



24TH STORY of Level 1 printed in FULL format.

Copyright (c) 1988 The New York Times Company;  
The New York Times

October 24, 1988, Monday, Late City Final Edition

SECTION: Section B; Page 5, Column 1; National Desk

LENGTH: 185 words

HEADLINE: POLITICS;  
Bush Flier Features Convict

BODY:

A Republican Party campaign flier mailed last week in support of Vice President Bush's campaign prominently features a photograph of Willie Horton, the murderer who escaped while on prison furlough in Massachusetts and then raped a woman in Maryland.

The executive director of the Bush/ Quayle campaign in New York, Steven B. Kelmar, said that the flier had been mailed to several hundred thousand New Yorkers.

Mr. Kelmar praised the flier as tough but effective in portraying Gov. Michael S. Dukakis as soft on crime. The flier was a venture of Victory '88, a joint operation of national and state party officials, Mr. Kelmar said. He said he understood the flier was being mailed in other states as well.

The Rev. Jesse Jackson and the Dukakis campaign said yesterday that Mr. Bush's campaign was using the case of Mr. Horton to stir racial fears. Mr. Horton is black and the woman raped in Maryland is white.

Mark Goodin, Mr. Bush's spokesman, said he had been unaware of the flyer. 'Party efforts like Victory '88 are separate from the campaign,' he said. 'We don't have any control over them.'

SUBJECT: PRESIDENTIAL ELECTION OF 1988; CRIME AND CRIMINALS; MURDERS AND ATTEMPTED MURDERS; SEX CRIMES; ELECTION ISSUES; PRISONS AND PRISONERS; PRISON ESCAPES; ELECTION ISSUES; BLACKS (IN US)

NAME: DUKAKIS, MICHAEL S (GOV); BUSH, GEORGE (VICE PRES); HORTON, WILLIE;  
KELMAR, STEVEN B

GEOGRAPHIC: MASSACHUSETTS



128TH STORY of Level 1 printed in FULL format.

## The Associated Press

The materials in the AP file were compiled by The Associated Press. These materials may not be republished without the express written consent of The Associated Press.

October 24, 1988, Monday, PM cycle

SECTION: Political News

LENGTH: 823 words

HEADLINE: Bush Denies Racism, Lying

BYLINE: By ROBERT GREENE, Associated Press Writer

KEYWORD: Political Rdp

## BODY:

George Bush declared today "there isn't any racism" in his ads, and he denied Democratic charges of Republican lying. He campaigned in New England and rival Michael Dukakis headed for California as the presidential race headed into its final two weeks.

Reacting to weekend talk of racism, Bush told reporters today. "It's absolutely ridiculous and everybody sees this as some desperation kind of move, basing it on one ad."

Bush was referring to Democratic complaints that the Republicans have been appealing to racial fears in Bush's speeches and ads stressing the case of Willie Horton Jr., a black convicted murderer who raped a white woman after escaping from a Massachusetts prison furlough.

"I mean people see this for what it is - a campaign tactic. I stand 100 percent behind those ads. I think the American people are smart," Bush said.

He added that the Democrats are running an ad about a man from a Bush-supported Houston halfway house who murdered a minister's wife. Bush asked, "What about their ad about the halfway house? Is that racism against Hispanics?"

"He is upset, not because it's false but because he is weak on crime and defense. And that's the inescapable truth," Bush said at a campaign breakfast in Waterbury, Conn.

The Republican candidate also noted new Democratic TV ads accusing Bush and the Republicans of lying and distorting Dukakis' record.

Bush said Dukakis had denied during their second debate that he had "raided" the Massachusetts pension fund. "Well, that is flat-out false and he knows it," Bush said.

In a speech prepared for delivery to a business group in Waterbury, Bush said, "My opponent now wants to turn back to clog up the circulatory system of America's economy with exactly the kind of big government schemes the Europeans are discarding."



The Associated Press, October 24, 1988

Dukakis was spending the entire day in California, including stops in Los Angeles and San Francisco, in pursuit of that crucial state's 47 electoral votes.

Republican vice presidential candidate Dan Quayle was going to be accompanied by his mother, Corrine Quayle, during his first stop in Missouri. He was going on to Kentucky.

Democratic vice presidential candidate Lloyd Bentsen was campaigning in Michigan, Missouri and Arkansas.

Dukakis, stopping Sunday night in Eau Claire, Wis., attacked the Republican ticket for what he called its "steady stream of distortion and misrepresentation."

Although Dukakis didn't mention it, campaign vice-chairman John Sasso said the candidate agreed with assertions by Bentsen and black leader Jesse Jackson that there were racist overtones to some Bush tactics.

Bentsen told a television interviewer he thought the Bush campaign was making a racist appeal by focusing on Willie Horton Jr., a black convicted murderer who escaped in 1986 from a Massachusetts prison furlough.

In 1987, Horton stabbed a white Maryland man and raped the man's fiancée. Horton is currently imprisoned in Maryland.

Asked on ABC-TV's "This Week With David Brinkley" if use of the Horton case constituted "an element of Republican racist appeal," Bentsen replied: "When you add it up, I think there is, and that's unfortunate, and I just don't want to see this election won on that kind of packaging and that kind of distortions."

In Boston, Jackson avoided the word "racist" but said the Horton case was one of several "rather ugly race-conscious signals" sent out by the Bush campaign.

"There have been a number of rather blatantly race-conscious signals that have had the impact of instilling ungrounded fear in whites and alienation from blacks," Jackson said after a 90-minute breakfast he and other black political leaders had with Dukakis.

Dukakis' meeting with the black leaders was the first such gathering since the Democratic convention, said Dukakis spokesman Mark Gearan. A session with Hispanic leaders was planned for Wednesday.

Jackson emerged from the meeting pledging to work harder for Dukakis, and on Sunday night in Atlanta, he delivered a speech calling Bush "one who runs against civil liberties, civil rights, women's rights, the poor and the homeless."

In other developments, a new poll conducted for the Dallas Morning News and the Houston Chronicle showed the Bush-Quayle ticket led the Dukakis-Bentsen ticket among likely Texas voters by 52 percent to 42 percent.

The survey of 776 potential voters conducted between Oct. 17 and Oct. 20 had a margin of error of plus or minus four percentage points.



The Associated Press, October 24, 1988

A poll by the Milwaukee Sentinel showed support for Dukakis slipping in Wisconsin. He was backed by 47 percent of the likely voters, compared with 45 percent for Bush. Dukakis had led 50-39 in August.

The telephone survey Oct. 14-18 of 687 likely voters had a four-point margin of error in either direction.

Nebraska's largest newspaper, The Omaha World-Herald, today endorsed Bush over Dukakis. The editorial cited Bush's experience as well as his stands on the issues.



1ST STORY of Level 1 printed in FULL format.

Copyright (c) 1988 The New York Times Company;  
The New York Times

October 24, 1988, Monday, Late City Final Edition

SECTION: Section A; Page 1, Column 5; National Desk

LENGTH: 1361 words

HEADLINE: Foes Accuse Bush Campaign Of Inflaming Racial Tension

BYLINE: By ANDREW ROSENTHAL

BODY:

Senator Lloyd Bentsen, the Rev. Jesse Jackson and other Democrats accused the Presidential campaign of Vice President Bush yesterday of inflaming the nation's racial fears with a relentless emphasis on the case of a black prisoner who raped a white woman while he was on leave from a Massachusetts prison. The Bush campaign immediately ridiculed the accusations.

Mr. Bentsen, the Democratic Vice-Presidential nominee, was asked on the ABC News program 'This Week' if there was a racial element to the Republican emphasis on prison furloughs and replied 'When you add it up, I think there is, and that's unfortunate.'

Mr. Jackson, speaking earlier at a Boston news conference, said: 'There have been a number of rather ugly race-conscious signals sent from that campaign.' He accused the Bush campaign of seeking to spread 'horrible' fears. Mr. Jackson spoke after a meeting of with Gov. Michael S. Dukakis of Massachusetts, the Democratic Presidential nominee, and about 20 prominent black politicians.

Joe Reed, chairman of the Alabama Democratic Conference, a statewide black political organization, said: 'Without doubt this campaign is setting race relations back because Bush's code words appear to be appealing to the worst in folk.'

The case of the escaped prisoner, Willie Horton, has been widely used in the campaign, cited by Mr. Bush on the stump, shown in television commercials by his supporters and featured in a flier mailed out by the New York Republican State Committee.

Mark Goodin, spokesman for the Bush campaign, said of the Dukakis campaign's complaints, 'My advice to them is 'grow up.' ' He continued, 'The whole idea is childish to say there is some sort of racial overtone in the Horton case. The issue isn't Willie Horton, the issue is why did he get out and why didn't Michael Dukakis stop it.'

Mr. Dukakis himself did not say anything publicly about the subject, but his deputy campaign chairman, John Sasso, told reporters as they flew across the country that Mr. Dukakis agreed with Mr. Bentsen.

Some of those who participated in the Boston meeting with Mr. Dukakis said the racial issue was mentioned, although the meeting was devoted primarily to strategies for turning out Democratic voters on Nov. 8.



(c) 1988 The New York Times, October 24, 1988

Mr. Goodin also attacked Mr. Jackson for raising the issue, saying: "It seems to me that it is the height of hypocrisy for Reverend Jackson to raise the specter of racism while he has in the past embraced Louis Farrakhan and has made religiously disparaging remarks about Jews," Mr. Goodin said. "He ought to be ashamed of himself." Mr. Goodin was apparently referring to Mr. Jackson calling New York City "Hymietown" in the 1984 campaign. Mr. Farrakhan, who is the leader of the Nation of Islam, a religious organization, has been accused of racism.

The charges raised by Mr. Jackson and the others today bring to the foreground an issue that has been simmering in the 1988 campaign, which has seen the Republicans use emotionally charged images to portray Mr. Dukakis as a liberal who is soft on crime and out of the political mainstream. They also reflect the increasingly aggressive counterattack by the Democrats, who are trying to make Mr. Bush's campaign tactics into a issue of character.

Mr. Horton was serving a sentence for murder in a Massachusetts prison. He escaped while on a weekend furlough in 1986 and later raped a Maryland woman and stabbed her fiance. He is imprisoned in Maryland.

Since Mr. Horton's attack on the couple, Mr. Dukakis has excluded first-degree murderers from the furlough program. But the Bush campaign has made the furloughs a central issue of the Presidential race, one that polls suggest has been highly effective in damaging Mr. Dukakis's image and left the Democrats scrambling for ways to respond.

#### 'One of Those Gut Issues'

"The Horton case," Bush campaign manager Lee Atwater told reporters last summer, "is one of those gut issues that are values issues, particularly in the South, and if we hammer at these over and over, we are going to win."

In a recent speech, the Vice President said that the Horton case had "come to symbolize, and represent -accurately, I believe - the misguided outlook of my opponent when it comes to crime."

Television spots on the prison furlough issue run by the Bush campaign have not included Mr. Horton's photograph or mentioned that he is black. Mr. Goodin said that was a deliberate decision, not because the campaign thought the picture would create racist overtones but because it wanted to focus on the furlough issue, not just the Horton case.

The furlough commercial that the Bush campaign uses has only a few discernably black faces among the two dozen or so prisoners shown. But its dull, gray tones make it hard to identify the men by race.

But Mr. Bush's frequent references to Mr. Horton often lead to his picture appearing in newspapers and on television. It also appears in television advertising, sponsored by the Committee for the Presidency and paid for by supporters of the Republican ticket but not, under Federal law, subject to the campaign's control.

#### 'Fear and Smear'



(c) 1988 The New York Times, October 24, 1988

Susan Estrich, Mr. Dukakis's campaign manager, insisted today that there was nothing innocent about the Bush campaign's use of the Horton case. In a telephone interview, she said: "There is no stronger metaphor for racial hatred in our country than the black man raping the white woman." She added "If you were going to run a campaign of fear and smear and appeal to racial hatred you could not have picked a better case to use than this one."

Mr. Jackson also noted that the Bush campaign's commercial on the prison furlough issue shows prisoners, many of them black or Hispanic, going through a revolving door.

"It's the oldest racial symbol imaginable," Donna Brazile, a Dukakis aide, said last week about the Horton case before she resigned after talking to reporters about rumors involving Mr. Bush's private life. "I mean, a black man raping a white woman while her husband watched."

#### Other Images Cited

Representative Charles B. Rangel of Manhattan, who was among those at the Boston news conference today, said: "Let's face it, if we talk about a murderer and a rapist and you have as part of the commercial black folks' faces, then you don't have to be a Democrat to know that is an appeal along racial lines."

Mr. Jackson said there were other racial images used by the Bush campaign, including his own relationship with Mr. Dukakis.

"The use of the Willie Horton example is designed to create the most horrible psycho-sexual fears, the furlough ad with black and brown faces rotating in and out of jail, the use of the Jackson-Dukakis ticket symbolism, which is distortion, referring to me as a Chicago hustler," Mr. Jackson said.

#### No Revisions Requested

Mr. Goodin said the campaign had no control over what commercials were aired by third parties. But he acknowledged that the campaign had influence with state organizations and groups supporting Mr. Bush.

Mr. Bush last week repudiated leaflets issued by the Illinois Republican State Central Committee after Mr. Dukakis denounced the pamphlets as "garbage." The pamphlets asserted that "all the murderers and rapists and drug pushers and child molesters in Massachusetts vote for Michael Dukakis."

Merle Black, professor of Political Science at the University of North Carolina and a leading analyst of Southern politics, said he had seen a commercial in that state using Mr. Horton's picture.

"It's the kind of issue George Wallace would have used," he said. "This is updated 1988 George Wallace-style politics."

#### HOMELESS URGED TO VOTE

By The Associated Press

Mr. Jackson, speaking Sunday at a rally in new York City to promote housing as an election issue next year, urged the homeless to vote in the Presidential



(c) 1988 The New York Times, October 24, 1988

election. "You're homeless, but you're not voteless," he told three busloads of homeless people who attended the rally at the Cathedral of St. John the Divine.

He criticized Mr. Bush, saying the Republican candidate "argued for the abandonment of the homeless."

GRAPHIC: photo of Gov. Michael S. Dukakis and Rev. Jesse Jackson (AP) (pg. B5)

SUBJECT: PRESIDENTIAL ELECTION OF 1988; PRISONS AND PRISONERS; RACIAL RELATIONS; CRIME AND CRIMINALS; ELECTION ISSUES; BLACKS (IN US); SEX CRIMES; CRIME AND CRIMINALS

NAME: DUKAKIS, MICHAEL S (GOV); BUSH, GEORGE (VICE PRES); BENTSEN, LLOYD (SEN); JACKSON, JESSE L (REV); ROSENTHAL, ANDREW; HORTON, WILLIE



20TH STORY of Level 1 printed in FULL format.

Copyright (c) 1988 The New York Times Company;  
The New York Times

October 26, 1988, Wednesday, Late City Final Edition

SECTION: Section A; Page 23, Column 1; National Desk

LENGTH: 532 words

HEADLINE: Campaign Finance;  
Independent Groups Putting 11th-Hour Millions in Races

BYLINE: By RICHARD L. BERKE, Special to the New York Times

DATELINE: WASHINGTON, Oct. 25

BODY:

Independent groups are spending millions of dollars in the final weeks before the election for activities to help their preferred candidates. Among other things, two groups are paying for the television advertisements attacking Gov. Michael S. Dukakis's prison furlough program in Massachusetts.

This money is being spent by individuals and corporate, labor and trade political action committees who are barred by election law from coordinating their efforts with the candidates or even consulting them.

On the Presidential level, most of the efforts are directed at aiding the Bush campaign. That spending is countered by labor groups who are spending millions of dollars to get their members to support Democrats. In races for House and Senate, the independent groups seem to be divided evenly in helping both Republicans and Democrats.

In a few cases the Bush and Dukakis campaigns have objected to these efforts, saying they could interfere with their own advertising strategies; in other cases, the campaigns have reaped the benefits without making any objection.

PAC's Maintain Control

In recent days, dozens of organizations filed financial reports with the Federal Election Commission, giving a better sense of the outside help candidates are receiving.

By spending independently, the political action committees maintain control over how their funds are used. In addition, many PAC's turn to independent contributions once they have given the maximum donation directly to a candidate.

'We think we've had a positive impact on all the races we've been in,' said Stephen D. Driesler, a senior vice president for the National Association of Realtors, which has thus far spent more than any group to help House and Senate candidates.

The Realtors have spent \$1.3 million in independent expenditures this year, including \$317,365, mostly on television advertising, to help Representative Trent Lott, a Republican who is running for the Senate in Mississippi.



(c) 1988 The New York Times, October 26, 1988

Some of the most negative advertisements in the Presidential campaign are being sponsored by two independent groups.

One, the National Security Political Action Committee, operates here through an organization called Americans for Bush. The group has sponsored television commercials that feature a photograph of Willie Horton, who was out of prison on furlough in April 1987 when he stabbed a Maryland man and raped his fiancée.

Bush campaign officials have filed complaints against that committee with Federal agencies, asserting that in fund-raising the group had misled people into believing that it was an agent of the campaign.

The group reported to the Federal Election Commission that it had spent \$5.9 million this year on independent expenditures. But a spokesman said slightly more than \$2.5 million had been budgeted for television advertisements to benefit Mr. Bush.

Another group, the Committee for the Presidency, began running radio and television ads in California last Friday on the furlough issue. The ads feature close-ups of two of Mr. Horton's victims. The group said it hoped to spend \$250,000 on advertisements. But its financial report showed it had raised \$93,360 as of Sept. 30.

SUBJECT: Terms not available



112TH STORY of Level 1 printed in FULL format.

The Associated Press

The materials in the AP file were compiled by The Associated Press. These materials may not be republished without the express written consent of The Associated Press.

November 3, 1988, Thursday, PM cycle

SECTION: Political News

LENGTH: 785 words

HEADLINE: Bush Denies Racism Underlies Campaign Tactics

BYLINE: By RITA BEAMISH, Associated Press Writer

DATELINE: COLUMBUS, Ohio

KEYWORD: Bush

BODY:

Republican George Bush branded as "grossly unfair and untrue" today suggestions that his campaign tactics were racially motivated, and rejected attacks on running mate Dan Quayle's civil rights record.

The vice president vowed during an interview on NBC-TV's "Today" show to "leave the tired baggage of bigotry behind."

Bush heatedly denied that his relentless attacks on Democratic rival Michael Dukakis over the Massachusetts prison furlough program had racist overtones in citing the case of Willie Horton Jr., a convicted black murderer who escaped from a 1986 furlough and raped a white Maryland woman.

"There is no bigotry," the GOP nominee said in the live half-hour interview. "I oppose that furlough program ..."

"But to go out as my opponent did ... and try to assign me something that is not in my heart, this charge of racism, is grossly unfair and untrue," Bush said.

Bush did not directly challenge interviewer Bryant Gumbel's statement that Quayle's civil rights record was "terrible."

Gumbel asked Bush whether voters would be getting the Bush who supported early civil rights legislation in Congress or the one who selected Quayle, "who has a terrible civil rights record."

"You're going to get both," Bush said, "because I stand by my record on Dan Quayle and I don't like these attacks on his integrity or his civil rights or anything else."

Bush called himself a man who "'was out front for civil rights and I will be again."



The Associated Press, November 3, 1988

He added: "I don't have one ounce of bigotry in my body, nor does my running mate."

The vice president said that "even though a lot of civil rights leaders automatically endorse whoever the Democratic candidate is, I think most of them know in their hearts that I am a decent, honorable person who cares about race relations and will leave the tired baggage of bigotry behind."

On the economy, Bush said spurring economic growth was his answer to reducing the federal budget deficit and fulfilling his promises to boost spending for some government programs without cutting defense outlays or raising taxes.

Speaking two days after the government reported another sluggish performance by the economy in September, the vice president said his proposals would be made possible by future economic growth at a 2.8 percent rate. "I hope it will grow at even more, and if it does you've got tremendous revenues coming into the federal government," he said.

Later, addressing a rally in downtown Columbus before he flew to Chicago, the GOP nominee said he was discounting the polls and political pundits "who are telling us what we think." He said "it's the people who will decide" the outcome of next Tuesday's balloting.

As national polls showed him holding onto a double-digit lead over the Massachusetts governor, a hoarse-voiced and buoyant Bush insisted Wednesday that he was campaigning all-out until the election.

"Yes things look pretty good nationwide, but I'm going to out-hustle that liberal governor," he told a high school rally in Lansing.

The rest of his schedule today called for rallies in Illinois, Ohio and New Jersey, all significant electoral-vote states where the race is close.

Press Secretary Sheila Tate said the campaign was keeping its strategy options open but for the most part Bush will hold a series of rallies in battleground states, and will stress some of the themes that he outlined in a wide-ranging speech Tuesday at Notre Dame University.

On Friday, the campaign will begin airing two new commercials nationwide - both positive spots rather than attack ads - with Bush talking about "the reasons he's running for president," said campaign manager Lee Atwater.

On Wednesday, Bush stumped in Illinois and Michigan at three raucous rallies, two of them at high schools. Illinois has 24 electoral votes, Michigan 20.

Bush stole Dukakis' "On your side" slogan when he talked about differences between himself and the Democrat.

At the rally at Lansing Catholic Central High School, Bush told the students to tell their parents "George Bush is on your side of the Great Divide."

Bush said the differences between him and Dukakis "are as deep and wide as the Great Divide," another term for the mountain watershed known as the Continental Divide.



The Associated Press, November 3, 1988

"And I represent the mainstream, the mainstream views, the mainstream values, and they are your values and my values and the values and values of the vast majority of the American people," Bush told a rally in Grand Rapids, Mich., where he was introduced by former President Gerald Ford.

"If I win the election, it will be a mainstream mandate," he said.

Despite his consistent lead in the polls, Bush tells each audience that he is running like he's 10 points behind.



3RD STORY of Level 1 printed in FULL format.

Copyright (c) 1988 The New York Times Company;  
The New York Times

November 3, 1988, Thursday, Late City Final Edition

SECTION: Section A; Page 1, Column 3; National Desk

LENGTH: 1299 words

HEADLINE: Bush, His Disavowed Backers And a Very Potent Attack Ad

BYLINE: The following article is based on reporting by Richard L. Berke, Michael Wines and Stephen Engelberg and was written by Mr. Engelberg. Special to the New York Times

DATELINE: WASHINGTON, Nov. 2

BODY:

The political commercial that raised some of the strongest doubts about Gov. Michael S. Dukakis's record on crime seems certain to win a place in the annals of campaign advertising.

The commercial, sponsored by a political action committee that supports Vice President Bush, appeared nationally on cable television for 28 days this fall. It featured a police photograph of a glowering Willie Horton, a convicted murderer who, after escaping while on a weekend pass from a Massachusetts prison, raped a Maryland woman and stabbed her fiance.

The commercial is not the only one that has attacked Governor Dukakis over the administration of his state's prison furlough system; indeed, the Bush campaign itself has produced such advertisements. But this one is regarded as particularly tough, both in its language and because of the Horton photograph. Mr. Horton is black, and some Democrats charge that his photo has injected a racist overtone into the Presidential race.

The Group Behind the Ad

Although disavowed by Mr. Bush's campaign, the commercial is the work of an advertising team with long-standing ties to the Republican Party. It was filmed by a former employee of Roger Ailes, the Bush campaign's leading expert on broadcasting. And now, in the waning days of the Presidential race, leaders of the National Security Political Action Committee, the independent group that sponsored the advertisement, are declaring that they have the tacit support of senior officials in the Bush campaign.

The group's activities are a case study in how independent political committees can have a major impact on a national campaign and provide a vehicle for carrying out attacks with which a campaign organization cannot be associated. And the controversy that has evolved over the group's role also illustrates the competition and sometimes outright hostility between campaigns and political action committees as they vie for contributions.

Senior Bush campaign officials have used strong language to disclaim any connection to the National Security Political Action Committee, which raised some of its money with mailings sent out under the banner of "Americans for



(c) 1988 The New York Times, November 3, 1988

Bush." The general counsel to the Bush campaign, Jan W. Baran, has called the group "bloodsuckers," while Mr. Ailes has said of such independent expenditure groups, "I hate them."

As for the Vice President himself, a May 4 letter that the campaign sent to the committee says the candidate "does not endorse nor approve of your activities."

#### A Letter of Praise

The committee's principals say they have complied with Federal election law, which bars independent organizations from coordinating their spending activities with Presidential campaigns, but they argue that the Bush camp protests too much. They say an Oct. 22 letter of praise over the signature of Mr. Bush's running mate, Senator Dan Quayle, is evidence of what they call the campaign's true sentiments toward their activities.

In the letter, Mr. Quayle offered thanks for a copy of another videotaped attack on Mr. Dukakis that was financed by the committee, and called its efforts "a source of real encouragement as well as a great boon to our efforts."

A spokesman for the Senator said that he knew nothing about the letter and that it had been written by an intern who, the spokesman said, signed it with an automatic pen.

But Elizabeth I. Fediay, the committee's 34-year-old founder, said in an interview today that she believed the letter was genuine. "Officially," she said, "the campaign has to disavow themselves from me. Unofficially, I hear that they're thrilled about what we're doing."

#### Surge From Obscurity

In the past two years, Ms. Fediay's committee has emerged from obscurity to become the biggest spender among independent political organizations. The Bush campaign charges in a complaint filed with the Federal Election Commission that the committee has misrepresented itself as an arm of the campaign and has sought to benefit financially from that professed affiliation. Most of the committee's vendors are several companies controlled by a group of Virginia-based direct mail specialists.

Ms. Fediay (pronounced feh-DYE) said she met Ronald Kanfer, one of the principals in those companies, nearly 10 years ago, when he was a copywriter at a Washington fund-raising concern and she was working for the Institute of American Relations, a conservative organization directed by her father. She said the idea to form the committee came to her suddenly in 1986, after she had consulted with several friends on Capitol Hill.

Mr. Kanfer said in an interview that his companies were but contractors for Ms. Fediay and other political experts who run the day-to-day operations of the committee. "We do the job she tells us to do," he said. "We have no say in their commercials, where they run, their grass-roots operations or any of that."

The latest Federal records show that the committee has spent \$7.032 million on behalf of Mr. Bush's candidacy, of which \$3.4 million has been paid to



(c) 1988 The New York Times, November 3, 1988

companies owned by Mr. Kanfer and his partner David Kunko.

Using telephone banks and letters to an array of potential contributors culled from conservative donor lists and other sources, the group has raised about \$9 million since its founding in the spring of 1986. All but about \$1 million has been raised in the last 10 months, mostly in donations of less than \$50.

#### A Letter to Baker

There is no evidence that the committee, in devising the Horton commercial, received any direction from the Bush campaign. Kathleen Hall Jamieson, professor of communications at the University of Texas, said the Vice President could have suffered a backlash had his organization sponsored such an advertisement.

'To have Willie Horton's picture in the Bush ad would have been extraordinarily damaging to Bush,' she said. 'It would have raised much earlier the question of 'Is this a negative ad?'

Lee Atwater, the Bush campaign manager, said in an interview today that the campaign had 'a firm policy' not to use Mr. Horton's photograph 'in any of our ads.' Asked if such use by the National Security Political Action Committee had been beneficial to Mr. Bush, he said, 'We have no way of evaluating that.'

The Bush campaign does appear to have passed up a chance to remove the Horton advertisement from cable television.

On the day that Ms. Fediay announced the 28-day run for the commercial, she had a letter hand-delivered to James A. Baker 3d, chairman of the Bush campaign, offering to call it off, according to Tony Fabrizio, a Washington-based media buyer who helped plan the advertisement and buy the television time.

Mr. Baker responded, three days before the commercial was to conclude its run, with a letter that recounted Mr. Bush's earlier expressions of disapproval.

'If they were really interested in stopping this, do you think they would have waited that long to send us a letter?' said Floyd Brown, a political consultant to the committee.

Mr. Atwater said today that he wrote the committee 'a very strongly worded letter' months ago, making clear that he opposed its efforts. 'I don't know what else we could do,' he said. 'Everybody involved knows that they didn't have our approval in any shape, form or fashion.'

The advertisement was produced by Larry McCarthy, who had been an aide in Senator Bob Dole's Presidential campaign and who was once an employee of Roger Ailes's company.

Mr. McCarthy said the group's ads were harder hitting than those that could be run by a candidate's national campaign. 'We were not the Bush campaign,' he said. 'So we didn't have to worry about our own supporters' being upset or about attacks from the press or the Dukakis campaign.'



(c) 1988 The New York Times, November 3, 1988

GRAPHIC: Photo of a campaign ad

SUBJECT: PRESIDENTIAL ELECTION OF 1988; TELEVISION; ADVERTISING; ELECTION  
ISSUES; CRIME AND CRIMINALS

ORGANIZATION: ;NATIONAL SECURITY POLITICAL ACTION COMMITTEE

NAME: BERKE, RICHARD L; WINES, MICHAEL; ENGELBERG, STEPHEN; BUSH, GEORGE (VICE  
PRES); DUKAKIS, MICHAEL S (GOV); AILES, ROGER; QUAYLE, DAN (SEN)



12TH STORY of Level 1 printed in FULL format.

Copyright (c) 1988 The New York Times Company;  
The New York Times

November 4, 1988, Friday, Late City Final Edition

SECTION: Section A; Page 34, Column 1; Editorial Desk

LENGTH: 578 words

HEADLINE: George Bush and Willie Horton

BODY:

When it became known that a prominent adviser to Vice President Bush's campaign had once made a count of Jews in the Bureau of Labor Statistics for President Nixon, the campaign dropped him in a flash. When five Bush advisory committee members were accused of anti-Semitic activities, the campaign dropped them in a flash.

But when Bush supporters ran an anti-Dukakis TV commercial playing on fears of black criminals, it took three weeks for the campaign to disapprove. And when the Maryland Republican Party put the same twist in a scurrilous fund-raising letter, it took the campaign six weeks to disapprove.

Mr. Bush has, from the start, portrayed Governor Dukakis as soft on crime. His diffidence in disowning these extreme manifestations of his theme conveys cynicism. Worse, these events dramatize the need to control the flow of sewer money outside the official campaigns.

Willie Horton is a black murder convict who raped a Maryland woman and stabbed her companion while on weekend furlough from a Massachusetts prison. Massachusetts was wrong to furlough a murderer sentenced to life without parole. Governor Dukakis inherited the furlough program from his Republican predecessor and eventually ended it - too slowly.

But Willie Horton is not unique. Many states and the Federal Government give furloughs. Other prisoners on furlough have committed murder. Nevertheless, Mr. Bush has flogged Governor Dukakis with the case for months. It should not surprise him that supporters carry it to extremes - nor take him weeks to disavow them.

The TV commercial in question opened with declarations that 'Bush supports the death penalty for first-degree murderers' and that 'Dukakis not only opposes the death penalty, he allowed first-degree murderers to have weekend passes from prison.' Then came photos of Mr. Horton and details of his crimes, while flashing the words 'kidnapping,' 'stabbing' and 'raping.' The sponsoring committee says it notified James Baker, the Bush campaign chairman, that the commercial would run for 28 days, offering to call it off. Mr. Baker's disapproval came on the 25th day.

He was even slower to denounce a September fund-raising letter from Daniel E. Fleming, Maryland's Republican Party chairman, that warned of 'the Dukakis/Willie Horton team.' The letter paired photos of the convict and the Governor with a headline 'Is This Your Pro-Family Team for 1988?' The text said, 'You, your spouse, your children and your friends can have the opportunity to receive a visit from someone like Willie Horton if Mike Dukakis



(c) 1988 The New York Times, November 4, 1988

becomes President.''

Mr. Baker disavowed the letter last weekend, six weeks after the fact, but then contended that Mr. Bush should not be held responsible. Yet in July, before Mr. Dukakis picked a running mate, Lee Atwater, the Bush campaign manager, said, 'maybe he will put this Willie Horton on the ticket.'

The two episodes cast harsh light on the Vice President and even harsher light on the Federal Election Commission. Presidential campaigns are supposed to be paid for with public funds. The offensive TV ad was sponsored by a committee that has spent \$7 million for the Bush cause. It could do so because the commission refuses to stop the flow of funds to independent groups: sewer money.

If the Bush campaign had wanted to stop these individual smears sooner, it could have. If the commission wanted to stop the flow of funds that makes them possible, it could, too.

TYPE: Editorial

SUBJECT: PRESIDENTIAL ELECTION OF 1988; EDITORIALS; ETHICS; FINANCES

ORGANIZATION: FEDERAL ELECTION COMMISSION

NAME: BUSH, GEORGE (VICE PRES); DUKAKIS, MICHAEL S (GOV)



1ST STORY of Level 1 printed in FULL format.

Copyright (c) 1988 The New York Times Company;  
The New York Times

December 1, 1988, Thursday, Late City Final Edition

SECTION: Section B; Page 17, Column 1; National Desk

LENGTH: 974 words

HEADLINE: WASHINGTON TALK;  
Bush and Jackson Seek Common Ground

BYLINE: By BERNARD WEINRAUB, Special to the New York Times

DATELINE: WASHINGTON, Nov. 30

BODY:

President-elect Bush met with the Rev. Jesse Jackson today and, borrowing one of the civil rights leader's campaign slogans, said he shared 'common ground' with Mr. Jackson and would seek his suggestions after moving into the Oval Office.

Mr. Bush also conferred with Norman R. Augustine, president and chief operating officer of the Martin Marietta Corporation. The private meeting, which was attended by Treasury Secretary Nicholas F. Brady, raised speculation that Mr. Augustine had been offered a senior job at the Pentagon. Although former Senator John G. Tower of Texas remains the leading contender for Secretary of Defense, Mr. Augustine has been mentioned as a possible choice for that job or for the deputy's post under Mr. Tower.

Mr. Jackson said after the 90-minute luncheon that he and Mr. Bush had discussed a range of issues, including domestic policy, the civil rights leader's opposition to the State Department decision to bar Yasir Arafat, the Palestinian leader, from entering the United States, and the possible parole of James Earl Ray, who is serving a 99-year prison term for assassinating the Rev. Dr. Martin Luther King Jr..

'A Very Bad Signal'

'I asked him not to let him go,' Mr. Jackson said in an interview. 'He said he thought the release of James Earl Ray would be a very bad signal for the nation. He has contacted the Justice Department to get a reading on the case.'

Mr. Jackson said he also protested the Bush campaign's television advertisements in the Presidential campaign about the furlough of Willie Horton, a convicted murderer. 'The Vice President said it was not his intent to focus on the racial issue, but to focus on the furlough issue,' Mr. Jackson said.

Over all, Mr. Jackson spoke warmly about Mr. Bush's efforts to 'keep the lines of communication open' and said that 'it is not important that we agree all the time,' but that it 'is important that we communicate.'

He added: 'Reagan had a closed door policy for eight years. You couldn't get an audience with him.'



(c) 1988 The New York Times, December 1, 1988

The President-elect has begun to try to heal wounds with Republican rivals like Bob Dole, his party's Senate leader, as well as Democrats like Mr. Jackson and Gov. Michael S. Dukakis of Massachusetts, whom he defeated in the Presidential election. Mr. Bush plans to meet Mr. Dukakis on Friday.

In the campaign, Mr. Bush and Mr. Jackson engaged in some harsh attacks on each other. Mr. Bush called Mr. Jackson a "hustler from Chicago," and Mr. Jackson said the Bush campaign was provoking racial fears.

But today Mr. Bush said: "The campaign is over. I have no arguments with the way Reverend Jackson conducted himself toward me, and I hope it's the same with him on a personal basis."

"There will be times in my Presidency when I will ask for his suggestions," Mr. Bush said. "He has a lot of very good ideas that are of keen interest to our country." Mr. Bush said that his relationship with Mr. Jackson "transcends politics" and that "there's some common ground here."

Mr. Jackson was accompanied to his luncheon with the Vice President by three of his children, Jesse Jr., Jonathan and Santita. The three Jackson children ate lunch separately with one of Mr. Bush's sons, George Jr. Mr. Bush's meeting with Mr. Augustine, meanwhile, riveted attention on the issue of who will be Secretary of Defense. Mr. Bush brushed aside questions about disagreements among his staff about the possible appointment of Mr. Tower as Defense Secretary. "Stay tuned," the President-elect said, adding that "all is tranquil" within his staff.

#### Consideration of Rumsfeld

Nonetheless, one Republican said that the Bush transition team had asked Tuesday for further financial documents from Donald H. Rumsfeld, who was a Defense Secretary in the Ford Administration, and that Mr. Rumsfeld's name was under active consideration. Mr. Augustine was also believed to be a serious candidate for the job, although transition officials insisted that Mr. Bush still favored Mr. Tower, a long-time friend.

One Bush aide said that the President-elect's meeting with Mr. Augustine, a former Under Secretary of the Army, was to discuss military procurement issues, and that it was unrelated to a Defense job.

Meanwhile, as numerous names arose for top jobs in the Bush Administration, the President-elect's chief recruiter, Chase Undermeyer, said that "it may take longer to fill positions in this Administration than ever before" because of extensive financial and security clearances.

Mr. Undermeyer also said there was a "sensitivity" on the part of Mr. Bush to appoint women and members of minority groups to high-level jobs in the Administration. So far, Mr. Bush's major appointments have been white men.

Mr. Undermeyer said that Mr. Bush's "constant theme" at meetings was, "Where are the blacks, where are the Hispanics, where are the women?" Mr. Undermeyer said names of minority members and women had been sent to Mr. Bush for senior jobs, "but he wants more." He added that there would be more women and minorities in the Bush Administration than in the Reagan Administration.



(c) 1988 The New York Times, December 1, 1988

Meanwhile, transition aides said that among those under consideration for key jobs was Samuel K. Skinner, chairman of the board of directors of the Northern Illinois Regional Transportation Authority, as a possible Transportation Secretary. Mr. Skinner was Illinois campaign director for Mr. Bush in the Presidential campaign.

Sources said that Senator Daniel J. Evans, a Washington State Republican who did seek re-election this year, was a strong contender for Interior Secretary. Representative Bill Gradison, an Ohio Republican who is chairman of the health panel of the Ways and Means Committee, is cited by transition sources as a key contender for Secretary of Health and Human Services.

SUBJECT: UNITED STATES POLITICS AND GOVERNMENT; BLACKS (IN US); APPOINTMENTS AND EXECUTIVE CHANGES

ORGANIZATION: DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF

NAME: WEINRAUB, BERNARD; BUSH, GEORGE (VICE PRES); JACKSON, JESSE L (REV); AUGUSTINE, NORMAN R

TITLE: WASHINGTON TALK PAGE (NYT)

A Dukakis Oct. 17 expressed frustration at how the "polls drive the process. . . . Now we've got a new set of numbers that has absolutely no relationship to anything we have or other people have, so you spend two or three days responding to questions about it."

B Bush, meanwhile, held a rare press conference in Denver Oct. 16, in which he acted like a president-elect, spelling out his general aims for his presidency. Bush said he would "get this deficit down" without increasing taxes and would get the Soviet Union "on the same wavelength" behind negotiations to reduce conventional military forces.

C Bush rejected an expectation that a blue-ribbon bipartisan panel studying the deficit would recommend tax increases, saying, "I think I'm identified with the direction in which the people want to go on revenue, for example, on taxes. I would say to the economic commission . . . 'Please listen to what the American people are saying.'" [See p. 220E3]

D Bush declined to be specific about what areas of the budget he would cut. Bush also refused repeated requests to discuss his projected cabinet appointments.

E **Counterattack**—Dukakis Oct. 19 hit back at what he said were persistent GOP distortions of his record on crime. Bush and his advertising had employed the crime issue above all others to shake confidence in Dukakis, particularly in the South and among so-called "Reagan Democrats." [See p. 753F3]

F In Quincy, Ill. Dukakis seized on GOP brochures focusing on what had been the central weapon for Bush: the release under the Massachusetts prison furlough system of a murderer named William (Willie) Horton Jr., who had subsequently escaped, stabbed a man and raped a woman in Maryland. The woman, Angela Barnes, had been enlisted to make appearances for Bush and was quoted by one of the brochures as asking whether Dukakis had "any compassion." [See p. 459E2]

G The second GOP brochure asserted, "All the murderers and rapists and drug pushers and child molesters in Massachusetts vote for Michael Dukakis."

Dukakis waved the brochures to the crowd and declared, "Friends, this is garbage, this is political garbage. This isn't worthy of a presidential campaign."

F Dukakis said, "I don't know of anything more cynical or more hypocritical than the way the Bush campaign has used our furlough program and that human tragedy [the Horton case] for political purposes."

→ For once, Bush was forced to backtrack, saying the disputed brochures went too far.

G The counterattack was the sort Democratic professionals had been urging for months. But analysts said it might now be too late for Dukakis to mount a hard-hitting counteroffensive without also damaging his own image.

Democratic professionals had criticized Dukakis for months for sticking to generalities while Bush defined the election, raising doubts about Dukakis's patriotism and portraying Dukakis as sympathetic to criminals and dedicated to military weak-

ness. Some analysts now said it was one of the ironies of the campaign that both candidates were being blamed equally by the public for the negative tone of the campaign. The ABC News/Washington Post poll released Oct. 18 found that while 37% of the respondents thought Bush was waging a "dirty campaign," 36% held the same view of Dukakis.

**Rusting Curtain**—Bush traveled Oct. 18 to Westminster College in Fulton, Mo. for a speech with historic overtones. It was there in an address in 1946 that British Prime Minister Winston Churchill had coined the term "Iron Curtain" to describe the Soviet hegemony over Eastern Europe.

Bush said the Russian Revolution was now "losing its luster."

"The Iron Curtain still stretches from Stettin [Szczecin, Poland] to Trieste [Italy]," Bush said. "But it's a rusting curtain. Shafts of light from the Western side, from our side, the free and prosperous side, are piercing the gloom of failure and despair on the other side. The truth is being sought as never before."

Bush had won an implicit boost from a member of the Soviet establishment Sept. 23, when Soviet Foreign Minister Eduard Shevardnadze paid a call on Bush at the vice presidential mansion and told reporters that Bush "has been involved in all high-level discussions here in Washington at our talks with the President."

**Chemical Arms**—Bush Oct. 21 repeated a theme he sounded at the conclusion of the second presidential debate, when he told a Lancaster, Ohio crowd, "The barriers against chemical warfare . . . must be repaired and raised even higher." Users of such weapons, he said, must "pay a price . . . a heavy penalty." [See p. 753F2]

A Bush aide confronted questions about why Bush in 1983 had cast two of his rare tie-breaking votes in the Senate to resume and finance the U.S. chemical-weapons program. He said Bush had done so because as long as the Soviet Union kept a stockpile of chemical weapons the U.S. had to keep up. As for sanctions, an aide said, "The minimum would be the glare of international publicity, and maybe there would be a diplomatic and economic price." [See 1983, pp. 873G3, 562F1]

**Teamsters Break for Bush**—The Teamsters union broke with the AFL-CIO and the rest of the American labor movement Oct. 17 and endorsed Bush for president. The union had supported Ronald Reagan in both 1980 and 1984, but the Reagan Justice Department had lately made moves to take over the union because of its ties to organized crime. The union said a poll of its membership had found Bush favored over Dukakis by 50%-46%. [See pp. 627A2, 480C2]

Teamsters President William McCarthy twice stressed that the endorsement was for Bush and not Bush's running mate, Sen. Dan Quayle (R, Ind.), or the policies of the Reagan administration. But McCarthy Oct. 19 clarified his statement, saying the union was supporting Bush and Quayle "like ham and eggs."

**Rumor Campaign**—The Dow Jones industrial average fell 43 points during trading Oct. 19 when a rumor swept the floor of the New York Stock Exchange that the Washington Post was about to publish an expose of extramarital sexual activities by Bush.

The Post took the unusual step of denying that it would publish such a story, and the market finished down only 22.58 points for the day. The events were taken as an indication of how skittish the stock market was on the first anniversary of the Oct. 19, 1987 stock market crash. [See 1987, p. 773A1]

The next day, a senior aide to Dukakis was forced to resign under fire after she declared publicly that Bush "owes it to the American people to 'fess up.'" The aide, Donna Brazile, added, "The American people have every right to know if Barbara Bush will share that bed with him in the White House." Brazile, who was black, also accused the Bush campaign of being "racist," using "every little code word and symbol."

Dukakis met privately with Bush that evening to apologize for Brazile's "unauthorized" remarks before the two made a traditional light-hearted joint appearance at the New York Roman Catholic Archdiocese's annual Alfred E. Smith Memorial Dinner. ("Some people say I'm arrogant—but I know better than that," Dukakis joked. Bush said, "I haven't seen so many people so well dressed since I went to a come-as-you are party in Kennebunkport.")

**Democratic Bedrock**—Dukakis worked to solidify traditional Democratic support, rousing a blue-collar crowd in Saginaw, Mich. Oct. 18 with a populist us-against-them theme. "George Bush wants to help the people who already have it made," Dukakis said. "I want to help every American family make it."

Dukakis Oct. 19 visited the predominantly black Bethel AME Church in New York City's Harlem district for a speech on civil rights and crime. Neither campaign had yet paid much attention to black voters, and black Democratic presidential candidate Jesse L. Jackson had been virtually absent from the Dukakis campaign. [See p. 642F3]

Dukakis told of his personal experience, recounting how his 77-year-old physician father had been beaten and robbed by an addict seeking drugs, and how his only brother had been killed by a hit-and-run driver. "That's why I've personally led the war on crime in my state," he said.

It was the sort of personal statement that many Democrats complained had been lacking in the second presidential debate, when Dukakis had been asked whether he would favor the death penalty for someone convicted of raping and murdering Mrs. Dukakis. (She had called the question "outrageous" and his answer "fine," but many Democrats had complained that he seemed dispassionate.) [See p. 753B1] □

**Rep. Swindall Indicted**. Rep. Patrick L. Swindall (R, Ga.) was indicted by a federal grand jury Oct. 17 on 10 counts of



79TH STORY of Level 1 printed in FULL format.

The Associated Press

The materials in the AP file were compiled by The Associated Press. These materials may not be republished without the express written consent of The Associated Press.

May 3, 1989, Wednesday, AM cycle

SECTION: Washington Dateline

LENGTH: 826 words

HEADLINE: Ailes Tries to Walk Away from Horton Controversy, But it Lives On

BYLINE: By DONALD M. ROTHBERG, AP Political Writer

DATELINE: WASHINGTON

KEYWORD: Ailes-Horton

BODY:

Roger Ailes, the media master of the Bush presidential campaign, wants it known that he did not - repeat, not - make any commercials featuring Massachusetts convict Willie Horton.

"At no time did any commercial for George Bush contain a picture of Willie Horton or use his name," Ailes said in letters sent to news organizations, including The Associated Press.

But wasn't it the Bush campaign that made Horton and the Massachusetts prison furlough program an indelible part of voters' perceptions of Democrat Michael Dukakis?

Indeed it was. And the Horton controversy lives on, most recently in an article written for The Washington Post Magazine by Dukakis campaign manager Susan Estrich and entitled, "Willie Horton and Me."

The Horton commercials were also at the center of successful efforts by students at predominantly black Howard University to force former Bush campaign manager Lee Atwater, now Republican National Committee chairman, to resign from the school's board of trustees.

Ailes has been trying to walk away from Horton for some time.

At first, the Bush campaign was concerned that the Horton ads would create a political backlash among voters who perceived the ads as racist.

Horton, who is black, escaped in 1986 while on his 10th furlough from a Massachusetts prison, where he was serving life without parole for a 1974 murder. He surfaced in 1987 in Maryland, where he assaulted a couple and raped the woman.

More recently, Ailes is described by associates as tired of being identified incorrectly as the creator of the Horton commercials.



The Associated Press, May 3, 1989

The two commercials that featured Horton were produced and aired by an independent expenditure committee called Americans for Bush, not the official Bush campaign committee.

As Ailes pointed out in his letter, "federal law prohibits any collaboration between a political action committee and a legal campaign committee during the course of a campaign."

This is not to say that Bush never raised the Willie Horton issue.

Before those ads were aired, Bush recounted the Horton case in great detail. In his speech accepting the Republican presidential nomination, Bush said it was "a scandal to give a weekend furlough to a hardened first-degree killer who hasn't even served enough time to be eligible for parole."

The Bush campaign did run commercials criticizing the Massachusetts prison furlough program. But they never mentioned Horton by name.

One was the "Crime Quiz" ad. The announcer asked, "Which candidate for president gave weekend passes to first-degree murderers who are not even eligible for parole?" An unflattering picture of Dukakis moved forward on the screen.

Another Bush commercial showed shadowy figures moving through a revolving gate while the announcer said, "His revolving door prison policy gave weekend furloughs to first-degree murderers not eligible for parole. While out, many committed other crimes like kidnapping and rape, and many are still at large."

Jesse Jackson and Sen. Lloyd Bentsen, the Democratic vice presidential nominee, attacked the Horton commercials as racist. Jackson said using the Horton case "is designed to create the most horrible psycho-sexual fears."

"Grossly unfair and untrue," retorted Bush when asked about the allegations his campaign was using racist tactics.

Estrich wrote that while Bush and his aides may not have paid for the television ads showing Horton's picture and Dukakis side by side (Americans for Bush did), "they took great pride in having found and framed the issue."

Late in the campaign, Ailes was interviewed on the Cable News Network and said that when he first saw the Horton commercial "I called headquarters and said whoever's doing that, get them to stop it. And the campaign legal counsel said we can't stop it. We have had conversations, we've sent letters, we can't stop it."

Jan Baran, who was general counsel to the Bush campaign, said he knew of no specific appeal to Americans for Bush to stop running the Horton commercials.

Bush aides did complain that the group's name and fund-raising tactics gave the incorrect impression that it was an official arm of the campaign.

On Sept. 8, the day after the two Horton commercials began a run on national cable networks that was slated to continue until Oct. 5, Elizabeth Feday, head of Americans for Bush, said she was sending a letter to campaign chairman James A. Baker III asking him to express "your wishes with regard to



The Associated Press, May 3, 1989

independent public advocacy of Mr. Bush for president."

She said, "If he asks me to stop advocating the election of George Bush, I will."

In a letter dated Sept. 27 - after the Horton commercials had run for nearly three weeks - Baker wrote to Ms. Fediay asking that "you cease using his name, the name 'Americans for Bush,' and any other name that suggests his or this campaign's association with you."

By then, there were few voters left in America who weren't familiar with the saga of Willie Horton.



70TH STORY of Level 1 printed in FULL format.

## The Associated Press

The materials in the AP file were compiled by The Associated Press. These materials may not be republished without the express written consent of The Associated Press.

November 8, 1989, Wednesday, PM cycle

SECTION: Washington Dateline

LENGTH: 656 words

HEADLINE: WASHINGTON TODAY: The Good, the Bad and the Un-Ugly of Negative Campaigns

BYLINE: By TOM RAUM, Associated Press Writer

DATELINE: WASHINGTON

KEYWORD: Bush-Negative Campaigns

## BODY:

President Bush says sure, he'd like to see cleaner campaigns. But he won't apologize for the hardball tactics that produced his lopsided victory over Democrat Michael Dukakis a year ago today.

"I don't have to stand here and defend the campaign of 1988. I'd be perfectly prepared to do it, but I was elected," the president asserted. And why argue with success?

Bush told a news conference on Tuesday: "I put confidence in the American people - their ability to sort through what is fair and what is unfair, what is ugly and what is un-ugly, and be as positive as possible."

Anyway, negative campaigning, like un-ugliness, may be in the eye of the beholder, Bush suggested. "What some consider negative, others consider factual," he said.

Bush was asked his views on the negative campaigning that marked this year's gubernatorial races in Virginia and New Jersey and the mayoral race in New York City - tactics that might have been borrowed, after all, from Bush's own 1988 campaign playbook.

"I think everybody would prefer the positives ... But I'm not sure there is much that a president can do about it," Bush reflected.

He said candidates must be permitted to get their message across in their own way, and that any restrictions on that message would amount to censorship.

Still, he continued, "Maybe I can have a role in seeing that it gets a little more positive."

The Virginia and New Jersey races included negative campaigning - largely from the Republican side in the final days of the Virginia race, and with both candidates in New Jersey comparing each other to a lying Pinocchio, complete



The Associated Press, November 8, 1989

with growing noses.

Democrat L. Douglas Wilder claimed victory over Republican Marshall Coleman in Virginia's gubernatorial race, while Democrat James Florio easily defeated Republican James Courter in New Jersey.

Bush relied heavily on negative campaigning in 1988 - from his frequent attacks on Dukakis' patriotism to the constant airing of ads on the rape of a Maryland woman by convicted murderer Willie Horton while on a weekend furlough from a Massachusetts prison.

In the concluding weeks of last year's race, then-Vice President Bush would vow on one day to wage a gentler, kinder campaign. Then, the very next, he would attack Dukakis as a "card-carrying member" of the American Civil Liberties Union who would torpedo prosperity and bring gloom and malaise upon America.

Sometimes he'd voice positive lofty themes in a morning appearance, then breathe fire later in the day.

Bush campaign ads, in addition to dramatizing abuses of the prison furlough program that Dukakis oversaw as Massachusetts governor, ridiculed his rival's ride in an Army tank and appeared to equate his veto of a pledge of allegiance bill to disrespect for the flag.

One of the chief architects of Bush's attack campaigning, media adviser Roger Ailes, resurfaced this year in the GOP New York mayoral campaign of Rudolph W. Giuliani - as did Bush's 1988 political strategist, Bob Teeter.

Bush campaigned this fall for the GOP candidates in New York, Virginia and New Jersey.

The president said Tuesday he still has "great confidence" that Americans made the right decision one year ago.

"I think they sorted through some of the allegations that this was the ugliest, dirtiest campaign. And I think they voted on a more positive basis," he said.

Bush reiterated a view expressed often during the 1988 campaign by his campaign manager, Lee Atwater, now the chairman of the Republican National Committee, that American politics were rife with negative campaigning from the very beginning.

"I don't say anything started in 1988 that hadn't been taking place in '86 or '82 or '80," Bush said. "You know, if you look into history, you're going to have certain things that are considered negative."

"I think it ought to be a little more positive ... (But) what else can you do?" he asked. "I'm certainly not going to legislate it."



49TH STORY of Level 1 printed in FULL format.

The Associated Press

The materials in the AP file were compiled by The Associated Press. These materials may not be republished without the express written consent of The Associated Press.

January 14, 1991, Monday, PM cycle

SECTION: Political News

LENGTH: 544 words

HEADLINE: Ailing Republican Chairman Apologizes for Hardball Tactics

BYLINE: By DONALD M. ROTHBERG, AP Political Writer

DATELINE: WASHINGTON

KEYWORD: Atwater

BODY:

"I was one cocky guy," says Lee Atwater. He had reason to be.

Manager of George Bush's 1988 presidential campaign, chairman of the Republican Party, realizing his dream of being a rhythm and blues guitarist, Atwater was on top of the world when struck down by a brain tumor.

In an interview with Life magazine, Atwater described his long battle with the inoperable tumor and how he has apologized to political opponents, including Michael Dukakis, the 1988 Democratic presidential nominee.

In the 1988 campaign, Atwater succeeded in making an incident involving furloughed prisoner Willie Horton an issue against Dukakis.

A convicted murderer, Horton raped a woman while on a weekend furlough from a Massachusetts prison. The Bush campaign used the incident to portray Dukakis as a liberal who was soft on crime.

"In part because of our successful manipulation of his campaign themes, George Bush won handily," said Atwater.

He conceded that throughout his political career "a reputation as a fierce and ugly campaigner has dogged me. While I didn't invent 'negative politics,' I am one of its most ardent practitioners."

"In 1988," he said "fighting Dukakis, I said that I 'would strip the bark off the little bastard' and 'make Willie Horton his running mate.'"

"I am sorry for both statements: the first for its naked cruelty, the second because it makes me sound racist, which I am not."

The 39-year-old party chairman described the moment last March 5 when he was speaking at a fund-raising breakfast for Sen. Phil Gramm, R-Texas.



The Associated Press, January 14, 1991

"I was on top of the world," he said. "My wife, Sally, was pregnant with our third child; I was recognized as a musician; my party leadership was intact. I was one cocky guy."

But as he stood before the audience, Atwater recalled, "I felt my left foot start to shake uncontrollably. In seconds, the twitch had moved into my leg and up the left side of my body. I was scared. I stopped speaking, grabbed at my side with one hand and clutched the podium with the other."

Atwater was rushed to the hospital and within days doctors determined he was suffering from a tumor on the right side of his brain.

When the Republican National Committee meets in Washington on Jan. 25, it will ratify President Bush's choice of Agriculture Secretary Clayton Yeutter to become the new party chairman. Atwater will receive the title general chairman.

Atwater re-entered the hospital this weekend and was scheduled to undergo surgery to remove dead tissue from the tumor.

Over the past months, he has undergone intensive radiation treatments. At one point, the amount of radiation being used to bombard the tumor was so high that visitors to his hospital room had to stand behind a lead shield.

"This month marks my 40th birthday - that deadline I set for achieving my life's goals," Atwater told Life. "I lie here in my bedroom, my face swollen from steroids, my body useless and in pain. I will probably never play the guitar or run again; I can only hope to walk."

"The doctors still won't answer that nagging question of mine: How long do I have? Three weeks. Three months. Three years."

"I try to live as if I have at least three years, but some nights I can't go to sleep, so fearful am I that I will never wake up again."



13TH STORY of Level 1 printed in FULL format.

The Associated Press

The materials in the AP file were compiled by The Associated Press. These materials may not be republished without the express written consent of The Associated Press.

January 16, 1992, Thursday, AM cycle

SECTION: Political News

LENGTH: 356 words

HEADLINE: Horton Ad Investigation Closed Without Reaching Conclusion

DATELINE: WASHINGTON

KEYWORD: FEC-Horton Ad

BODY:

Federal officials closed an investigation of the 1988 election's notorious Willie Horton ad without resolving whether there was improper coordination between the Bush campaign team and the ad's sponsors.

The Federal Election Commission split 3-3 along party lines on whether to close the case, which involved a supposedly independent group called the National Security Political Action Committee.

Such groups are permitted to spend unlimited amounts of money on behalf of a candidate as long as their activities are not coordinated with the candidate's campaign.

A limited FEC investigation found a number of deliberate phone and personal contacts between Roger Ailes, President Bush's chief media consultant in 1988, and Larry McCarthy, a former Ailes employee who produced the Horton ad, during the time the ad was made and broadcast, according to documents released this week.

The investigators also found that Jesse Raiford was simultaneously retained by both the Bush campaign and National Security PAC to perform production services, "giving rise to a presumption of coordination."

But the FEC general counsel said further limited investigation would not clear up whether there was in fact coordination, given the "absolute denials of coordination" by Ailes, McCarthy and others. The commission agreed.

Democrats had pressed for a full-scale exploration, saying the commission should settle questions about the Horton ad's origin. But Republicans on the panel said the probe had gone far enough and would not provide the fourth vote needed for a full investigation.

The Horton ad, which ran on cable television in September and October 1988, developed into a major controversy and has become shorthand for racial politics.

Horton, who is black, is a convicted murderer who escaped during a weekend furlough from a Massachusetts prison, then raped a Maryland woman and



The Associated Press, January 16, 1992

terrorized her husband.

The ad used the Horton case as a club against the Democratic nominee, Michael Dukakis, who was then governor of Massachusetts. It showed a picture of Horton, prompting opponents to charge Bush with playing on racial fears.



4TH STORY of Level 1 printed in FULL format.

The Associated Press

The materials in the AP file were compiled by The Associated Press. These materials may not be republished without the express written consent of The Associated Press.

March 6, 1992, Friday, PM cycle

SECTION: Political News

LENGTH: 680 words

HEADLINE: Bush, on Campaign Trail, Blasts 'the Ugly Politics of Hate'

BYLINE: By RITA BEAMISH, Associated Press Writer

DATELINE: OKLAHOMA CITY

KEYWORD: Republicans

BODY:

President Bush called on Americans today to "reject the ugly politics of hate" as he campaigned at a cheering, pom-pom waving student rally in this Super Tuesday primary state.

Bush, who thus far has avoided a direct clash with challenger Patrick Buchanan over civil rights, blended a warning against bigotry with a call for voluntary prayer in school in remarks at Oklahoma Christian University.

Bush was cutting short what was to have been a campaign trip lasting through Monday and returning to Washington Saturday night. Some advisers have been saying his packed schedule looked like an un-presidential, panicky dash through Tuesday's primary states.

Bush told the students he was "counting on Oklahomans, you young people especially to reject the ugly politics of hate that's rearing its head again."

"Antisemitism, racism bigotry, they have no place in the United States of America," Bush said.

Bush aides say a head-on clash with Buchanan over civil rights now could prompt his followers to sit out next fall's election. "We want those conservatives to be with us in November," spokesman Marlin Fitzwater said.

Meanwhile, Buchanan campaigned at the Alamo in San Antonio, donning a Stetson hat and telling a crowd of about 300 at the front gate that Bush had deserted the conservative cause on taxes and civil rights and tolerated federal grants for "filthy and blasphemous art."

Buchanan was campaigning in Texas a day after Vice President Dan Quayle stumped the state, which also has a primary on Tuesday.

Buchanan shot back at Quayle for telling Texans that the challenger's views on trade amounted to protectionism and would do nothing to create American jobs.



The Associated Press, March 6, 1992

"There's nothing wrong, my friends, with wanting your own country to win every competition," Buchanan said. "We've got to start thinking about Americans - all of us - American workers and American business."

Buchanan also poked fun at the president, describing Texas as "one of George Bush's 13 adopted home states."

"He grew up in a little town near Amarillo called Kennebunkport," Buchanan said. "He can tie and rope a lobster with the best of them."

Buchanan was in Oklahoma City on Thursday, and a black legislator walked out on Buchanan's speech to the Oklahoma legislature, claiming his comments were racially divisive.

But Bush continued to treat the subject gingerly.

Asked by reporters about Buchanan's criticism of the 1965 Voting Rights Act, Bush responded, "You're not going to engage me at all this way."

"I've got to try to lead the country. You don't get anywhere if you start trying to tear down the other guy, or appealing to the ugly side of things."

When Buchanan addressed the Democratic-controlled Oklahoma legislature, black members did not join the applause. One, Rep. Don Ross, walked out, saying Buchanan's characterization of the civil rights bill as a quota bill "is tainted with racism."

Another black legislator, Rep. Kevin Cox, objected to publication of Buchanan's remarks in the House Journal.

Bush has gone out of his way not to join the criticism of Buchanan as a purveyor of racial and anti-Semitic notions.

He said Thursday, "We reject the haters and we're for the American people," but cautioned that he did not intend that as a specific commentary on a question about Buchanan.

In a Tampa, Fla., speech Wednesday he said, "Without any regard to the primaries, I think we've got to come together as a country to resist the politics of ugliness and hate, racial bigotry and discrimination. We've got to stand against that wherever we are."

Race issues are sensitive turf for Bush. He was criticized by opponents in his 1988 campaign for using ads about Willie Horton, a black convict who raped a woman while on a weekend furlough from a Massachusetts prison, against Democratic nominee Michael Dukakis.

Buchanan has openly courted the backers of former Ku Klux Klan leader David Duke, who appears on the GOP ballot with Bush and Buchanan in several states. Buchanan denies any bigotry or anti-Semitism and on Thursday rejected comparisons with Duke.

THE WHITE HOUSE  
WASHINGTON

June 3, 1991

MEMORANDUM TO GOV. SUNUNU  
THROUGH: DAVID DEMAREST *AD*  
FROM: TONY SNOW/BOB SIMON *TS BS*  
SUBJECT: THE USE AND ABUSE OF WILLIE HORTON

Democrats have turned "Willie Horton" into the codeword of the decade. It means: Republicans are racists. They take unfair advantage of black people. Don't trust them.

Willie Horton's transformation from embarrassment into rallying cry offers a case study in the politics of deliberate division. Democrats found themselves stuck with a losing law-and-order issue, and therefore transformed it into something they thought might yield political fruit. They cried racism.

If you want to understand the difference between our approach to civil rights and theirs, consider the following timeline (a more detailed timeline, with support materials, is enclosed):

In 1987, the Lawrence Eagle-Tribune won a Pulitzer Prize for an expose about Michael Dukakis' prison-furlough program. It printed Willie Horton's picture. No one called the paper racist.

In April, 1988, Albert Gore raised the furlough issue during a campaign debate. He and others used it against Gov. Dukakis during the primary campaign. No one accused them of being racist.

In June, the President first criticized the furlough program. No one accused him of racism then.

That same month, Time magazine became the first national publication to publish Willie Horton's picture. No one accused it of being racist.

By July, national media, including television, had reported on the Horton story and shown his picture. No one accused the media of racism.

Willie Horton

2

By July, national media, including television, had reported on the Horton story and shown his picture. No one accused the media of racism.

In September, Americans for Bush, a committee entirely unrelated to the Bush presidential campaign, ran a furlough ad that included Willie Horton's picture. We asked the group not to air the ad, and tried to distance ourselves from the committee; we also instructed all our campaign operatives not to mention Willie Horton's race.

In October, a Dukakis TV ad included the name and picture of an Hispanic murderer who had escaped from a federal half-way house. No one accused Dukakis of racism.

On October 20, 1988, someone asked Dukakis campaign chairman Paul Broutas whether the Bush campaign was racist. He replied: "I would not accuse them of that."

It wasn't until October 23, 1988 that Democrats attempted to convert a losing law and order issue into something more divisive -- but for them, politically profitable. A group of party leaders denounced the furlough issue as racially motivated.

The press quickly denounced this new approach. The Washington Post wrote on Oct. 25, 1988 that it may or may not be relevant to stress the Dukakis furlough record, "but it isn't racist."

In short: We did not raise the race issue in 1988. We did not draw attention to Willie Horton's race. We were the only group in the campaign that tried specifically to eliminate any mention of Willie Horton's race -- within our campaign and in the presidential campaign at large. To repeat, since so many people seem to have ignored this crucial fact: It was not our ad. We didn't want it. We tried to knock it off the air. Our opponents know this.

All we want is an honest debate, conducted in an atmosphere of goodwill. We're not getting it. They won't address the facts; they won't even discuss our bill; and they simply deepen their insults daily. Theirs is a campaign of slander, not of reason. If our opponents want an honest debate, let them drop their slanders, honor the facts, and accept our invitation to sit down and talk about ways to promote true racial harmony.

Willie Horton does stand for a deliberate politics of division, but not on our part. Democrats resorted to the Horton issue out of sheer political desperation: They raised it barely

3

two weeks before the election. The question shouldn't be whether we have changed, but whether they have.

If you hear our foes continue to call upon the name of Willie Horton, you'll know that the politics of division are alive; that the politics of irrational fear are alive; and that good people of all parties will have to assume responsibility for saying: Enough is enough. Stop talking trash and start talking truth.

This is classic Newspeak: We stand accused of their sins. As one of our most vociferous opponents put it: They don't want a civil rights bill. They want a political win.

## CHRONOLOGY OF WILLIE HORTON ISSUE

- 1987 Lawrence Eagle-Tribune investigates Massachusetts furlough policy and wins Pulitzer Prize. Photo of Horton is printed. Upset citizens in Massachusetts launch referendum drive to ban furloughs for murderers.
- 4/12/88 The first national political use of the issue occurs when Al Gore attacks Dukakis over "weekend passes for first-degree murderers" in a New York debate.
- 6/9/88 Bush criticizes Dukakis furlough program for first time. Does not mention Horton.
- 6/20/88 Time's 6/27 issue describes how Horton "haunts" Dukakis' campaign. The article represents the first time Horton's photo is published nationally.
- 6/22/88 Bush renews his attack on furloughs and first mentions Horton by name.
- 6/30/88 Reader's Digest publishes the entire Horton story, its first major nationwide exposure. Horton's photo is not used, nor is his race mentioned.
- 7/31/88 A Washington Post article by Tom Edsall says: "Horton's picture has appeared repeatedly on network television news..."
- 9/88 Americans for Bush, an independent expenditure committee, airs an ad criticizes Dukakis' furlough program. The ad prominently displays Horton's picture. This ad was then repeatedly mis-identified on network news as a "Bush ad." At the same time, the Bush campaign was running its "revolving door" ad, which neither mentioned Horton nor showed his face. The Bush campaign never used Horton's photo in any way at any time.
- 10/88 A Dukakis TV ad uses the name and photo of a Hispanic murderer who escaped from a federal half-way house.
- 10/20/88 Dukakis campaign chairman Paul Brontas is asked if he thought the Bush campaign was racist. He said, "I would not accuse the campaign of that."
- 10/23/88 Sen. Bentsen, Jesse Jackson, Paul Kirk, Rep. Mervyn Dymally, and Rep. Charles Rangel all simultaneously denounce the Bush campaign as racist for using the furlough issue.

2

10/25/88 A Washington Post editorial cites "the Dukakis campaign's new charge that the Bush campaign is making racist appeals. We think it's a phony... ... Massachusetts is the only state that furloughed prisoners sentenced to life without parole, and that for 11 years Mr. Dukakis supported that policy and resisted attempts to end it. It may or may not be relevant to stress that, but it isn't racist."