

FOIA MARKER

This is not a textual record. This is used as an administrative marker by the Clinton Presidential Library Staff.

Folder Title:

JHG [John H. Gibbons] Meetings with Russian S & T [Science & Technology] Officials

Staff Office-Individual:

Science Technology Policy-Gibbons, John

Original OA/ID Number:

CF 100

Row:	Section:	Shelf:	Position:	Stack:
23	6	11	1	V

John O

EXECUTIVE OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
OFFICE OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY POLICY
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20506

April 7, 1993

MEMORANDUM FOR JOHN H. GIBBONS

THROUGH: J. THOMAS RATCHFORD

FROM: JOHN F. O'NEIL

SUBJECT: MEETING WITH RUSSIAN MINISTER BORIS SALTYKOV

Bob Clarke, U.S. Science Counsellor at the Embassy in Moscow, has sent a cable reporting on a conversation with Minister Saltykov and a staffer in the Ministry. In the cable (attached), Bob relays that Lev Mukhin, Russian Science Counsellor in Washington, was misinformed and therefore misrepresented to you Minister Saltykov's desires and availability for meetings later this month.

In sum, Saltykov will be in the U.S. for three days only, April 19-21, 1993. Saltykov himself told Clarke that he would not be prepared to conduct a Basic Sciences Joint Commission Meeting. Bob reports that Saltykov's objective is to meet with S&T officials in the new Administration and that he very much wants to meet with you. Saltykov will be prepared to discuss next steps for the Agreement.

OK
Since Saltykov must be in Moscow for a 8:00 AM meeting on Thursday, April 22, 1993, he will be unable to meet with you on April 21, 1993, as planned. However, there is time on Monday afternoon, April 19, 1993, for the informal meeting you described to Mukhin. As you suggested, the agenda could focus on basic science, particularly whether the Basic Sciences Agreement should be renewed and in what form that should be done, and cover aspects of other avenues for S&T cooperation between the U.S. and Russia.

You may wish to consider including one or two other S&T officials in your meeting. Possibilities include Ash Carter who is concerned with S&T policy issues pertaining to the International Science and Technology Center in Moscow, and Tim Wirth or Eleanor Constance from State who are concerned with the broader S&T policy issues of cooperation with Russia.

It would also be possible to arrange a dinner for the evening of April 19, 1993, if you yes would like to consider that option.

Attachment

People to invite to join for informal discussions

- Ash Carter
- Leon Furth: energy, space
- E. Constance (State)
- Rose - (use)

JHG spoke to him

US/Russia

Leon Fuerth

origin: Russian proposal from foreign minister - need top-level people to bind - dog the activity. Learned ^{a lot} from earlier exercise re arms control. Seems the Russians look at these things differently from them.

security side of MIR. Russ-India contract: violates ^{on 1st stage} US rules set by Gove - They're ready to accommodate our quiet progress:

① commercial space mkt.

② Space sta. redesign.

if they accommodate.

\$: use less US \$; use > roubles
but don't screw our partners, Boeing, ...

ie. It's a possible win-win.

✓ \$ send the Lockheed / Proton paper to Leon PDQ

Dept. of State draft ^{letter} Gove - Chelamundyn for Gove to send

Alt: Gove chair a meeting

Ron Brown / Chalkin group: investment opportunities.

Energy person, experience in Russia? ^{suggested} Tony's joint hire
(re White Nights project)

Dan Tominian called re how to put together a Space group -
nucleus = Put together a group like that was used to prepare for summit.
Issue = how to link to private enterprise

Station: launcher, ... have to develop faster -
yesterday = Bez Aldrin: Use MIR as conjunction piece
change MIR orbit to access US station -

Can NASA go for option that they're talking about?

logical players (span) JH6, NASA

Bonemin (non-publi)

NBC

OSTP

UNCLASSIFIED

<DIST> SIT: VAX

<PREC> IMMEDIATE<CLAS> UNCLASSIFIED<OSRI> RUEHLNA<DTG> 140857Z APR 93
<ORIG> AMCONSUL ST PETERSBURG
<TO> RHEHAAA/WHITEHOUSE WASHDC IMMEDIATE
INFO RUEHC/SECSTATE WASHDC PRIORITY 4347
RUEHMO/AMEMBASSY MOSCOW PRIORITY 3259

O'Neil

<SUBJ> AMERICAN HOPES TO ASSURE THAT RUSSIAN
SCIENTISTS CONRINUE TO RECEIVE S&T PUBLICATIONS

<TEXT>

UNCLAS ST PETERSBURG 01062
WHITE HOUSE FOR OSTP FOR O'NEIL; FROM CONSUL GENERAL
E.O. 12356: N/A

TAGS: TSPL, PREL, ECON, EAID, RS, US

SUBJECT: AMERICAN HOPES TO ASSURE THAT RUSSIAN
SCIENTISTS CONRINUE TO RECEIVE S&T PUBLICATIONS

1. WITH THIS MESSAGE, WE SEEK TO ALERT OSTP TO
POSSIBLE CALL FROM EITHER DR WARREN MUIR, AN AMERICAN
ENVIRONMENTAL CONSULTANT WHO WORKED EARLIER AS DEPUTY
ASSISTANT ADMINISTRATOR AT EPA, OR DR ZHORES ALFEROV,
VICE-PRESIDENT OF THE RUSSIAN ACADEMY OF SCIENCES AND
HEAD OF THE ACADEMY IN NORTHWEST RUSSIA. ALFEROV,
WHO IS VISITING WASHINGTON THIS WEEK, WILL BE
SPEAKING WITH MUIR, WHO VISITED ST PETERSBURG IN
EARLY FEBRUARY AND TALKED WITH ACADEMY OFFICERS HERE,
ABOUT MUIR'S IDEAS ON WAYS TO ASSURE THAT RUSSIAN
SCIENTISTS CAN CONTINUE TO RECEIVE SCIENTIFIC
PUBLICATIONS DESPITE THEIR INSTITUTIONS' AND THEIR
OWN SERIOUS DIFFICULTIES WITH HARD CURRENCY. SINCE
THE VISIT HERE, MUIR REPORTS HAVING SPOKEN WITH,
INTER ALIA, THE AMERICAN CHEMICAL SOCIETY, EPA, AND
SOROS FOUNDATION. MUIR HAS OFFICES IN ALEXANDRIA
(TELEPHONES 780-7474; 683-6695).

2. CONSULATE GENERAL SUPPORTS THIS IDEA AND WOULD BE
HAPPY TO HELP IN ITS IMPLEMENTATION. GOSNELL
NNNN

<SECT> SECTION: 01 OF 01<SSN> 1062<STOR> 930414045753 M0338038
<TOR> 930414050824

UNCLASSIFIED

OSTP

UNCLASSIFIED

<DIST> SIT: VAX

<PREC> IMMEDIATE<CLAS> UNCLASSIFIED<OSRI> RUEHCAA<DTG> 131653Z APR 93
<ORIG> SECSTATE WASHDC
<TO> AMEMBASSY MOSCOW IMMEDIATE 0000

<SUBJ> SALTYKOV'S APRIL 19-20TH MEETINGS WITH US SCIENCE OFFICIALS

O'Neil

<TEXT>

UNCLAS STATE 111039

FOR S&T COUNSELOR

E.O. 12356: N/A

TAGS: TSPL TRGY PGOV RS

SUBJECT: SALTYKOV'S APRIL 19-20TH MEETINGS WITH US SCIENCE OFFICIALS

REF: (A) 93 MOSCOW 10728

1. THIS IS AN ACTION CABLE. EMBASSY IS REQUESTED TO DELIVER LETTER (PARA 6) FROM JOHN H. GIBBONS, ASSISTANT TO THE PRESIDENT FOR SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY, TO BORIS SALTYKOV, RUSSIAN MINISTER FOR SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY POLICY (ORIGINAL IS BEING POUCHED TO EMBASSY), AND REVIEW WITH MINSCI INFORMATION (PARAS 2-5) REGARDING MINISTER SALTYKOV'S APRIL 19-20TH VISIT TO WASHINGTON.

2. U.S. AGREES WITH RUSSIAN VIEW (REFTEL) THAT MEETINGS SCHEDULED WITH MINISTER SALTYKOV APRIL 19-20 WILL BE GET ACQUAINTED SESSIONS THAT PROVIDE AN OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS A WIDE RANGE OF S&T ISSUES. THEY WILL NOT SUBSTITUTE FOR EITHER THE BASIC SCIENCES JCM OR THE SUMMIT FOLLOW-ON CONSULTATIONS.

3. THE CURRENT SCHEDULE OF APPOINTMENTS FOR MINISTER SALTYKOV IS AS FOLLOWS:

MONDAY, APRIL 19: 1:30 - 4:00 PM DR. GIBBONS (FOR EMBASSY INFORMATION, DR. GIBBONS IS REQUESTING REPRESENTATIVES FROM STATE, DOD, THE NSC AND THE OFFICE OF THE VICE PRESIDENT TO ATTEND);

TUESDAY, APRIL 20: 2:30 PM UNDER SECRETARY-DESIGNATE WIRTH

4. WE ARE ATTEMPTING TO SCHEDULE AN APPOINTMENT WITH STROBE TALBOTT, AMBASSADOR-AT-LARGE AND SPECIAL ADVISOR TO THE SECRETARY FOR THE NEW INDEPENDENT STATES, AND WITH NSF DEPUTY DIRECTOR BERNTHAL. WE REGRET THAT WE HAVE TO SCHEDULE APPOINTMENTS DURING THE GEORGETOWN UNIVERSITY CONFERENCE, BUT NOT ALL U.S. OFFICIALS ARE AVAILABLE ON THE 19TH.

5. EMBASSY SHOULD CONFIRM THAT THIS SCHEDULE IS ACCEPTABLE TO MINSCI AND RELAY ANY ADDITIONAL REQUESTS FOR APPOINTMENTS. WE ARE EXPECTING DEPUTY MINISTER YAKOBASHVILI, DMITRI PISKUNOV, CHAIRMAN OF THE STATE COMMITTEE FOR INDUSTRIAL POLICY, AND PROBABLY A RUSSIAN EMBASSY OFFICER, TO ACCOMPANY MINISTER SALTYKOV TO ALL MEETINGS (WE HAVE ARRANGED FOR AN INTERPRETER TO BE PRESENT FOR THE AFTERNOON SESSIONS ON THE 19TH AND 20TH). PLEASE CONFIRM WITH MINSCI AND ADVISE US IF THE MINISTER EXPECTS TO BRING ADDITIONAL STAFF.

6. BEGIN TEXT OF GIBBONS-SALTYKOV LETTER:

APRIL 9, 1993

DEAR MINISTER SALTYKOV:

THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR KIND LETTER OF CONGRATULATIONS. I AM STILL ADJUSTING TO MY NEW POSITION AND IT IS COMFORTING TO HEAR FROM A COLLEAGUE SUCH AS YOURSELF WHO UNDERSTANDS THE ISSUES AND PROBLEMS WE FACE

UNCLASSIFIED

OSTP

UNCLASSIFIED

IN SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY POLICY. I LOOK FORWARD VERY MUCH TO MEETING YOU IN PERSON WHEN YOU TRAVEL TO WASHINGTON TO PARTICIPATE IN THE GEORGETOWN CONFERENCE ON "SCIENCE IN RUSSIA IN THE TRANSITION PERIOD" ON APRIL 20, 1993. I HOPE TO PARTICIPATE IN THE CONFERENCE WITH YOU, ALTHOUGH MY SCHEDULE MAY NOT PERMIT IT.

I APPRECIATE YOUR ASSURANCE ON CONTINUING AND EXPANDING THE FRUITFUL COOPERATION OUR TWO COUNTRIES HAVE ENJOYED UNDER THE AGREEMENT FOR COOPERATION IN THE FIELD OF BASIC SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH. I WOULD LIKE TO REASSURE YOU OF THE INTEREST IN THE UNITED STATES IN CONTINUING THE FRUITFUL COOPERATION BEGUN UNDER THIS AGREEMENT FOUR YEARS AGO. IN FACT, I WOULD LIKE VERY MUCH TO DISCUSS BASIC SCIENCE COOPERATION WITH YOU, ALONG WITH OTHER MATTERS, WHILE YOU ARE IN WASHINGTON. PERHAPS WE COULD MEET ON APRIL 19, 1993, THE DAY BEFORE THE GEORGETOWN CONFERENCE, IN THE AFTERNOON.

AS THE SUMMIT CLEARLY EMPHASIZED, THE UNITED STATES REMAINS COMMITTED TO EXPANDING THE SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY INTERACTION BETWEEN OUR TWO COUNTRIES. IN THIS REGARD, I LOOK FORWARD TO BUILDING ON THE PROGRESS THAT YOU AND MY PREDECESSOR, ALLAN BROMLEY, ACHIEVED IN ADVANCING OUR SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY RELATIONSHIP. CAPITALIZING ON THE MOMENTUM FROM THE SUMMIT, I BELIEVE WE WILL HAVE AMPLE OPPORTUNITIES FOR JUST THIS IN THE NEAR FUTURE.

UNTIL WE MEET IN WASHINGTON, I WISH YOU EVERY SUCCESS.

SINCERELY,

JOHN H. GIBBONS

ASSISTANT TO THE PRESIDENT
FOR

SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY

DR. BORIS G. SALTYKOV

MINISTER FOR SCIENCE, HIGHER

EDUCATION, AND TECHNOLOGY POLICY

11 TVERSKAYA STREET

MOSCOW, RUSSIAN FEDERATION

END TEXT OF LETTER.

WHARTON

NNNN

<SECT> SECTION: 01 OF 01<SSN> 1039<STOR> 930413125509 M0336951
<TOR> 930413130159

UNCLASSIFIED

2

OSTP

UNCLASSIFIED

<DIST> SIT: VAX WHSR_IN

<PREC> ROUTINE<CLAS> UNCLASSIFIED<OSRI> RUEHMOA<DTG> 141628Z APR 93

<ORIG> AMEMBASSY MOSCOW

<TO> RUEHC/SECSTATE WASHDC 0263

RHEHAAA/WHITEHOUSE WASHDC

<SUBJ> SCIENCE MINISTER SALTYSKOV'S APRIL 19-20
MEETINGS WITH USG OFFICIALS

<TEXT>

UNCLAS MOSCOW 011150

DEPT. FOR EUR/ISCA/CAST (BARKLEY/HARNISH), AND

OES/SCT (CAMPBELL)

WHITEHOUSE FOR OSTP (O'NEIL)

E.O. 12356: N/A

TAGS: TSPL, TRGY, PGOV, RS, US

SUBJECT: SCIENCE MINISTER SALTYSKOV'S APRIL 19-20

MEETINGS WITH USG OFFICIALS

REF: (A) STATE 111039

1. S&TOFF DELIVERED LETTER (REFTEL) FROM SCIENCE
ADVISOR GIBBONS, ADDRESSED TO MINISTRY OF SCIENCE
MINISTER (MINSCI) SALTYSKOV, TO MINSCI INTERNATIONAL
AFFAIRS STAFFER VLADIMIR TYSHCHENKO. TYSHCHENKO
STATED THAT MINSCI IS SATISFIED WITH THE MEETINGS
SCHEDULED (INCLUDING PROPOSED MEETINGS WITH AMB.
TALBOTT AND NSF DEPUTY DIRECTOR BERNTHAL) AND HAD NO
ADDITIONAL MEETING REQUESTS.

2. IN ADDITION TO THE RUSSIAN OFFICIALS LISTED
REFTEL, MFA DIRECTOR OF THE DEPARTMENT OF
INTERNATIONAL SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY COOPERATION,
SERGEI KISLYAK, WILL ACCOMPANY SALTYSKOV TO AT LEAST
SOME OF HIS MEETINGS WITH USG OFFICIALS. ACCORDING
TO TYSHCHENKO THE OTHER RUSSIAN SCIENCE OFFICIALS
ATTENDING THE CONFERENCE AT GEORGETOWN UNIVERSITY
WILL NOT ATTEND SALTYSKOV MEETINGS WITH USG
OFFICIALS. COLLINS
NNNN

<SECT> SECTION: 01 OF 01<SSN> 1150<STOR> 930414123252 M0338873

<TOR> 930414125056

O'Neil
~~Patchford~~
~~Schwitzer~~

UNCLASSIFIED

John - Please call Sue - 4/7

Sue Bactel wants to
know exactly how much
time she should schedule
for the JHG meeting w/ Saltykov
on the afternoon of 4/19. j

EXECUTIVE OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
OFFICE OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY POLICY
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20506

April 7, 1993

MEMORANDUM FOR JOHN H. GIBBONS

THROUGH: J. THOMAS RATCHFORD

FROM: JOHN F. O'NEIL 

SUBJECT: MEETING WITH RUSSIAN MINISTER BORIS SALTYKOV

Bob Clarke, U.S. Science Counsellor at the Embassy in Moscow, has sent a cable reporting on a conversation with Minister Saltykov and a staffer in the Ministry. In the cable (attached), Bob relays that Lev Mukhin, Russian Science Counsellor in Washington, was misinformed and therefore misrepresented to you Minister Saltykov's desires and availability for meetings later this month.

In sum, Saltykov will be in the U.S. for three days only, April 19-21, 1993. Saltykov himself told Clarke that he would not be prepared to conduct a Basic Sciences Joint Commission Meeting. Bob reports that Saltykov's objective is to meet with S&T officials in the new Administration and that he very much wants to meet with you. Saltykov will be prepared to discuss next steps for the Agreement.

Since Saltykov must be in Moscow for a 8:00 AM meeting on Thursday, April 22, 1993, he will be unable to meet with you on April 21, 1993, as planned. However, there is time on Monday afternoon, April 19, 1993, for the informal meeting you described to Mukhin. As you suggested, the agenda could focus on basic science, particularly whether the Basic Sciences Agreement should be renewed and in what form that should be done, and cover aspects of other avenues for S&T cooperation between the U.S. and Russia.

You may wish to consider including one or two other S&T officials in your meeting. Possibilities include Ash Carter who is concerned with S&T policy issues pertaining to the International Science and Technology Center in Moscow, and Tim Wirth or Eleanor Constable from State who are concerned with the broader S&T policy issues of cooperation with Russia.

It would also be possible to arrange a dinner for the evening of April 19, 1993, if you would like to consider that option.

Attachment

UNCLASSIFIED

FROM: Anne T. Wishard
DATE: 04-05-93 03:19:27 PM
SUBJECT: SUBJECT: SCIENCE MINISTER SALTYSKOV
COMMENTS: Mukhin-Saltykov

CONTROLS:
UNCLAS MOSCOW 009973

DEPARTMENT FOR OES/SCT (CAMPBELL), EUR/ISCA/CAST (BARKLEY)
WHITE HOUSE FOR OSTP

E.O. 12356: N/A

BODY:

TAGS: TSPL, PGOV, RS, US
SUBJECT: SCIENCE MINISTER SALTYSKOV'S VISIT TO
WASHINGTON

1. AT AN APRIL 2 CEREMONY MARKING THE SOROS SCIENCE FOUNDATION'S AWARD OF USD 10 MILLION IN GRANTS TO SCIENTISTS (REPORTED SEPTEL), SCIENCE MINISTER BORIS SALTYSKOV SPOKE TO S&TCOUNS ABOUT HIS PENDING VISIT TO WASHINGTON, NOW SLATED FOR APRIL 19 TO 21. SALTYSKOV SAID HE IS EAGER TO MEET THE NEW ADMINISTRATION'S SCIENCE POLICY OFFICIALS, INCLUDING OSTP'S DR. GIBBONS AND AMBASSADOR TALBOTT.
2. SALTYSKOV SAID HE IS NOT PREPARED TO HOLD A BASIC SCIENCE JC MEETING DURING HIS VISIT, BUT WOULD BE READY TO DISCUSS NEXT STEPS FOR THE BASIC SCIENCE AGREEMENT.
3. VLADIMIR TYSHCHENKO OF THE SCIENCE MINISTRY'S USA DESK, ALSO AT THE CEREMONY, TOLD S&TCOUNS THAT RUSSIAN SCIENCE COUNSELOR MUKHIN WAS MISINFORMED IN HIS RECENT MEETINGS WITH U.S. OFFICIALS IN WASHINGTON IN AGREEING TO HOLD A JC IN APRIL. TYSHCHENKO REITERATED THAT HE PURPOSE OF SALTYSKOV' U.S. VISIT IS TO FAMILIARIZE HIMSELF WITH THE NEW ADMINISTRATION AND DISCUSS NEXT STEPS IN DEEPENING U.S.-RUSSIAN S&T COOPERATION.
4. SEPARATELY, SALTYSKOV TOLD S&TCOUNS THAT HE WAS REMOVED FROM HIS POST AS DEPUTY PRIME MINISTER NOT BY HIS OWN CHOICE, BUT DUE TO POLITICAL REASONS HE CLAIMS NOT TO FULLY UNDERSTAND. HE SAID HE HAD MOVED BACK TO HIS OFFICES IN THE SCIENCE MINISTRY AND IS PLEASED TO BE FOCUSING EXCLUSIVELY ON SCIENCE ISSUES.
YALOWITZ

UNCLASSIFIED

INCOMING
TELEGRAMUNCLASSIFIED
Department of StatePAGE 01
ACTION QES-09 MOSCOW 11150 141832Z

SPR411R

INFO	LOG-00	ACDA-17	AID-00	AMAD-01	BIB-01	CEQ-01	CIAE-00
	CIP-10	COME-00	C-01	OASY-00	DINT-05	CODE-00	DOEE-00
	ITCE-00	CISA-00	EB-00	EUR-00	HA-09	H-01	TEDE-00
	INR-00	IO-19	ITC-01	L-00	MCO-00	ADS-00	MOFM-04
	MOF-03	M-01	NASA-02	NAS-01	NRC-03	NRRC-00	NSAE-00
	NSF-02	OIC-02	OMB-01	PA-02	PM-00	PRS-01	P-01
	SCT-03	SDEL-00	SIL-00	SNP-00	SP-00	SSO-00	SS-00
	STR-17	TRSE-00	TST-00	T-00	USIE-00	SA-00	EPAE-00
	RPE-01	SNIS-00	/129W				

-----B333A7 141850Z /38

R 141628Z APR 93
FM AMEMBASSY MOSCOW
TO SECSTATE WASHDC 0263
WHITEHOUSE WASHDC

UNCLAS MOSCOW 011150

DEPT. FOR EUR/ISCA/CAST (BARKLEY/HARNISH). AND
OES/SCT (CAMPBELL)

WHITEHOUSE FOR OSTP (O'NEIL)

E.O. 12958. N/A
TAGS: TSPL, TRGY, FGOV, RS, US
SUBJECT: SCIENCE MINISTER SALTUKOV'S APRIL 19-20
MEETINGS WITH USG OFFICIALS

REF: (A) STATE 111039

1. S&TOFF DELIVERED LETTER (REFTEL) FROM SCIENCE
ADVISOR GIBBONS. ADDRESSED TO MINISTRY OF SCIENCE
MINISTER (MINSCI) SALTUKOV, TO MINSCI INTERNATIONAL
AFFAIRS STAFFER VLADIMIR TYSHCHENKO. TYSHCHENKO
STATED THAT MINSCI IS SATISFIED WITH THE MEETINGS
SCHEDULED (INCLUDING PROPOSED MEETINGS WITH AMB.
TALBOTT AND NSF DEPUTY DIRECTOR BERNTHAL) AND HAD NO
ADDITIONAL MEETING REQUESTS.

2. IN ADDITION TO THE RUSSIAN OFFICIALS LISTED
REFTEL, MFA DIRECTOR OF THE DEPARTMENT OF
INTERNATIONAL SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY COOPERATION,
SERGEI KIELYAK, WILL ACCOMPANY SALTUKOV TO AT LEAST
SOME OF HIS MEETINGS WITH USG OFFICIALS. ACCORDING
TO TYSHCHENKO THE OTHER RUSSIAN SCIENCE OFFICIALS
ATTENDING THE CONFERENCE AT GEORGETOWN UNIVERSITY
WILL NOT ATTEND SALTUKOV MEETINGS WITH USG
OFFICIALS. COLLINS

UNCLASSIFIED

TOTAL F.02

4/15/93 2:57PM

From : gsher at nsf15
To : John O'Neil Fax#93951572 at FAX
Receipt requested
Subject : Correspondence with Tyshchenko

Forwarded with Changes

4/15/93 2:57PM

From : gsher at nsf15
To : "TYCHTCHENKO V.I." at NOTE
cc : cturczak
mbalis at NOTE
Subject : Re: us-russia cooperation in s&t

Message Contents

John:

Here is the exchange of correspondence I had with Tyshchenko. Also, this is to confirm that Yakobashvili's hotel expenses for the two nights of April 18-19 will indeed be covered through Georgetown.

Gerson

=====

Dear Vladimir:

I am delighted that we are now in e-mail contact. It is indeed a very convenient form of communication and I am glad you are using it.

Thank you very much for the information about the internship issue. Yesterday when I was out, Gonchar called me twice but did not leave a message. Perhaps he had some information. In any event I will look forward to hearing more.

Thanks also for the information about the visits of Drs. Saltykov and Yakobashvili. My office, especially Cassandra Turczak, is deeply involved in planning these visits and I believe there will be a discussion at NSF on Monday morning, April 19.

I knew you would be unhappy with me about visiting Kiev but not Moscow. Maybe you will feel a little better if I tell you that I was not traveling on NSF business, but rather on business of the International Science Foundation for the FSU (Soros). I am presently in a "transitional period" because in about a month I will take a two-year leave of absence from NSF to become the Associate Director of the ISF. This is a very big job with very big problems but I am looking forward to it with enthusiasm because of the tremendous opportunities. In this capacity, indeed, I expect to travel much more often to Moscow, Kiev, etc. than I have done at the NSF. Anyway, I am sure you agree that transitional periods are always difficult; I am doing two jobs at once and have discovered that it is better to

do one job at a time.

I am sorry that I will not be seeing you next week in Washington but am sure that we will meet soon, somewhere. By the way, when you send me e-mail messages, please send a copy to Cassandra Turczak (cturczak@nsf.gov) and one or the other of us will be sure to read them right away.

Best regards,

Gerson

----- Original Header Lines (From NOTE) -----
Organization: Department of International Science and Technology
Cooperation
X-Mailer: BML [MS/DOS Beauty Mail v.1.30]
----- Message Contents -----

Dear Gerson,

I am so happy to receive your reply on my messages sent earlier to you. It is my first E-mail which went through to the U.S.A. Time delay of our messages depends on our service system named REALCOM, which operates like a post-box. This was explained to me by those, who installed an E-mail modem on my pc. Now I feel very comfortable to have such convenient instrument for quick communication.

First of all about a proposal on four-six month internship at NSF for Russian representative. I spoke already twice with Mr.A.A.Gonchar and he promised every time to have a decision soon on selection a candidature for this case. But until now this question still is under consideration.

I am trying to accelerate this matter and hope that Dr.B.G.Saltykov will bring in some form a corresponding decision. I also know that A.A.Gonchar would like to discuss possibilities of sending several specialists for training to NSF but with short durations, say, for two months but three persons. I do not really know whether he would raise this question to NSF.

Dr.B.G.Saltykov will be in Washington with a very short visit at the invitation of Dr.Harley D.Balzer from Georgetown University to participate in the Conference on Science and Technology. A rather large team from Russia will accompany Dr.B.G.Saltykov.

In addition we have requested the U.S.A. Embassy in Moscow and Dr.Balzer to arrange for Dr. B.G.Saltykov meetings with new high officials of the Science and Technology sphere, particularly with Mr.John Gibbons, with Mr.Strobe Talbott, with new administration of the NSF and the National Academy of Science.

I know that Dr.Balzer is involved directly with scheduling of Dr.Saltykov program, which is very intensive and very short, because he should be in Moscow in the morning on April 22 to participate in the Council of Ministers meeting. Dr.Saltykov will arrive to Washington on April 17.

His deputy Zurab A.Yakobashvili's visit to the U.S.A. is organized at the invitation of the International Visit Program of the US Information Agency. Now Mr.Yakobashvili is in France and as it is planned he should arrive from Paris to Washington on April 18.

He will join Dr.Saltykov's meeting program and after his departure Mr.Yakobashvili will continue meetings and negotiations in order to arrange a practical program of the US-Russia cooperation in the field of Science and Technology. He will stay in the U.S.A. approximately until April 27.

I do not go neither with Dr.Saltykov, nor with Mr.Yakobashvili, because

they are accomponed already by a large team and somebody should do here a homework.

It seems to me that you should visit our Ministry and other governmental organizations here more often. Taking into consideration that you just visited Kiev, which is less than two-hour flight from us, I can only say shame on you because we have so many issues to discuss and exchange views. We badly need here to know who came with a new Administration, new directions in our cooperations, especially with the NSF. We have difficulties to finance many trips to the U.S.A. and that is why we prefer to have american representatives in Moscow to discuss and coordinate our joint actions. I am sorry for such a long letter but I tried to reply on all your comments which may help you to understand what is going on on our side.

With best reqard,

Vladimir Tychtchenko
Moscow, April 13, 1993.

EXECUTIVE OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
OFFICE OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY POLICY
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20506

April 2, 1993

MEMORANDUM FOR JOHN H. GIBBONS

THROUGH: J. THOMAS RATCHFORD *JTR*
FROM: JOHN F. O'NEIL *JFO*
SUBJECT: VISIT BY ACADEMICIAN YURI OSIPOV
PRESIDENT, RUSSIAN ACADEMY OF SCIENCES (RAS)
MONDAY, APRIL 5, 1993
9:00 AM IN ROOM 180, OEOB

Dr. Osipov will be accompanied by Dr. Rem Petrov, a Vice-President of RAS, and Igor Makharov, RAS Main Scientific Secretary. Dr. Osipov does not speak English. Dr. Anatoly Shurygin of the Russian Embassy will also attend the meeting and act as interpreter.

Dr. Ratchford, Zoltan Annau from State, and I will join you.

This meeting will be limited to 30 minutes because of your busy schedule on Monday. It should provide an opportunity for you to start meeting personalities in the Russian S&T community and to hear firsthand how political and economic developments are affecting S&T in Russia. It will also provide a glimpse into the different constituencies and philosophies interacting in the Russian S&T scene in the midst of other turmoil.

Dr. Osipov was instrumental in formation of the Russian Academy and was chosen its first President. He was also chosen to continue as President after the Russian Academy merged with the old Soviet Academy of Sciences. As President, he was saddled with a huge bureaucracy and then forced to seek financial support from sources other than the government. I understand that Premier Chernomyrdin has invited Dr. Osipov to attend at least some cabinet meetings and that Chernomyrdin is more receptive to S&T issues than his predecessor.

Attached is a biography on Dr. Osipov and a short piece on "Russian S&T Developments." Additional classified material will be available on Monday morning.

Talking points, including a few questions you may want to ask Dr. Osipov, are also attached.

TALKING POINTS

WELCOME

**VERY PLEASED TO ESTABLISH A RELATIONSHIP WITH THE RUSSIAN
ACADEMY OF SCIENCES**

WHAT BUSINESS BRINGS YOU TO THE UNITED STATES?

**I AM INTERESTED IN YOUR ASSESSMENT OF THE PROSPECTS FOR SCIENCE
IN RUSSIA, INCLUDING THE BUDGET AND NEW GOVERNMENT PRIORITIES.**

**IS THERE SUPPORT FOR SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY IN THE GOVERNMENT
AND THE LEGISLATURE?**

**WE ARE VERY INTERESTED IN REFORMS IN SCIENCE IN RUSSIA. WOULD
YOU PLEASE GIVE US YOUR PERSPECTIVE ON REFORM EFFORTS IN S&T?**

**I HAVE HEARD ABOUT A FOUNDATION FOR BASIC RESEARCH IN RUSSIA.
CAN YOU SHARE WITH US DEVELOPMENTS WITH THE FOUNDATION?**

**ARE THE FUNDS BEING DISTRIBUTED ON A PROJECT-BY-PROJECT
BASIS OR IN GRANTS TO INSTITUTES?**

ARE THE FUNDING LEVELS ADEQUATE?

WHAT SUPPORT, IF ANY, COMES FROM THE MILITARY TODAY?

HOW ARE WESTERN INITIATIVES TO SUPPORT OR ASSIST S&T IN RUSSIA PERCEIVED IN RUSSIA?

ARE YOU RECEIVING FUNDS FROM OTHER COUNTRIES?

ARE THERE EFFORTS WITHIN RUSSIA TO FACILITATE SUCH SUPPORT, FOR EXAMPLE TAX EXEMPTION PROVISIONS OR MATCHING FUNDS IN RUBLES?

HOW DOES THE S&T ESTABLISHMENT VIEW THE DEBATE OVER REFORM?

CAN YOU TELL ME WHAT NIKOLAY MALYSHEV'S POSITION IS?

WHAT ARE MINISTER SALTYKOV'S RESPONSIBILITIES NOW AND IS HIS POSITION IN THE GOVERNMENT WEAKENED?

Russian S&T Developments

One year after the collapse of the USSR, the Russian S&T establishment is in turmoil and transition, and there is no consensus within Yel'tsin's government or the scientific community about how to restructure science with the transition to a market economy. Although policymakers have outlined some general principles to steer scientific reform, little progress has been made in implementing institutional change. In general, science policy has become mired in bureaucratic infighting as a result of its declining priority and severe cutbacks in government funding. Meanwhile at the grassroots individual scientists are finding their once secure ivory towers--and living standards--are falling, and they are struggling to survive in a turbulent and changing environment.

The Decline in Funding

Overall spending on civilian science in 1992 will be only about one-third of last year's level. The Russian Academy of Sciences (RAS)--the principal performer of basic research--has been particularly hard hit by budget cutbacks, and most of the Academy's military and industrial sources of funding have also dried up. In the wake of a 20 percent slump in industrial production and curtailment of state investment, orders for industrial R&D have declined by a factor of 10, according to Russian official sources.

Soaring inflation and the need to raise wages is eating up what little state support remains for science. Indeed available funds barely cover wages and utilities, leaving little for equipment, supplies, and maintenance. Many research programs have come to a halt or slowed appreciably, and new projects have been put on ice. Some institutes have even begun to sell off laboratory equipment and office furnishings to stay afloat.

The Plight of Russian Scientists

Scientist wages--chronically low for years--have failed to keep pace with inflation and have fallen relative to other occupations. For example, the salary of a director of an Academy institute in July 1992 barely equalled the average monthly wage in the economy, whereas in January it was 25 percent higher. A senior research scientist at the RAS now earns less than a bus driver, while a junior scientific worker makes less than a cleaning woman in the Moscow subway. To make ends meet many researchers have had to take a second or even a third job.

Deteriorating living and working conditions have accelerated an exodus of scientific researchers abroad--particularly to the West. According to Academy sources, 40 percent of the "good" theoretical physicists and 80 percent of the "best" mathematicians are now working abroad, temporarily or permanently. The departure of such scientific stars is leaving crippled research teams and collapsing scientific schools behind. At some leading Academy facilities the exodus has reached significant proportions, possibly threatening the very viability of the institutes.

In addition, significantly larger numbers of scientists are abandoning research altogether for more lucrative work in Russian industry or private enterprise. A general loss of interest in science as a career among Russian youth also has slowed the flow of fresh talent into basic research to a trickle.

S&T Reform

Minister of Science Boris Saltykov has been the driving force to demilitarize, marketize, and rationally downsize the S&T establishment. He has spoken out firmly in favor of

concentrating on the best scientists and priority projects, especially in areas where Russia is at or near the world level. Toward this end he has proposed designating 25-30 institutes as "state science centers" that would be fully funded by the government and could preserve core basic science capabilities. Saltykov has also pressed for changes in the mechanisms of funding--particularly the switch from institutional to project funding as well as the creation of a quasi-independent Russian Basic Research Fund, utilizing peer review and competitive grants for individual researchers. However, most of these reform initiatives have yet to be implemented.

Most senior RAS leaders have resisted structural reforms that could erode the Academy's institutional monopoly in basic science as well as their own privileges and power to control scientific resources. Thus they have been cool toward the idea of state science centers for fear that the Academy will lose control of some of its best assets. They also worry that the newly created Russian Basic Research Fund will draw and distribute resources away from the Academy.

Despite strong economic pressure, most R&D facilities have managed so far to avoid massive layoffs by reducing the workweek, imposing furloughs, and going into debt. Most have resisted downsizing and other painful reforms, hoping Moscow or the West will bail them out. But their room to maneuver and defer such hard choices is rapidly shrinking.

Outlook

In the next year, unemployment among scientists is likely to rise, perhaps dramatically, as institutes face more extreme belt-tightening. Instead of a rational drawdown, the weeding out process will likely continue to be highly haphazard, difficult, and protracted. Although Western assistance may save the careers of individual scientists and help keep some research projects alive, such aid will not enable the scientific establishment to remain anywhere close to its past level of effort.

At the same time, the Yel'tsin government is likely to focus greater attention on applied science and technology as it presses ahead with market reforms and extends the privatization program to the S&T arena.

EXECUTIVE OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
OFFICE OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY POLICY
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20506

March 30, 1993

MEMORANDUM FOR JOHN H. GIBBONS

THROUGH: J. THOMAS RATCHFORD
FROM: JOHN F. O'NEIL 
SUBJECT: MEETING WITH LEV MUKHIN
RUSSIAN SCIENCE COUNSELOR

Dr. Lev Mukhin of the Russian Embassy has requested a meeting with you to provide information on the status of Minister Boris Saltykov and discuss future meetings. Mukhin is a scientist and very involved in the basic sciences.

I believe he will report that Saltykov was removed as Deputy Prime Minister for Social Policy (an impossible position--he will now have more time for S&T) but reappointed as Minister of Science and Technology Policy. He will seek to reassure you personally that Saltykov remains the Minister for S&T.

He may also relay the Ministry's desire to hold both the Basic Sciences Joint Commission Meeting and the Talks on Expanding S&T Cooperation when Saltykov comes to Washington the week of April 18, 1993. You have decided to hold the Basic Sciences meeting but to defer the other talks.

I have set up a meeting for Mukhin at 3:45 PM with Tom Ratchford, myself, and Cathy Campbell of State in Tom's office. If you have five minutes, I recommend you drop by. It is important for Mukhin to report to Saltykov's Ministry that he met with you and relayed his message personally, and that you are concerned and supportive of Saltykov.

I recommend you make the following points:

- Your concern about political developments, but specifically for Saltykov and S&T.
- Your offer to host the Basic Sciences meeting when Saltykov comes to Washington this month.
- The need to defer talks on expanding cooperation because it is too early in this Administration and not all officials have been confirmed yet.

JTD

EXECUTIVE OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
OFFICE OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY POLICY
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20506

March 30, 1993

MEMORANDUM FOR JOHN H. GIBBONS

THROUGH: J. THOMAS RATCHFORD

FROM: JOHN F. O'NEIL *JFO*

SUBJECT: MEETING WITH LEV MUKHIN
RUSSIAN SCIENCE COUNSELOR

Dr. Lev Mukhin of the Russian Embassy has requested a meeting with you to provide information on the status of Minister Boris Saltykov and discuss future meetings. Mukhin is a scientist and very involved in the basic sciences.

I believe he will report that Saltykov was removed as Deputy Prime Minister for Social Policy (an impossible position--he will now have more time for S&T) but reappointed as Minister of Science and Technology Policy. He will seek to reassure you personally that Saltykov remains the Minister for S&T.

He may also relay the Ministry's desire to hold both the Basic Sciences Joint Commission Meeting and the Talks on Expanding S&T Cooperation when Saltykov comes to Washington the week of April 18, 1993. You have decided to hold the Basic Sciences meeting but to defer the other talks.

I have set up a meeting for Mukhin at 3:45 PM with Tom Ratchford, myself, and Cathy Campbell of State in Tom's office. If you have five minutes, I recommend you drop by. It is important for Mukhin to report to Saltykov's Ministry that he met with you and relayed his message personally, and that you are concerned and supportive of Saltykov.

I recommend you make the following points:

- Your concern about political developments, but specifically for Saltykov and S&T.
- Your offer to host the Basic Sciences meeting when Saltykov comes to Washington this month.
- The need to defer talks on expanding cooperation because it is too early in this Administration and not all officials have been confirmed yet.