini Friday at 9:00 am, 2:00 pm and 8:00 pm. The segment will include separate interviews with me and the President of Geddes. We are also told there is strong probability the story will run on Headline News.

We think there is an increasing probability that the media, particularly in Canada, will focus upon whether the Vice-President's commitments to preserve the Alsek / Tatshenshini River system and Glacier Bay National Park will be raised in Friday's meetings. The CNN coverage increases dramatically that possibility.

We have several concerns.

First, we obviously want the Tatshenshini to be raised during the meeting. We are told by our best sources in the Canadian government that whether Tatshenshini is raised will indicate the seriousness with which this issue is viewed by the Administration. The emerging Canadian press coverage seems to confirm this. We believe that the meeting Friday affords a unique and important opportunity for the new Administration signal its commitment to preserve Glacier Bay National Park from the "environmental nightmare" of Windy Craggy. And, every US and Canadian agency that has reviewed the proposal, including the recent BC government study, confirms the great risk of

801 PENNSYLVANIA AVE., S.E.
 SUITE 400
 WASHINGTON, DC 20003
 (202) 547-6900
 (202) 543-6142 (FAX)

**PHOTOCOPY
PRESERVATION**

McGinty, McElwee
February 4, 1993
Page 2

devastating impact to US resources by the proposed mine.

Last year's legislative initiatives would have initiated a process of bilateral negotiation to protect the entire Alsek / Tatshenshini watershed. Friday's meeting affords the two governments the opportunity to continue the Vice-Presidents's initiatives and begin these discussions, directed towards the creation of the largest international wilderness and biodiversity reserve.

Second, we are concerned that the press not twist a non-statement on the Tatshenshini into a conclusion that the Administration is retreating from the Vice-President's positions and last year's legislative initiative.

Finally, we want to give you a "heads up" that we intend to contact select press contacts to apprise them that Tatshenshini may be raised on Friday.

If I can assist you in any way, please do not hesitate to give me a call. Randy Showstack, our Director of Communications, is also contacting Marla Romash by memorandum, a copy of which is enclosed.

enclosures



PHOTOCOPY
PRESERVATION

M E M O R A N D U M

BY FAX

TO: Marla Romash, Vice-President Gore's Office
FROM: Randy Showstack
RE: Tatshenshini River
DATE: February 4, 1993

During President Clinton's meeting with Canadian Prime Minister Mulroney on Friday, we understand that there is a possibility they may discuss the issue of the enormous and ecologically destructive copper mine proposed for near the confluence of the Tatshenshini and Alsek Rivers.

Over the past several days, we have received media inquiries about the Tatshenshini from CNN and elsewhere. CNN has produced a story about the Tatshenshini, and plans to air it several times throughout the day on Friday. Yesterday's Globe and Mail carried the story, "How a tucked-away corner of B.C. may get on Friday's Washington agenda"; I am faxing you a copy of this.

As you are aware, Vice-President Gore appeared with American Rivers in April 1992 to announce his introduction of a joint resolution in Congress to protect the Alsek and Tatshenshini River System from the proposed copper mine. In December 1992, he issued a statement supporting the UNESCO World Heritage Committee's decision to designate Alaska's Glacier Bay National Park and Preserve as a World Heritage Site.

American Rivers would like to work with you as this issue develops over the next few days. We stand ready to provide you, and the media, with any necessary materials. We also intend to inform the media that this issue could be discussed during President Clinton's meeting with Prime Minister Mulroney.

Tom Cassidy, American Rivers' General Counsel and expert on Alaska rivers issues is also faxing a memorandum to Katie McInty and Pam McElwee; a copy of that memo also is being sent to you. I look forward to speaking with you today.

801 PENNSYLVANIA AVE., S.E.
SUITE 400
WASHINGTON, DC 20003
(202) 547-6900
(202) 543-6142 (FAX)



a member of Earth Share



January 1993

**BRITISH COLUMBIA COMMISSION
ON RESOURCES AND ENVIRONMENT (CORE)
REPORT ON TATSHENSHINI / ALSEK LAND USE**

- Key Findings -

The following quotes highlight the findings of the B.C. Government's recently released CORE Interim Report on the Tatshenshini-Alsek. (Volume One - Report and Recommendations; Volume Two - Appendices) These indicate that the risks associated with the proposed transboundary Windy Craggy copper mine project are major and severe, and that exceptional resource and preservation values would be placed in jeopardy in Canada and the U.S. should the project be allowed to proceed by the B.C. Government. (Note: Bolding of key text has been added.)

PART I: RISKS OF PROPOSED WINDY CRAGGY PROJECT

1. International Fisheries At Severe Risk From Tailings Dams

"[The] estimate of risks of impacts on salmon indicate that events leading to severe impacts [would be expected] once every 12 years. These severe impacts would be associated with tailings dam failures ...they indicate a high probability of severe impacts in the watershed that could affect both Canadian and U.S. fish resources ..." (P. 96, Vol. I)

"Severe consequences on the environment [are defined as]:

- permanent or large-scale habitat destruction*
- lethal to significant portion of population*
- avoidance not possible"* (P. 2-6, Vol. II)

"The risk assessment process identified 86 potential sources of environmental risk, of which 12 were considered to have potentially severe consequences... All 12 were associated with a potential breach of the tailings dam." (P. 76, Vol. I)

"The tailings and waste rock impoundment would be designed to store 124 million tonnes of tailings and 100 million tonnes of acid waste rock under four

metres of water. The impoundment would be created by the construction of two embankments [350' and 150' high in Upper Tats Creek valley, 15 miles east of the U.S. border]" (P. 59, Vol. I)

"A breach of the dams as a result of either earthquakes or other reasons (flooding and erosion) would cause tailings and water to flow into Tats and/or Noisy Creek and from there into the Tatshenshini or Alsek River. Exposed tailings left along stream and river banks after such a breach would continue to generate acidity and metals in solution indefinitely. Destruction of fish habitat would be essentially permanent..." (P. 67, Vol. I)

"Although perpetual water cover prevents oxidation of acid-generating material, given the variety of natural forces characterizing the project area, it would remain a perpetual hazard in terms of dam stability and potential for tailings escaping through a breach." (P. 76, Vol. I)

2. Earthquake Hazards

"Historically, the area has registered some of the largest earthquakes in the history of the planet. Today it remains the most seismically active zone in Canada ..." (P. 28 & 29, Vol. I)

"In terms of both size and frequency of earthquakes, the Windy Craggy vicinity ranks among the most seismically active parts of the world." (P. 3-2, Vol. II)

3. Acid Rock Drainage (ARD) Hazards

"40% of the waste rock produced at the minesite would be acid - generating because of its exceptionally high sulphide content." (P. 55, Vol. I)

"ARD is an accelerated form of metal leaching from rock...the potential high metal concentrations associated with ARD can be toxic to aquatic and terrestrial life... a detailed understanding of all relevant processes is probably decades or even centuries away. As a result, mining companies must depend on the relatively imperfect understanding now available for the prevention, prediction and control of ARD.

The potential release of contaminated water into the environment is the main risk presented by the open pit and underground components of the Windy Craggy project. A failure of the water management system to collect and handle sufficient water moving through the mine could lead to the release into the watersheds of acid-rock drainage (ARD) or metal-laden water, spilled hydrocarbons, or nutrients from explosives. Of particular concern is acid - rock drainage, which occurs when sulphides in rock are exposed to the air (for example, by blasting) and oxidize, resulting in the release of low pH drainage, often high in dissolved heavy metals.

The [risk assessment] team identified the possibility that the system for collecting water and pumping it to the portal could fail as a result of human error, equipment failures, geologic events such as earth quakes, or contaminated water escaping through fractured rock." (P. 53, Vol. I)

"[The risk assessment process as undertaken for CORE] does not include possible detrimental actions, such as human errors, that have occurred during accidents with other technologies." (P. 2-2, Vol. II)

4. Abandonment Hazards

"Some key components of the project must continue to perform their intended function in perpetuity. In particular, the tailings dams must remain perpetually functional in retaining both tailings and water if long term confinement of the tailings and prevention of ARD are to be assured. Perpetuity is indeed a very long time ..." (P. 2-13, Vol. II)

"As some key components of the Windy Craggy project, such as the tailings dams, must continue to function in perpetuity, it is recognized that some predictions of likelihood must be entirely speculative. For example the longevity of materials such as concrete is unknown, and biological, climatic, and geological forces may change significantly over time." (P. 50, Vol. I)

"During long term abandonment at mines, there is often no day-to-day monitoring and maintenance of mine walls and sump and pump equipment. Because of steep pit walls, slope unraveling will likely occur and continually expose fresh rock to potential oxidation. As a result, there is a higher potential for problems to develop and continue for some time during long term abandonment.

Geddes Resources Limited expects certain natural remediation events to occur which are critical to long term containment, such as the freezing of pit walls and the flooding of the lower pit and the eventual establishment of a glacier in the abandoned pit. The team did not find technical information to confirm whether these events will take place as postulated.

Geddes Resources Limited intends to place a plug in the underground portal to control water flow and initiate flooding ...In the past, portal plugs generally have had poor success due to leaks at the plug, leaks through enhanced fractures around the plug, and redirection of water flow to other discharge points. " (P. 5-5, Vol. II)

"It is not at all clear that the proposed long term mitigation will occur, as postulated, and the risk of acid rock drainage may well increase over time. (P. IV, Vol. II)

"Regular inspection and periodic repair of the dam after abandonment would likely mean that neither the impoundment site nor the access road for the Haines Highway could be abandoned as long as heavy equipment was needed for these tasks; and without abandonment, neither the site nor the transportation corridor would recover their wilderness character. " (P. 76, Vol. I)

5. Glacier Waste Rock Dump Hazards

"It [is] most probable that some acid waste could reach the glacier dumps as a result of improper sorting. Any significant quantity of acid waste included in the dumps, which are approximately nine kilometers from the Alsek River, could generate acid and lead to chronic contamination of the Frobisher/Alsek watershed." (P. 55, Vol. I)

6. Transportation Corridor Problems

"The team noted that the following external conditions all contribute to the difficulty of building and operating the transportation corridor.

- i) Rough Terrain: "...the team recognized a number of sections where grade and slope instability could create unfavourable conditions for both construction and operation of the road. It is believed that an average grade of 8" or 14% may be at, or close to, a safe limit (P. 4-11, Vol. II) [NB. "The road is designed to a top grade of 12" or 21%"] (P. 4-10, Vol. II)*
- ii) Remote Location: This will place a premium on self-sufficiency during construction and operation and will mean it may be difficult to marshal personnel and equipment to respond to any spills.*
- iii) Seismic Conditions: In all areas of the corridor, especially in areas of active faults, design of bridges and burial of pipes must accommodate expected seismic activity to approved 'worst case' limits." (P. 4-11, Vol. II)*

7. Geddes Project Proposal is Unacceptable

"The current mining plan poses substantial environmental risks... Discussions with [B.C.] ministry representatives for the provincial mining review process suggest that the current plan would be unlikely to gain provincial approval. A dramatic redesign would likely be needed. " (P. 65, Vol. II)

PART II: INTERNATIONAL IMPLICATIONS

1. United States Has Veto

"The United States government effectively has a veto power over this project because of the requirements for project licensing in the United States. Taken at face value, the potential benefits to the US seem to be low (one study estimated 17 jobs in Haines, Alaska as the benefits accruing to the United States.) The perceived risks of the project, however, are likely high, given concerns over acid rock drainage and the effects of seismic activity on the tailings dams." (P. 67, Vol. II)

The international implications are of major significance given the concerted opposition to mine development, together with broad-based Congressional and now Administration opposition." (P. 5, Vol. I)

2. World Heritage Convention & Glacier Bay National Park

{ The lower Alsek River flows through Glacier Bay National Park, which in December 1992 was designated a World Heritage Site by the World Heritage Site Committee of UNESCO. This designation potentially affects regulatory approval of the Windy Craggy project through obligations placed on the Canadian government. As a signer of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, Canada is subject to Article 6, which provides that

re: development { "each State Party to this Convention undertakes not to take any deliberate measure which might damage directly or indirectly the cultural or natural heritage referred to in Articles 1 and 2 situated on the territory of other State Parties to this convention. "

This provides an opportunity for arguments to be made that potential environmental risks - for example, risks to fish habitat and migratory bears - associated with the Windy Craggy project may threaten attributes of Glacier Bay National Park, thus creating the possibility of breach of Article 6." (P. 83, Vol. I)

PART III: TATSHENSHINI / ELSEK PRESERVATION VALUES

1. International Significance

"Internationally and provincially significant special features include:

- The Tatshenshini River, ranked one of the top wilderness rafting rivers in the world; no other river in British Columbia or Canada provides a similar length of wilderness experience from an interior to coast landscape.*
- High numbers of grizzly bears, supported by an unusually lush habitat..*
- Mount Fairweather, the highest point with the greatest topographic relief in British Columbia, and world-class mountaineering area.*
- Several rare [bird and mammal] species to the province, ...and 45 of British Columbia's 600 rare plant species.*
- The Blue Glacier Bear, a rare colour phase of the black bear, which may only occur in the lower Alsek River area.*
- Fisheries resources, including salmon populations that support a commercial fishery in Alaska and are a critical food source for the area's high population of grizzly bears." (Pages 36 & 37, Vol. I)*

2. Biodiversity

"The Coast Mountain range, through which the Alsek and Tatshenshini rivers flow, contains the largest non-polar icecap in the world and some of the biggest valley glaciers in Canada. The combination of the mild Pacific influence and the glacial history of the area has produced an exceptionally diverse range of biophysical conditions...the region contains habitats not found anywhere else in Canada. " (P. 26, Vol. I)

"The Tatshenshini/Alsek area comprises three ecosections, including part of the Icefield Ranges, 90 percent of the Tatshenshini Basin, and the Alsek Ranges. There is currently no representation of any of these ecosections in British Columbia's protected areas..." (P. 26, Vol. I)

3. Grizzlies

"The Tatshenshini/Alsek area is one of the last strongholds of a thriving grizzly population in North America ...One of the best habitats for grizzlies in B.C. and Canada is Tats Creek... [i.e. the location of the proposed mine/mill site]" (P. 29, Vol. I)

4. Scenic Features

"The Tatshenshini River, Haines Highway corridor, Fairweather Mountain, Tarr Inlet and Turnback Canyon have been ranked as "Outstanding" in the B.C. Parks special features inventory, indicating provincial or international significance." (P. 28, Vol. I)

5. Tourism

"The overall tourism capability class for the Tatshenshini and Alsek river valleys is 'very high'" (P. 35, Vol. I)

PART IV: BENEFIT/COST VALUES: Preservation Vs. Mining Options

One of the studies contracted by CORE undertook a benefit/cost values study to assess the economic return to British Columbia of the various land use options for the Tatshenshini-Alsek. The conclusions of this assessment were:

- *"The expected return [to the province] from selecting the preservation alternative is \$410 million." (P. 55, Vol. II)*
 - *"The overall expected value of the mining alternative [to the province] is estimated at -\$360 million." (P. 59, Vol. II)*
-