

Originally Processed With FOIA(s):
2005-0336-F

FOIA Number:
2005-0336-F

FOIA MARKER

**This is not a textual record. This is used as an
administrative marker by the George Bush Presidential
Library Staff.**

Record Group/Collection: George H.W. Bush Presidential Records
Collection/Office of Origin: Science and Technology Policy, Office of (OSTP)
Series: Bromley, D. Allan, Files
Subseries: Global Climate Change Files - Conferences/Meetings

OA/ID Number: 62059
Folder ID Number: 62059-010

Folder Title:
Global Change: Strategy Task Force Meeting - 9/17/90

Stack:	Row:	Section:	Shelf:	Position:
	0	0	0	0

File

EXECUTIVE OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
OFFICE OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY POLICY
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20506

September 17, 1990

*Danzon, Stewart, Brady, Maynard, Bromley, Isabicht, ~~the name~~, Holmsted
Gray, Myers, Deland, Schmalzer, Partners, Dawson, McBee*
MEMORANDUM FOR GLOBAL CHANGE STRATEGY TASK FORCE

FROM: D. ALLAN BROMLEY *Alan*
SUBJECT: Global Change Strategy Task Force Meeting

The Global Change Strategy Task Force will meet Tuesday, September 18, 1990, at 2:00 p.m. in Room 180 of the Old Executive Office Building.

As we discussed at our last meeting, we will address several options relating to organizational issues for the first negotiating session of the framework convention on climate change. A draft options paper which addresses the timing, duration, and location of the first negotiating session is attached.

In addition, the Department of State has prepared a list of the priority issues, identified by the OES PCC Working Group on Environment, related to the proposed Second World Climate Conference Ministerial Declaration (attachment A). Please review and be prepared to comment on this list of major issues. A copy of an annotated compilation of all comments on the full declaration is also attached for your information (attachment B).

Attachments

* *Richard Porter on list of reports of materials*
Barry McBee

EXECUTIVE OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
OFFICE OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY POLICY
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20506

*Global Change
file*

September 17, 1990

MEMORANDUM FOR GLOBAL CHANGE STRATEGY TASK FORCE

FROM: D. ALLAN BROMLEY *Duan*
SUBJECT: Global Change Strategy Task Force Meeting

The Global Change Strategy Task Force will meet Tuesday, September 18, 1990, at 2:00 p.m. in Room 180 of the Old Executive Office Building.

As we discussed at our last meeting, we will address several options relating to organizational issues for the first negotiating session of the framework convention on climate change. A draft options paper which addresses the timing, duration, and location of the first negotiating session is attached.

In addition, the Department of State has prepared a list of the priority issues, identified by the OES PCC Working Group on Environment, related to the proposed Second World Climate Conference Ministerial Declaration (attachment A). Please review and be prepared to comment on this list of major issues. A copy of an annotated compilation of all comments on the full declaration is also attached for your information (attachment B).

Attachments

THE WHITE HOUSE
WASHINGTON

GLOBAL CHANGE STRATEGY TASK FORCE

AGENDA

September 18, 1990

- I. First Negotiating Session of the Framework Convention on Climate Change
 - Date
 - Duration
 - Location
- II. Second World Climate Conference Ministerial Declaration
 - Major Issues
 - U.S. Comments on Declaration
- III. Other Business

A.

DRAFT

Framework Convention Negotiations - Organizational Session

I. BACKGROUND

At several past meetings, the Strategy Task Force of the Global Change Working Group has discussed the U.S. position on the timing and length of session, location, and level of representation at the negotiations for a climate change convention. It is now essential that we get clearance on several decisions very soon so that: (a) the President and the U.S. delegation can move forward to secure our offer to host the first negotiating session (by having detailed preparations underway), (b) the US will be well-prepared in its planning for the meeting, and (c) the US can, in fact, be organized in its preparations for the negotiations by insuring that we have enough lead time to get ready for the meetings.

The consensus on the best time for the climate change negotiations was to have them begin in February 1991, perhaps during the first week of that month, preceded by an October prepcom. This is, in fact, what is now underway.

On September 24, 1990 an intergovernmental meeting will be held on organizational issues for the first negotiating session. A number of issues will be considered at this meeting, several of which have not been resolved for the U.S. side. There are three organizational issues which now need decisions:

- (1) Can we agree that the first negotiating session will begin the week of February 4-8?
- (2) Will the duration of the first negotiating session be one or two weeks?
- (3) Will the location of the session be in Washington, D.C. or elsewhere in the U.S.?

II. TIMING AND DURATION OF FIRST NEGOTIATING SESSION

The issue of timing involves not only the starting dates of the session, but also the length of the session.

The two options are:

- o One week session, starting February 4 ✓
- o Two week session, starting either February 4 or January 28

Summary of Options:

- o **OPTION 1 - A one week session beginning February 4: the first day (day and a half) for opening ceremonies, confirmation of officers and agenda, and country statements. These activities would be followed by plenary discussions on how the negotiations will be organized, assignment of drafting tasks, and identification of analytical work to be done by the IPCC.**

PROS:

- o U.S. originally (informally) proposed this date and schedule to be compatible with international meeting schedule.
- o This was chosen by U.S. as reasonable date to follow up on Presidential offer.

CONS:

- o Could be too short period of time to finish all the work.
- o If longer session, might better to have longer meeting and insure our points are incorporated into the negotiating outline.
- o **OPTION 2 - A two week technical level working session beginning the last week in January (favored by UNEP Executive Director Tolba). The session could focus on negotiating outline of framework document.**

PROS:

- o If there is strong international sentiment to do this, it could be advantageous for the US.
- o If there is strong international sentiment to do this, the U.S. might be perceived as foot-dragging if we did not.

CONS:

- o A one week session would allow a focus on basic organizational matters
- o Costs will be twice as much and there will be more time for mischief

III. LOCATION OF FIRST NEGOTIATING SESSION

The issue is whether to have the negotiating session in Washington, D.C. or elsewhere in the U.S.

- o **OPTION 1 - Washington, D.C.:**

PROS:

- o Opportunity for Presidential appearance to provide a forum for strengthening Presidential leadership on global change issue.
- o This would minimize costs and logistical arrangements. (Based on IPCC Plenary experience, DOS now has good leads on potential sites, conference services contractors, interpretation equipment and personnel, translation and printing services, catering services, and representational guest lists.)

CONS:

- o Greater distractions from Washington-based groups, and the Hill
- o Greater participation from press

o OPTION 2 - Elsewhere in United States:

PROS:

- o Less distraction from Washington-based groups, and the Hill**
- o Less participation from press**

CONS:

- o Costs would be greater for all participants and logistics would be far more difficult and expensive. (e.g., locating a reliable conference services contractor at the site of the conference, scouting appropriate sites for representational events, and making heavy investment on advance teams).**
- o More difficult for President to appear and advance leadership issue on global change.**

A
—

Major Policy Issues
Second World Climate Conference
Ministerial Declaration

1. Targets and timetables for reducing greenhouse gas emissions
2. Stipulating the nature and content of a convention on climate change
3. Financial Assistance
4. Statement concerning the scientific understandings associated with climate change
5. Precautionary Principle

-2-

1. Targets and timetables for reducing greenhouse gas emissions

Ministerial Declaration:

20. We stress, as a first step, the *desirability importance* need to stabilize emissions of greenhouse gases (not controlled by the Montreal Protocol). We note with appreciation the unilateral commitments of some industrialized countries to stabilize emissions at present level or reduce them by the year 2000; *we agree on this **

21. We agree that stabilization of greenhouse gas emissions should be achieved by industrialized countries by the year (2000) and should be set at (present) emission levels;

* a. 22. We urge industrialized countries to establish greenhouse gases reductions programmes aiming at achieving at least 20% reduction of their current contribution to global warming potential, possibly by the year 2005 and in any case not later than the year 2010;

USG position:

We should not agree to specific targets and timetables. We should take a comprehensive approach that includes all sources and sinks of greenhouse gases and, in the short-term, take those actions which are justified for reasons other than climate change. USG proposed language for paras. 20 and 21 follows on page 3; para 22 should be deleted.

Houston Summit Communique:

"We are committed to undertake common efforts to limit emissions of greenhouse gases, such as carbon dioxide.... The Second World Climate Conference provides the opportunity for all countries to consider the adoption of strategies and measures for limiting or stabilizing greenhouse gas emissions, and to discuss an effective international response."

21. We recognize that the most effective response strategies, especially in the short-term, are those which are:
- ┆ Justified for reasons other than climate change and also provide beneficial influence on potential climate change;
 - ┆ Economically efficient and cost effective,;
 - ┆ Able to serve multiple social, economic, and environmental purposes:
 - ┆ Easily modified to respond to increased scientific and economic understanding of climate change;
 - ┆ Compatible with the concept of a comprehensive approach addressing all sources and sinks of greenhouse gases;
 - ┆ Compatible with the concept of sustainable economic growth and development;
 - ┆ Administratively practical and effective in terms of application, monitoring, and enforcement;
 - ┆ Inclusive of obligations by both industrialized and developing countries.
22. We recommend that limitation and adaptation strategies be considered as an integrated package that complement each other to minimize net costs. These strategies should include measures which limit emissions from greenhouse gas sources as well as those which increase the ability of natural systems to utilize greenhouse gases. A comprehensive approach is needed which considers the costs of options for reducing emissions of different greenhouse gases and the effects of those reductions on potential

-4-

2. Stipulating the nature and content of a convention on climate change

Ministerial Declaration:

23. We recommend that the specifications of the obligation to stabilize and reduce greenhouse gases emissions be realized in the form of ~~[separate]~~ Protocols to the Climate Convention. ~~[Some of these protocols could be negotiated concurrently with the framework convention.]~~ *Background work on these a comprehensive strike*

40. We recommend further that the Climate Convention and associated protocols ~~contain specific obligations and~~ address in particular:

- (i) the enhancement of research and systematic observation of climate ~~not~~
- (ii) the control of greenhouse gas emissions ~~not~~ *and sinks*
- (iii) the adaptation to the adverse effects of climate change in coastal areas
- (iv) the needs of developing countries for financial assistance in their development efforts and transfer of technology
- (v) appropriate institutional and decision-making procedures.

USG position:

The declaration should not prejudge the negotiations. We support the negotiation of a framework convention; at a minimum, the declaration should be general and should advocate a comprehensive approach that includes sources and sinks of all greenhouse gases. USG would propose deleting para. 23; new USG version of para. 40 follows on page 5.

Houston Summit Communiqué:

"We reiterate our support for the negotiation of a framework convention on climate changes;...implementing protocols...should consider all sources and sinks."

-5-

35. We recommend that such negotiations consider the possible elements compiled by the IPCC, and that the Framework Convention be framed in such a way as to gain the support of the largest possible number of states. We recommend that the Framework Convention contain, at a minimum, general principles and obligations, and that it *incorporate* ~~advocate~~ a comprehensive approach that includes sources and sinks of all greenhouse gases.

-6-

3. Financial Assistance

Ministerial Declaration:

27. We recommend that additional resources should progressively, be mobilized to help developing countries take the necessary measures to address climate change consistent with their development needs.

USG position:

We will not commit to providing new and additional funding which increases the overall budget. We are already giving the environment a higher priority in our assistance funding, both bilateral and multilateral, and believe that existing resources and mechanisms must be fully utilized before new monies can be considered. It will also be necessary to quantify the costs associated with any actions in this area before consideration of new funds can be justified. We will also note that the provisions of the Montreal Protocol are not a precedent for other environmental issues.

We understand that other countries may try to strengthen this paragraph, calling for explicit reference to "new and additional funding". USG proposes that para. 27 be deleted.

Houston Summit Communique:

"We recognize that developing countries will benefit from increased financial and technological assistance to help them resolve environmental problems..."

-7-

4. Statements concerning the scientific understandings of climate change.

Ministerial Declaration:

4. Climate has varied in the past. But the temperature increase which is predicted to occur in the decades to come due to the increasing accumulation of the greenhouse gases in the atmosphere has not been encountered in the last 100,000 years at least; nor has the past rapidity of change been as fast as that predicted. The greenhouse gases result from a host of human activities such as the burning of fossil fuel, deforestation, mining operations and waste management.

8. Global warming poses environmental threat of a magnitude the world has never known. Human activities which have lead to the emissions of greenhouse gases into the atmosphere have so far committed the Global Commons to an irreversible warming so far.... It is therefore important that emissions of greenhouse gases, especially carbon dioxide and other long lived greenhouse gases, be reduced as soon as possible.... The long lived gases (CO₂ and N₂O) would require at least 60% reductions in emissions, and methane 15-20% reduction in emissions in order to stabilize their concentration in atmosphere at today's level.

USG position:

The declaration must accurately describe the scientific context and uncertainties associated with potential climate change. USG proposed language follows on page 8.

Houston Communique:

Does not address the scientific underpinnings.

-5-

4. Climate has varied significantly in the past; however, the potential change in global mean temperatures over the next century associated with human activities is predicted to be larger and more rapid than those seen in the last 10,000 years. The magnitude, timing, rate and regional distribution of these predicted climate changes are uncertain because of limitations in our present scientific understanding of climate processes and in our ability to model the behavior of climate systems and components. The human-caused emissions of greenhouse gases, while significant, are much smaller than the exchange between the atmosphere and natural systems. Stabilization of atmospheric concentrations of long-lived gases at today's levels, for example, would require either a 60 to 80% decrease in anthropogenic emissions or a 2 to 3% increase in absorption by natural systems.
8. The potentially serious consequences of human-induced climate change, however, give sufficient reasons to begin adopting response strategies that are fully justified for other reasons, even in the face of significant uncertainties. These strategies could include: improved energy efficiency, use of lower greenhouse gas-emitting sources; improved forest management; development of comprehensive coastal management plans; use of practices to recycle and reuse CFC gases and their substitutes; and improved agricultural practices.

-9-

5. Precautionary Principle

Ministerial Declaration:

17. In order to achieve sustainable development, we must base ourselves on the precautionary principle. Environmental measures must anticipate, prevent and attack the causes of environmental degradation. Where there are threats of serious or irreversible damage, lack of ~~full~~ scientific certainty should not be used as a reason for postponing measures to prevent environmental degradation.

otherwise justified

USG position:

This definition was agreed to in the Bergen Declaration. We expect other countries to reopen this language, at which time we will seek to have the definition include a reference to the no-regrets strategy. USG proposed language follows on page 10.

Houston Summit Communique:

"We agree that in the face of threats of irreversible environmental damage, lack of full scientific certainty is no excuse to postpone actions which are justified in their own right."

-10-

In order to achieve sustainable development, we must base ourselves on the precautionary principle. Environmental measures must anticipate, prevent and attack the causes of environmental degradation. Where there are threats of serious or irreversible damage, lack of full scientific certainty should not be used as a reason for postponing measures to prevent environmental degradation which are justified in their own right.

B

WORKING DRAFT

9/12/96

DRAFT

PRIORITY CONCERNS ON SWCC

<u>Concern</u>	<u>Para</u>
We need to correctly convey scientific context and uncertainties.	4 8
We should take no-regrets actions.	9 17 20 22
All countries must share obligations.	20 24
We should take a comprehensive approach.	20 21 40
We will negotiate a framework convention only.	23 40
No new funding will be available	25 26 27

Precautionary Principle.

US COMMENTS ON SWCC DRAFT DECLARATION

General Comments

- References should be to a framework convention on climate change, rather than the Climate Change Convention;
- There should be no mention of concurrent negotiation of the framework convention and any implementing protocol(s);
- References to limitation measures should include mention of all GHGs and their sources and sinks, not just CO2;
- References to funding should not call for additional resources.
- There should be no specific commitments to quantitative reductions in greenhouse gas emissions.
- Text similar to that of the IPCC Policymakers Summaries and other previously adopted documents should be as consistent as possible with the texts of those sources.
- References should be to "industrialized" and "developing" countries, rather than "developed" and "less developed"
- The subtitles in parentheses should be eliminated.
- All paragraphs relating to the IPCC should be gathered together in one section.
- All paragraphs relating to the framework convention on climate change should be gathered together in one section.
- The small number of paragraphs dealing with science is disproportionate to the large number dealing with policy issues.

Key:

- "Original Version" is the 13 July 1990 Draft prepared by the SWCC organizers.
- "Comments" are the August 24 US Comments provided via STATE 291963, with the amendments agreed to in Sundsvall.
- "New Version" is the version distributed to other governments during the 4th IPCC Plenary.

④

Original:

PREAMBLE

1. We, the Ministers from [] countries representing the world community met in Geneva, Switzerland, from 6 to 7 November 1990 at the Second World Climate Conference.

Comments:

Specific Changes

Delete title "Preamble"

Para 1, line 1: delete "the" before "Ministers".

Para 1, line 1: delete "representing the world community"

New Version:

1. We, Ministers from [] states, met in Geneva, Switzerland, from 6 to 7 November following the Second World Climate Conference.
- 1 ?

Original:

2. Our Meeting following the IPCC Report is a demonstration of our intention to take active and constructive step in the global response to the global climate change issue. It is also the expression of our will to fully contribute to the preparation for the 1992 UN Conference on Environment and Development.

scientific understanding

Comments:

Para 2, line 2: replace "IPCC" with "adoption by the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change of its First Assessment"

Para 2, line 2-3: replace "step in the global response to the global climate issue" with "steps in response to concerns regarding human-induced global climate change"

Para 2, line 4: delete last sentence

New Version:

2. Our Meeting, following the adoption by the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change of its First Assessment Report, is a demonstration of our intention to take active and constructive steps in response to concerns regarding human-induced global climate change.

Original:

3. Ever since the dawn of history, man's life on earth has been largely dependent on the environmental processes which we call weather and climate. The world climate system consists of a delicately balanced combination of many interactive components which include the atmosphere and the biosphere, as well as the land, sea and ice surfaces.

Comments:

Para 3, line 1: delete "largely"

Para 3, line 3: delete "delicately balanced"

Para 3, line 4-5: add a comma after "atmosphere" and change the rest of the sentence to read: "the oceans, the biosphere, as well as land and ice surfaces."

New Version:

3. Since before the dawn of history, life on Earth has depended on the natural processes we call weather and climate. The world climate system has many interactive components which include the atmosphere, the oceans, the biosphere, as well as land and ice surfaces.

Original:

4. Climate has varied in the past. But the temperature increase which is predicted to occur in the decades to come due to the increasing accumulation of the greenhouse gases in the atmosphere has not been encountered in the last 100,000 years at least; nor has the past rapidity of change been as fast as that predicted. The greenhouse gases result from a host of human activities such as the burning of fossil fuel, deforestation, mining operations and waste management.

USE IPCC OVERVIEW LANGUAGE

Comments:

Para 4, replace with:

Climate has varied significantly in the past; however, the potential change in global mean temperatures over the next century associated with human activities is predicted to be larger and more rapid than those seen in the last 10,000 years. The magnitude, timing, rate, and regional distributions of these predicted climate changes are uncertain because of limitations in our present scientific understanding of climate processes and in our ability to model the behavior of climate systems and components. The human caused emissions of greenhouse gases are much smaller than the exchange between the atmosphere and natural systems. Stabilization of atmospheric concentrations of long-lived gases at today's levels, for example, would require a 60-80% reduction in anthropogenic emissions compared to a 2-3% increase in absorption by natural systems.

New Version:

4. Climate has varied significantly in the past; however, the potential change in global mean temperatures over the next century associated with human activities is predicted to be larger and more rapid than those seen in the last 10,000 years. The magnitude, timing, rate and regional distribution of these predicted climate changes are uncertain because of limitations in our present scientific understanding of climate processes and in our ability to model the behavior of climate system and components. The human-caused emissions of greenhouse gases, while significant, are much smaller than the exchange between the atmosphere and natural systems. Stabilization of atmospheric concentrations of long-lived gases at today's levels, for example, would require either a 60 to 80 percent decrease in anthropogenic emission or a 2 to 3 percent increase in absorption by natural systems.

SUBS TACTIC
① 34?
SEE #24

Original:

5. Recognising that climate change is a common concern of mankind United Nations General Assembly's Resolution 43/53 urged the intergovernmental and non-governmental organisations and scientific institutions, to treat climate change as a priority issue, and to co-operate in research and action-oriented programmes so as to increase the understanding of the causes and effects of climate change.

Comments:

Para 5: add to the end of the paragraph:

Industrialized countries and developing countries have a common responsibility in dealing with problems arising from climate change.

(AND VARIED)?

New Version:

5. Recognizing that climate change is a common concern of mankind, the United Nations General Assembly urged intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations and scientific institutions to treat climate change as a priority issue and to cooperate in research and action-oriented programmes so as to increase the understanding of the causes and effects of climate change. Industrialized countries and developing countries have a common responsibility in dealing with problems arising from climate change.

Original:

6. The World Climate Programme undertaken jointly by the World Meteorological Organization, the International Council of Scientific Unions with the co-operation of its Scientific Committee on Oceanic Research, and UNESCO and its International Oceanographic Commission and UNEP have endeavoured during the last decade to promote a quantitative understanding of climate, and predictions of global and regional climate changes on all time scales and on their potential impacts. Through its three major projects the study of Tropical Ocean and Global Atmosphere, the Global Energy and Water Cycle Experiment, and the World Ocean Circulation Experiment, the World Climate Research Programme has succeeded in providing valuable information on the causes, processes and some of the effects of climate change.

Comments:

Para 6, lines 1-5: list all sponsors on an equal basis: WMO, UNEP, ICSU including SCOR, UNESCO and its Intergovernmental Oceanographic Commission

Para 6, line 5: replace "a quantitative understanding.... impacts." with

an improved quantitative understanding of climate, advances in predictions of global and regional changes on all time scales and estimates of the potential impacts of these changes.

Para 6, line 7-10: delete "Through its three.... Circulation Experiment,"

Para 6, lines 11-12: replace both lines with:

...improved our understanding of climate change processes, thus providing valuable information on the causes and possible manifestations of such change. However many uncertainties remain and must continue to be addressed by these and national scientific programs.

New Version:

6. The World Climate Programme, undertaken jointly by the World Meteorological Organization (WMO), the United Nations Environment Program (UNEP), the International Council of Scientific Unions (ICSU), with the cooperation of the Scientific Committee on Oceanic Research (SCOR), and the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) and its Intergovernmental Oceanographic (IOC), has endeavored during the last decade to promote improved quantitative understanding of climate, advances in predictions of global and regional climate changes on all time scales, and estimates of the potential impact of these changes. The World Climate Research Programme has improved our understanding of climate processes, providing valuable information on the causes and possible manifestations of climate change. However, many uncertainties remain and must continue to be addressed by international and national scientific programs.

Original:

7. The Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) established by U.N.E.P. and W.M.O. has undertaken to study the problem of climate change including global warming. Through the work of its various working groups and their sub-groups the I.P.C.C. has produced a comprehensive report on the causes and effects of climate change. It has also ~~proposed~~ strategies to delay, limit or mitigate the impact of climate change, and at the request of United Nations General Assembly has ~~proposed the~~ elements for inclusion in a convention on climate.

also identified possible

Comments:

Para 7: place in a new section entitled "The Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change" after rewriting as follows:

The Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) was established by WMO and UNEP to assess the current level of scientific knowledge on climate change including its possible impacts and options for limiting or adapting to adverse impacts. Based on the work of its various working groups and their subgroups the IPCC has produced its First Assessment of global climate change. It has also identified options to limit and to adapt to climate change, and has identified elements to be considered for inclusion in a framework convention on climate change and in possible subsequent protocols.

New Version:

The Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change

11. The Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) was established by WMO and UNEP to assess the current level of scientific knowledge on climate change including its possible impacts and options for limiting or adapting to adverse impacts. Based on the work of its various working group and their subgroups, the IPCC has produced its First Assessment Report on global climate change. Its Report identifies options to limit and adapt to climate change and elements to be considered for including in a framework convention on climate change and in possible subsequent protocols.

8.

DEFINITION OF PROBLEM AND RISKS

Original:

8. Global warming poses environmental threat of a magnitude the world has never known before. Human activities which have lead to the emission of greenhouse gases into the atmosphere have so far committed the Global Commons to an irreversible warming so far. In order to stem unprecedented global warming likely to lead to serious environmental consequences such as a rise in sea level of about 20 cm by the year and 65 cm by the end of the next century urgent action should be taken now. Carbon dioxide has been responsible for over half the enhanced greenhouse effect in the past and is likely to remain so in the future. It is therefore important that emissions of greenhouse gases especially CO2 and other long lived greenhouse gases be reduced as soon as possible. This is urgent because changes in emission rates of these gases lead to a slow rate of change in their concentration in the atmosphere. If action is delayed, it will take much longer and much greater reductions at greater economic sacrifice to stabilize concentrations at today's levels. The long lived gases (CO2 and N2O) would require at least 60% reductions in emissions, and methane 15-20% reduction in emissions in order to stabilise their concentrations in atmosphere at today's levels. The other gases of concern, namely the CFC are addressed under the Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer.

Comments:

Para 8: delete the title "Definition of Problem and Risks"

Para 8: Replace with the following paragraph from RSWG Policymakers Summary, page 12:

→ The consideration of climate change response strategies present formidable difficulties for policymakers because of: (a) remaining scientific uncertainties regarding climate change; (b) uncertainty with respect to how effective specific response options or groups of options would be in actually limiting or averting potential climate change; and (c) uncertainty with respect to the costs, effects on economic growth, and other economic and social implications of specific response options or groups of options.

New Version:

7. The consideration of global climate change response strategies presents formidable difficulties for policymakers because of: (a) remaining scientific uncertainties regarding climate change; (b) uncertainty in the effectiveness of response options in actually limiting or adapting to potential climate change; and (c) uncertainty in estimates of costs, effects on economic growth, and other economic and social implications of specific response options or groups of options.

4.

(1)

Original: GLOBAL STRATEGY

9. We consider therefore that a global response must be decided and implemented without further delay based on the best available knowledge such as those resulting from the IPCC assessment. Recognizing that the principle of equity should be the basis of any global response to the climate change phenomena industrialized countries, which are responsible for most of the observed increase in the greenhouse gases' concentration in the atmosphere must take the lead, commit themselves to immediate action and provide resources and assistance to developing countries to help them in addressing climate change in a way compatible with their development needs. [To this end the industrialized countries will support developing countries with additional and specific contributions.] [To this end there is a need to negotiate the necessary support needed by developing countries] [To end there is a need to provide the necessary support, including additional and specific financial assistance to the developing countries]

Comments:

Para 9: delete the title "Global Strategy"

Para 9: replace with the following:

CHECK IPCC
OVERVIEW
+ PMS

The potentially serious consequences of human-induced climate change, however, give sufficient reasons to begin adopting response strategies that are fully justified for other reasons even in the face of significant uncertainties. These strategies could include improved energy efficiency; use of cleaner, more efficient and lower greenhouse gas-emitting energy sources; improved forest management; development of comprehensive coastal management plans; use of practices to recycle and reuse CFC gases and their substitutes; and improved agricultural practices.

New Version:

8. The potentially serious consequences of human-induced climate change, however, give sufficient reasons to begin adopting response strategies that are fully justified for other reasons, even in the face of significant uncertainties. These strategies could include: improved energy efficiency, use of lower greenhouse gas-emission sources; improved forest management; development of comprehensive coastal management plans; use of practices to recycle and reuse cfc gases and their substitutes; and improved agricultural practices.

Original:ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF THE CONCLUSIONS OF LONDON CONFERENCE ON THE MONTREAL PROTOCOL

10. [Short text to be included after the conclusions of the London Meeting]

Comments:

significant

Para 10, replace text in parenthesis with:

We acknowledge the agreement of the Parties to the Montreal Protocol in June in London to phase out substances that deplete the ozone layer. This action, when implemented, will have a beneficial influence on global climate change by reducing human emissions of greenhouse gases. We urge all states to participate in the Protocol and implement the London agreements.

ratify

amendments

join

New Version:

The Montreal Protocol

10. We acknowledge the agreement of the Parties to the Montreal Protocol in June in London to phase out substances that deplete the ozone layer. This action, when implemented, will have a beneficial influence on global climate change by reducing human emissions of greenhouse gases by [percent]. We urge all states to participate in the Protocol and implement the London agreements.

WASCH FINAN. MICH. "PRECEDENT"

Original:

HEDGE

ENDORSEMENT OF THE CONCLUSION OF THE SCIENTIFIC PART OF SWCC

11. ^{acknowledge} We are highly appreciative of the work done by IPCC.

^{take note of} We ^{accept} and are highly appreciative of the conclusions and recommendations of the scientific part of the Second World Climate Conference as presented in the annex 1 of this Declaration. Their implementation should be strongly supported by governments.

SFR
SECTION

Comments:

Para 11, lines 1-4: replace with:

We acknowledge the conference statement of the scientific and technical part of the Second World Climate Conference. We urge all nations and relevant international organizations to respond to the conference statement and incorporate relevant actions into their scientific and technical programs.

Para 11, lines 2-3: rewrite first part of sentence to read:

We are also appreciative of the conference statement of the scientific part of the Second World Climate Conference

New Version:

The SWCC Conference Statement

14. We acknowledge the conference statement of the scientific and technical part of the second world climate conference. We urge all nations and relevant international organizations to respond to the conference statement and incorporate relevant actions into their scientific and technical programs.

Original:

THEREFORE:

I. ROLE OF SCIENCE IN IMPROVING OUR UNDERSTANDING, CAPACITY OF PREDICTION AND OUR RESPONSE TO CLIMATE CHANGE

12. We reaffirm that, in order to reduce uncertainties, to increase our ability to predict (including early identification of as yet unknown climate-related problems) and to design scientifically sound response strategies, there is a need to strengthen both national and international activities in research, monitoring, and data and information exchange related to climate change.

Comments:

Para 12: delete the title "Therefore"

Para 12: title should read "Role of Science"

Para 12, lines 2-3: replace "(including early identification of as yet unknown climate related problems) and to design scientifically sound response strategies" with

climate and climate change on a global and regional basis and to design response strategies that are scientifically and economically sound

Para 12, line 5: scientific research, monitoring, analysis.

Para 12, line 6: add additional paragraph:

To this end, we pledge our full support to the needs of the World Climate Program including contributions to the WMO Special Fund for Climate and Atmospheric Environment Studies.

New Version:

Role of Science

15. We reaffirm that in order to reduce scientific uncertainties, to increase our ability to predict climate and climate change on a global and regional basis, and to design response strategies that are scientifically and economically sound, there is need to strengthen both national and international activities in scientific research, monitoring, analysis, and data and information exchange related to climate change.

To this end, we pledge our full support to the needs of the world climate program including contributions to the WMO special fund for climate and atmospheric environmental studies.

OTHER

Original:

13. Recognizing that climate changes are of a complex interdisciplinary character, we urge the full participation of scientists dealing with atmosphere, the oceans and land, as well as with the physical, chemical and biological processes needed for a deeper understanding of climate issues. Given the intrinsically global nature of climate and climate research, we stress the need to strengthen international cooperation. The magnitude of the problem being addressed is such that no nation can undertake it alone. It is imperative therefore, that, to the extent feasible, national research programmes on climate be planned in such way that they form integral parts of international research programmes. We urge that special resources to sustain such programmes are made available to less developed countries in order to insure their full participation in the international research effort and the response strategies based upon the results.

Comments:

EDITOR.

Para 13, line 1: climate change | and its impacts |

Para 13, line 10: replace "from integral parts of" with "are consistent with and support"

Para 13, line 12: replace "less developed" with "developing"

Para 13, lines 13-14: delete "and the response strategies based upon the results"

New Version:

16. Recognizing that climate change and its impacts are of a complex interdisciplinary character, we urge the full participation of all scientists who are expert in dealing with the atmosphere, the oceans, and land as well as with the physical, chemical and biological processes needed for deeper understanding of climate issues. Given the intrinsically global nature of climate and climate research, we stress the need to strengthen international cooperation. The magnitude of the problem being addressed is such that no nation can undertake it alone. It is imperative therefore, that, to the extent feasible, national research programmes on climate be planned in such a way that they are consistent with and support international research programmes. We urge that special resources to sustain such programmes be made available to developing countries in order to insure a full partnership in the international research effort.

Original:

14. We stress that special efforts be directed to key areas of uncertainty, including:

the role of clouds, ocean and greenhouse gases; ecosystem responses to global change; effects of land-use changes in the hydrological cycle; climate changes on a regional scale and the socio-economic and cultural dimensions and impacts of climate change.

Comments:

Para 14, line 3-7: replace with

the roles of clouds, oceans, and greenhouse gases;
ecosystem interactions with climate; net emissions of
greenhouse gases; types and levels of atmospheric aerosols;
effects of land-use changes in climate change; regional
climate change; and the regional socio-economic and
ecological implications of impacts of climate change.

New Version:

17. We stress that special efforts be directed to key areas of uncertainty, including: the roles of clouds, oceans and greenhouse gases; ecosystems interactions with climate; net emissions of greenhouse gases; types and levels of atmospheric aerosols; effects of land-use changes on climate change; regional climate; and regional socioeconomic and ecological implications of climate change.

Original:

15. We consider that research programmes must be accompanied by long-term monitoring programmes so designed as to provide continuous and comprehensive coverage of climate-influencing variables as well as those useful in detecting climate change. We agree that long term governmental commitments are necessary to sustain these monitoring programmes. We ask further-more that obstacles to the free flow of relevant data and information be removed.

Comments:

LDC SOVEREIGNTY
ISSUE

1 ?

Para 15: replace last two sentences with:

We recommend that governments make the long term commitments necessary to the development and operations of these monitoring and data management programs. We fully support the Climate Change Detection Project of WMO with its goal of regularly providing assessments of the state of the global climate to all governments.

Para 15, line 7: add a new paragraph:

We support the ~~free~~ ^{full} and open exchange of relevant data between nations, recognizing its important use in monitoring, detecting and predicting and understanding climate and climate change. It is critically important to move ahead as quickly as possible with the development of integrated, comprehensive (satellite and in situ) ocean and terrestrial monitoring systems and with the improvement of the existing atmospheric system. We agree to strengthen and improve the utilization of our current data resources by improving the quantity, quality and accessibility of these data. We recommend that governments make the long-term commitments necessary to the development and operation of these monitoring and data management programs. We stress that full and open access to relevant data and information by global change researchers from all countries must be a fundamental principle of international climate data policy, and we urge countries to establish national policies and administrative practices consistent with this principle.

"Free" VS "full"
1

New Version:

18. We consider that research programmes must be accompanied by long-term monitoring programmes so designed as to provide continuous and comprehensive coverage of climate-influencing variables as well as those useful in detecting climate change. We recommend that governments make the long-term commitments necessary to the development and operation of these monitoring and data management programs. We fully support the Climate Change Detection Project of WMO with its goal of regularly providing assessments of the state of the global climate to all governments.

New Version:

19. We support the free and open exchange of relevant data between nations, recognizing its important use in monitoring, detecting, predicting and understanding climate and climate change. It is critically important to move ahead as quickly as possible with the development of integrated, comprehensive (satellite and in situ) ocean and terrestrial monitoring systems and with the improvement of the existing atmospheric system. We agree to strengthen and improve the utilization of our current data resource by improving the quantity, quality, and accessibility of these data. We recommend that governments make the long-term commitments necessary to the development and operation of these monitoring and data management programs. We stress that the free and open access to relevant data and information by climate and global change researchers from all countries must be a fundamental principle of international climate data policy, and we urge countries to establish national policies and administrative practices consistent with this principle.

Original:

16. We reaffirm that there is no need to establish new international coordination mechanisms, but rather urge all countries and relevant organizations to contribute through their national efforts and to increase financial support and assistance in kind on a sustained basis to important existing programmes such as the World Climate Programme including the WMO/ICSU World Climate Research Programme, the ICSU International Geosphere-Biosphere Programme, and the climate-related components of programmes of WMO, UNEP, Unesco and its IOC and FAO. We further urge that these programmes be better supported in order to continue to strengthen their interdisciplinary approach, to include the participation of all nations, and to increase coordination in order to achieve still greater efficiency.

Comments:

Para 16: line 1: add "scientific" after "international"

Para 16: line 3: delete "through their national efforts"

Para 16: lines 9-12: redraft final sentence as follows:

We further urge that these programs continue to strengthen their interdisciplinary approach, broaden national participation, and strive for more effective coordination.

2-3

New Version:

20. We reaffirm that there is no need to establish new international scientific coordination mechanisms, but rather urge all countries and relevant organizations to contribute and increase financial support and assistance in kind on a sustained basis to important existing programmes such as the World Climate Programme, including the WMO/ICSU World Climate Research Programme; and the climate-related components of programmes of WMO, UNEP, UNESCO and its IOC, and FAO. We further urge that these programs continue to strengthen their interdisciplinary approach, broaden national participation, and strive for more effective coordination.

WATCH

Original:

II. POLICY TARGET FOR URGENT POLICY ACTION

(Precautionary measures)

17. In order to achieve sustainable development, we must base ourselves on the precautionary principle. Environmental measures must anticipate, prevent and attack the causes of environmental degradation. Where there are threats of serious or irreversible damage, lack of full scientific certainty should not be used as a reason for postponing measures to prevent environmental degradation.

BUDEN
QUOTEBuzen
quote }Comments:Para 17: title should read: "Policy Considerations"Para 17: add at the end of the paragraph "which are justified in their own right"in
(Houston version)New Version:

9. In order to achieve sustainable development, we must base ourselves on the precautionary principle. Environmental measures must anticipate, prevent and attack the causes of environmental degradation. Where there are threats of serious or irreversible damage, lack of full scientific certainty should not be used as a reason for postponing measures to prevent environmental degradation which are justified in their own right.

copy
no sigs
ppl.

If can't get what want, push to
stick to Buzen

Original:

18. We note that a mechanism is being set up by WMO and UNEP to undertake the necessary intergovernmental negotiations on global warming.

ADD TO IPCC
FOLLOW-UP
CH

Comments:

Para 18: move to end of Declaration to new section entitled "Framework Convention on Climate Change" after rewriting to read:

We note that a mechanism has been created by WMO and UNEP for intergovernmental negotiations on a framework convention on climate change.

Not in new version

Original:

(Stabilization and reduction of greenhouse gases)

19. We recognise the fundamental need [to conserve the global climate,] and protect it from anthropogenic interference. Taking into account that the increase of greenhouse gas concentrations in the atmosphere threaten the natural variability of climate, we agree that the ultimate global objective should be to stabilize and reduce those concentrations.

REWRITE

EMISSIONS VS CONCENTRATIONS

Comments:

Para 19: delete entirely to improve balance between science paragraphs and policy paragraphs

BAD LANG.; MEANINGFUL
PARTS ELSEWHERE?

LOOK FOR BERGEN/NOORDWIJK VAR.

Original:

20. We stress, as a first step, the need to stabilize, while ensuring stable development of the world economy, emissions of greenhouse gases not controlled by the Montreal Protocol. We note with appreciation the unilateral commitments of some industrialised countries to stabilize emissions at present level or reduce them by the year 2000.

(OVERVIEW)

PMS II, p. 13

Comments:Para 20: rewrite as follows:

We recognize that the most effective response strategies, especially in the short-term, are those which are:

- Justified for reasons other than climate change and also provide beneficial impacts on potential climate change;
- Economically efficient and cost effective;
- Able to serve multiple social, economic, and environmental purposes;
- Easily modified to respond to increased scientific and economic understanding of climate change;
- Compatible with the concept of sustainable economic growth and development;
- Compatible with the concept of a comprehensive approach that deals with all sources and sinks of greenhouse gases;
- Administratively practical and effective in terms of application, monitoring, and enforcement; and
- Inclusive of obligations by both industrialized and developing countries in addressing this issue.

New Version:

Policy Considerations

21. We recognize that the most effective response strategies, especially in the short-term, are those which are:

- Justified for reason other than climate change and also provide beneficial influence on potential climate change;
- Economically efficient and cost effective;
- Able to serve multiple social, economic, and environmental purposes;
- Easily modified to respond to increased scientific and economic understanding of climate change;
- Compatible with the concept of a comprehensive approach addressing all sources and sinks of greenhouse gases;
- Compatible with the concept of sustainable economic growth and development;
- Administratively practical and effective in terms of application, monitoring, and enforcement;
- Inclusive of obligations by both industrialized and developing countries.

BEATEN
& NOORD
IPCC
PSC & PMS
P.13

Original:

21. We agree that stabilization of greenhouse gas emissions should be achieved by industrialized countries by the year [2000] and should be set at [present] emission levels.

INDUST. / ASAP
 - (BERGEN / NOORD.)

Comments:

Para 21: rewrite as follows:

We recommend that limitation and adaptation strategies be considered as an integrated package that complement each other to minimize net costs. These strategies should include measures which limit emissions from greenhouse gas sources as well as those which increase the ability of natural systems to utilize greenhouse gases. A comprehensive approach is needed which considers the costs of reducing emissions of different greenhouse gases and the effects of those reductions on potential climate change.

ADD TO #20

New Version:

21. We recommend that limitation and adaptation strategies be considered as an integrated package that complement each other to minimize net costs. These strategies should include measures which limit emissions from greenhouse gas sources as well as those which increase the ability of natural system to utilize greenhouse gases. A comprehensive approach is need to which considers the costs of options for reducing emissions of different greenhouse gases and the effects of those reductions on potential climate change.

Original:

22. We ~~urge~~ industrialized countries to establish greenhouse gases reduction programmes aiming at achieving at least 20% reduction of their current contribution to global warming potential, possibly by the year 2005 and in any case not later than the year 2010;

Comments:

Para 22: delete entirely to improve balance between science paragraphs and policy paragraphs

Original:

23. We recommend that the specifications of the obligation to stabilize and reduce greenhouse gases emissions be realized in the form of separate Protocols to the Climate Convention. Some of these protocols could be negotiated concurrently with the framework convention.

MOVE TO SEP. SECTION

Comments:

Para 23: delete entirely; point addressed in para 37-8.

Original:(Economic situation of certain countries)

24. We recognize that developing countries with, as yet, relatively low energy requirements, which can reasonably be expected to grow in step with their development, may have targets that accommodate that development. We also recognize that additional financial resources [will] [may] have to be made available to developing countries to enable them to limit their net emissions of greenhouse gases while ensuring a steady development of their economies;

Comments:

Para 24: replace with page ii of RSWG Policymakers Summary:

We note that all countries have a common responsibility for dealing with problems arising from climate change.
Industrialized countries should adopt domestic measures to limit climate change by adapting their own economies in line with future agreements to limit emissions.
Industrialized countries should also cooperate with developing countries in international action, without standing in the way of the latter's development.
Developing countries should, within limits feasible, take measures to suitably adapt their economies. Because a large, projected increase in world population is a major factor in causing the projected increase in global greenhouse gases, it is essential that global climate change strategies include strategies and measures to deal with the rate of growth of the world population.

MEX:

New Version:

23. We note that all countries have a common responsibility for dealing with problems arising from climate change. Industrialized countries should adopt domestic measures to limit greenhouse gas emissions by adapting their own economies in line with future agreements to limit such emissions. Industrialized countries should also cooperate with developing countries in international action addressing climate change, without standing in the way of the latter's development. Developing countries should, within limits feasible, take measures to suitably adapt their economies. Because a large, projected increase in world population is a major factor in causing the projected increase in global greenhouse gases, it is essential that global climate change strategies include strategies and measures to deal with the rate of growth of the world population.

Original:(Fund (Climate Fund))

25. We recommend that existing institutions for development and financial assistance including the World Bank and other Multilateral Development Banks, Bilateral Assistance Programmes, the relevant United Nations organisations and specialized agencies, and scientific and technological organisations should give greater attention to climate change issues within their environmental and other relevant programmes by providing expanded funding including concessional funding. In addition, regional and subregional co-operation should be reinforced and funded so as to address and implement the required action at that level.

Comments:

Para 25: delete "by providing expanded funding including concessional funding"

CHECK
IPCC RPT

New Version:

24. We recommend that existing institutions for development and financial assistance including the world bank and other multilateral development bank, bilateral assistance programmes, the relevant United Nations organizations and specialized agencies, and scientific and technological organizations give greater attention to climate change issues within their environmental and other relevant programmes. In addition, regional and sub-regional cooperation should be reinforced and funded so as to address and implement the required action at that level.

Original:

26. We ^{re}commend that consideration should be given to the need for funding facilities including a clearinghouse mechanism and a possible new international fund and their relationship to existing funding mechanisms, both multilateral and bilateral. Such funding should be related to the implementation of the climate convention and associated protocols. In the meantime the donor community is urged to provide assistance to developing countries to support immediate actions addressing climate change without waiting for the Convention.

*whether there is a**Any**HOLD LINE*Comments:

Para 26: replace with:

We recommend that financial resources channelled to developing countries to limit and/or adapt to climate change be focused on those activities which contribute both to limiting greenhouse gas emissions and promoting economic development.

New Version:

25. We recommend that financial resources channelled to developing countries to limit and/or adapt to climate change be focused on those activities which contribute both to limiting greenhouse gas emissions and promoting economic development. We recommend further that the scope of resource needs for these activities be assessed for developing countries. Such assessments should include, inter alia, country studies and the capabilities of existing institutions and mechanisms to meet the financing needs identified.

Original:

27. We recommend that additional ~~resources~~ should progressively, be mobilized to help developing ~~countries~~ take the necessary measures to address climate change consistent with their development needs.

Comments:

Para 27: delete in its entirety.

Original:

28. We recommend further that the scope of resources needed be assessed. Such assessments should include *inter alia* country studies and the capabilities of existing institutions and mechanisms to meet the financing needs identified, ~~similar to the approaches developed under~~ the Montreal Protocol.

EDIT.

as has been done under

LEAVE AS IS

Comments:

Para 28, line 1: after "assessed" add "for developing countries".

Para 28, lines 4-5: delete "similar to the approaches developed under the Montreal Protocol."

combined into para 25 of new version

New Version:

25. We recommend that financial resources channelled to developing countries to limit and/or adapt to climate change be focused on those activities which contribute both to limiting greenhouse gas emissions and promoting economic development. We recommend further that the scope of resource needs for these activities be assessed for developing countries. Such assessments should include, *inter alia*, country studies and the capabilities of existing institutions and mechanisms to meet the financing needs identified.

Original: 29. We recommend that, initially, international funding be directed to:

- (i) conducting research and monitoring;
- (ii) promoting public awareness, education and institutional and manpower development.
- (iii) promoting efficient use of energy, including appropriate end use technologies, increasing the use of non-fossil fuels and switching to energy sources with lower greenhouse gas emissions and the use of renewable energy sources;
- (iv) increased financial support for forest protection and forest management improvement, [for example through the Tropical Forest Action Plan (TFAP), the Plan of Action to Combat Desertification, the International Tropical Timber Organization (ITTO) and other relevant international organizations];
- (v) arranging for technology transfer to and technology development in developing countries;
- (vi) assisting developing countries in planning how to address problems posed by climate change;
- (vii) supporting developing countries to enable their full participation in international meetings on the subject of climate change.

The use of financial resources could subsequently be extended inter alia to major energy sources with little or no environmentally damaging characteristics and for steps to reduce other global man-made emissions of greenhouse gases due to human activities.

Comments:

Para 29, line 1, subpara (iii): break into two subparas by starting new subpara with "increasing the use of...."

Para 29, line 1, subpara (iv): delete "financial"

Para 29, para 1, subpara (iv): following "for example through" add "a global forestry agreement".

Para 29, para 1, subpara (v): replace with:

(v) fostering technology development and transfer of technology that is usable and applicable to economic development opportunities that would be beneficial to developing countries.

Para 29, para 1, subpara (vii): replace "their full" with "greater"

Para 29, para 1, subpara (vii): replace "meetings" with "activities"

Para 29, para 1, add new subpara (viii):

(viii) improving climate data management related to global and regional data sets with special emphasis on developing country requirements.

Para 29, second paragraph: delete entirely

KEEP
IS

KILL (OR
KEEP INTER
ALIA)

New Version:

26. We recommend that initially international funding be directed towards:

- (i) conducting research and monitoring;
- (ii) promoting public awareness, education and institutional and manpower development;
- (iii) promoting efficient use of energy, including appropriate end use technology;
- (iv) increasing the use of non-fossil fuels and switching to energy sources with lower greenhouse gas emissions and the use of renewable energy sources;
- (v) increasing support for forest protection and improving forest management, for example through a global forestry agreement, the Tropical Forestry Action Plan (TFAP), the Plan of Action to Combat Desertification, the International Tropical Timber Organization (ITTO) and other relevant international organizations;
- (vi) arranging for technology transfer to and technology development in developing countries;
- (vii) assisting developing countries in planning how to address problems posed by climate change;
- (viii) supporting greater participation of developing countries in international climate change activities; and
- (ix) improving climate data management related to global and regional data sets with special emphasis on developing country requirements.

Original:

(Economic Instruments)

30. We recognise that an environmentally sound development must include policies which will achieve a sustainable energy system and take the environmental costs and benefits of energy fully into account. We are convinced that promoting energy efficiency is the most cost effective immediate measure for reducing energy-related emissions of atmospheric pollutants, in particular CO₂.

Comments:

Para 30, replace with:

We recognize that environmentally sound development must include policies which consider the costs and benefits of energy use. We are convinced that, in many states, increasing energy efficiency is one of the most cost effective measures for reducing energy-related emissions of greenhouse gases.

2

Para 30, line 6: add new sentence at end as follows:

However, considerable research is necessary for each nation to establish what degree of energy efficiency is also economically efficient taking into account environmental externalities.

4

New Version:

27. We recognize that environmentally sound development must include policies which consider the costs and benefits of energy use. We are convinced that, in many states, increasing energy efficiency is one of the most cost effective measures for reducing energy-related emissions of greenhouse gases. However, considerable research is necessary for each nation to establish what degree of energy efficiency is also economically efficient taking into account environmental externalities.

Original:

31. We recommend that ~~[new]~~ policies at national level ~~be established~~ making extensive use of economic instruments in order to increase energy efficiency and reduce energy consumption.

Such instruments could include:

- (i) taxes on environmentally damaging activities and energy inefficient product
- (ii) emission trading (tradeable permits/allowances)
- (iii) reduction or, wherever possible, elimination of subsidies to ~~[energy intensive and other]~~ activities that induce climate change
- (iv) other measures such as emission charges and fees deposit refund systems and fiscal incentive

Such action ^{CW} should in particular affect energy prices with the aim to reflect environmental costs and benefits and provide incentives to reduce energy consumption. They ^{SW} should also modify production and consumption pattern and encourage production and use of energy efficient technologies.

Comments:

Para 31, para 1, line 1: replace "new policies at the national level be established making" with "policies at the national level make"

Para 31, line 3: replace "reduce energy consumption" with "conservation"

Para 31, subpara (iii): delete "energy intensive and"

Para 31, subpara (iv): replace "change" with "charge"

Para 31, subpara (iv): move "fiscal incentives" to before "measures" and delete the word "and" at the end.

Para 31, para 2 (on p. 7): delete this paragraph.

New Version:

28. We recommend that policies at the national level increase energy efficiency and conservation, making use of economic instruments including:

- (i) taxes on environmentally damaging activities and energy inefficient products;
- (ii) emission trading (tradeable PERMITS/allowances);
- (iii) reduction or, wherever possible, elimination of subsidies to activities that induce climate change; and
- (iv) other fiscal incentive measures such as emission charges and fee-deposit-refund systems.

Original:(Technology development)

32. We agree that technological breakthrough in a wide range of fields covering energy, industry and other sectors related to the emission and absorption of CO₂ and other greenhouse gases is the key element of any long-term strategy that deals with climate change in a way that meets the goal of sustainable development. To this end, we urge all countries, the industrialized countries in particular, to intensify their individual efforts and international cooperation in technology development concerning, inter alia, low-energy and low-GHG production processes and products (e.g. chlorofluorocarbon substitutes with little or no global warming potential), and CO₂ fixation and reutilization.

Comments:

Para 32, line 3: delete "CO₂ and other"

Para 32, line 4-5: delete "in a way.....sustainable development"

Para 32, line 6: delete "the industrialized countries in particular,"

Para 32, lines 7-10: replace "in technology developing..." with
on technologies and practices which reduce emissions or
 increase absorption of greenhouse gases.

New Version:

29. We agree that technological breakthrough in a wide range of fields covering energy, industry and other sectors related to the emission and absorption of greenhouse gases is the key element of any long-term strategy that deals with climate change. To this end, we urge all countries to intensify their individual efforts and international cooperation on technologies and practices that reduce emissions or increase absorption of greenhouse gases.

Original: (Transfer of technology)

[Alternative 1]

33. We urge that relevant technology be utilized by all sectors in all countries to the full extent possible. We recognize that there are great disparities in energy efficiency, even among the industrialized countries, and further urge all countries, industrialized and developing, to identify and take effective measures to remove barriers to the dissemination of the best available technology. This requires in the case of developing countries, effective measures to aid their efforts in meeting the specific needs arising, to a great extent, from their lack of human and financial resources and other elements necessary for the continuous development and dissemination of the most appropriate technology. The East European countries, which are currently suffering the consequences of inefficient use of energy and other resources, also require special attention. To this end, we also urge all industrialized countries and relevant international institutions to step up their contributions to the effective transfer and dissemination of relevant technology in ways that fully address the constraints that all these countries face.

[Alternative 2]

33. We consider important that this expansion of development employ appropriate and environmentally sound technology in order that the problem of global warming and climate change not be exacerbated. Consequently, the transfer and development of such technologies must assume a high priority. It will be important for the industrialized nations to respond to this priority and assign sufficient resources to assure technological development and establishment of mechanisms for successful transfer.

Comments:

Para 33, We prefer Alternative 2.

Para 33, Alternative 2: replace "this expansion of" with "economic" on line 1

Para 33, Alternative 2: delete "and environmentally sound" on line 2

Para 33, Alternative 2: replace "technology in order... exacerbated" with "technologies and practices" on line 2

Para 33, Alternative 2: revise second sentence as follows:

Consequently, consideration of effective mechanisms to develop and transfer such technologies must be accorded a high priority.

Para 33, Alternative 2, lines 5-8: Rewrite last sentence to:

It is important for both industrialized and developing nations to respond to this priority, by creating conditions that would be conducive to the development and transfer of such technologies and practices.

New Version:

30. We consider important that economic development employ appropriate technologies and practices. Consequently, consideration of effective mechanisms to develop and transfer such technologies must be accorded a high priority. It is important for both industrialized and developing nations to respond to this priority by creating conditions that would be conducive to the development and transfer of such technologies

3
2

Original:

34.

(Forestry)

34. We recognize that the conservation of the world's forests is of crucial importance for global climatic stability, particularly having regard to the important contribution of forest destruction to global warming through the emission of carbon-dioxide, methane and other trace gases.

We stress the need to reduce the rate of deforestation and to enhance the potential of the world's forests as a sink for greenhouse gases, through vigorous programmes of reforestation and afforestation.

① Urge the earliest completion of the feasibility assessment of
We endorse the target included in the Noordwijk Declaration of achieving net global forest growth of 12 million hectares per year, through conservation of existing forests and through aggressive programmes of reforestation and afforestation.

We call on all countries to:

- (i) Adopt clear objectives for the conservation, reforestation and sustainable management of forests in national development plans.
- (ii) Amend national policies to minimize forest loss and their human disturbance associated with public and private development projects (e.g. roads, dams, resettlement projects, mining, logging).
- (iii) Integrate forest management solutions with policies on environment, agriculture, transportation, energy (poverty and landlessness).
- (iv) Strengthen, support and extend the Tropical Forestry Action Plan (TFAP) process to all countries with tropical forests, and expand support for immediate implementation of completed plans.
- (v) Strengthen the role of the International Tropical Timber Organization (ITTO) in supporting the sustainable utilization of forest resources.
- (vi) Strengthen the role of development banks, IMF, FAO, UNEP, and other multilateral and bilateral organizations in helping developing countries achieve conservation and sustainable development of forests by:
- a) Requiring analyses of climate change implications, potential greenhouse gas emissions, and response programmes in their review of project proposals involving forests;
- b) Expanding greatly aid and investment flows to the forest sector as well as for the production of energy from biomass.
- c) Expanding debt relief via renegotiation of debt, and debt for conservation exchanges; and
- d) Linking structural adjustment measures to alleviation of climatic impacts and reduction of gas emissions.

EDIT.

REWRITE

FIX IF LEFT

Comments:

Para 34, line 2: after "importance" add "to the stability of the global climate"

Para 34, lines 2-4: delete "for global climatic stability,.... and other trace gases."

Para 34, lines 2-4: delete "for global climatic stability,.... and other trace gases."

Para 34, para 3: delete in its entirety because it goes beyond the Noordwijk Declaration

Para 34, para 4, delete subpara (vi)(b-d)

New Version:

31. We recognize that the conservation of the world's forests is of crucial importance to the stability of the global climate. In particular we note the significance of forest destruction to global climate change both in contributing to the increase in emissions of carbon-dioxide, methane and other trace gases, and in reduction of natural absorption of carbon dioxide.

We stress the need to reduce the rate of deforestation and to enhance the potential of the world's forests as a sink for greenhouse gases, through vigorous programs of reforestation and afforestation.

We call on all countries to:

- (i) adopt clear objectives for the conservation, reforestation and sustainable management of forests in national development plans;
- (ii) amend national policies to minimize forest loss and disturbance by public and private development projects (e.g. roads, dams, resettlement projects, mining, logging);
- (iii) integrate forest management solutions with policies on environment, agriculture, transportation, energy, poverty and landlessness;
- (iv) strengthen, support and extend the tropical forestry action plan (tfap) process to all countries with tropical forests, and expand support for immediate implementation of completed plans;
- (v) strengthen the role of the international tropical timber organization (ITTO) in supporting the sustainable utilization of forest resources;
- (vi) strengthen the role of development banks, IMF, FAO, UNEP, and multilateral and bilateral organizations in helping developing countries achieve conservation and sustainable development of forests by requiring analyses of climate change implications, potential greenhouse gas emissions, and response programmes in their review of project proposals involving forests.

Original:

35. We call finally for the development of a World Forest Conservation ~~Protocol or Convention~~ covering temperate, boreal and tropical forests, in the context of or in association with a Climate Convention which also addresses energy supply and use. The specific elements of such a protocol or convention are a matter for international negotiations which should begin at an early date. These elements may include: fundamental research, tropical forest planning, measures to use, protect and reforest, international trade, financial assistance and possible national and international targets for conservation, reforestation and afforestation.

*Convention
or
agreement*

Comments:

Para 35, line 7: before "tropical" add "temperate and"

Para 35: replace first four lines with:

We call finally for the development of a global forest convention or agreement. The specific elements of such a convention or agreement....

New Version:

32. We call finally for the development of a global forest convention or agreement. The specific elements of such a convention or agreement are a matter for international negotiations which should begin at an early date. These elements may include: fundamental research, temperate and tropical forest planning, measures to use, protect and reforest, international trade, financial assistance and possible national and international targets for conservation, reforestation and afforestation.

36. We recommend that regional and/or sub-regional studies on these subjects be undertaken to cover the impacts of climate change in the following fields:

Original:

- (i) Drought;
- (ii) Desertification;
- (iii) Water resources and their evolution;
- (iv) Agriculture (positive and negative impacts);
- (v) Energy;
- (vi) Forests.

Comments:

These studies should lead to the development of scenarios and short, medium- and long-term measures for mitigation of drought and stopping and reversing desertification for the attention of economic and political decision makers.

Para 36: expand list of items to include coastal resources, human health, infrastructure, human settlements, fisheries and biodiversity.

Para 36, para 1, line 2: positive and negative impacts

Para 36, para 1, line 3: replace "fields" with "areas"

Para 36, subpara (iii): delete "and their evolution"

Para 36, subpara (iv): delete "(positive and negative impacts)"

Para 36, subpara (v): replace with: "Energy supply and use:"

Para 36, para 2: replace with:

We recommend that all nations assess the potential impacts of climate change on their resources and plan for adaptation. Appropriate regional institutions should work with member countries to assess and plan for regional impacts of climate change. Industrialized countries should provide technical assistance to developing countries to conduct such assessments. These activities might be facilitated by the establishment, within an existing institution, of an international clearinghouse on climate change impacts and assessments.

New Version:

33. We recommend that regional and/or sub-regional studies be undertaken to evaluate the positive and negative impacts of climate change in the following areas:

- (i) drought;
- (ii) desertification;
- (iii) water resources;
- (iv) agricultural;
- (v) energy supply and use;
- (vi) forests;
- (vii) coastal resources;
- (viii) human health;
- (ix) national infrastructure;
- (x) human settlements;
- (xi) fisheries; and
- (xii) biodiversity.

We recommend that all nations assess the potential impacts of climate change on their resources and plan for adaptation. Appropriate regional institutions should work with member countries to assess and plan for regional impacts of climate change. Industrialized countries should provide technical assistance to developing countries to conduct such assessments. These activities might be facilitated by the establishment, within an existing institution, of an international clearinghouse on climate change impacts and assessments.

Original:

III. GLOBAL CONVENTION

37. We welcome the resolutions of the Executive Council of the WMO and Special Governing Council of UNEP authorising their Secretary General and Executive Director to begin negotiations ~~for~~ a Climate Convention, ~~and associated Protocols.~~ We call for such negotiations to begin without delay. We endorse the WMO and UNEP Governing Bodies Decisions in this respect. We urge all countries to join in these negotiations, with the aim of completing negotiations to ensure adoption of a Climate Convention by the time of the UN Conference on Environment and Development in 1992;

on a Framework
convention on
climate
change

MEX ADDITION OK

Comments:

Para 37, title should read "Framework Convention on Climate Change"

Para 37, line 3: replace "begin negotiations for a" with

establish an ad hoc group of government representatives to prepare for negotiations for a Framework

Para 37, line 4: delete "and associated protocols"

Para 37, line 5: replace "without delay" with "no later than February 1991"

4
+ TRACK
WMO
RESOL.

New Version:

Framework Convention on Climate Change

34. We welcome the resolutions of the Executive Council of the WMO and special session of the governing council of UNEP ~~authorizing their Secretary General and Executive Director to establish an ad hoc group of government representatives to prepare for negotiations on a framework convention on climate change.~~ We call for such negotiations to begin not later than February 1991. We urge all countries to join in these negotiations, with the aim of completing negotiations to ensure adoption of a framework convention by the time of the UN conference on environment and development in 1992.

with respect to

1-2

Original:

38. We recommend that such negotiations take account of the possible elements compiled by the IPCC, and that the Climate Convention be framed in such a way as to gain the support of the largest possible number of countries.

KEEP AS IS

Comments:

Para 38: change "the Climate" to read "the Framework Climate"

Para 38, line 1: replace "take account of" with "consider"

New Version:

35. We recommend that such negotiations consider the possible elements compiled by the ipcc, and that the framework convention be framed in such a way as to gain the support of the largest possible number of states. We recommend that the framework convention contain, at a minimum, general principles and obligations, and that it advocate a comprehensive approach that includes sources and sinks of all greenhouse gases.

3
COR (1) IF
COMPREH. DOESN'T
GET IN BLEND

Original:

39. We welcome the offer of the Government of the United States to host the first negotiating meeting of a Working Group on the elaboration of a Climate Convention. We also welcome the possible invitation of Italy to host the first meeting of the Working Group for the elaboration of an Energy Protocol. We urge that these two meetings be convened at the beginning of 1991.

Comments:

- ① HASN'T HAPPENED
- ② NO SIMULTAN. PROTOCOLS
- ③ UNCONNECTED

Para 39, lines 2-3: revise first sentence to read:

We welcome the offer of the Government of the United States to host the first negotiating session on the Framework Convention in February 1991.

Para 39, lines 3-6: delete the last two sentences.

New Version:

36. We welcome the offer of the government of the United States to host the first negotiating session on the framework convention in February 1991.

Original:

40. We recommend further that the Climate Convention [and associated Protocols] contain specific obligations and address in particular:

- ① ITEMS FOR NEGOT.
- (i) the enhancement of research and systematic observation of climate
 - (ii) the control of greenhouse gas emissions
 - (iii) the adaptation to the adverse effects of climate change in coastal areas
 - (iv) The needs of developing countries for financial assistance in their development efforts and transfer of technology
 - (v) appropriate institutional and decision-making procedures.

Comments:

COVERED BY 438

Para 40: replace with language from RSWG Policymakers Summary:

We recommend that the framework convention contain, at a minimum, general principles and obligations, and that it take a comprehensive approach addressing all sources and sinks of greenhouse gases.

Combined with para 35 in new version.

New Version:

35. We recommend that such negotiations consider the possible elements compiled by the IPCC, and that the framework convention be framed in such a way as to gain the support of the largest possible number of states. We recommend that the framework convention contain, at a minimum, general principles and obligations, and that it advocate a comprehensive approach that includes sources and sinks of all greenhouse gases.

PUT
SOMEWHERE
ELSE

Original:

IV. INFORMATION AND PUBLIC AWARENESS

41. We believe that a well informed public is essential for addressing and coping with as complex an issue as climate change and urge countries
- (i) encourage wide participation of all sectors of the population in addressing climate change issues and developing appropriate responses
 - (ii) provide guidance for positive practices to limit/or adapt to climate change
 - (iii) incorporate in the curricula of their educational systems environmental education
 - (iv) establish national committees or clearing houses to collect, develop and disseminate accurate information on climate change issues.

Comments:

None

New Version:

Information and Public Awareness

37. We believe that well informed public is essential for addressing and coping with as complex an issue as climate change and urge countries to:

- (i) encourage wide participation of all sectors of the population in addressing climate change issues and developing appropriate responses
- (ii) provide guidance for positive practices to limit/or adapt to climate change
- (iii) incorporate in the curricula of their educational systems environmental education
- (iv) establish national committee or clearing houses to collect, develop and disseminate accurate information on climate change issues.

Original:

V. INSTITUTIONAL MATTERS

42. We congratulate the IPCC for the outstanding achievement of producing a very short time its first report on the state of the science of climate change, the socio-economic impact and policy options. We recognize that the IPCC structure can provide an invaluable mechanism for periodic assessments, perhaps every five years, of the evolving knowledge from research and impact studies. We urge that the IPCC continue its analysis of risks of action and inaction, policy options and economic aspects of alternative measures for limiting greenhouse ~~emissions~~, mitigating or adapting to climate change. We also urge that ~~the~~ further report on these issues should be produced during 1991 to support the then ongoing negotiations of a Climate Convention on Climate Change.

studies

Comments:

Para 42 and 43, place paragraphs in new section on IPCC.

Para 42, line 3: policy options to limit or adapt to climate change

Para 42, line 4: delete "structure"

Para 42, line 5: delete "perhaps every five years"

Para 42, lines 7-8: delete "risks of action and inaction"

Para 42, lines 8-9: replace "and economic aspects.... adapting to climate change." with "especially the economic aspects of alternative measures for limiting greenhouse gas emissions of adapting to climate change."

Para 42, line 10: delete "during 1991"

Para 42, lines 11: delete "then"

Para 42, last sentence: framework convention

New Version:

12. We congratulate the IPCC for the outstanding achievement of producing its First Assessment Report on the state of the science of climate change, the socio-economic impacts and policy options to limit or adapt to climate change. We recognize that the IPCC can provide an invaluable mechanism for periodic assessments of the evolving knowledge from research and impact studies. We urge that the IPCC can provide an invaluable mechanisms for periodic assessments of the evolving knowledge from research and impact studies. We urge that the IPCC continue its analysis of policy options, especially the economic aspects of alternative measures for limiting greenhouse gas emissions or adapting to climate change. We also urge that further reports on these issues be produced to support the ongoing negotiations of a Framework Climate Convention on Climate Change.

43

Original:

- ✓ 43. We further express our appreciation to WMO and UNEP for initiating the IPCC and providing an efficient Secretariat. We urge that this arrangement be continued and that countries continue to provide resources to support the Secretariat and participation of developing countries in the work of IPCC.

Comments:

Para 43, line 2: after "efficient" add "and effective"

Para 43, line 3: replace "that countries continue..... in the work of the IPCC." with "expanded to provide secretariat support for negotiations on a framework convention on climate change"

New Version:

13. We further express our appreciation to WMO and UNEP for initiating the IPCC and providing for an efficient and effective Secretariat. We urge that this arrangement be continued and expanded to provide secretariat support for the negotiations on a framework convention on climate change.

GLOBAL CHANGE STRATEGY TASK FORCE

AGENDA

September 18, 1990

I. Introduction

- . Thanks for coming to the meeting - as noted, due to the busy schedule of international meetings this fall, we will be holding these once a week from now on. Last week, to make best use of everyone's time, we decided to have a number of information documents prepared for your review at this meeting. However, from now on we will plan to meet every week.

- . Try to schedule the same time and day each week?

. As we have discussed at past meetings, we have a number of issues to address regarding, first, the Framework Convention Negotiations, and, secondly, the Second World Climate Conference Ministerial Declaration.

. Hopefully, you should have received a package of material yesterday with some background on these issues.

. Incidentally, I would like to thank ^{Buff} Chris Dawson and the others at Department of State who have taken a great deal of time from busy schedules to prepare background materials for us. I realize that, like most of our groups, there is a small number of people covering a large number of issues and I want to express my appreciation for their hard work.

II. The FIRST ISSUE we should address is one which we have discussed somewhat in previous meetings - that of the TIMING, LENGTH, AND LOCATION OF THE FIRST NEGOTIATING SESSION ON THE FRAMEWORK CONVENTION.

. It is important to get a resolution of these issues at this meeting, if possible, so that we may get our clearance to our representatives who are presently on their way to the organizational session for that first negotiating session.

. That organizational session begins next week, Sept. 24

. As noted in the Options paper, we must resolve these issues so:

a. The President and the US are taken seriously in our offer to host this first session,

b. The US can be organized in our preparations for the negotiations by insuring that we have enough lead time to get ready.

. Go through the options paper (start on p. 2)

Address cost issue.

III. THE SECOND SET OF ISSUES that we should address are the major policy issues involved in the SECOND WORLD CLIMATE CONFERENCE MINISTERIAL DECLARATION

. Background:

. Last week, the OES PCC Working Group on Environment met to go through all of the US comments on the proposed language of the draft Ministerial Declaration.

. The US comments and changes are indicated on the Declaration in Appendix B, which presents the Declaration on a paragraph by paragraph basis.

. Chris Dawson has prepared an summary of the major policy issues which are represented in the document, This is in your package as Attachment A.

. Call on Chris to discuss the issues.

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

1. LEVEL OF REPRESENTATION

. As soon as possible, we next need to address the issue of the level of US representation at the Ministerial portion of the Second World Climate Conference.

. The possibilities range from that of a special negotiator to technical/legal experts.

. Go through options

2. NAS EVANS STUDY

. Recently, had a briefing from Sen. Dan Evans and Bob

- ① Budget
- ② 2nd World Climate
- ③ 2nd World Climate

③ 2nd Task Force - Howard Gruenspecht & Bob Cengel.
- working group - Conference - New Haven Conf. - 10/13/89.

*Head of delegation
Chris Dawson*

*Thatcher and
Gother head of
state.*

*Internal
briefing*

will keep them informed.

Task Force on Comprehensive and Incentives Approaches to Climate

Outline of Current Activities

September 17, 1990

Participation to date has included numerous agencies, including CEA, CEES, CEQ, NOAA, DOE, DOI, DOJ (chair), EPA, NASA, NSF, OPD, OSTP, State, USDA, USTR, Treasury, WH Counsel. Coordination ongoing with interagency research efforts, including National Energy Strategy, CEES/Global Change, CEES/MARS, new CEES/Ad Hoc Economics group.

We have drafted an Interim Report, which is now being circulated for interagency comment and will be submitted by late September. It describes the significant research and analyses needed to develop and support the comprehensive and incentives approaches.

The following summarizes the key topics of the Interim Report in its current draft stage:

A. Introduction

Describes the policy context of the approaches: they consider "how to" design policy choices, if any, and not "how much" action to take. They apply to an array of policy issues, including setting a research agenda, identification of "no regrets" measures or technology development opportunities, and, if relevant, designing emissions limitations.

B. Comprehensive Approach

I. Measuring atmospheric concentrations of GHGs. Need to monitor atmospheric concentrations of all relevant gases, including CO₂, CH₄, N₂O, CFCs, HCFCs, HFCs, O₃, CO, NO_x, NMHCs (VOCs), OH. Uses direct satellite, aerial and ground-based observation of current gases, and sample records stored in ice cores, tree rings.

II. Impacts of GHGs: Comparative Indices.

(A) Radiative forcing index. Discusses need to harmonize diverse methodologies, improve estimates of residence times of GHGs, account for saturation effects, and other scientific properties. Indicates need to consider and incorporate discount rates and means for adapting index values to new scientific information; both require multidisciplinary study. International workshop in Dec.

(B) Full environmental impacts index. Discusses value of an index that incorporates, in addition to radiative forcing, the salient non-warming impacts of GHGs, such as CO₂'s enrichment of plants and CFCs' effects on

stratospheric ozone layer. Notes analytic difficulties in developing this index.

III. Measuring and monitoring net GHG emissions

(A) Measuring net GHG emissions. Data well developed on CO2 sources, CFCs. Better data needed on CO2 sinks; methane, nitrous oxide and tropospheric ozone sources and sinks. Better data needed generally for developing countries. Need for direct observation techniques, and for proxies or surrogates to estimate net emissions. Assembling inventories of nations' net GHG emissions (OECD project).

(B) Forecasting future net emissions. Current economic models typically cover only CO2, energy sector. DOE's Edmonds' Second Generation GHG Emissions Model would expand to all GHGs, all sectors. Full development: 3 years away.

(C) Monitoring emissions in the future. Need to expand monitoring capabilities, develop proxies or surrogates, and consider institutional arrangements for generating emissions data, such as national reporting and incentives for improved capabilities.

IV. Evaluating net GHG emissions limitations achieved by current national policies and proposals

(A) Calculating extent and costs of net GHG limitations achieved by U.S. "no regrets" actions.

(B) Analyses of results of other nations' policies and proposals. Test claims made by others.

V. Evaluating cost-effectiveness of comprehensive versus piecemeal approaches.

(A) Develop marginal cost of net GHG avoidance functions, for gases, sources, sectors, and nations. Examine variations in costs across these variables to show benefits of flexibility within a comprehensive approach.

(B) Apply cost-effectiveness analysis to proposals made in national and international discussions.

(C) Environmental effectiveness: propensity for and impact of induced shifts in residuals. Develop crisp retorts to piecemeal proposals (whether offered internationally or in Congress) by showing their futility in limiting net GHG emissions. Examples: CO2-only policy induces fuel switching to natural gas that increases methane emissions; unilateral or industrialized-nation-only policy induces shifts of demand for fuels, and industry flight, to other nations.

(D) Benefits of including sink development through "net emissions" approach: side benefits of encouraging afforestation and phytoplankton protection. Biodiversity, soil erosion, food webs, timber harvesting.

VI. Bridging from discrete and partial approaches to a comprehensive approach.

Hurdle: gaps in the science of monitoring of certain GHGs, such as monitoring of non-point emissions of methane and nitrous oxide, and of CO2 sinks. Discusses need for more research, consideration of costs of taking partial action now versus costs of doing additional research, prospects for partial action to evolve into comprehensive action.

Hurdle: several discrete GHGs, sources and sinks will be dealt with outside climate convention, including CFCs, VOCs, forestry. Discusses means to integrate such items into a comprehensive climate approach.

C. Incentives: emissions trading, fees, and other economic instruments

I. Emissions trading

(A) Domestic trading. Need for economic analysis of gains from trades.

(B) International trading. Informal, bilateral model. Consider potential gains from international reallocations, institutional design, relation to trade and financial assistance systems, sovereignty issues.

II. Emissions fees.

Possible consideration of various types of fees, including carbon tax, BTU tax, relative radiative forcing tax, etc. Defer to budget talks.

III. Adaptation incentives.

Consider market failures in private sector planning to anticipate long-range impacts (e.g. coastal construction; planning for future water use; other technologies and practices); incentives to encourage efficient adaptation investments and choices.

IV. Economic instruments in general. Pursue study and discussion through OECD, IPCC, CEES Ad Hoc Economics group.

FUNDING FOR FIRST NEGOTIATING SESSION

o Estimated costs for the first negotiating session run between \$300 to \$500 thousand, depending on where the conference takes place, how long it lasts, and the number of participants.

o OES has requested \$318,000 in FY 91 funds to cover the cost of a modest conference in Washington. D.C. with full U.N. standard translation and interpretation services. (This includes interpretation in five or six languages, plus full on-site translation of conference documents.) Providing we get the full amount and providing the first negotiating session runs no longer than one week, we should be able to fund the session with minimal solicitation of other agencies.

o If OES receives significantly less than what we have requested to cover conference costs, we shall have to pass the hat to other agencies in addition to collecting from them about \$200,000 to cover FY 91 IPCC secretariat and developing country travel expenses.

o If sequestration takes place and/or departmental budgets are severely reduced, agencies funds may not be available to cover costs of conference and special discretionary funds may be needed.

Washington ✓
~~Denver~~
Dallas ✓