

1 So I think we'd better --

2 DR. GORDON: That's an interesting question.

3 MR. CHAPPELL: Yes. I mean, my image of
4 Western medicine is the sole practitioner with a
5 shingle. I am the doctor. I choose this doctor. It's
6 my primary doctor and so on. But I think the consumer
7 who is driving CAM thinks of the source as the wellness
8 center.

9 DR. GORDON: I don't know, because there are
10 not so many of them as one might like.

11 What I see, and our town meetings will tell
12 us a lot more about this. What I see practicing here
13 in Washington, D.C. and what many of my colleagues see
14 is that for the most part people are going here and
15 there and everywhere without much guidance, without
16 much central -- I see you're nodding your head.

17 MR. CHAPPELL: Yes.

18 DR. GORDON: And people are calling up all the
19 time saying what should I do, where should I go. If
20 you can't see me, tell me where I should go because I
21 don't have a clue.

22 MR. CHAPPELL: And the resolution to that in
23 the marketplace would be a health center.

24 DR. BERNIER: Without walls or with?

25 MR. CHAPPELL: Both. Without walls on the

1 internet and with walls in the community.

2 DR. GORDON: Other comments about this?

3 Effie and then Bill.

4 MS. CHOW: To go back to the concept of CAM.
5 Oftentimes we're talking about CAM as if it's another
6 modality. CAM is a way of life. Most of the CAM
7 practices foster a way of life. And so we've got to
8 keep remembering that. And you cannot preach CAM unless
9 you've practiced CAM fully.

10 Again, you said a walk through walk instead
11 of just talking the walk.

12 So I think we need to keep that in mind all
13 the time so that we're not talking about teaching the
14 practitioners, and you broached that, to just deal with
15 their clients. It's teaching the practitioners to
16 really be what they're going to practice and learn to
17 touch their clients in talking and look them in the eye
18 and be close to them.

19 I mean, you sit here like this and your
20 language is like -- okay. I'm helping you. And you
21 know, the energy flows this way and this way but energy
22 flows that way. And just that body language. The
23 doctors, the nurses, everybody should learn something
24 about. And just the touch. It makes so much
25 difference. And oftentimes that's what the patients

1 need.

2 I call them clients because they have a right
3 to information and make a decision as to what they want
4 to do, die or live. And you help them die well.

5 I was mentioning that in helping people die
6 well, suddenly they realize they haven't been living
7 and they suddenly decide they want to live. And that
8 has often happened with our people.

9 And so therefore, we have to look at
10 education for helping the practitioners to live a
11 better life. Therefore, they can be examples to their
12 patients and then, knowing that, they can advise or
13 references. They don't have to teach the patients but
14 being an example of being less stressful. Therefore,
15 their energy will affect their client better if they're
16 not chewing or something like that, or fiddling or et
17 cetera.

18 And so then we have to talk about education
19 to the real practitioners a lot more intensive and then
20 qualify what that education might be. And then the
21 informational aspect, what that might be.

22 So there's different levels, I think, but
23 definitely I want to bring back that vision that CAM is
24 a living essence, not another practice.

25 DR. GORDON: Are we all on accord on this? I

1 think we've got it. And I think this is important.

2 One of the things we want to do is see --
3 perhaps look at programs, maybe yours, maybe mine,
4 maybe other peoples' where we're actually doing this
5 with health professionals in their educational
6 settings.

7 MS. CHOW: Just another -- one example. It's
8 really great.

9 DR. GORDON: Effie, I actually want to move a
10 bit if we can.

11 MS. CHOW: Can I just give this one?

12 DR. GORDON: Okay. A quick one.

13 MS. CHOW: Because this program in Wichita,
14 Kansas, the Center for Improvement of Human Function,
15 they give wellness days. I talk about wellness days.
16 But they are actually giving six wellness days a year
17 and they don't send flower or anything to people if
18 they end up sick or in a hospital. But when they come
19 out of the hospital they send them flower and notes.
20 And it's actually in practice.

21 DR. GORDON: Bill's next. Then Joe. I don't
22 know if anybody over here --

23 DR. FAIR: I was glad that Tom asked that
24 question of how to define health care practitioners and
25 your response was quite appropriate, I thought. And

1 that just underscores the fact that we can't look to
2 the physician to do everything and that we have to
3 treat these other practitioners as partners in health.

4 And again, to touch on what you said, and I
5 don't know how to do this in the final report, but
6 there's no better way to teach this in medical schools
7 than sounds like what you're doing at Georgetown, is to
8 get the people involved in it. And it's very much akin
9 to the previous discussion about how do we bring things
10 into schools and teach school kids, except this way the
11 kids are a little bit older. They're in medical
12 school.

13 So I would think there would be a strong --
14 we should have a strong feeling or a strong commitment
15 to bringing this into medical schools, not with the
16 idea of creating a new specialist but with the idea of
17 teaching medical students how to live better
18 themselves. And, by inference, how they will spread
19 this to their patients.

20 DR. GORDON: Joe.

21 DR. FINS: There's one group I don't think I
22 heard, and that was pastoral care people, the
23 chaplains, who I think are critically important
24 providers of spiritual support and healing in the
25 mainstream really. I think we should hear from them.

1 And also, they've gone through an interesting
2 history over the last 15 or 20 years. There's a
3 College of Chaplains. There's the accreditation
4 processes. There are training programs. They've
5 maintained their separateness but they've integrated.

6 So maybe we can hear from some of the leaders
7 from the chaplaincy community about how that
8 transformation occurred and it may be instructive to
9 other practitioners.

10 DR. GORDON: George, were you about to say
11 something?

12 MR. DEVRIES: NCQA actually has some
13 interesting requirements of programs like the one my
14 company operates where we provide chiropractic,
15 acupuncture, naturopathy, massage therapy benefits for
16 enrollees of health plans. But as part of that, even
17 if the member is able to directly access the CAM
18 provider without a physician referral, we still as an
19 organization have to provide at least notification or a
20 report back to the primary care physician that the
21 member has accessed care and diagnosis and proposed
22 treatment, including like under acupuncture,
23 traditional Chinese herbal supplements that the member
24 might get.

25 So it's an interesting -- shall we say almost

1 -- shall we say a process that's already happening.
2 And in terms of someone just talked about the health
3 clinic without walls. It's physicians and CAM
4 providers working together in the interest of treating
5 their patients. And this is a communication process, I
6 guess, that we've already had to institute among CAM
7 providers and physicians regarding treatment plans on
8 patients.

9 It's been very positive in the context that
10 all of a sudden you see the primary care physicians
11 talking with the acupuncturists and the chiropractor
12 and their provider.

13 DR. GORDON: So this is a model of teaching to
14 professional students about what can happen, how people
15 can -- in this context?

16 MR. DEVRIES: I think so. It's in the context
17 too that it's just a real life model of really forcing
18 those practitioners and providers to talk and to work
19 together on particular patients. It's very positive.

20 DR. GORDON: I want to raise two other issues
21 for everybody's consideration that are related,
22 directly related to this. One is I think certain
23 competencies in CAM, self care, basically, but I think
24 nutrition should be basic to every physician's
25 education. I think it's inexcusable that physicians

1 don't know more about nutrition than they do.

2 And you're shaking your heads so I guess we
3 have agreement.

4 I have a second preference because I've
5 learned how to do it and I don't know that there will
6 be as general agreement. I think every physician
7 should know how to work with his or her hands to do some
8 kind of manipulation. Chinese medicine. Everybody who
9 practices traditional Chinese medicine does
10 manipulation. And I do it. There are plenty of times
11 when I refer to other people because I know what I can
12 do and I know what I can't do. And if I don't, I
13 quickly find out. But to me it seems so much a part of
14 medicine.

15 And I know this is not necessarily a popular
16 idea in the West but it has been very important to me.
17 And increasingly, physicians want to learn
18 manipulation.

19 So I raise that as a possibility, at least
20 something to talk about.

21 The other issue which is a more -- a broader
22 issue is the whole one of what should other
23 practitioners know about conventional medicine. This
24 is very important to me.

25 I think -- not that the other one isn't --

1 but I think one of the places we run into trouble in a
2 variety of ways and that CAM practitioners are
3 criticized -- well, you don't know what you're doing.
4 How much do you know about conventional treatment. How
5 can you screen out problems.

6 And I think there has to be a level of
7 competency among CAM practitioners for understanding
8 what they know and what they don't know. And I think we
9 need to devote some time here to thinking about that.

10 Dean.

11 DR. ORNISH: I like the idea because to me the
12 best integrative medicine is when we integrate the best
13 of traditional and non-traditional approaches. And I
14 like what you just said about -- because so often
15 people tend to think of, well, Western trained doctors
16 really don't know about nutrition or they don't know
17 about a variety of different modalities and so they
18 tend to inappropriately use antibiotics or surgery for
19 procedures that perhaps alternative approaches are more
20 beneficial.

21 But the same problem also exists in the other
22 direction, as you've alluded to. Both from a
23 philosophical standpoint and a practical standpoint, to
24 the extent that education of allopathic physicians can
25 include a greater awareness and appreciation of

1 alternative approaches and what works and what doesn't
2 work and for whom and under what circumstances and
3 where to refer people to and how to find the best
4 people in the field to refer to and how to credential
5 people and so on.

6 But also, in the same light that alternative
7 practitioners of one variety or another need to
8 understand that Western medicine really does some
9 things very well and often may not necessarily refer
10 appropriately in that direction as well. So I think we
11 can all learn from each other in that way.

12 DR. GORDON: Other responses to this?

13 DR. ORNISH: I would say, by the way, that I'm
14 in complete agreement of including nutrition as part of
15 all physicians' training. When it comes to
16 manipulation or acupuncture or other things that may
17 have great value, I think that it may not necessarily
18 be something that all physicians have the time and
19 interest to be trained in just because of the
20 limitations of resources. But I like the idea of
21 including some basic ideas as part of all physician
22 training.

23 DR. GORDON: Tom and then Bill.

24 MR. CHAPPELL: There's a medical school in
25 Maine for osteopathy that's also just going into

1 complementary and alternative medicines. It seems to
2 me when you bring up the question of hands and so on,
3 they really are an interesting model as I think
4 listened. It's called --

5 VOICE: The New England College.

6 MR. CHAPPELL: -- New England College. Thank
7 you. In Biddeford Pool; right? Biddeford Pool, Maine.
8 And Sandra Featherman is the President.

9 But I do think that they're an interesting
10 model where osteopaths have sort of taken a particular
11 point of view anyway towards medicine and then they're
12 adding to it.

13 I'm interested in their curriculum in this
14 discussion.

15 DR. GORDON: And that, of course, raises the
16 issue that we ought to have a greater understanding of
17 various curricula.

18 MR. CHAPPELL: Yes.

19 DR. GORDON: Of naturopathy, for example, or
20 traditional Chinese medicine or chiropractic. That if
21 we're going to help make suggestions we need to have
22 some baseline knowledge about what's happening right
23 now.

24 Bill?

25 DR. FAIR: Not to beat this issue to death

1 regarding training physicians to be CAM practitioners,
2 we can't ignore the practical aspect. I think the 8 to
3 10 minute visit is with us for the foreseeable future.
4 You can't be all things to all people, so physicians
5 are going to have to rely more on other practitioners
6 to deliver these things, like massage and acupuncture
7 and so forth. Unless you think otherwise.

8 DR. GORDON: I don't have -- personally, I
9 don't have, except in very rare instances, the time or
10 the inclination to do massage, even though I've had
11 some training in it. I think the 8 or 10 minute visit
12 is an abomination except for a kid with a little cut.

13 This brings us back to the whole issue of
14 services. I think we have to challenge that. And
15 fundamentally, again, this is coming back to Effie's
16 point and the point that many of us have made, is that
17 the whole vision of CAM is not of an 8 to 10 minute
18 visit. It's a vision of some kind of what I call
19 healing partnership with people. And I think that's
20 part of our world view. And even though it's a major
21 change, has to happen.

22 For that to happen, I think that we need to
23 come down on the -- I think we shouldn't accept that
24 particular status quo.

25 DR. FAIR: I'm just saying that the --

1 DR. GORDON: That doesn't mean we shouldn't
2 refer to massage therapists or acupuncturists or other
3 folks.

4 DR. FAIR: Sure.

5 DR. GORDON: I just think that in order for us
6 to do a decent referral, how are you going to do that
7 in 8 to 10 -- are you going understand who that person
8 is and who they would best work with and what's most
9 appropriate for them.

10 DR. FAIR: Well, certainly, you're preaching
11 to the converted here.

12 DR. GORDON: I know.

13 DR. FAIR: Maybe George could give us more
14 information about how the insurance company views that
15 because what I hear from physicians in practice is
16 that's a way of life and not really likely to change
17 very much.

18 DR. GORDON: And when think about it, Dean was
19 telling me last night something I hadn't realized.
20 That when the President or some of these high officials
21 go for a physical, it's like an eight hour position and
22 different specialists have their turns. And maybe we
23 ought to start thinking along those line.

24 Again, we don't need one person to do all
25 things. That there would be a physician who may sit as

1 the captain of the ship, if you will. Somebody has to
2 coordinate it. But then all of these other
3 practitioners get in their part, too.

4 So in toto, it takes a lot more than eight or
5 10 minutes but maybe the captain of the ship would have
6 a short period of time.

7 DR. ORNISH: But just to respond to what Bill
8 said, as you know, many of the alternative approaches
9 have as their approach to treat the underlying cause of
10 the problem. Now the cause may be identified in
11 different ways in different systems of thought but
12 still the idea is to treat the cause rather than to
13 like literally or figuratively bypass it.

14 In the case of health care costs, one
15 approach has been, as you alluded to, to shorten
16 hospital stays, shift outpatient surgery, more doctors
17 to see more and more patients in less and less time, in
18 eight minutes to see a new patient. And it's
19 profoundly frustrating for both doctors and patients
20 which I think is part of the reason why so many people
21 have been voting with their feet and paying out of
22 pocket for these services because one of the things
23 that most alternative practitioners have in common is
24 that they spend time with you. They listen to you.
25 They often touch you. They do the things that make

1 people feel connected, which is why people are even
2 willing to pay out of pocket for it.

3 And I think that if we can encourage
4 approaches that look at -- I mean, for example, we
5 found that by spending much more time with people,
6 spending a year with people, it actually saved an
7 average of almost \$30,000 a patient as an alternative
8 to a bypass as one example that spending more time with
9 people actually save money. And I would encourage
10 testimony from people who have similar experiences in
11 that area.

12 DR. GORDON: I think that's very important.

13 I going to come to you in a second, Joe.

14 One of the things that my experience has been
15 is that by spending more time with people, I get almost
16 no phone calls in the middle of the night. I get
17 almost -- it's a whole different situation that the
18 more connected you are with people the more they learn
19 to take care of themselves. And that's a very
20 interesting, very interesting paradox. And that our
21 work, I think, is really about what's the model for the
22 physician.

23 The other thing that you raised, both of you
24 raised, is that it's enormously frustrating for
25 physicians.

1 DR. ORNISH: Well, that's what I was going to
2 say. It's profoundly unsatisfying both for physicians
3 and for patients. And if we can help emphasize that
4 rather than doing this as threatening to physicians,
5 which is often how it's perceived, that it's a
6 profoundly satisfying way to practice medicine.

7 You reduce your malpractice costs because
8 people are much less likely to sue you if they feel
9 cared for. And it's a whole lot more fun for everyone
10 involved. And I think that message really hasn't
11 gotten out as much as it could.

12 DR. GORDON: Joe.

13 DR. FINS: On that point and the earlier point
14 about education, I think to go back to number 1 about
15 the research gaps, I really think we need to do
16 outcomes of research that looks at cost benefit
17 analysis and real efficacy. I mean, if someone gets
18 acupuncture, if someone gets massage and their back
19 pain keeps them at work, going to work instead of being
20 at home, what is the long-term consequences
21 economically of these interventions, which may, if you
22 look at it microscopically, is a longer visit. It's
23 not the eight minute visit. It's the 45 minute
24 session.

25 What does that mean for disability and

1 wellness and productivity. And I think we should --
2 when we think about the research mandate we should
3 include those kinds of outcomes.

4 On the education issue that we were just
5 talking about, it would seem to me that it would be
6 good to have some RFPs from some funding entity about
7 substantive and process issues in complementary and
8 alternative medicine. You know, strategies for doing
9 this.

10 I think we know more and more about what CAM
11 is but we don't know a lot about how to teach it. And
12 it seems to be it's a very robust field, the strategy
13 of bringing into the medical school and nursing and
14 other curricula. And I think that might be a nice RFP
15 for either the National Center or HHS or something.

16 MR. GROFT: That actually exists. I believe
17 there is an RFP or an RFA out on the streets right now
18 that deals with developing curricula.

19 DR. FINS: Okay. Great.

20 MR. GROFT: And several of these things I know
21 are available through NIH grant programs already. So I
22 believe there is something on the street at the present
23 time.

24 And again, I think Richard Nahin, who's in
25 charge of the extramural program there with Steve

1 Strauss, can help us with that, too.

2 DR. GORDON: Effie.

3 MS. CHOW: I hope we're keeping the vision
4 that CAM is part of a whole team. It's not an
5 alternative to Western medicine. And that still the
6 primary -- and as much as -- you know, I'm a nurse
7 myself and have great respect for the medical system.
8 It's a misuse of the medical system that is the
9 problem. It's not the medical system.

10 And I hope that the vision again is to see
11 the alternative, what is called complementary and
12 alternative medicine. And I would like another word
13 rather than that. It is teamwork and not one star.
14 And then the medical doctor, in due respect to all of
15 you here. And then CAM is like added on and it's
16 always the doctor that has to be the master of the
17 ship.

18 For example, I myself, when I have people and
19 they haven't been to a doctor for a long time, I refer
20 them to a doctor. But I'm the master of the ship and
21 the doctor gives me a report as to what's happening.
22 And the client needs to inform all the practitioners of
23 what they're taking.

24 Because, like you said, Jim, they're shopping
25 around and we need to devise a method to help them to

1 stop shopping around. Because even when something is
2 good for them, they still think there's another miracle
3 thing out there and they don't deal with the treatment
4 deeply enough, so that they don't get the benefits.

5 And they also come to see the complementary
6 and alternative medicine when it's a dead end rather
7 than early referral. And so, for example, how can we
8 devise education and practice code that perhaps going
9 to early referral to CAM can prevent some of the
10 seriousness, which Dean is doing, as one model. And
11 that can be promoted on a larger scale.

12 So I'd like to turn it to the team, not the
13 physician, and then the CAM rotating around that.

14 DR. GORDON: So we can look at a variety of
15 different kinds of models.

16 MS. CHOW: Yes. And so that your point about
17 education the CAM practitioners that they need to work
18 with the medical model as well and be informed. And so
19 when to refer and when to do so appropriately.

20 DR. GORDON: There's a few more minutes.

21 MR. ROLIN: Buford Rolin here. I Just wanted
22 to make a comment. In the Indian Health Service we
23 have that model right now. The only facet that we're
24 missing is the CAM and that's where we're really
25 working now within the system to make that available.

1 I know with a couple of our hospitals in the
2 Navaho area, they're already set up and have that
3 established. But how do we incorporate that. We like
4 to think that our model is one stop shopping and the
5 hospitals or clinics that we operate. But that's the
6 one facet that we've got to be able to make conclusive
7 in that process and that's what we're working on there.

8 But we do have a model in that aspect. I
9 just wanted to share that.

10 DR. GORDON: In terms of education, any
11 education of health professionals, we're agreed that
12 we're going to address education of all health
13 professionals? And we need to learn more about some of
14 the systems. We need to talk about the spirit of the
15 practice as well as the individual practices. That
16 nobody is going to do everything but that there has to
17 be a kind of informed understanding of all the
18 different professionals about other professions. And
19 there has to be a sense of teamwork. And students of
20 all kinds have to be exposed to the best thinking.

21 And think there's still too much
22 polarization, and not just on the part of conventional
23 medicine but also on the part of some who are
24 alternative practitioners. And I think we need to sort
25 of see what kinds of models of collaboration and

1 collaborative teaching there can be.

2 Anything else that we've omitted here?

3 (No response.)

4 Great. So we will break for lunch. We'll be
5 back here at 1:00. We'll have lunch. We'll come back
6 at 1:00.

7 VOICE: Jerry, would you want to check to see
8 if the lunch has arrived?

9 DR. GORDON: How could the lunch no be here?

10 So we're going to break for lunch in any
11 case. We'll be back at 1:00 for public comment.

12 How many people do we have, Michele?

13 MS. CHANG: Seven people.

14 DR. GORDON: We have seven people for public
15 comment. We'll do that between -- we'll finish with
16 that by 2:00. Then we'll finish our discussions here
17 by about 3:00 and we'll be planning for the next
18 meetings as well.

19 MR. ROLIN: Jim, could I just make a comment?
20 I'm going to have to leave after lunch. I cannot be
21 here this afternoon. But I just want to say to all of
22 you that indeed it's a pleasure for me to be part of
23 this Commission and I'm looking forward to bringing our
24 perspective and from my community, making it a part of
25 this.

1 And I know Egaly as well. When we were
2 talking about organizations a bit ago and how we can
3 have some input, I think of our American Indiana
4 Physicians Association and other organizations that we
5 have that certainly we can have input and bring that
6 perspective to this process.

7 And so I'm really honored and certainly
8 appreciate the President for his consideration in
9 appointing me to this Commission and I look forward to
10 working with you all.

11 DR. GORDON: Great. Thanks for being with us.

12 (Pause.)

13 We don't have lunch?

14 Can we move on?

15 MR. GROFT: That's what I was thinking.

16 DR. GORDON: Okay. Everybody up for that for
17 another 10 or 15 minutes of discussion?

18 Okay.

19 MR. GROFT: And my apologies. I don't know
20 where the food is but I gather it's between here and
21 Arlington. As soon as it arrives we'll break
22 immediately.

23 DR. GORDON: Okay.

24 MR. GROFT: We've talked about a number of
25 different activities that we'd like the Commission or

1 that you would like us to do and that we're willing to
2 work with you in implementing. And so if you could
3 jump ahead a little bit to number 7, other activities
4 of the Commission, just to give you some ideas of what
5 we were thinking about doing to make your activities a
6 little bit better known to the public and a little bit
7 more visible to everyone.

8 We do want to produce an interactive website
9 in the sense that we'll receive communication from the
10 public about the activities of the Commission,
11 including the issues and questions that we develop,
12 especially as we start to go out into these town
13 meetings. We would like to present the same questions
14 on the internet and let people respond to us.

15 I think as we do this, we want to let you
16 know that we will not respond to those inquiries. We
17 will simply receive inquiries. There's far too much
18 work and almost impossible to try to respond to perhaps
19 tens of thousands of responses.

20 DR. GORDON: Steve, clarify what you mean.

21 MR. GROFT: The website, the internet site.
22 We would put up the agendas. We would put up the
23 questions that we're addressing, the issues that we're
24 addressing to receive input from the world.

25 DR. GORDON: And we'll be putting up summaries

1 or minutes of these meetings?

2 MR. GROFT: Summaries of what goes on here.
3 The minutes from the meetings, as we develop the
4 issues.

5 And say as we start to prepare sections of
6 the report, the Commission wants us to put up a section
7 of the report to get comments on, we would do it. We
8 would put it out there and let people comment, bring
9 those comments back to you to let you know what people
10 are saying about what our activities are and what our
11 conclusions are and what we should change.

12 DR. GORDON: But what did you say we could not
13 respond to?

14 MR. GROFT: All the responses. We cannot
15 respond to the responses.

16 DR. GORDON: Respond personally to every
17 question that's raised.

18 MR. GROFT: If 10,000 people send us a
19 response to the issues or 5,000 people, we cannot
20 respond to those. We have to be willing to receive
21 them and not respond. It's impossible. And I don't
22 mean to sound like we don't care, but we will take them
23 and we will synthesize them, but to try to provide an
24 individualized response -- we may be able to send back
25 a short thank you, that we appreciate your comments and

1 we'll continue to keep you informed and keep checking
2 our website for information, just to let them know that
3 we are paying attention but we can't answer.

4 DR. BERNIER: But you will be putting all this
5 on the website?

6 MR. GROFT: Yes. All this will be on the
7 website and available.

8 I've run a website for the Office of Rare
9 Diseases and it's quite a task trying to keep up with
10 inquiries without a full blown information center
11 itself taking care of the inquiries that are coming in
12 or a much larger staff that what we want to bring in.

13 We don't want to bring in people to respond
14 to inquiries from the public because that really in
15 NCCAM's -- what will happen, people will start asking
16 us questions about specific interventions and
17 treatments and we don't want that to occur. We want to
18 continue to focus on the issues and the questions that
19 you have the responsibility to answer and put together.

20 MR. CHAPPELL: Can we post commonly asked
21 questions with responses to those commonly asked
22 questions?

23 MR. GROFT: If we see a pattern developing of
24 questions, we could put up frequently asked questions
25 and a response. Again, we may not want to do that. We

1 don't want to short circuit questions by providing
2 answers. But I think as is typical with a web site, it
3 evolves. And I think before we would do things, we
4 would have a beta site that we would tell all of you to
5 go look at first or ask you to look at and see if this
6 is what you want to do.

7 And even before we go public with everything,
8 as we make changes, major changes, you first would have
9 the opportunity to look at what we're putting up and
10 get a quick concurrence back from the Commission
11 members that indeed this is okay to put up.

12 DR. GORDON: But Tom, I'm wondering -- and
13 Steve -- if what you're looking for, we could certainly
14 have an information sheet about the Commission, what
15 the Commission is doing, who the members are, the kinds
16 of issues that we're focusing on that we could send to
17 everybody.

18 MR. GROFT: That would be the first part that
19 we would identify the Commission and put in all the
20 Executive Order and everything else that goes with the
21 charter and what have you. That would just be the easy
22 -- they're the easy things to do. It's then
23 identifying the issues, getting responses and things
24 like that.

25 MR. CHAPPELL: Then with regard to our

1 listening or reading, are we going to read and listen
2 to the responses?

3 MR. GROFT: Are you?

4 MR. CHAPPELL: We. You.

5 MR. GROFT: We will. Yes.

6 MR. CHAPPELL: Okay.

7 MR. GROFT: Oh, yes. The idea being that we
8 would collect them ourselves and incorporate the
9 comments and suggestions into the documents that we're
10 preparing as we move along. We're not just going to
11 throw them away. We will collect and we will save
12 them.

13 MR. CHAPPELL: So they'll find their way into
14 this room.

15 MR. GROFT: Into the report somehow or other.

16 DR. GORDON: Steve, you'll be able to bring --
17 if there are issues that are raised frequently, you'll
18 bring them here to the meetings?

19 MR. GROFT: Oh, definitely so. Whatever comes
20 up we will keep you informed. If new issues are
21 brought up, we will prepare summaries of what is
22 presented to us from the website to that you're not
23 kept in the dark as far as what is the public really
24 saying.

25 So we would synthesize this into some type of

1 a workable document.

2 MR. CHAPPELL: But it's not truly an
3 interactive website then?

4 MR. GROFT: Not totally. It's just that they
5 can send us messages. We can send a message back. We
6 also can send back directly a summary of the minutes to
7 everybody who sends us an inquiry. From each meeting,
8 we then can -- as soon as the minutes are completed, we
9 can send them a copy of those minutes, mass
10 distribution, so we don't have to it individually. And
11 that's something we'd be building up to. People who
12 respond and send us questions or send us responses, we
13 would create a master list, a list serve, that they
14 would then be recipients of everything that goes out.

15 I think to keep them informed, I think there
16 would be the feeling that we are contributing something
17 back to them for the time that they've taken to respond
18 to our needs. I think if we could do that, that would
19 be helpful.

20 Any other suggestions? We're really open. I
21 think as we go along and start this, it is something in
22 evolution that we'll want you to look at and tell us
23 what we should do and how it should be altered.

24 MS. CHOW: To prevent having to answer a lot,
25 perhaps in the notification saying that the questions

1 will be taken into account, too, so you don't have to
2 answer those. And if there's a lot of questions, then
3 you might put that question back out to the public and
4 get some --

5 MR. GROFT: Definitely. There are things that
6 we can do. You will be kept informed as we go along.
7 And as I said, the beta site gives you the opportunity
8 to look at everything before it goes out.

9 DR. ORNISH: Since we're still waiting for --

10 DR. GORDON: The food is here, so --

11 DR. ORNISH: Oh, lunch is here?

12 DR. GORDON: Yes. But we'll just finish this
13 up.

14 DR. ORNISH: I was just wondering if we were
15 going to talk at all about public meetings or is that
16 something you want to wait until later?

17 DR. GORDON: Why don't we do that after the
18 public comment. We'll talk about that.

19 MR. GROFT: If you have your calendars or
20 anything, maybe we could look at that after lunch then
21 or later in the afternoon.

22 DR. ORNISH: One of the things that Secretary
23 Shalala said yesterday was how important it is to try
24 to pick meeting times when virtually everybody can be
25 there. And since some people are leaving even before

1 lunch, maybe we could just take a moment and get our
2 calendars together.

3 MS. CHANG: I have Buford's already.

4 DR. GORDON: We have Buford's?

5 MS. CHANG: Yes. And Charlotte. I didn't get
6 hers.

7 DR. GORDON: I've got her.

8 So we have the two people who are leaving.
9 I'm wondering, since we want to start the public
10 session at 1:00 and we don't want to hurry through our
11 lunch -- you'll be here at 2:00?

12 DR. ORNISH: I may not be and I know some
13 other people definitely won't be. So I just thought --
14 because it's just so hard to play phone tag with
15 everybody.

16 MR. GROFT: Let's throw out the next possible
17 date of the whole Commission.

18 DR. ORNISH: I think it would just take three
19 minutes.

20 MR. GROFT: We were thinking of around October
21 4th, 5th or 6th.

22 DR. ORNISH: October 6 would be a good day for
23 me.

24 MR. GROFT: Would be?

25 DR. GORDON: Well, it's going to be at least

1 two days.

2 MR. GROFT: We'd like to have two days.

3 DR. GORDON: And perhaps two and half days.

4 VOICE: What days of the week are they?

5 MS. CHOW: How about the next week?

6 MR. GROFT: Wednesday, October 4th; Thursday,
7 the 5th, and Friday, the 6th.

8 DR. ORNISH: I could do -- the 5th and 6th
9 work for me.

10 MS. CHOW: How about the following week? The
11 11th and 12th?

12 DR. GORDON: 5 and 6 is fine.

13 MR. GROFT: Does that look okay?

14 (Whereupon, a discussion was held of future
15 meeting dates.)

16 DR. GORDON: Anybody else who has to leave,
17 and obviously we want everybody to be here for public
18 comment and for the small remainder of the afternoon
19 time. If you have to leave, please make sure you've
20 filled out your form about which committee, which
21 interest group.

22 MR. GROFT: We are looking at October 5th and
23 6th as the next date then.

24 VOICE: Here in D.C.?

25 MR. GROFT: Here in D.C. in all likelihood.

1 Now there may be something in between, a couple of town
2 hall meetings that some of you may want to attend if
3 it's in your local area.

4 DR. GORDON: What I'd like to do though is to
5 adjourn because people are already leaving for lunch.
6 So if we can adjourn for lunch. We'll come back at
7 1:00 to do public comment and then we'll work out --
8 we'll talk about town hall meetings here and we'll also
9 talk about them individually with people as we develop
10 time.

11 (Whereupon, the luncheon recess was taken at
12 12:07 p.m.)

1 *AFTERNOON SESSION

2 DR. GORDON: We're going to have public
3 comment and I'll ask each of you who's going to be
4 speaking to us to stay within these guidelines.

5 No more than five minutes for whatever you
6 have to say. And then if Commission members, if you
7 have questions, please feel free to -- and you want
8 clarification or you'd like to ask questions, please
9 feel free to do so. We'll have a few minutes after
10 each talk to do that.

11 And when you begin, introduce yourself and
12 say who you are and where you come from, and just
13 begin.

14 MS. TRACHTENBERG. Hi. My name is Duchy
15 Bracht Trachtenberg. I'm a clinical social worker and I
16 actually work and live in Maryland right outside D.C.

17 I'm here today actually to speak on behalf of
18 the American Public Health Association's special
19 interest group on alternative and complementary health
20 practices.

21 The outcomes from public health initiatives
22 depend on many of the same independent variables that
23 affect standard clinical practice, including compliance
24 and interactions. In recent years, however, these
25 factors have changed remarkably. The public's

1 increasing use of alternative and complementary
2 therapies has introduced new issues that affect most
3 clinical events.

4 Alternative and complementary health
5 practices are in effect the definition of exclusion,
6 referring to those treatments having alternative
7 origins outside of the conventional medical system. It
8 can include everything from trained, licensed and
9 regulated naturopathic physicians to patient self
10 treatment, dietary supplements and mail order providers
11 on the internet.

12 The potential for significant differences in
13 quality and safety of care are obvious.

14 Our ability to take advantage of the benefits
15 and avoid the risks of ACHP therapies in public health
16 depends, in my opinion, on consideration of the
17 following principles.

18 ACHP therapies are here to stay. Ignoring
19 them only forces us to make decisions without all of
20 the information.

21 ACHP therapies present both benefits and
22 risks not unlike conventional therapies. While natural
23 therapies have many well documented uses and tend to be
24 less toxic and more accessible, they also generate
25 significant morbidity and mortality when used

1 incorrectly. The same considerations, including
2 compliance, drug-nutrient interactions and assurance of
3 proper administration apply here as well.

4 ACHP is not a simple subset of conventional
5 medicine. Legitimate providers often require unique
6 training to the level of conventional medical
7 physicians in order to safely and effectively apply
8 these therapies. It may be a mistake to assume that
9 the conventional medical model can inherently evaluate
10 or apply alternative therapies.

11 The effective combination of conventional and
12 ACHP approaches has the potential to improve public
13 health outcomes and reduce cost. The addition of
14 alternative strategies can affect many current public
15 health initiatives in many ways, including improved
16 compliance outcomes and cost.

17 Participation of all types of licensed health
18 professionals who include alternative therapies in
19 their practices should be included in any public
20 deliberations. In particular, chiropractors,
21 naturopathic doctors and licensed acupuncturists should
22 all be included in the deliberations of this
23 Commission, not just M.D.s. In any of the states that
24 have recognized another type of health professional
25 with licensure or certification, then that type of

1 professional should be represented here.

2 And finally, coordination of federal
3 initiatives needs to begin so that outcomes can be
4 measured accurately and efforts are maximized rather
5 than duplicated. And I'd ask you actually to refer to a
6 proposal which was actually created within our special
7 interest group at APHA. It's entitled "A Modest
8 Proposal," and I've given it to you so that you can
9 review it.

10 Initiatives, taskforces and programs dealing
11 with alternative therapies are sprouting up from one
12 end of the Department of Health and Human Services to
13 the other, and many departments, including the Veterans
14 Administration, the Center for Substance Abuse
15 Treatment, HRSA, they've all conducted ACHP activities.
16 There is a need for a single focal point within the
17 government to coordinate these activities, including
18 but not limited to research.

19 The NIH should be allowed to focus solely on
20 research and other ACHP issues should be coordinated at
21 the department level.

22 In conclusion, I suggest that the best public
23 health outcomes will result from a credible and
24 meaningful collaboration of common sense public health
25 wisdom and competent therapies. This collaboration, to

1 be effective, must include well trained and
2 knowledgeable providers and managers from both areas.
3 It must also include careful consideration of all
4 independent variables, including patient self
5 treatment, subject reliance on untrained providers, and
6 the potential for these actions to undermine public
7 health objectives.

8 Simply put, our culture has changed and the
9 American Public Health Association's special interest
10 group on alternative therapies has started the process
11 of accounting for the new benefits and risks that come
12 with the popularity of alternative therapies.

13 Our group has several hundred members
14 currently, including NDs and licensed acupuncturists
15 and we are continuing to bring additional types of
16 health professionals into APHA who often have their
17 first contact with organized public health within our
18 group.

19 We recognize an affinity between holistic
20 practitioners and public health which, by its nature,
21 has always taken a holistic approach. And actually,
22 what I would like to also add at the very end is I
23 would encourage this Commission to actually make
24 contact with both Dr. Joe Pizzorno, who is our chair,
25 the recently retired president of Bastyr University.

1 And I would also encourage you to speak to Dr. Alan
2 Trachtenberg, who is our founding chair, who obviously
3 is known by some of you here, who was the planning
4 chair for the acupuncture consensus panel at NIH and is
5 currently with the Office of Pharmacologic and
6 Alternative Therapies at CSAP.

7 Thank you.

8 DR. GORDON: Thank you very much.

9 Do we have any questions or comments from the
10 Commission members?

11 (No response.)

12 Okay. I think we're all concerned about
13 public health aspects and we welcome input, as well as
14 your modest proposal for coordination at the federal
15 level, which we will be considering.

16 Thank you.

17 Next is Sandra McLanahan.

18 DR. McLANAHAN: I'm Doctor Sandra McLanahan
19 and I think this is an amazing experience to be here to
20 watch this. It's kind of like a dream team out here.
21 And it's an auspicious time, sort of a quantum leap for
22 our culture, suitable to the new millennium.

23 I think it's really a chance for us to start
24 new with medicine and a broader vision of medicine.

25 I particularly want to thank Jim Gordon for

1 starting on the note that he has and I've watched him
2 at the Chantilly meeting do such a great job of
3 bringing together people from diverse backgrounds and
4 creating dialogue. It's so useful.

5 I love to quote Winston Churchill. He said,
6 I trust America to do the right thing after having
7 exhausted all other options.

8 So I think we're at that moment.

9 As Effie was saying earlier, we don't have a
10 health care system. We have an illness care system.
11 And we don't have medical school, we have drugs and
12 surgery school. So we need to make some fundamental
13 shifts. And I think you're all in a position to help
14 create that.

15 It's just us. It's us. And we look out the
16 window and we see our people suffering and ourselves.
17 And so what are the steps. And so here's my sort of
18 wish list and I'll kind of go through it quickly.

19 I worked with Dr. Denoresh from the beginning
20 fo that research as the Director of Stress Management
21 Training. I worked with Michael Lerner, to help set up
22 Commonweal. And we went around the world to look at
23 alternative complementary care for cancer.

24 Then I worked with Mehmet Oz to use pre- and
25 post-surgery alternative CAM interventions pre- and

1 post-surgery and now I'm working on a couple of
2 projects. I work with Dannien Brinkley for Compassion
3 in Action, which is end of life care trying to get CAM
4 into end of life care and hospice and into veterans
5 hospitals, which are our worst hospitals and should be
6 much better than they are.

7 And also I work with about 14 different
8 practitioners in kind of a model. When we're talking
9 about different models, it's kind of a Mandala or wheel
10 model where each practitioner has important
11 comprehensive contributions to the whole picture, a
12 sort of comprehensive evaluation.

13 And what we've done in the past, and I've
14 worked in this fashion for 30 years, is take a patient,
15 have them seen by all the different types of
16 modalities, medicine, chiropractic, osteopathy,
17 acupuncture, psychiatry, nutrition, and then prioritize
18 what's most important and help the patients themselves
19 choose a pathway through alternative medicine. So I
20 like the wheel model there.

21 I think if you go into any hospital and try
22 to figure out why people get sick, it's cigarettes,
23 alcohol, bad diet, lack of exercise and stress. And
24 these are the things that I hope you all will focus on
25 because we've gotten switched in our emphasis in

1 medicine to the interventions, the drugs and the
2 surgery, rather than to the root causes.

3 And if we go back to the roots, let's look at
4 what alternative medicine and CAM in general has to
5 offer in terms of the roots of what's making people
6 sick; cigarettes, alcohol, bad diet, lack of exercise
7 and stress. Those five areas.

8 Part of the reason that NIH can't do it all
9 is because with their \$15 billion, which you'd think
10 you could buy some health with \$15 billion every year
11 or more, the test tube molecular model has sort of gone
12 about as far as we can go. The genetic way of looking
13 will provide some more information, but we need to
14 again see what's making people sick. And just knowing,
15 as we know all the genome -- we just saw yesterday in
16 the Washington Post the environmental contribution of
17 illness, the diet, the choices of lifestyle are really
18 95 percent of the problem.

19 So how can we shift our medical care system
20 to look at those roots.

21 And just to say that society's perceived
22 needs -- I love that statement. Somebody made that
23 this morning. What are our perceived needs in terms of
24 medicine and health. We have 200,000 documented deaths
25 a year from medicines and only 40 documented deaths a

1 year from herbs. So unfortunately the media, as soon
2 as there is one herbal problem splashes it all over the
3 place, and then the general public doesn't know what to
4 do and how to sift through it.

5 It's hard enough for us as medical people to
6 sift through what's good and what's not good. The
7 general public, who doesn't know whether it's a good
8 study or not or whether the media is presenting it way
9 before the information is appropriate and so forth, has
10 a much harder time.

11 So I'd like to see these emphasis of the
12 Commission, and I'll just finish up.

13 Outcomes research, pre- and post-surgery is a
14 great way to study alternatives and CAM in general. The
15 problem, say, for example, with chamomile. It's a
16 wonderful remedy for stomach problems. But nobody can
17 patent it so who's going to fund the research.

18 Athletes are using magnets all over the
19 place. Do we really know the full range of what kind
20 of long-term effects and how much to use. When I'm
21 sick, how much Echinacea to take. These kinds of
22 questions haven't been answered yet as far as I know,
23 and they're good questions.

24 And maybe you could commission a report like
25 the Chantilly Report that answers the kinds of

1 questions we've been talking about the last couple of
2 days. It feels like the general public is the Queen
3 Elizabeth II. It's already sailed. The majority of
4 people are using alternatives and here we are like this
5 little tugboat waving behind trying to figure out which
6 way to go.

7 We have a purpose, however, which is to
8 provide some kind of summary. And in that summary, I'd
9 like to see the following.

10 A book list. It could be a simple book list
11 of the things that we think people could get started
12 with. You could put that book list on the website.
13 That wouldn't take too much time and I think it would
14 be very helpful. The books I think of -- Jim Gordon's,
15 would be really helpful, and Dean's. Michael Lerner's
16 books, Dannien Brinkley's book, "Saved by the Light."

17 There's a book, "Eye Care Revolution" on
18 alternatives for reversing cataracts without surgery.
19 "Healing From The Heart," which is Mahmud Oz's book on
20 using alternatives in a surgical setting. And then
21 "Integrative Cardiac Care" is a new book for all
22 cardiologists on integrative cardiac care by Dr.
23 LaMole.

24 I'd like to see our meetings have stretch
25 breaks and let's have complementary and alternative

1 medicine right here as we meet. Let's look at the
2 food. Let's look at the air. Let's look at plants and
3 nature.

4 In summary, my best alternatives that I've
5 seen in 30 years of doing this work, massage and body
6 work, hypnosis, group support, acupuncture, Yoga,
7 herbs, music, aroma therapy, color, love, prayer and
8 spirituality.

9 This kind of thing could be introduced into
10 our schools. We could have a lunch program of stress
11 management, a lunch program like they have mandated
12 from the government, a lunch program so our children
13 eat well. How about a lunch program so they reduce
14 stress well. Sort of a stress immunization program.
15 And for computer workers, especially for Post Office
16 workers.

17 We could have warning labels on foods just
18 like we have warning labels on cigarettes. They could
19 be labeled something like "this Coke has seven
20 teaspoons of sugar, which increases your risk of --
21 seven teaspoons. And Mountain Dew has nine teaspoons
22 of sugar in it. -- increases your risk of diabetes,
23 heart disease, toxemia of pregnancy and white sugar and
24 white flour could have little labels on them. And when
25 they appear on television afterwards -- I don't know if

1 the drug companies know what they're really doing with
2 all these advertisements that have at the end of the
3 advertisement all the things -- diarrhea, bleeding,
4 headaches, migraines -- what they're really doing to
5 themselves. But we still have patients asking for it
6 despite all the lists of side effects.

7 So what about having a mandate to have foods
8 be labeled. We have foods that are labeled for their
9 positive effects now. Wheaties helps prevent cancer of
10 the colon and so forth. We could have foods labeled
11 for the negatives.

12 I was in a book store where a woman came up
13 to the weight loss books and the Atkins books were
14 there. And she said -- I said to her, that's not really
15 a very safe diet. And she said, but a doctor
16 recommended it.

17 So in conclusion, I think you have a chance
18 here to really help people sort out what works and what
19 doesn't work.

20 And I thank you very much.

21 DR. GORDON: Thank you, Sandy.

22 Questions?

23 Bill.

24 DR. FAIR: Thank you, Sandy.

25 I'd also like to start with one of my

1 favorite quotes from Churchill. "Action based on
2 perfection equals paralysis." I hope that doesn't
3 characterize this Committee.

4 DR. McLANAHAN: Well said by a surgeon.

5 DR. FAIR: We won't get everything perfect.

6 But I think you made an important point that
7 we haven't discussed I think so far, and that is that
8 the CAM therapies hold with it not only the promise of
9 helping the disease but helping the prevention.

10 DR. McLANAHAN: Yes.

11 DR. FAIR: If you get surgery or radiation,
12 you're not really preventing something. You're treating
13 something. But it doesn't help --

14 DR. McLANAHAN: Exactly. About 95 percent of
15 our health care budget goes toward treatment. Only
16 five percent toward prevention. It really needs to be
17 the reverse.

18 DR. FAIR: Oh, yes.

19 DR. McLANAHAN: We'd all benefit from that
20 type of change.

21 DR. FAIR: And what's the other figure that's
22 often stated. Eighty percent of all the health care
23 costs that the average individual incurs in his or her
24 lifetime occur in the last six months of life.

25 DR. McLANAHAN: Exactly.

1 DR. FAIR: Which is an astonishing figure.

2 But my question to you was were you
3 suggesting or were you recommending that it's time for
4 another Chantilly Report? Something like that?

5 DR. McLANAHAN: I would say an updated --
6 well, you could commission an updated Chantilly Report.
7 That would be one thing you could do instead of doing
8 it yourself. But you could also in your report take
9 the Chantilly Report one step further, which is to look
10 at the social origin of disease.

11 We are social creatures. The number one risk
12 factor for illness is social isolation and so forth.

13 You could look at love and survival and all
14 these complex factors and come out with a policy which
15 would actually help people be more healthy.

16 For example, what Jim Gordon's doing in
17 Kosovo to help those people recover is a remarkable
18 model. We could present that type of model for our
19 entire country in various ways: in schools, in
20 hospitals, in workplaces, work sites and so forth.
21 That could be our health policy. And I think we'd all
22 benefit.

23 DR. GORDON: Great. Thank you, Sandy.

24 Any other questions or comments?

25 (No response.)

1 Okay. Great.

2 Sandy has been working in this venue for some
3 time doing wonderful work herself.

4 Thank you.

5 Next is Tony Martinez.

6 MR. MARTINEZ: I'm actually under the stress
7 of trying to see if I can catch a 2:00 flight out of
8 National, so I'm going to be very to the point.

9 I want you to know that I'm really honored to
10 make these brief remarks and as you all begin this very
11 important work.

12 I appear before you in my capacity as a
13 citizen, although some of you know me through my
14 professional work.

15 I'm an attorney by training and I've always
16 been a tireless advocate for complementary and
17 alternative medicine and I've devoted myself to helping
18 integrate CAM into our health care system.

19 As some of you know, many individuals,
20 including myself, advocated and worked very hard for
21 the creation of this Commission, and this Commission is
22 really a tribute to the leadership of Senator Tom
23 Harkin and the others in Congress who gave life to this
24 Commission.

25 You all have an extraordinary opportunity

1 before you, and I urge you to consider the potential
2 impact of your participation and the Commission report
3 that you will create will have on our health care
4 system and use it to help transform our health care
5 system to be a real true model of health care.

6 Literally millions of people are counting on
7 you to draw up a plan that will help integrate CAM as a
8 full participant in the American health care system.

9 So with this in mind, I wanted to give you
10 some suggestions on the context of what I believe you
11 ought to include in your report. And that is
12 essentially a legislative concept and policy objective
13 draft that essentially the domestic policy advisor to
14 the President of the United States, the Secretary of
15 Health and Human Services and the Congressional
16 leadership could easily take and adapt and transform
17 your recommendations into appropriate executive orders,
18 federal regulations and legislation to implement the
19 changes and advice you will recommend.

20 So I make the following suggestions for your
21 consideration as you begin.

22 Number one. Invite and solicit testimony
23 from the trade and professional associations
24 representing the providers of CAM services and health
25 care products.

1 Two. Invite and solicit testimony from key
2 leaders and persons in the CAM field. There are many
3 individuals who can give this Commission much guidance
4 and knowledge.

5 Three. Request the attendance and testimony
6 of representatives from the appropriate and respective
7 agencies who would be impacted by your report. Your
8 recommendations will generate changes to various
9 statutes and regulations and there is unfortunately a
10 history of missed opportunities and abuses with respect
11 to complementary and alternative medicine by some
12 federal agencies.

13 While it is not your charge to act as an
14 investigatory body, the experience of CAM by patients,
15 professionals and business people with respect to
16 certain federal agencies should be brought to light so
17 you can better advise both the executive and
18 legislative branches.

19 Four. Let us remember that CAM is not just a
20 federal health care issue. It is a state issue in every
21 state of the Union. Please be sure to request the
22 attendance of respective governors, health policy
23 advisors, state health commissioners, as you travel
24 around the country.

25 And the last recommendation. CAM is also a

1 federal health issue and you should request that the
2 respective congressional committee chairs with
3 jurisdiction over health care funding and policy detail
4 staff to participate and observe this Commission's
5 proceedings. And I recommend that the executive
6 director and the Commissioners personally visit with
7 the various members of Congress responsible for health
8 care policy and inform them of your activities and
9 solicit their input and support where it's appropriate.

10 And please know that your report will be
11 supported by the grassroots public because they've been
12 waiting for something like this.

13 Thank you for your time. I look forward to
14 contributing and working for the success of this very
15 auspicious Commission.

16 Thank you.

17 DR. GORDON: Thank you.

18 Tony, it's actually so wonderful to hear all
19 of you and to look over this list because it's like a
20 Who's Who of people who have helped to move this whole
21 movement ahead. And Tony, you've been fabulous for many
22 years.

23 So thank you, and thank you for your
24 comments.

25 Do you have a minute or two before you go?

1 MR. MARTINEZ: I have a minute. They have a
2 taxi waiting for me.

3 DR. GORDON: I had a specific question about
4 the kinds of people who are having issues with
5 regulatory agencies that you think might be most useful
6 for us to hear.

7 MR. MARTINEZ: I think, for example, you can
8 look at it from different aspects. From a patient
9 standpoint, you can see the travails. I mean, most
10 people do not realize from a legal standpoint that
11 Americans do not have medical freedom of choice.

12 The regulations that are imposed by the Food
13 and Drug Administration, they only impact people at a
14 very critical time of their lives when they're facing
15 terminal or very serious illnesses, and then they've
16 got to scramble.

17 I speak from personal experience. When my
18 father was diagnosed with lung cancer, I had to drive
19 him to Ottawa General Hospital in Canada to get a
20 therapy that was not available here and we didn't have
21 the time to go through the rigamarole with all the
22 bureaucracy. So I think it's important that you have
23 some patient talk about that.

24 There's a very famous case, a little boy
25 who's trying to get the anti-neoplasma treatment,

1 little Thomas Navarro. These people really feel and
2 experience the harsh reality. That there isn't freedom
3 of choice here in this respect.

4 I think you need to also speak to some of the
5 businesses. I can say legally some of the agencies
6 have very heavy-handed tactics. I'm all for good
7 enforcement. And if you're not following the rules,
8 like for example, I have extensive background in
9 dietary supplements and I know if you're not producing
10 a high quality product or you're mislabeling a product,
11 I hope the FDA takes your product off the market, takes
12 swift action against you. But in this whole area with
13 claim, we need to start looking at and speaking to the
14 experience.

15 This issue about non-patentability of natural
16 products. There's legislation out there that begins to
17 address this and there are people who really could give
18 their expertise. So hopefully you'll have some
19 business people as well as the patient perspective.

20 DR. GORDON: One thing that I'd like to ask
21 for from you is -- two issues jump out at me. The
22 first is what should we expect from manufacturers and
23 how can we create a situation so people are actually
24 getting what they're supposed to be getting. So I'd
25 like your help in that.

1 And I'd also like your help in -- and this is
2 something we haven't touched on so I'm particularly
3 glad that you're bringing it up -- in how do we ask the
4 right questions to create an atmosphere where we can
5 make recommendations about freedom of choice. Who do
6 we ask the questions of, what kinds of questions, what
7 are the most important issues. If you could help us
8 formulate some of that.

9 MR. MARTINEZ: There are three areas that you
10 can look at in this regard. One is to start looking
11 at, thinking about giving Congress some consideration
12 as to a model of how to incentivize clinical research
13 and research and development of these natural products
14 that are so difficult to patent. That's one.

15 Second, I think in your evaluation of the
16 health care system of CAM, you have to look at the tax
17 code. There are some tax problems in the fact that
18 people -- insurance companies, there's no incentive for
19 insurance companies or employers to provide benefits
20 because of the way the tax code is written. That needs
21 to be addressed so that there could be full coverage
22 and incentives for benefits.

23 And then third, you have to look at an
24 overall model of how to interface both the federal and
25 the states. So how the federal government can create

1 the kind of federal policy that would incentivize and
2 promote the states to move forward and start
3 integrating CAM in their respective states.

4 DR. GORDON: Great. I hope we'll be able to
5 call on you.

6 MR. MARTINEZ: Absolutely. You can count on
7 it.

8 DR. GORDON: Great.
9 Tom.

10 MR. CHAPPELL: I'm not sure I heard the answer
11 to this question about how we would bring about
12 efficacy in terms of promising a product and what's
13 actually delivered.

14 MR. MARTINEZ: Well, the way that the law is
15 reflected on that is that there is federal regulations
16 for good manufacturing practices and there's got to be
17 an adherence to those GMPs by manufacturers. And there
18 has to be an enforcement mechanism and there has to be
19 actual enforcement taking place because the FDA, for
20 example, complains about quality issues about
21 supplements and they're not really doing very much
22 about it. And the market is in a little bit of chaos.

23 DR. GORDON: So one of the questions, as I
24 understand it, that we should be asking is the FDA has
25 the regulatory authority to ask for and ensure good

1 manufacturing practices and you're saying they're not
2 doing that.

3 MR. MARTINEZ: I would go back to the FDA and
4 say, well, what's it going to take, what do you need to
5 do to start taking appropriate enforcement action.
6 Because really the wonderful thing about the natural
7 products industry or the wonderful thing about the FDA,
8 is once the FDA starts taking enforcement action,
9 everybody will take notice. And anybody out there
10 who's not playing by the rules is not going to want to
11 get their head hammered because when the FDA -- the FDA
12 has a very rich history of being able to hammer
13 businesses quite effectively.

14 So it's almost like -- I'm not for using a
15 sledge hammer to swat an ant but you can take a fly
16 swatter and give it a smack to a company that's not
17 playing by the rules and everybody is going to take
18 notice and say, okay, I can't cut corners.

19 It's really not fair to the businesses that
20 are doing everything by the book that they have to
21 compete with substandard businesses out there. And if
22 everybody knows that, hey, there's an equal playing
23 field, an enforcement field, I think overall the
24 quality is going to get better.

25 DR. GORDON: Thank you.

1 Tom, did you have anything else?

2 Effie, go ahead.

3 MS. CHOW: Tony, I like what you said and I
4 would like to see that you would provide us with more
5 input in those lines, written, and suggestions.

6 MR. MARTINEZ: Well, rest assured that I am
7 personally and professionally committed to the work of
8 this Commission.

9 MS. CHOW: Thank you.

10 DR. GORDON: Thank you. Thanks so much.

11 Next is Jay Witter.

12 MR. WITTER: Good afternoon.

13 My name is Jay Witter and I'm the Vice
14 President of Government Relations for the American
15 Chiropractic Association. I appreciate the opportunity
16 that the Commission has given me to address you.

17 The American Chiropractic Association
18 congratulates each of you on your appointment to the
19 White House Commission on Complementary and Alternative
20 Medicine Policy. We applaud the President for
21 establishing this worthy Commission in an effort to put
22 forth public policy that recognizes complementary and
23 alternative medicine as a viable choice for American
24 citizens.

25 In addition, we would like to thank Senator

1 Tom Harkin for his leadership in Congress, for all the
2 complementary and alternative health care issues he's
3 worked on.

4 As more and more consumers seek out
5 alternatives to allopathic medicine, the U.S. health
6 care delivery system much accept and better understand
7 all health care options available to consumers. The
8 ACA wishes the Commission success in paving the way for
9 better consumer access to complementary and alternative
10 health care.

11 Chiropractic is the third largest doctoral
12 level health care profession in the Western world after
13 medicine and dentistry. In addition, recent studies
14 have found that chiropractic care is one of the most
15 popular alternative health care treatments available to
16 consumers.

17 The chiropractic profession has a long
18 history of striving to be recognized as a vital part of
19 an integrated health care system, yet even today, as
20 much as chiropractic has been proven effective,
21 patients are still being denied access to chiropractic
22 care in both federal and private health care plans.

23 As the largest national association
24 representing doctors of chiropractic, the ACA offers
25 its assistance and expertise to the Commission in

1 putting forth the policy recommendations that will be
2 incorporated for proven complementary and alternative
3 therapies into the mainstream health care system.

4 The ACA looks forward to working with the
5 Commission as you develop your policy recommendations.

6 Thank you.

7 DR. GORDON: Thank you.

8 Any questions for Jay Witter?

9 (No response.)

10 Great. Thank you. You were here this
11 morning. We're very eager to learn more about
12 chiropractic education and the interface between
13 chiropractic and some of the other health professions.

14 So thank you. We'll be calling on you.

15 MR. WITTER: Thank you.

16 DR. GORDON: Next is someone who probably
17 needs no introduction at all, who's been a wonderful
18 leader in this movement, Beth Clay.

19 MS. CLAY: Thank you, Jim.

20 For those of you who don't know me, I'm Beth
21 Clay and I am a staffer on the Government Reform
22 Committee in the House of Representatives. I'm
23 formerly from the National Institutes of Health where I
24 had the pleasure and honor of working with Steve Groft
25 and the three previous directors of the Office of

1 Alternative Medicine. And I am here for Chairman Dan
2 Burton who has taken the lead in the House of
3 Representatives in looking at the role of complementary
4 and alternative medicine in our health care system.

5 And over the last couple of years we've done
6 a series of hearings where I think four members of your
7 Commission have testified before the Committee. Dr.
8 Fair, Mr. Devries, Dean Ornish and of course Jim Gordon
9 have come and explained to 44 members of Congress
10 issues around the world of alternative medicine;
11 access, research needs, medical freedom issues which
12 are very prevalent in this field.

13 And Tony Martinez mentioned one of the issues
14 that we're currently dealing with, and that is the
15 plight of Thomas Navarro, a little boy whose family was
16 denied access to an alternative clinical trial.

17 They are presently en route. They've been
18 living in Mexico actually for a while taking a
19 different treatment because they could not find an
20 appropriate non-toxic treatment to help their child.

21 I wanted to get back to the root of what
22 you're here for and to congratulate you, first, for
23 being here and being part of a Commission that has the
24 ability to change health care and healing, not only in
25 this country but around the world. Because the work of

1 this Commission will affect every health care
2 practitioner in this country and every health agency in
3 every country around the globe will read the report
4 that comes from this Commission and use it as a model
5 of how they can improve their health care.

6 And as I've sat and listened the last two
7 days to the discussion, I'm thrilled to hear -- getting
8 back to the root of what are we really talking about.
9 We're not talking about having a doctor's visit and
10 getting a prescription. What we're talking about is
11 developing a lifestyle for Americans and helping people
12 learn how to start at the very beginning of our
13 educational system and helping people make good choices
14 in their everyday life so that when they come and see a
15 physician it's for a well care visit and not a critical
16 care visit.

17 And keeping in mind the semantics issue.
18 I've learned in my lifetime. I was thrilled when
19 Sister Charlotte described herself and described
20 herself as a Southern woman. I also am a Southern
21 woman. And that brings into itself a specific
22 understanding and perspective in life. I also am the
23 mother of four Asian-American children, which brings
24 for them a particular perspective in life. And having
25 a respect for different cultures and perspectives in

1 life is one of the things that as we look at these
2 issues, having a respect for the different systems of
3 healing that people choose and giving people --
4 honoring people in their choices.

5 Part of the conversation is how do we
6 integrate, how do medical doctors integrate
7 complementary practices into their healing system. But
8 part of it also is how do medical doctors allow the
9 people who come and visit them to choose other health
10 care professionals, to stay within their own system of
11 healing, and to respect that. And I hope that as we go
12 through this we'll keep that in mind.

13 One of the things that I do in my life, and
14 as I've gone through my own journey in looking for
15 where I belong in life, has been becoming a hospice
16 volunteer. And I am thrilled, Dr. Fins, that you are
17 here.

18 One of the hearings we did last October was
19 looking at improving care at the end of life through
20 complementary medicine. And part of this aspect is what
21 is so wonderful about hospice. It's the hospice team.
22 The doctor is a part of that team. The patient's in
23 charge.

24 You have a doctor, you have a nurse, you have
25 a volunteer, you have a chaplain, you have a whole

1 team. You also have a community. When someone is in
2 an end of life situation, their community becomes
3 involved. How do we recreate and strengthen our
4 communities, and through that, improve health.

5 How do we bring that into health care from
6 the beginning of life and through every stage. And
7 maybe taking that perspective, we don't have to work in
8 the health care system we have now. We can change
9 that. And this Commission can do that.

10 You have a lot of friends on Capitol Hill.
11 We're just half a block up the street. We are here for
12 you through this process.

13 I will be happy to provide to you the reports
14 that have come out from our hearings. We've done about
15 nine over the last two years looking at different
16 issues, specifically, a lot in cancer. I'd be happy to
17 provide those.

18 If there are other things that you need,
19 please let us know. We would love legislative
20 solutions. We're here to help. You have friends in
21 both the House and the Senate. And that list is
22 growing.

23 One of the things I have seen over the last
24 two years is not only have the seeds been planted, and
25 it's like watching a rose garden grow. You've got rose

1 bushes. And members of Congress, the division I look
2 when I first came onto the Hill, they're like tight
3 little rosebuds and different ones blossom at different
4 times and they're in different stages. But they are
5 all beautiful beings who are beginning to open up and
6 bloom. And that is what's happening across this
7 country in health care. We have a chance to blossom
8 and improve health.

9 DR. GORDON: Thank you very much, Beth.

10 I really appreciate your being here and your
11 consistent presence and your vision.

12 One thing I hope that you'll do, and then
13 open for other comments or questions, is not only
14 through your office which has been so active on so many
15 of these issues, but if you'll help give us guidance
16 about others on the Hill whom we should be contacting
17 and asking to help us with our considerations and
18 deliberations.

19 MS. CLAY: One of the things I meant to do was
20 to give a couple of suggestions as well. And I would
21 suggest that you all send a letter to each member of
22 Congress letting them know that you've had your first
23 meeting, outlining what your mandate is and asking for
24 their input.

25 DR. GORDON: Great.

1 MS. CLAY: And I would also suggest you do
2 that with all of the professional medical associations,
3 the alternative and the AMA and others to let them know
4 that the Commission has been established, that you're
5 welcoming input and to do the same thing with citizens
6 organizations.

7 Be proactive in letting people know you exist
8 and this room will be full to overflowing the next
9 time.

10 DR. GORDON: Great. Thank you.

11 Do we have agreement on that?

12 (All nod yes.)

13 So let's make sure we do that. And we can
14 work on that communication and go over it and I can
15 sign it for the Commission.

16 Great. That's a great idea, Beth.

17 We'll be coming back for more.

18 MS. CLAY: And I'll be happy to work at any
19 time.

20 DR. GORDON: You'll be available, as we need
21 guidance, to talk with other members and other
22 committees? You'll be able to help us with that as
23 well?

24 MS. CLAY: I'm always here for you.

25 DR. GORDON: Fantastic.

1 Any other questions of Beth? Over the last
2 two years now, she's been able to raise some very, very
3 important questions working with Representative Burton
4 and with his committee about a whole host of issues
5 related to CAM in a very broad perspective. So I think
6 that we have a lot to learn.

7 MR. GROFT: I would just like to commend Beth.
8 As she mentioned, she was a staff member of mine with
9 the Office of Rare Diseases several years ago, so it's
10 very nice to see her make this tremendous transition
11 into this type of person on the Hill and a professional
12 transition. It's nice to see her on the other side of
13 the microphone.

14 So, congratulations, Beth. You've done a real
15 nice job. And good luck.

16 DR. GORDON: Great.

17 Next is Barbara Meyerson sic).

18 REV. MEYERMAN: Thank you, Jim. One of these
19 years you will pronounce my name correctly.

20 Hello and good afternoon. I'm very grateful
21 to be here. My name is Reverend Barbara Meyerman.

22 DR. GORDON: Oh, --

23 REV. MEYERMAN: That's okay.

24 DR. GORDON: -- I not only can't pronounce
25 it. I can't read it.

1 REV. MEYERMAN: And I'm not even a doctor and
2 you can't read my handwriting.

3 And, Steve, it's good to see you. I was
4 actually at Chantilly and so this is such a fantastic -
5 - this is -- Sandra was saying it's a dream team and I
6 really feel the same way. For those of us that have
7 been on the -- not so much the professional end or
8 being part of the councils but actually out here
9 working with the public and the people that are trying
10 to create integration of CAM therapies, it feels really
11 wonderful to be here. And I want to thank each one of
12 you for being a part of this. It's very exciting.

13 I think that this has been very necessary
14 because as a person that's only missed one NIH OAM or
15 CAM meeting since its inception back after the
16 Chantilly meeting through Wayne Jonas and you, Steve,
17 and everyone else, it's been quite an exceptional ride.
18 And it is like a tugboat trying to push a huge ship.
19 And you know how long it takes to turn a huge ship.

20 And I think that this is the key to it
21 because there hasn't been an entity that has the
22 ability to create policy changes. It's mostly been
23 focused upon research. And that's the old NIH model
24 that we've all had. So it's like trying to cram
25 something that's a huge Mandala and put it into this

1 medical model that has existed since we first had the
2 creation of penicillin.

3 It's like the FDA being reformed now. The
4 same thing is true there and all across the lines of
5 government. It's all very necessary.

6 So at this point I would like to call myself
7 a health care practitioner according to your new
8 definition, Tom. Thank you very much.

9 I have called myself in the past a holistic
10 health practitioner, the founder of a group that is
11 expanding called the All's Well Alliance. And it's a
12 group of holistic practitioners, CAM practitioners,
13 including acupuncture, rebirthing, breath work,
14 chiropractic, all different modalities. And of course,
15 it's a very large umbrella.

16 So one of the things I would recommend and I
17 believe Beth or some of the other people can provide,
18 you need to see the history. Someone once called me
19 the NIH historian of CAM because I had been there from
20 the beginning and I've seen so many things created and
21 occur.

22 I think rather than reinventing some of these
23 things, there's actually been some -- and Jim, you were
24 there to see some of this. There's been some
25 proposals. There's been some ideas shared around at a

1 table similar to this at NIH and there was no ability
2 to really create broad policies and actions. So one of
3 the things I recommend out of that that you look at,
4 because it's such an overwhelmingly broad scope, is
5 that one of the things that was created by Wayne was a
6 Mandala.

7 Do you remember that, Jim?

8 And it was a very lovely model for addressing
9 every single facet of what you're looking at now. So
10 you might want to go back and request the history of
11 all of that.

12 Would you think that that would be good, Jim,
13 as well, for everyone here to have some of those
14 minutes of the meetings and different things that went
15 on? I think it would be of benefit to kind of get up
16 to speed on some of the history of what has occurred so
17 that we don't have to remake it again. Because this is
18 a group that is really recreating protocols, recreating
19 policy, recreating a new model, into a new model that's
20 integrated. And that's very different.

21 Effie, you talked about illness versus health
22 and this being an illness center rather than health and
23 human services. And several people have addressed
24 that.

25 One of the things about the history, I have a

1 pretty good memory about all the different NIH
2 meetings, believe it or not, and one of the things that
3 comes to mind that I'd like to share with you is that
4 there was maybe three years ago -- correct me on this.
5 It's in the minutes. There was a vote that passed on
6 creating and, believe it or not, a non-disease specific
7 center. That was as far as NIH/OAM could go at the
8 time. That was as radical a statement as could be made.
9 So that it would not be a center generated based on a
10 disease protocol. It's in the minutes.

11 There are thousands and thousands of years
12 and pages of protocols for acupuncture and other
13 Eastern medical modalities where we could just simply
14 get somebody to interpret it from another language and
15 have tons and tons of information that has already
16 worked.

17 It might not be up to the rigorous standards
18 exactly of research that is typical of NIH but I'm sure
19 much of it could be very, very useful. That way we
20 don't have to reinvent the wheel here in the United
21 States. We can look at all the things that are out
22 there that are working in other countries.

23 When NIH Office of Alternative Medicine went
24 after two or three years of creation to the first world
25 health congress, people actually came up and said we do

1 not understand your name. It was confusing to them.
2 Do you know why? Because CAM was health care. It
3 wasn't alternative.

4 And so really what we're looking to do here
5 in the United States, we're like the kindergartners
6 getting up to speed on some of the integration that's
7 occurred in other parts of the world. And you can see
8 that effect and the results, which is everything, when
9 you look at the difference in our health care and in
10 the results of how many people are dying from different
11 diseases, from medication or whatever.

12 So I ask you to please look at this, as well.

13 One other thing. In terms of training, I'm
14 really thrilled to hear you, Bill, talk about
15 cooperative work because not all physicians are going
16 to make great adjustments and do chiropractic or
17 anything else. They're not meant to be that. It's
18 meant to be a team effort. Because we are a
19 manifestation of mental health, emotional health,
20 physical health. And all of these things need to be
21 addressed if we're going to truly address whole health
22 with an individual.

23 So I thank you very, very much, and it's joy
24 to be here. And I will do anything in my power to get
25 things out to different groups that I'm connected with

1 on the internet.

2 I think it would be nice to have the White
3 House interfacing and have something out there. This
4 meeting was not put out very well to the public so that
5 there would be more practitioners that would come.

6 So thank you.

7 DR. GORDON: Thank you. And than you for your
8 participation and your sense of history.

9 I think that we're very clearly on the track
10 of the whole issue of wellness and how to make that
11 manifested in all of our recommendations.

12 The other thing. Once again, the way things
13 happened, it was impossible for us to get out word any
14 earlier than yesterday, simply because of the clearance
15 procedures that came through. So in the future, we are
16 completely committed to making sure that word is out
17 far in advance to as wide an audience as possible about
18 these meetings and we welcome people.

19 We also welcome, in the meantime, input via
20 e-mail and we will have town hall meetings at various
21 places around the country which will be solely devoted
22 to sort of testimony and back and forth from the
23 community. And we'll ask you and all of you to help us
24 bring together groups of people in those various
25 locations around the country. So, we're very much

1 committed to that.

2 Any other questions for Barbara?

3 (No response.)

4 Okay.

5 And our last person who'll be speaking is
6 again someone who's been very involved in this process
7 for some time, Maury Silverman.

8 MR. SILVERMAN: Hi. I'm Maury Silverman and
9 I've been involved in alternative health care issues
10 for years. And I'd just like to comment on many items
11 I've heard here since yesterday.

12 Most recent was this morning. Jim talked
13 about looking at the malpractice system. I think that
14 would be helpful. Here you have a system that I would
15 best compare to a best Cold War term, mutually assured
16 destruction. It makes honest people dishonest.

17 And may I offer a suggestion? Back in 1973
18 the Nixon Administration's HEW, the original name for
19 this place, had a malpractice commission. Dig out
20 their recommendations and see how much of that was
21 actually implemented in all those years.

22 Attached to that is like a three inch thick
23 book of appendix of related papers. And in that
24 there's a chapter on alternatives to litigation. And
25 one complex sentence. It might have been the solution

1 to the whole thing. And it read as follows. There's
2 no rule of law nor precedent of public policy that
3 precludes arbitration in the medical/legal interface.
4 And I wonder if arbitration would be a more logical way
5 to handle these things.

6 Malpractice probably would be divided into
7 gross errors which are the ones that trial attorneys
8 wait for and create terror and inflate the medical care
9 delivery system's cost. And just majority of it is
10 probably things that could have been done a lot better.

11 And CAM, the whole idea and phenomenon of CAM
12 is doing things better by adding more modalities. It's
13 not an either/or phenomenon. It's a both/and
14 phenomenon. You have a problem in the center of the
15 wheel and there are a lot of ways to approach it. And
16 the more of these different modalities you have, the
17 opportunity and the system capacity to provide a
18 person, the faster and better problem solving you get
19 for a given disease entity.

20 Next is the idea of clinical research. I
21 personally think that we really need the next NIH
22 director to be somebody who's actually had a career in
23 clinical medicine. National Academy of Sciences has
24 published a lot of material from the early '90s in gaps
25 in clinical research and we really need to get back and

1 look at the original mandate for NIH, I think going
2 back to Frankly Roosevelt's time, which said that it's
3 supposed to be research that will benefit the health of
4 the American population.

5 A lot of NIH -- all of it has moved science
6 forward. No doubt about that. But a lot of it is kind
7 of like the National Science Foundation. And we need
8 more clinical research and a director of NIH who has
9 practiced clinical medicine and can translate that to
10 the delivery system. Because the changed with managed
11 care and the business aspect, a lot of your academic
12 medical departments and teaching hospitals and academic
13 medical centers and medical schools have lost resources
14 that benefit teaching, that enable faculty and
15 participating physicians to devote the time to teach.
16 And I think you've got to make up this gap through
17 clinical research that comes from NIH and look at their
18 very significant budget increase to really be devoted
19 to clinical research.

20 Next is ideas -- you've talked about
21 methodology. We need more in the way of multi-
22 factorial methodologies to test things like natural
23 products, which is a synergism of a lot of things, like
24 in a botanical.

25 You mentioned, Effie, that it won't make much

1 difference to pull one active ingredient out of a
2 botanical. It's the mixture and the synergism. So we
3 need methodologies to be able to test that.

4 There's a difference between the nutritional
5 and the pharmaceutical model and it's got to go way
6 beyond the traditional scientific method of
7 dependent/independent variables.

8 You're right. You need to identify the gaps
9 in the research, identify the good body of research
10 that is there and respect the difference between
11 Eastern and Western medicine. Western medicine, they
12 don't want to put anything into the marketplace until
13 it comes out of the lab and we can analyze why it works
14 ad infinitum, ad nauseam, often.

15 Eastern medicine is often based on
16 empiricism. We know this works. Acupuncture is an
17 example.

18 There was a good comment yesterday that we
19 need to explain these things. Why is Chi, the energy.

20 I remember when I was medical student, I
21 started running into that. The person who taught me
22 most when I was a medical student was probably someone
23 we named Abra, who was the cadaver I dissected in gross
24 anatomy. And I learned then that every organ system,
25 every muscle group is enveloped by connective tissue,

1 fascial planes, fascial layers. And this is what
2 really corresponds to the meridians and acupuncture
3 points.

4 And in all that connective tissue, you've got
5 melanin pigments in all your connective tissue. And
6 there's a long article in one of the old journals,
7 "Melanin, the Organizing Molecule." It's like an
8 electron transport chain. That's where your energy is
9 mediated.

10 So I have a firm belief that all these
11 modalities can in fact and will be explained in terms
12 of all the basic and clinical medical sciences they
13 teach in every medical school.

14 Information is an important part of this.
15 People are empowered by information now and you've got
16 to look at that. We have often an outdated regulatory
17 model. It's not any longer like the Age of Franklin
18 Roosevelt when regulation -- there was an educated
19 class and then everybody else, and the educated class
20 made decisions for all of society. Now every
21 individual is empowered by information at the touch of
22 a button on a computer. The internet. And we need to
23 reformulate for this age and let it be both a bottom up
24 and a top down phenomenon.

25 You're recent conference on integrative

1 cancer therapy was a good example of bottom up, of
2 practitioners from mainstream institutions showing up.
3 But this is a good Commission because you now have an
4 opportunity to make recommendations from the top down
5 so it all meets at the center.

6 I appreciate what you're doing and I just ask
7 you to bring it along a little more effectively, a
8 little further, and focus on some of these things.

9 Thank you.

10 DR. GORDON: Thank you. Thank you very much.

11 Any questions or comments for Maury?

12 (No response.)

13 DR. GORDON: Great. We appreciate your
14 attention and your thoughts.

15 So this is the beginning of the interchange.
16 This is going to grow over time and we welcome any or
17 all of you back. Next time we'll have a couple of
18 hours of comment. Please feel free to keep in touch
19 with us at any time, communicating with us, telling the
20 Commission what your thoughts are about what's
21 happening, what we ought to be considering. And we
22 look forward to this ongoing dialogue.

23 That's the end of the time for public
24 comment.

25 Steve, we have a couple of issues and let's

1 go through them. And then we'll be ready to conclude
2 the meeting.

3 MR. GROFT: We talked about the next meeting.
4 The next whole meeting of the entire group will be the
5 October 5th and 6th dates most likely here in the
6 Washington area. And the announcement will go out much
7 earlier and we will have a greater effort to --

8 DR. GORDON: I think they're not hearing.

9 MR. GROFT: Is this coming through?

10 DR. GORDON: Is it coming through?

11 Beth, Sandy? We want to tell everybody.
12 Barb. We're meeting October 5th and 6th is the next
13 full meeting. Just want to make sure all of you know as
14 well as everybody up here knows about it.

15 MR. GROFT: And so we will get the
16 announcement out and we'll be communicating with you
17 directly. Those who registered today will be getting
18 an announcement of the meeting. And as soon as our
19 website is up and active, we'll be informing the world
20 of this, as well.

21 I think between now and then we expect to
22 hold a couple of town hall meetings. They will be
23 announced as well. And we'll make every effort to
24 contact you and for you to help us contact people at
25 the local areas.

1 We've talked already about the possibility of
2 a town meeting in San Francisco and San Diego. Several
3 Commission members have indicated a willingness to join
4 us there in New York. We've already been talking about
5 later on, another meeting.

6 So we expect to do several town hall meetings
7 throughout the country, not just in metropolitan areas.

8 VOICE: Make sure you do middle America, too,
9 please.

10 MR. GROFT: I'm getting to that. It's not just
11 going to be the large --

12 DR. GORDON: Columbia, South Carolina.

13 MR. GROFT: I think the suggestion was made
14 for utilizing the services of some type of marketing
15 firm to help us. But I think we all know where we
16 should go and I think the Commission members will tell
17 us where else we should go to hold our meetings.

18 Everyone goes to the Coast. They go to
19 Chicago. They go to Denver. They go to Dallas. I
20 think it's incumbent upon us to go other places and to
21 really capture all of America, not just the large
22 cities and not just those who happen to know about
23 complementary and alternative medicine or those who
24 have access to the internet and can gather us. We have
25 to do a better job of going out to where there isn't

1 access to the internet and those who don't know about
2 the benefits of the services that are available through
3 the interventions. That's our responsibility and we'll
4 be spending a lot of effort getting out to all the
5 populations of the country.

6 DR. GORDON: And we do welcome your
7 suggestions about places to go and people to contact
8 about that.

9 MR. GROFT: The other things. We're almost
10 finished with the agenda unless you've got any
11 questions.

12 We talked a little bit about the types of
13 meetings we're going to hold and the like. So -- a few
14 position papers or reviews that we'll have done for the
15 Commission's benefit and we'll be working on those as
16 we go along, too.

17 MS. CHANG: Last night I think it was
18 mentioned that we might want to consider, in addition
19 to the town hall meetings, looking at a chat time on
20 line with the Director, the Chair, or any one of the
21 Commissioners. That people, for example, in college
22 campuses or elsewhere might be able to chat on line and
23 we could offer that technology as well. So any other
24 suggestions, and a beta suggestion like that, please do
25 bring them forward so that we can see the feasibility

1 of that.

2 And I still need two checklists over there.

3 MR. GROFT: We are considering in the future
4 having these actual meetings be live on the internet so
5 we're going to look into the expense of that effort and
6 communicate that out more broadly as well so it will be
7 much more accessible to the public.

8 DR. GORDON: Anything else?

9 MR. GROFT: No.

10 DR. GORDON: So our next step -- there will be
11 a couple of other steps. We will act and get out a
12 communication to all members of Congress, to major
13 health care organizations and associations and citizens
14 groups about the existence of the Commission. We will
15 be sending all of you soon a summary and some ideas
16 about how we're going to proceed. A summary of the
17 meeting and ideas about how we're going to proceed for
18 the next panels on the four topics that we covered, as
19 well as opportunity to talk among ourselves about our
20 overview, our philosophy, the world view of the
21 Commission and of CAM.

22 We will be planning meetings. We've
23 tentatively -- Dean and Effie and I have tentatively
24 scheduled a town hall meeting in San Francisco on
25 September 8th and we'll be talking. Joe and Bill and I

1 are going to talk about meeting in New York soon. And
2 Buford and I were talking about a way to meet
3 representatives of many of the Native American groups
4 at one of their health conferences. And we welcome
5 opportunities to meet, and we want all of you to be
6 thinking about places and times and ways that we can
7 meet with other groups as well.

8 The other thing is that let's be in touch
9 with each other. There'll be discussions on the phone.
10 We'll plan conferences calls pretty soon, right, about
11 -- especially soon about the research group, which will
12 be the next meeting on the 5th and 6th. The group of
13 people who signed up to be part of that, there'll be a
14 conference call fairly soon.

15 There will be conference calls involving and
16 ideas about position papers that we want prepared that
17 will come out of this meeting, and then will come out
18 of the back and forth on the conference calls.

19 So we're going to be moving ahead. We have
20 each others' phone numbers and have each others'
21 addresses. Please be in touch.

22 Commission members, please feel free to be in
23 touch with me any time, any way. And I'll take the
24 liberty of doing the same if that's okay.

25 And I know Steve and Michele will be

1 available and will be working together here.

2 Anything else?

3 MR. CHAPPELL: A clarification, please, on the
4 press release. I believe you're going to be the
5 conduit for any discussion with the public media. On
6 the other hand, I heard you say we could do what we
7 want with a press release. So it's difficult for me to
8 do something with a press release and not be dragged
9 into a conversation with the press about what goes on
10 here. So it really doesn't work for me to promote
11 this, my involvement in this on the one hand, and not
12 have anything to so. So I don't know if that's true of
13 others, but I will not be able to do anything with a
14 press release because it will draw me into discussions
15 which I believe you would like to be the focus and
16 spokesperson for.

17 DR. GORDON: I think there are two aspects of
18 it. The way that I think it makes sense, it may not
19 make complete sense but I think it makes pretty good
20 sense, is that everybody who's on the Commission is
21 here because they think it's an interesting and
22 exciting and an important event and process.

23 MR. CHAPPELL: Speaking for ourselves. Right.

24 DR. GORDON: And I think that you can speak --
25 everybody can speak from his or her own point of view

1 about your involvement. My role is to speak, as I did
2 this morning, to speak for the Commission. This is who
3 we are, this is how we're moving ahead.

4 So if we can make that distinction that's
5 fine.

6 MR. CHAPPELL: Good. Thank you.

7 DR. GORDON: And if somebody wants somebody to
8 speak for the Commission, please refer them to me. But
9 also feel free to say I'm a medical ethicist and I'm an
10 internist and I think this is very important, or I'm a
11 businessman and this is important.

12 DR. PAZ: Also, what I was thinking is that we
13 could be really good focal points for entering lots of
14 information and folks' input into this Commission as
15 well.

16 MR. GROFT: I think you can always give your
17 perspective as a member of the Commission, your own
18 personal perspective, what you feel is important.
19 That's the embodiment of what we're trying to do here.
20 And you are certainly entitled to give that to any of
21 the press members. Anybody who calls you, you can talk
22 about your own personal involvement and your own
23 personal direction and perception of what we're doing,
24 whether you like it or you dislike it, positive or
25 negative. That's your right.

1 So we do not restrict anything. We don't
2 want every Commission member saying I'm speaking for
3 the Commission, but your own personal perspective
4 certainly is welcome and agreed upon.

5 DR. GORDON: Steve, are we going to get out a
6 press release now about what's happened in this
7 meeting? I think we should.

8 MR. GROFT: Probably once we get the summary
9 together from the meeting we'll put some of this out
10 that highlights our schedule of events and the series
11 of activities that we'll be involved with. So it will
12 be more than just a short press release but we want to
13 say you're planning a town meeting for such-and-such a
14 date; our next meeting is such-and-such. Here are some
15 of the issues that we will discuss.

16 We'll be working with the press people to
17 help us formulate that announcement.

18 DR. GORDON: As we get out press releases
19 we'll send them to all the Commission members so that
20 everybody will have whatever comes out.

21 MR. GROFT: The same with the letters that
22 we'll be sending out to -- as it was suggested -- to
23 members of Congress informing them of our activities,
24 as well as the professional societies. These are all
25 activities that we will be initiating.

1 MS. CHOW: And you will include the town hall
2 meetings in your press release?

3 DR. GORDON: Yes.

4 MR. GROFT: Right. And that will be a special
5 announcement itself coming as well.

6 MS. CHOW: Can you give us some guidelines as
7 to town hall meetings in our particular areas? Will we
8 want to involve the governor, the mayors of the cities,
9 from there to the local community people?

10 DR. GORDON: I think that's a wonderful idea.
11 I think that each one will probably be somewhat
12 different and I had not thought of that but it's
13 obvious and it's terrific.

14 So I think that what we'll try to do, what we
15 will do, is with the first couple we'll develop how we
16 do it, and then as we do each one we'll let everybody
17 know how we've done it. And that will be something for
18 people to build on.

19 So if we can talk about who to involve and
20 how to do that, then we'll kind of build a body of
21 knowledge about how to create town meetings.

22 MS. CHOW: I know the Congress people and the
23 Senators and the mayor have been much involved with
24 activities with us, so we would involve them.

25 MR. GROFT: That's why I think our

1 conversations with you -- for you to identify who are
2 the local individuals that we should contact. And I
3 think we also will identify people who we need to
4 contact. For example, those in the state government
5 who are responsible for licensure and credentialing.
6 We want to make sure that they are invited to attend.
7 The providers of insurance and the payors, we want to
8 make sure that they are available and they're aware of
9 what's going on.

10 So looking at the issues, we then will try to
11 identify the players that we want to inform of our
12 activities, as well as get their input into our
13 questions that we will develop. Because we will
14 develop a series of questions for people to address at
15 these meetings.

16 MS. CHOW: I hope the questions will kind of
17 run in the same vein as our discussions so that it's a
18 consistency of what our discussion is and then the town
19 hall.

20 MR. GROFT: They will but they'll be a little
21 bit different because we want to get their perceptions
22 and their needs so that we can come back and formulate
23 policy recommendations.

24 MS. CHOW: But it will be still on the same
25 subject.

1 MR. GROFT: Right.

2 DR. GORDON: Well, no. I think the subjects
3 will be very different, to tell you the truth. And I
4 don't know ahead of time what they're going to be
5 because there may be a very different issue in the
6 Native American community in Oklahoma than there is in
7 an urban setting in New York.

8 MS. CHOW: Of course. Yes.

9 DR. GORDON: And there will certainly be
10 differences between the health -- there may be a
11 preponderance of health professionals who for whatever
12 reason will show up at one meeting and a preponderance
13 of mothers with young children at another meeting.

14 So I think the issues are going -- and that's
15 part of the beauty of it is that we expect very -- we
16 want to open it so that people can address the issues
17 that are important to them, just as Tony raised an
18 issue that was somewhere in the back of my mind and
19 maybe in the backs of some of your minds. We didn't
20 bring it forward and then he brought it out. And just
21 as Beth made the suggestion about communicating with
22 Congress.

23 I think this is what we want to encourage is
24 all the things that we can't think about in advance and
25 really be open to those.

1 MR. DEVRIES: Excuse me. A question regarding
2 town meetings. Some of us, myself in particular, work
3 with providers and health plans locally all across the
4 country and certainly have the ability, for example, in
5 the San Francisco Bay Area, our company provides
6 complementary and alternative medicine benefits for
7 most of the health plans up in the San Francisco Bay
8 Area. And we contract with over 1,000 complementary
9 and alternative medicine providers in the San Francisco
10 area.

11 And so would you like other Commissioners to
12 support those efforts in other parts of the country
13 even though we're not located there.

14 DR. GORDON: Absolutely.

15 MR. DEVRIES: Be more than glad to, at least
16 from our perspective and involvement.

17 DR. GORDON: Great. Okay.

18 Anything else?

19 (No response.)

20 Thank you all very much. I have to say this
21 is a wonderful group. I really am enjoying our work
22 together and I really feel like with our remarkable
23 diversity there's also a wonderful respect and a very
24 exciting kind of convergence that we're experiencing.

25 So it's great to be with you and look forward

1 to seeing you next time.

2 Thank you all. And thank you, Michele and
3 Steve and Jerry for making it possible for us to move
4 forward.

5 MS. CHOW: I just want to thank Steve and Jim
6 for running this thing so well. I think they deserve
7 applause, and the staff.

8 (Whereupon, the proceedings were concluded at
9 2:20 p.m.)

1
2 REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE

3 This is to certify that the attached
4 proceedings before: WHITE HOUSE COMMISSION
5

6
7 In the Matter of:

8 PLANNING MEETING
9

10
11
12 were held as herein appears and that this is the
13 original transcript thereof for the file of the
14 Department, Commission, Administrative Law Judge
15 or the Agency.

16 EXECUTIVE COURT REPORTERS, INC.
17 1320 Fenwick Lane, Suite 702
 Silver Spring, MD 20910
 (301) 565-0064

18 _____
 Official Reporter

19
20 Dated: JULY 13&14, 2000
21