An Investigation into the Underachievement and Underperformance of Specific Ethnic Minority Groups in Education and Training in a Further Education College

-----

A Cymorth funded project

-----

Vivien Turner

Coleg Glan Hafren, April 2006
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This project was initiated by Hilary Griffiths, Assistant Principal Curriculum and Quality, Coleg Glan Hafren. Evan Davies, Nigel Hallett and Stephen Mayhew have helped with the statistical data, and Sara Webber and Joanne Gower with piloting and administering questionnaires. External support for this project has been immense. Nathan Evans from BVSNW-BEST has given advice, acted as gate keeper to the different community organisations, and ran a focus group for Bangladeshi boys. The mentors from Mentoring for All (MENFA) have worked actively to set up and run a mentoring scheme in the college and run confidence building workshops. The City Centre Youth Project (Grassroots) ran a pilot drop-in Advice Centre at both college campuses.

Thanks for the work of:
Nathan Evans                   Black Voluntary Sector Network Wales (BVSNW)
Clementina Alexander) MENFA Centre
Beatrice Mbuko                   Black and Ethnic Minority Support Team (BEST)
Caryl Peets                     )
Madge Thomas                   )
Sujatha Thaladi                )
Julie Wilson                   )
Jade Lawrence                  City Centre Youth Project, Grassroots

Thanks for the information and advice provided by the following individuals and organisations:
The Bangladeshi Reference Group
Nazma Begum                    Bengali Liaison Officer Fitzalan High School
Bronwen Bermingham             Barefoot Project
Dave Blythe                    Fitzalan High School
Gareth Cooke                   Rumney High School
Onyema Ibe                     York Consulting
Samina Khan                   Cardiff LEA
Janice Lee                    Willows High School
Ian Hooper                    Assistant Director of Tower Hamlets
                                 Sixth Form College
Paul Marsh                    City Centre Youth Project, Grassroots
Rehana Miah                   Bangladeshi Women’s Group
Saeed Soleman                 Somali Youth Association (SoYA)
Muse Mohammed                 )
Richie Paines                 South Wales Police Minority Support Unit
Clive Sefia                   Black Voluntary Sector Network Wales(BVSNW)
Tracey Stephens               Cathays High School
Shahien Taj                   All Wales Saheli Association
Ken Warman                    Director of Tower Hamlets Sixth Form
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methodology</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Results</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Appendices:

1. Other barriers to learning experienced by different ethnic groups in college 28
2. Interview with Dave Blythe, Assistant Head Fitzallan High School 29
3. Interview with Janice Lee, Head of Ethnic Minority Achievement Service, Willows High School 31
4. Interview with Tracey Stephens, Deputy Head, Cathays High School 33
5. Interview Ken Warman Director of Sixth Form College, Ian Hooper Assistant Director of Sixth Form College, Tower Hamlets College 35
6. Coleg Glan Hafren questionnaire 37
7. College questionnaire. Good and bad things about education 39-44
INTRODUCTION

The Race Relations Act 1976 makes it unlawful to discriminate on the grounds of race, colour, nationality or citizenship, ethnic or national background in areas of employment, education, housing and the provision of goods and services. This was strengthened by the Race Relations Amendment Act 2000 which placed a general duty on public institutions to promote racial equality and prevent racial discrimination.

Cardiff has the highest proportion of people from British Minority Ethnic (BME) groups in Wales at 8.4% and within the college population 14% come from BME groups. This may reflect the popularity of college for BME young people, or simply the very young age profiles of these communities. The distribution of BME students within the college varies with 31% in Information and Office Technology, 20% in Business and Professional Studies 2.5% in Automotive Engineering and 4% in Building and Engineering Services.

Coleg Glan Hafren has always had a strong commitment to diversity and equality. The Cymorth funded action research reported here reflects this commitment. Its aims were to investigate the perceived barriers to learning of the 4 (BME) groups who have been identified as being at risk of failing to complete their courses. These are Bangladeshi, Black African, Chinese and Mixed Heritage Black African Caribbean/White students.

The objectives were as follows:

♦ To work with students in the College to elicit the barriers to learning
♦ To pilot a BME mentor within the College to support BME students and elicit their views
♦ To liaise with local ethnic minority community groups (particularly BME youth groups) to gain an understanding of possible cultural, religious and any other issues that may impact on the learning of these students
♦ To work with teaching staff within the College and in feeder schools to look as possible ways of breaking down barriers or perceived barriers to learning and achievement
♦ To enhance links between the college and local community groups with the possible objective of increasing and widening participation.

1 'Ethnic group' refers to people of the same race or nationality with a ‘long shared history and a distinct culture’. ‘Black and Minority Ethnic’ (BME) is a term commonly used by the home Office. Source: Economic and Science Research Council (ESRC) information Centre.
The project was undertaken over 21 weeks from November to April 2005/2006 by the College’s Equal Opportunities and Diversity Manager with an allocation of 4 hours a week.
1.1 This project used a variety of methods and gathered qualitative and quantitative data from the College and from outside sources including individuals and community organisations. Data was also exchanged with a researcher from a Scottish based consultancy, York Consulting, undertaking a parallel project funded by ELWa, and in March, the project manager visited Tower Hamlets College in London to find out the particular strategies that had been adopted to promote the achievement and retention of students.

1.2 The methods reported here reflect the diverse aims and objectives of the project. (See Introduction)

METHODS

2 LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 A short literature review was undertaken. The project relied mainly on the survey supplied by York Consulting with whom some sources were exchanged.

3 SECONDARY AND PRIMARY DATA FROM COLEG GLAN HAFREN

3.1 Secondary data
Statistical data from MIS sources provided information on the BME group numbers, retention and achievement.

3.2 In order to establish the accuracy of the College data base, the enrolment forms for all Mixed Race Black African Caribbean/White students were accessed and compared with the College statistics.

3.3 Since the majority of students from the targeted BME groups live in the south of Cardiff, the retention and outcomes for these students were compared with the average for all students living in those areas rather than with the whole College average alone.
3.2 Primary data

♦ Discussions and interviews were held with 11 academic staff to explore their perceptions of the barriers to learning experienced by the target groups

♦ A questionnaire was sent to tutors and course tutors of full-time students in Business Studies, IT/OT, Sport Leisure and Tourism, Health and Social Care and General Education. (Appendix 6)

A convenience sample was used. The numbers for some BME groups were very low (for example, 15 Chinese students in the whole college) and a quota sample would have been more appropriate. Nonetheless the survey did manage to capture responses from a satisfactory proportion of the targeted BME groups.

The questionnaires asked students their gender, age ethnicity and course and the number of hours of paid and unpaid work outside college they did each week. Students were also asked two open ended questions, ‘Thinking about yourself and your education, please list three good things about the education or training you have had in the UK’, and, ‘Thinking about yourself and your education, please write down any things that you think may prevent young people successfully completing education or training courses in colleges’. (Appendix 7&8)

♦ Focus groups with college students from the 4 target groups were led by a researcher from York Consulting

♦ Workers from community organisations who were employed in College during the project reported on the issues they had identified during their work in College

4 ESTABLISHING COMMUNITY LINKS AND GATHERING PRIMARY DATA

4.1 LINKS WITH COMMUNITY ORGANISATIONS

Links were established with the following organisations and projects:

♦ All Wales Saheli Association
♦ Bangladeshi Women’s Organisation
♦ Bangladeshi Reference Group
♦ Barefoot Project
♦ Black and Ethnic Minority Support Team (BEST)
♦ Cardiff LEA Adult Education
♦ Cardiff People First
♦ City Centre Youth Project- Grassroots
♦ Mentoring For All (MENFA)
♦ Somali Youth Association (SoYA)
♦ South Wales Police Minorities Support Unit
4.2 **LINKS WITH PARTNERSHIP SCHOOLS**
Existing links with partnership schools were used. Interviews with a member of staff were carried out at Cathays High School, Fitzalan High School, Rumney High School and Willows High School. In addition, questionnaires were issued to year 11 pupils in these schools, and the College marketing department piloted the questionnaires and took them to Rumney High School & St Illtyd’s High School.

4.3 **ESTABLISHING MENTORING**
Mentoring is a process by which a trained mentor is available to a student to challenge, extend knowledge and experience in order that they can develop and reach their full potential. Six mentors have worked with students in the College since an initial meeting in December. All are trained and experienced and from BME backgrounds. The MENFA approach is to match mentors with the mentees based on their interest and skills and mentor them on a one-to-one basis. Meetings initially take place in College, but these could be followed by sessions at MENFA.

4.4 **A PILOT STUDENT ADVICE DROP-IN CENTRE**
A similar contact was made with the City Centre Youth Project, Grassroots, and a student youth worker set up a Grassroots outreach project drop-in centre for 2 hours a week at each of the two College sites. Student Services managed this project.

4.5 **YOUTH FOCUS GROUPS**
BEST organised and carried out a Bangladeshi boys focus group.

4.6 **SOUTH WALES POLICE MINORITIES SUPPORT UNIT**
An interview was carried out with a representative from the Minorities Support Unit to find out if there were any particular issues with any BME groups in Cardiff.

4.7 **THE ALL WALES SAHELI ASSOCIATION**
Through contact with the All Wales Saheli Association, the project manager was able to attend the launch of the Ethnic Minorities Youth Forum which involved small focus groups, and the launch of Muslim Women Wales Speak.

The project manager was also able to organise two focus groups in College for the Saheli organisation so that they were able to gather evidence from College staff to report to the government’s ‘Combating Extremism’ unit.
5 THE EXTENT OF UNDERACHIEVEMENT

5.1 Retention, completion, attainment and success for all four groups has been below the College average even when compared with students living in similar postal code areas (Table 1). This year retention remains poor for Bangladeshi and Mixed Heritage students, but is the same as the College average for Black African students and much better than the College average for Chinese students. (Table 2)

Table 1. 2004-2005 Comparison of 4 BME groups’ outcomes with all students from similar Post Codes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethnicity</th>
<th>Enrolled</th>
<th>Cont.</th>
<th>Completed</th>
<th>Withdrawn</th>
<th>Passed</th>
<th>% Retention</th>
<th>% Completion</th>
<th>Attained</th>
<th>Success</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bangladeshi</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>56.2</td>
<td>52.3</td>
<td>47.8</td>
<td>25.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black African</td>
<td>179</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>76.0</td>
<td>74.9</td>
<td>64.1</td>
<td>48.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinese</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>71.4</td>
<td>69.2</td>
<td>44.4</td>
<td>30.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed White Black</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>60.0</td>
<td>60.0</td>
<td>66.7</td>
<td>40.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All college             | 1224     | 84    | 850       | 290       | 621    | 76.3        | 74.6        | 73.1     | 54.5    |

Table 2. Student withdrawals from college, April 2005-2006 given as a percentage for the group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethnicity</th>
<th>All student enrolments</th>
<th>Number of students enrolled after Nov 01</th>
<th>% withdrawal for Students before Nov 01</th>
<th>% Withdrawal students still in college after Nov 01</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bangladeshi</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black African</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>158</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinese</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed White Black Caribbean</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College average</td>
<td>3159</td>
<td>2868</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Questionnaires

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>COMPLETION</th>
<th>Attainment</th>
<th>RETENTION</th>
<th>Success</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No complete/</td>
<td>% of those students who</td>
<td>No. enrolled-No.</td>
<td>No. passed/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No enrolled-no continuing students</td>
<td>passed/students who completed</td>
<td>withdrawn</td>
<td>No. enrolled- continuing</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.2 One hundred and forty seven completed questionnaires were returned. These were sorted by ethnicity for the four main groups and with a further group for all students with any other ethnic background, including White British. (Table 3) Time constraints meant that it was not possible to analyse by age or gender.

Table 3 Numbers of returned questionnaires by ethnic group, percentage of students in the college and in the survey.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethnicity</th>
<th>a</th>
<th>b</th>
<th>c</th>
<th>a</th>
<th>b</th>
<th>c</th>
<th>a</th>
<th>b</th>
<th>c</th>
<th>a</th>
<th>b</th>
<th>c</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bangladeshi</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>91.2</td>
<td>74.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black African</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>91.2</td>
<td>74.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed Black African Caribbean/White</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>91.2</td>
<td>74.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinese</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other ie Pakistani/White etc</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>91.2</td>
<td>74.8</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>91.2</td>
<td>74.8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Work outside College

5.3 Students were asked how many hours they worked outside College and how much unpaid work they undertook, excluding homework and helping in the house. All groups reported less than an hour’s unpaid work, but there was a considerable difference in the average number of hours paid work undertaken each week with Chinese and Bangladeshi students working an average of 13.8 and 10.3 hours respectively. (Chart 1) This reflects lecturer reports of long hours worked by some Chinese and Bangladeshi students.

Chart 1

Average number of paid hours worked per week
Barriers to learning

5.4 ‘Thinking about yourself and your education, please write down any things that you think may stop young people completing education and training’

As can be seen in charts 2 to 7, the small number of Bangladeshi students identified the largest numbers of barriers to learning. For all students, the most frequently identified issues were money problems, problems with the course or with the work on the course, lack of motivation or interest, and problems outside College, particularly with home or family. Other problems include problems with teachers or teaching, disruptive students, work outside college, absenteeism, peer pressure and distance to college. (Appendix 1 )
The school questionnaire

5.5 Eighty five questionnaires were returned from year 11 pupils in 5 Cardiff schools. Compared with college students, pupils are more likely to identify friends and out of school activities as good features, and more likely to cite behavioural issues such as poor behaviour, boredom, fighting and cheeking teachers, as reasons for not succeeding.

Student focus groups (report from focus group leader Onyema Ibe)

5.6 Seventeen learners were interviewed on February 13th at the Parade and Trowbridge Sites.

5.7 Overall, students were positive about their learning experience in the college and gave a range of reasons as to why they had chosen CGH. These included:

- the college’s reputation
- the football academy
- family/friends awareness of the college
- entry requirements
- partnership with their former school

5.8 Most of the students commented on the relaxed approach in the college and importantly that they were treated as adults. The majority of the issues/challenges that were raised were ones that would relate to any student. These included:

- the need for greater self discipline compared to school
- lack of recreational facilities at the Parade site
- the cost of travel when not eligible for the bus pass (3mile rule and over 18 rule)
- the length of the college day and the travel between sites

5.9 There were a couple of points that were specific to the religious or cultural needs of the students. A couple mentioned the difficulty in expressing themselves in their academic work despite being fluent in English. One mentioned the challenges in following the lecturer because of the speed of delivery and her accent. Two students mentioned the fact that there was not halal meat used in any meals in the canteen. Two students from mixed ethnicities who had been born in Wales commented on their frustration when lecturers/other students considered them as “foreigners”.

5.10 None of the students had experienced any direct discrimination or overt racial abuse whilst at the college and felt they would know what steps to take if something had occurred.

5.11 No-one suggested other activities that could be done that would better meet their religious or cultural needs.
Focus groups with young people outside college
5.12 Focus groups were planned with young people at the Butetown Youth Pavillion, and with Bangladeshi boys and girls at the Barbados Centre in Riverside. They were to be run by community workers, but unfortunately, owing to work pressures the only group that finally took place was with Bangladeshi boys, although a questionnaire was issued to young people at Grassroots in Cardiff city centre.

5.13 Six Bangladeshi boys aged between 13 and 16 attended a focus group which explored their general background and interests, ambitions and thoughts about college or going to college. It was hoped to also discuss racism and family support but there was not time to discuss this at length.

5.14 The boys had long and short term goals that were similar to their peers of the same age. Friends and family were very important influences and important sources of support, with education, religion and respect also being identified. Ambitions included work in public services (police and fire service) and managing a business. The boys had a good basic idea of the courses available at Coleg Glan Hafren and where the City Centre site was, but were not, at that time, interested in visiting the college.

5.16 Four of the 6 boys listed drugs as a barrier that might prevent young people completing education.

5.10 The facilitator notes that racism was not a major issue. There was concern about trouble from visitors coming for sporting events following the building of the Millenium Stadium.

INTERVIEWS WITH INDIVIDUALS AND ORGANISATIONS OUTSIDE COLLEGE
5.11 Summaries of these interviews can be seen in the appendix (2-5) and are referenced in the text.
CONCLUSION

6.1 Bangladeshi, Black African and Mixed Race Black African Caribbean/White students have a retention and achievement rate that is below the college average.

6.2 The small number of Chinese students also had poor outcomes and retention in 2004-2005, but this year their retention is significantly better than the College average. The student numbers are low, 14 students enrolled on full-time mainstream courses in 2005-2006. With such low numbers it is possible that the statistics are an artefact and do not reflect any particular characteristic associated with Chinese ethnicity. Indeed, in Cardiff schools generally, Chinese pupils are reported to achieve well.3 Because of this, and the difficulty in contacting Chinese community groups, Chinese students are not discussed in detail in this report.

The barriers to learning- Bangladeshi students

6.3 Bangladeshi students have the poorest performance in the College. For 2004-2005 their outcomes, compared with students from similar post codes, were: completion, 52% (College 75%), attainment 67% (College 73%) and success 25% (College 54%). This year their withdrawal is 42%.

6.4 One possible explanation is that Coleg Glan Hafren may not attract the ablest students from this group. School sources suggest that school Sixth Forms or Sixth Form College may be a more attractive option, particularly for Muslim girls. This warrants further investigation since in Welsh schools generally Bangladeshi students are higher achievers than Black Africans and Pakistanis4 while in England they tend to be lower achievers.

6.5 Secondary sources on Bangladeshi children’s educational achievement in Britain suggest that reasons for underachievement are linked to a combination of factors. These include Bangladeshis’ relatively recent migration to Britain and poverty.5 Poverty and relative deprivation are both important factors in educational achievement, however one study has found that when poverty is measured by the eligibility for Free School Meals (FSM), then Bangladeshis receiving FSM are performing better than expected at all

3 See Interviews in Cardiff Schools in the Appendices 2-4
6.6 Key stages and GCSE. Bangladeshi children not receiving FSM do not perform as well as expected.  

6.7 The close ties within the community and with the community back in Bangladesh can affect school attendance and performance if young people are expected to work long hours outside school or college, stay at home to help with family duties or visit relatives in Bangladesh for long periods. In England, Bangladeshi pupils had the highest rates of both authorised and unauthorised absences of all BME groups. 

6.8 The College survey shows that Bangladeshi students work the second longest paid hours each week and that they identify the largest numbers of barriers to achievement. Over 60% suggested that problems with family or home or financial problems could be reasons why students may not be successful in education or training. At the same time, Bangladeshi students are not satisfied with their experiences in college. The College issues student survey forms Student Perception of College (SPOC forms). In summer 2005 Bangladeshi students were the least satisfied with all aspects of their courses; teaching, Key Skills, tests and assessments, support and accommodation and equipment. In contrast with this, Indian and Pakistani student’s responses were generally similar to or above the College ratings.

6.9 The Bangladeshi Reference Group in Cardiff considers that the Bangladeshi underachievement in school is a central concern. They identify problems that are shared with all young British people, such as the underachievement of boys, a sense of not knowing what to do, and peer pressure. There are, however, three particular issues identified by the group. Firstly, there is a lack of identified role models, despite the fact that there are many examples of successful British Bangladeshis. These achievements need to be brought to the attention of young people. A second concern is support for education. If parents have been brought up in Bangladesh they may not have received a great deal of formal education, or may not be familiar with the English medium education system having been educated in an Islamic school. The lack of a formal education background is particularly true of women. It can mean that they find it difficult to help their children with school work and may also not understand what is expected of their children at school or their children’s educational opportunities and achievements.

6.10 A final possible problem is the cultural differences between parents brought up in Bangladesh who retain strong cultural and emotional ties with their homeland and the different perspectives of their British children. As one member of the group said, ‘Culture clash is a bit of an issue as well.’ And, ‘I call this the lost generation, they can’t find their way back.’

---

6 Dept for Education and Skills (Jan 2005) Ethnicity and Education: the evidence on minority ethnic pupils P15
7 Ibid. P17
6.11 While Western individualism places a high value on individual achievement and individual material gain, this is not necessarily compatible with social values that emphasise family and community cohesiveness. A Newcastle study of Bangladeshis in the North East identified a tension between internal (generational) tensions, and the demands of Western society. One young Bangladeshi student is quoted as saying, ‘We’re going through lots of changes and it’s difficult for our parents and us..... You’ve got a lot more people to look after, and that is right. But in some ways it doesn’t fit into Western ways. Maybe it would be better if the Western ways changed and they looked after their families. Maybe they’re the real problem, not our way of life. That’s what our generation have to sort out,’

6.12 Secondary sources and school and college sources identify fluency in English as being an important factor affecting achievement.\(^8\)\(^9\)\(^10\) Bilingualism is an advantage in school achievement, but there may be a handicap for students who have not had enough formal education in English to acquire full bilingualism. It takes 2 years to acquire spoken fluency, but up to 10 years to acquire academic competence.\(^11\) As one Bangladeshi student in a focus group said, ‘I sound English, and what lecturers don’t realise it that I am often translating.’

**BLACK AFRICAN STUDENTS**

6.13 While the category ‘Bangladeshi’ reflects cultural and group characteristics, ‘Black African’ refers to very many different groups from a whole continent. It is clear from the literature and from the observations of College staff that Black African students are not a homogenous group. Muslim Somali students from a pastoral economy, for example, who may have arrived recently in the UK with few educational opportunities, may have little in common with urban Christian Nigerians who have received primary and secondary education through the medium of English.

6.14 Coleg Glan Hafren has Black African students from a large number of African countries, but statistics about specific ethnic groups within the Black African category are not available. It appears that the largest groups are Somalis and Sudanese, although there are a number of from the Democratic Republic of the Congo, and from Commonwealth countries.

6.15 Black African student’s outcomes are below the college average for students living in similar postal codes. In 2004-2005, attainment was 61.1% (college, 73.1%) and success was 48.0% (college 54.5%). However, their completion was the same as the College’s at 74.9% (college 74.6%), and this year their retention matches the College’s average for all students. It appears that Black African students stay in college but are less successful in completing their qualifications.

---

9 See Interviews in Cardiff Schools in the Appendices 2-4
11 Source: Janice Lee, Willows High School. Appendix 3
6.16 Black African students rated good/friendly helpful lecturers, interesting subjects and the chance to gain qualifications highly, and 33% cited money problems as the reason for not succeeding in education or training.

6.17 Somali students appear to be a significant college group within the Black African category. Cardiff has the largest Somali community in the UK. Some come from families that settled in Cardiff in the last century or before, while others are relative newcomers. The biggest recent immigration of Somalis was in 1990s following the collapse of the central government, with the majority of recent immigrants to Cardiff coming from Northern Somalia.

6.18 Welsh data identifies Somali and Yemeni school pupils as having the lowest attainment. School sources suggest that Somali and Sudanese refugee pupils experience particular problems due to their lack of English and lack of education or disrupted education, and they are likely to have suffered mental or physical trauma. One informant feels that, ‘Generally across the country we didn’t respond to their needs quickly.’

6.19 Somali pupils are also reported to be noisy and to have slightly more disruptive behaviour than other groups. The police report that they have a slightly higher incidence of petty crime and fighting. SOYA informants report that a recent survey of young Somalis show that they feel that they are ‘picked on’ by teachers in school more than other pupils.

6.20 Qat is used extensively in East Africa, the Arabian peninsular and the Middle East. Youths in Cardiff may start chewing qat around the age of 16, and may use it at night 3 or more times a week. It boosts energy, clarity of thought and euphoria resulting in tiredness and lethargy the following morning. The extent to which qat chewing, or other drug use is a barrier to learning has yet to be established.

6.21 Somali has only recently been written, so parents may not be literate in Somali or English. While Somali parents want to support their children in their education, some may have limited understanding of the expectations and demands of the British education system, and be unable to help with homework.

6.22 College informants report that some Somali students on ESOL courses may have little or no educational background because of the disrupted situation in Somalia. Some also experience poorer health than other students and have absences for doctors’ visits and visits to solicitors. They may also not qualify for a bus pass or for childcare. This means that they walk to college and may not come if the weather is very bad and may be

12 EALAW Op. Cit. P vii
13 School informant- Fitzalan High School
14 Interviews in schools
15 SOYA survey- not yet published
unable to attend college if childcare arrangements break down. As well as having a higher than average absence rate, they also appear to be late frequently which may be partly attributed to a lack of understanding of educational expectations, but also to barriers to attendance already described.

6.23 Other groups, such as the Congolese students are reported have a good educational background with many already holding the French Baccalaureate. Students from Commonwealth countries generally have received some of their education through the medium of English.

CHINESE STUDENTS
6.24 According to Careers Wales, there were only 20 Chinese Year 11 students in 2004-2005 in Cardiff and the Vale and all of these went on to full-time education. 16 14 full time Chinese students enrolled in College in 2005-2006 of whom 5 may be school leavers and 5 are overseas students.

6.25 Chinese pupils in schools are regarded as high achievers, yet the small number in college are amongst the lower achievers. It has not been possible to make contact with Chinese community organisations in Cardiff.

MIXED RACE BLACK AFRICAN CARIBBEAN/WHITE STUDENTS
6.26 Secondary sources on Mixed Heritage young people are relatively sparse due to the fact that it was only in the 2001 Census that people had the option of identifying themselves as coming from ‘mixed’ ethnicity. Mixed Heritage pupils in schools are the largest minority ethnic group in English schools. Mixed Heritage children, in particular those with one Black and one White parent, are over-represented in the care system and school exclusions, under-achieving at school and more likely to become drug users and have suicidal thoughts. 17 18 In English schools, White/Asian pupils and White/Black African girls perform above average while White/Black Caribbean and White/Black African boys underachieve. 19 Reasons for this underachievement have been attributed to ‘Low teacher expectations ...linked to stereotypical views of the negative effects of fragmented homes and identity confusion on account of their mixed heritage.’, and ‘Peer group pressures ... exacerbated by name calling and forms of exclusion by both White and Black peers.... . These two barriers can lead to the adoption of extreme rebellious behaviour by White/Black Caribbean boys.’ 20 Girls ‘often become depressed’. 21

---

16 City and County of Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pupil Destinations 2005 Careers Wales
17 Keep the love alive. http://www.2as1.net/Articles/article.asp?id=212
18 Graham Readfearn In Between Sheffied Multiple Heritage Service IN Young People now 28 April-4 May 2004
19 Leon Tikly et.al (2004) Understanding the educational needs of mixed heritage pupils dfes Research Briefs and Research Reports.RB549
20 Ibid.
6.27 The literature suggests that particular barriers to achievement for this group may be problems with identity (or teachers perception that students have problems with their identity), low teacher expectations and racism from both Black and White peers. The Sheffield study reported a game played with young people aged 10 to 14 in Sheffield schools where pupils were asked to describe the names that they have used to describe themselves and that their friends use to describe them. They report that most of the words reported by mixed heritage pupils were racially abusive.  

6.28 The EALAW report suggests that there may be identity issues for BME young people. Pupils who were high achievers identified more strongly with both ‘British’ and ‘Welsh’ identities, and in general pupils may find it easier to identify themselves as ‘British’ rather than ‘Welsh’. ‘The difference between ‘British’ and ‘Welsh’ identification may also be linked to the Welsh language and an integral part of Welshness.’ 23 In the College focus groups, 2 mixed heritage students who had been born in Wales ‘commented on their frustration when lecturers/other students considered them as ‘foreigners’. Just how typical these issues are of Cardiff young people is not known, and further work would be needed to establish the particular identity issues of mixed heritage young people in the city.

6.29 In Coleg Glan Hafren there has been a year on year increase in the number of students describing themselves as Black African/White or African Caribbean/White. The data for 2005-2006 is confusing with between 10 and 29 full-time students identified as Mixed Race Black African Caribbean/White, putting them between 0.8% and 2.3% of the full-time student population. This is may be an underestimate since some mixed race people prefer to describe themselves as Black or White. 25

6.30 This group’s achievement was below the College average. The startling feature of this group appears to be their high withdrawal rate at the beginning of this academic year, and their continuing high level of withdrawal. (Table 2) Despite this, Black African Caribbean/White students were most likely to identify positive features of teachers as a reason for success and least likely to identify home or family problems, problems with money or ill health as reasons for not completing a course. Practical work and sport were also seen as positive features.

6.31 Despite their positive view of teachers, the SPOC returns for April 2005 show that Mixed Heritage White/Black African Caribbean students were not satisfied with their teaching or the support they receive in College, did not enjoy work experience placements and do not use the college’s support services.

25 To be or not to be. http://www.intermix.org.uk/pzone/FEA_08_tobeornottobe.asp
MENTORING
6.32 Forty students attended initial mentoring meetings and 12 have followed these up in one-to-one mentoring sessions. A further 16 students have attended confidence building workshops. In addition mentors have visited students in class and in the Hafren Diner and Atrium at the City Centre.

Main issues that have been addressed are:
♦ Problems resulting from poor English. This means that many are not mixing outside their own group. They can be socially isolated from mainstream British students and as their English does not improve it remains difficult to mix. This has also been reported by ESOL staff.
♦ Lack of confidence/self esteem. Clearly mentoring will attract, and hopefully help, these students.
♦ Not using resources available in the College. This is the case with mainstream students as well as ESOL students and applies to Learning Centre support as well as College facilities. One mentee, for example, did not know that there was a diner on the tenth floor at the City Centre, another who was told she needed help with maths did not know where to go
♦ Lacking information about resources available outside College
♦ Some students misunderstood the aim of mentoring thinking that mentors would provide money or jobs, or decided not to join the scheme.

THE DROP-IN CENTRE
6.33 Grassroots is a charity which works with 16-25 year olds. It aims to, ‘instil optimism and to promote self awareness and self-worth in young people who see themselves in a negative light.’ As part of this project, a Grassroots worker offered to set up a drop-in centre in the College to give advice on housing, health, legal matters and money

6.34 The project started in January and lasted through the Spring term with 7 two hour sessions at each site. Fifteen students were seen and a further 5 visited Grassroots. The main problems were money and debt and housing. As a result of housing advice 2 students were able to continue in college.

ENGLISH AS A SECOND LANGUAGE
6.35 Competence in academic English is an important factor linked to academic success. In Welsh schools, ‘there is a pronounced and significant difference between the levels of English language proficiency for high achievers and low achievers.’

6.36 In Coleg Glan Hafren there is active and developing English as a Second Language (ESOL) provision at Entry 2 & 3 and the more advanced Levels 1-2. It is recommended that students should complete level 2 before progressing to mainstream courses. Students are naturally anxious to join mainstream courses and acquire qualifications that will enable them to progress to higher education or employment.

6.37 Some College lecturers report that not all ESOL students are able to cope with the demands of academic English on their courses, and that this can be a reason for withdrawal or failure. There appear to be a number of reasons why students may be inappropriately enrolled onto courses.

- The recommendation that students complete level 2 is not always adhered to. Students may apply for a mainstream course using the normally College application form and their current status as a college student will not be picked up.
- Tutors on courses may be unaware that students whose spoken English appears fluent, and who may be British citizens may still lack necessary literacy skills.
- On some courses, tutors test written English skills by asking for a short piece of written English. This may be an exercise with which ESOL students are well practised, for example, writing about themselves or their home, and this can give an over optimistic impression of their skills.
- Last minute applications when staff are under pressure

RACISM
6.38 Cardiff has a long history of racial integration. One of the first recorded mixed marriages took place in Cardiff in 1768, and there is a long established mixed heritage population in the city. In 1948 it was estimated that 7,000 of the country’s 25,000 ‘coloured’ population lived in Cardiff.

6.39 At the same time, Cardiff, in common with the rest of Britain, has a history of discrimination which includes racism. There were race riots in Cardiff in 1919 when 23 of the 24 Chinese laundries had their windows smashed, and in the same year there was a spate of attacks on Black seamen. One white man was stabbed to death and a week of rioting followed with attacks on the homes of Black people. In the 1930s The League of Coloured People intervened on behalf of Black seamen in Cardiff who were finding it difficult to get work, and in 1936, they appealed for assistance in placing the coloured youth in Cardiff who are growing up.

27 Gary Younge The Congo Boys of Cardiff
http://books.guardian.co.uk/review/story/0,12084,725466,00.html

28 Robert Keel Picture Post 3 July 1948 accessed on
http://www.spartacus.schoolnet.co.uk/JhultonE.htm

without opportunities for work......The average employer, would much sooner have an alien employee than a coloured British one. So of course it is with hotels and landladies offering appointments.  

6.40 Discrimination and racism continued in the second half of the C19 with poorer education and employment opportunities for Black and mixed race citizens. Betty Campbell, Wales first Black headmistress was told at school in the 1950s that there would be ‘too many problems’ if she became a teacher. Today unemployment and low skills levels remain a problem for many BME groups in Cardiff as in the rest of the UK.

6.41 According to the Community Safety Unit of the Welsh Assembly Government, ‘all regions in Wales witnessed an increase in the number of racist incidents reported to the police in the period from 2002 to 2004. This is attributed to better recording standards and more confidence in reporting incidents. The total number of reported racist incidents in Wales in the year 2002/03 was 2,330, a 6% fall on the previous year, but an overall increase of 431% on the figure of 439 in 1996/97. However racist incidents in South Wales increased by 346% between the year 1995/96 and the year 2002/03 from 443 to 1,594 reported incidents.’ In Cardiff there is reported to have been a small increase in racist incidents following 9/11 and the June bombings in London, although the increase is not as great as in some other areas of Britain.

6.42 Cardiff is alternately presented as a city where there is a high degree of racial harmony, or a city that is racially blind or ‘racially naïve’. The extent of racism or discrimination in any organisation is difficult to determine. The EALAW survey found that, ‘Almost three quarters of the ethnic minority pupils surveyed experience racism but incidences of high levels of racism are much lower, Racism is more prevalent outside than inside school for most ethnic groups suggesting that schools provide a certain level of protection against racism.’ All school informants noted that pupils mix well in the first year of secondary school and then tend to separate into social groups based on ethnicity, but mix again in the Sixth Form. This is reflected in observations made by College staff.

6.43 The question of whether or not students experience racism in College is a difficult one to answer. A great deal of work has been done in the College to enhance staff’s awareness of inclusivity and understanding of race and ethnicity, and to ensure that staff are aware of their obligations to comply with anti discriminatory legislation. Personnel have never dealt with a staff disciplinary incident involving racism or discrimination. South Wales Police report that they have never received a complaint of racism from Coleg Glan

---

30 http://www.movinghere.org.uk/galleries/histories/caribbean/growing_up/growing_up.htm
31 Betty Campbell quoted in Connections Summer 1999
32 ICAR - Information centre about Asylum Seekers and refugees in the UK
33 Interview with PC Richie Paines South Wales Police Minorities Support Unit.
Hafren, and in the focus groups led by York Consulting all students were asked if they had experienced racism in College, but none was reported. Racism has not been mentioned to any of the College mentors who are themselves from BME groups.

6.44 Students at induction are given training on equal opportunities and diversity. However, it has to be recognised that college students will reflect the diverse attitudes of their social groups, and the College will have students with a range of different attitudes. There are occasional reports of students exchanging insults some of which are racist. When these are investigated they appear to form part of a general youth vocabulary of insults all of which are unacceptable. For example, ‘You’re a White/fat/skinny/Black arsed bitch.’ If racism occurs amongst students, it may not only be confined to relationships between students. Indeed, one lecturer, herself from a BME group, has said that she feels that students from similar backgrounds give her less respect both as a woman and as a member of a BME group.

6.45 There is evidence that staff would benefit from further embedding training on racial and cultural issues as these link to equal opportunities. A frequent comment from lecturers was that they are not aware of their students’ ethnic background and ‘treat all students the same’, yet at the same time identify issues that arise as a result of not having a good understanding of cultural or religious differences. For example, one functional manager whose team deals with students on a daily basis noted that women may feel that some male students have misogynist attitudes towards them and as a result ‘lose their generosity of spirit’. Staff are not clear about the extent of their role in teaching student behaviour that is considered acceptable, or indeed whether or not they should be doing this.

6.46 While there is an acceptance that students with physical or learning disabilities need particular help, this is less acceptable for BME groups on the grounds that there are other students who also have problems and would equally benefit from extra assistance. The feeling seems to be that resources should be targeted at individuals and not specific groups.

\[\text{35 At the college focus group for staff run by the Saheli Association, it was noted: ‘There is a need to address the way in which some men talk to women staff. Also husbands talking for their wives who may be applying for college courses.’}\]
RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1 Experience organising this project shows that targeting particular groups within the College can cause ill feeling from both staff and students. There have been comments such as, ‘Everything’s done for the Muslims’, ‘Everything’s done for the ethnic minority students’, ‘People who have paid taxes all their life should come first’, ‘Why just Bangladeshis, what about the Pakistanis?’ ‘I’m all right. I’m no different.’ ‘What about those boys? They’re useless’ (indicating a group of White students), ‘I’m from Thailand, can you count me as Chinese?’

7.2 There are high achievers in all the different social, gender and ethnic groups in College. The current ELWa classification system confuses ethnic groups with racial categories and makes it difficult to identify particular underachieving groups within these categories. Any action by the College should target underachieving groups, but also needs to be inclusive and not make any particular groups feel that they are problematic or lead to resentment that some groups are receiving an unfair share of the resources available.

7.3 Given the need for inclusivity, it is nonetheless important to support the groups at particular risk. The most BME important groups identified here are the Bangladeshi students and the second most important the Mixed Heritage Black African Caribbean/White students. Within the Black African group, Somali and Sudanese students are reported to have particular needs for support.

7.4 LINKS WITH COMMUNITY ORGANISATIONS

♦ The College already has well established links with partner schools, and individual courses and tutors have links with a vast range of community organisations and industries. It should be possible to establish links with community organisations specifically working with BME groups, and some links have already been established through this project.
There are a number of community projects which have been successfully promoting BME achievement for some time, and others will shortly start. Both the College and the community will benefit from any partnerships that can be developed. The organisations that have worked in the college since November are MENFA and Grassroots. Other organisation that have expressed an interest in forming partnerships are the Bangladeshi Reference Group and the SoYA project, The Joint Education Achievement and Economic Activity Programme (JEEP) which will be piloted shortly with 11-16 & 16-24 year old Somalis.

Forging links with community leaders, including the Bangladeshi and Somali community.

### 7.5 SUPPORT FOR STUDENTS

**Mentoring and drop in centre**

Both the mentoring service and the drop-in centre have provided support and change for students. The numbers taking up the opportunities for each pilot project are low. To evaluate the effectiveness of this sort of support it should be started at the beginning of the academic year and run through the year.

Other mentoring opportunities used at Tower Hamlets that could also be developed in the college include training first year students as mentors for second year students, and using university volunteers as specialist subject coaches. Tower Hamlets are also training volunteer mentors from their administrative staff who mentor during their lunch hour.

**Support for speakers of other languages**

There is evidence from schools, college staff, the college mentors and students that difficulty with academic English is a barrier to achievement and that the length of time spent in English medium education is an important factor in acquiring competence.

Two groups of students may be at particular risk. Firstly students who come from local schools, have fluent spoken English and who are assumed to be academically competent, but may nonetheless need help with academic English, and secondly ESOL students who have not achieved ESOL level 2 but progress to mainstream courses.

Advice is needed from ESOL lecturers in the college, EMAS and other specialists about the methods for identifying and supporting both these groups of students. There needs to be a
whole college approach to identifying and helping students who would benefit from English language support from the start of their course.

♦ **Positive role models.** Providing positive role models for students by inviting former students to visit the college and talk about their achievements. This has been done with some success at Tower Hamlets College.

♦ **Positive Images** Presenting positive images of BME groups using wall displays. There is currently a display celebrating sports achievers at Trowbridge which encompasses age, sexual orientation, gender, people with disabilities, as well as BME groups. It would also be helpful to develop a display celebrating the achievements of successful Cardiff people from all BME and mainstream groups.

♦ **Forging links with families.**
  a) Developing absence calling in Sylheti and Somali. Initially a Sylheti or Somali speaker could be employed one evening a fortnight
  b) An initial letter in Somali and Sylheti sent to parents of new students explaining college expectations
  c) A parents meeting at the beginning of the year for Sylheti and Somali speakers

### 7.6 STAFF DEVELOPMENT

♦ Further staff development on cultural and religious issues as these link to an understanding of equal opportunities.

### 7.7 COLLEGE DEVELOPMENTS

Establishing new procedures or disseminating existing procedures for:

1. The acceptable numbers of days away from college for religious festivals. Clear guidelines are needed about the leave that students can be expected to take for religious festivals. Staff and students are very uncertain about this. There are examples of Hindu students taking time away from college during Ramadan, a lecturer mentioning that her students took 3 weeks away for Ramadan, and was unaware that this was inappropriate. Another lecturer faced with students who wanted to leave at 3pm because they were fasting checked with the Islam RE tutor and is clear that students should attend college as normal during Ramadan but would be away for one day of Eid.
2. Clarification of the requirements for mosque attendance at lunchtimes on Fridays and how these can be accommodated within the timetable

3. Procedures for photographing students for their college ID when they are wearing veils. (See for example Imperial College’s Policy on Dress: Health, Safety and Security Requirements)

- Clarification of the extent to which staff have a role in teaching students acceptable behaviour when they feel that there is a conflict between behaviour that is socially acceptable in one cultural context, but less acceptable in a Western cultural context.

- Further investigation of the reasons for the low numbers of BME students on engineering courses

7.8 SUBSTANCE ABUSE AND ALCOHOL

Substance and alcohol abuse is a barrier to achievement for some young people in all social and ethnic groups in Britain. The extent or type of abuse for specific BME groups needs to be established to find out if indeed there are any particular issues.
Bibliography


Betty Campbell quoted in Connections Summer 1999


City and County of Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pupil Destinations 2005 Careers Wales


Robert Keel Picture Post 3 July 1948 accessed on http://www.spartacus.schoolnet.co.uk/JhultonE.htm

Keep the love alive. http://www.2as1.net/Articles/article.asp?id=212

Graham Readfearn In Between Sheffield Multiple Heritage Service IN Young People now 28 April-4 May 2004

ICAR- Information centre about Asylum Seekers and refugees in the UK


Leon Tikly et.al (2004) Understanding the educational needs of mixed heritage pupils dfes Research Briefs and Research Reports.RB549

http://www.movinghere.org.uk/galleries/histories/caribbean/growing_up/growing_up.htm

To be or not to be. http://www.intermix.org.uk/pzone/FEA_08_tobeornottobe.asp

Gary Younge The Congo Boys of Cardiff
http://books.guardian.co.uk/review/story/0,12084,725466,00.html
# Appendix 1

**Other barriers to learning experienced by different ethnic groups in college**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Bangladeshi</th>
<th>Black African</th>
<th>Black African Caribbean/White</th>
<th>Chinese</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bad teaching,</td>
<td>Teachers unable to help</td>
<td>Issues with teachers</td>
<td>Long hours in college</td>
<td>Teachers and students arriving late (2)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Timetable</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Not getting along with lecturers/bad teachers (3)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bad students mixing with good</td>
<td>No respect for college rules</td>
<td>Disruptive students (2)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Too many hours in college (2)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distance to college</td>
<td>Distance to the college (2)</td>
<td>Transport</td>
<td></td>
<td>Inconvenient TT (4)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Account user banned</td>
<td>College IT policy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Should have the option to attend Key Skills</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Childcare/parenthood</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Too many hours in college (2)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>College facilities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Unreliable support (3)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Food too expensive</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Treatment and guidance (3)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social life</td>
<td>Not enough practical</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Students messing about (6)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Other issues outside college (2)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Living away from college</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Discrimination against people with ASBOs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Jobs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Job/apprenticeship</td>
<td></td>
<td>Food to expensive</td>
<td>Not many facilities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>College is not very nice. It’s dull.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Cost of food in college</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 2
Interview with Dave Blythe Assistant Head Fitzallan High School

03 06 03

The school has a large proportion of BME students. The school places a strong emphasis on racial tolerance and harmony. This is evident in displays around the school. Students mix in ethnic groups in the playgroup. There have been tension on ethnic lines; the example given was spill over from issues in the community.

Bangladeshi students
Bangladeshi students constitute between 10-15% of the school population. Their outcomes are poor. Dave considers the reasons to be:

- Extended leave back to Bangladesh. It means that they can regress academically by up to a year
- English is not the language of the home, Mum often doesn’t speak English
- Very few English reading books in the home
- Low educational aspirations for girls. For example, bright girls on A level courses can be taken back to Bangladesh 2-3 weeks before their exams.
- Low aspirations for boys which leads to poor attendance/motivation.
- Work outside school. Boys may be working in the family business. Girls may be kept home to look after siblings, or may be late taking siblings to school
- Issues with arranged marriages. If husbands come from Bangladesh attitude change may be difficult

Somali students
Somali students constitute about 10% of the school population. Vary greatly—some v bright, many lack motivation. May be psychologically traumatised following their experiences in Somalia. They may have had no previous schooling. Have an attitude that we owe them everything. There is an issue with poor attendance and time keeping. They’re loud, they can’t have a quiet conversation. There is a problem with the division Sunni and Shi’ite

Possibly generally across the country we didn’t respond quickly enough. 'We didn’t get it right when they come in.'

Have a Black African mentoring programme. It does make a different for those who want help and the majority are girls.

Parents don’t always understand English. Arranged marriage doesn’t seem to be a problem as with Bangladeshis.
Mixed race
Maybe Cardiff hasn’t got to grips with the difference (between mixed race and White pupils). There is an issue with underachievement in boys. Parents may not have high education themselves, and there may be low expectations.

Mixed race students may perceive that they are excluded to a large extent. However, as with White boys and girls they can be excluded by the curriculum. Some respond well to the alternative curriculum. Is there institutional racism?

Chinese
Normally achieve quite well. They are often gifted mathematically. They are expected to work a lot outside school. There can be issues with the parents not speaking English.
Appendix 3
Janice Lee
Head of Ethnic Minority Achievement Service, Willows High School

Interview 01 03 06

General remarks
The main BME groups at Willows are Dual Heritage, Bangladeshi, Pakistani and Somali. General issues include bullying on religious rather than ethnic lines, particularly after 9/11; usually referring to their mothers. There is question of ethnic identity. ‘I have to say it’s never far below the surface. There’s always that edge.’

CGH may not be attracting the most academic students who will tend to choose school sixth forms of Sixth Form College.

Issues particular to each group

Bangladeshi students

Most Bangladeshi students at Willows are born in this country.

1. Help with education at home.
   Parents, particularly the mother, may have limited education and may be unaware of what is expected.

Parents may not always value education for girls

2. Community cohesion may mean that young people don’t want to get educated out of their community

3. Language is crucial to students’ success. It takes 18 months-2 years to acquire social fluency, but up to 10 years to acquire academic competency. Janice worked on a project with BMEs who appeared fluent but cannot always express what they want to say clearly enough to satisfy academic criteria.

Dual heritage African Caribbean/White students

1. Sometimes they seem to have identity issues; they need to be brought up to value both. ‘Unless they have strong parental support from both heritages, it seems to have a strong psychological effect’.

Black African students

1. As with Bangladeshis, there may be language issues. Some Black students may speak a patois at home and need to learn Standard English for academic purposes.

Chinese students
They tend to do very well

**Recommendations**

- Mentoring. Janice has worked on a project with BME students who appeared fluent, but couldn’t always write down what they wanted to say fast enough. She has accompanied them to every maths, science and English lesson. They had individual interviews every half term unless there was a particular issue to deal with, possibly more frequently if there was a particular issue to deal with. Many more informal meetings were held to keep checks on coursework progress. Could almost guarantee and improvement in grades by 1 or 2 grades.

- Identifying students whose English may require extra support. In the States there are sometimes ‘pre teaching’ years to give students the opportunity to improve their academic standards.

- Teach in smaller groups. The relationship with the teacher is crucial.
Appendix 4
Interview with Tracey Stephens, Cathays High School,
03 March 2006

About half the intake is from BME backgrounds. The school runs a project to support Black African/Caribbean students in year 10 and 11, which is having some success. The school is able to use interpreters (supplied by EMAS) when interviewing parents. White British males are underachieving compared with Bangladeshis, Pakistanis and Somalis in terms of added value.

Tracey notes that students’ social groups span ethnic divisions in the first few years of college. ‘As they get older they seem to go more into their ethnic groups, particularly Somalis.’ In the Sixth form, where groups are smaller students tend to mix together again. Possible by the time young people reach the age of 16, young people may become more aware of cultural issues.

The partnership with Coleg Glan Hafren is seen to be fruitful and positive. Students who choose both college and school are very happy with the choice and partnership students always do well. However, some of the most able pupils choose to go to St David’s College ‘because of the ethos’. CGH attracts two groups of students, ones who want to do something completely different, and those who have just had enough of school (these tend to be in the lower ability range).

Bangladeshi students
No particular barriers to learning, and no particular issues with girls, although there are quite small numbers, only around 20 in each year group. Bangladeshi parents in this school are generally second generation Welsh/Bangladeshi and usually very keen for their children to do well.

Black African- Somali
Quite loud and confident. Perhaps have a higher rate of bad behaviour. Some have a strong religious influence at home and go to mosque but don’t necessarily behave in the same way at school.

Chinese
Always achieve. They are amongst our highest achieving pupils. They often have parents at the university.

Mixed race
Some probably fall into the same category as underachieving boys. Have to get the teaching strategies right, for example in terms of short term goals.

Recommendations
1. Continue the partnership as this offers students a taste of independence while still maintaining the safe environment of school
2. Possibly a consideration of class timing. Tracey notes that it is very difficult to get Muslim girls to attend evening events as parents want
them at home. This could be a deterrent to enrolling on courses where the groups are mixed and there are late classes.

There are no other particular recommendations for the transition from school to college.
This college is situated in Poplar in the East End of London. It is well appointed and well maintained. ‘We have the best educational buildings in the borough’. The college is able to attract funds from a number of different sources. In contrast with other parts of the country, Bangladeshi students outcomes are the best with Black Africans second. White Europeans perform poorly.

The college does not necessarily attract the best students from the feeder schools and the highest achieving students tend to go outside the borough, although the college is now beginning to attract students from outside the borough. Over the last 5-6 years there has been a change in management ideas and approach. ‘We were trawling along quite nicely. As if there was an unspoken agreement that we won’t ask too much of you. It was a 2 year period in an open prison.’

1. The college focuses on educational achievement and ‘knows the limit of pastoral support’. They do not put emphasis students’ disadvantages of background or problems but on their strengths. The Bangladeshi community have high levels of unemployment and long term sickness, yet at Level 2&3 their results are >=national benchmarks and at a level 2-3 points above the average.

2. Recruitment
The college used to have an agreement with the borough that every applicant was entitled to a place in the college. ‘We’ve stopped this. It’s, ‘You’ve got a place here...well done.’ Schools were indifferent to us. 11-16 schools don’t see us as their college. Schools with 6th forms are a bit frightened of us’. The college applies the entry criteria rigorously. They explain the expectations in terms of work, attendance homework etc carefully and ask the question, ‘Are you willing to work?’ They are rigorous about internal progression. ‘We have got to get the college out of the cycle of supporting non progression.’

3. Tutorials. Tutorials have changed greatly to focus very much on ILPs and academic achievement. They were about drugs/family/diversity. Now there are many individual tutorials with discussions on achievement.
4. Rewarding achievement. Big celebrations of achievement. £160 for getting 300 points and send the results back to school. Regular reward ceremonies throughout the year and assemblies where they talk about the future, recognise achievement and give certificates.

5. The college runs a specific project, ‘Aim higher’. It is for gifted students and attracts extra funds.
Appendix 6

**COLEG GLAN HAFREN- QUESTIONNAIRE**

I would be grateful if you would complete this short questionnaire. We are interested in your ideas and views about education and training and in your experiences. The aim is to improve the service we can offer students in Coleg Glan Hafren.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>Are you</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>(Tick ✓✓ ✓✓ your response)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2</th>
<th>Your age</th>
<th>18 or under</th>
<th>19-22</th>
<th>23 or older</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3</th>
<th>Your background</th>
<th>Bangladeshi</th>
<th>Black African</th>
<th>Mixed African Caribbean/ White</th>
<th>Chinese</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>4</th>
<th>What is your course?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>5</th>
<th>Thinking about yourself and your education, please list three good things about the education or training you have had in the UK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>6</th>
<th>Thinking about yourself and your education, please write down any things that you think may prevent young people successfully completing education or training courses in colleges</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*If you have other comments, please write on the back of this page.*
## Appendix 7 COLLEGE QUESTIONNAIRE

### Good things

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Good/friendly lecturers/help</th>
<th>Interesting subjects/learning/choices</th>
<th>Better future/qualifications</th>
<th>It's free</th>
<th>EMAsmoney</th>
<th>Friends</th>
<th>Facilities</th>
<th>Good atmosphere</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>White/other</strong></td>
<td>14</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>110</strong></td>
<td>12.73</td>
<td>70.71</td>
<td>5.66</td>
<td>88.39</td>
<td>4.53</td>
<td>220.98</td>
<td>4.07</td>
<td>8.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chinese</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bangladeshi</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Black African</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mixed</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Good/friendly lecturers/help</th>
<th>Interesting subjects/learning/choices</th>
<th>Better future/qualifications</th>
<th>It's free</th>
<th>EMAsmoney</th>
<th>Friends</th>
<th>Facilities</th>
<th>Good atmosphere</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>White/other</strong></td>
<td>14</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>110</strong></td>
<td>12.73</td>
<td>70.71</td>
<td>5.66</td>
<td>88.39</td>
<td>4.53</td>
<td>220.98</td>
<td>4.07</td>
<td>8.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chinese</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bangladeshi</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Black African</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mixed</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Good/friendly lecturers/help</th>
<th>Interesting subjects/learning/choices</th>
<th>Better future/qualifications</th>
<th>It's free</th>
<th>EMAsmoney</th>
<th>Friends</th>
<th>Facilities</th>
<th>Good atmosphere</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>White/other</strong></td>
<td>14</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>110</strong></td>
<td>12.73</td>
<td>70.71</td>
<td>5.66</td>
<td>88.39</td>
<td>4.53</td>
<td>220.98</td>
<td>4.07</td>
<td>8.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chinese</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bangladeshi</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Black African</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mixed</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Appendix 8 COLLEGE QUESTONNAIRE

## Barriers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Ill health</th>
<th>Home/Family</th>
<th>Money problems</th>
<th>Bullying/problems with other students</th>
<th>Wrong decision</th>
<th>Too much work/stress of work</th>
<th>Not completing work/lazy/lack of motivation or interest/attitude</th>
<th>TV</th>
<th>Work outside college</th>
<th>Absenteeism</th>
<th>Peer pressure</th>
<th>Drugs</th>
<th>Don't know</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White/other</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>110</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6.36</td>
<td>17.27</td>
<td>19.09</td>
<td>10.91</td>
<td>3.64</td>
<td>13.64</td>
<td>16.36</td>
<td>0.91</td>
<td>11.82</td>
<td>4.55</td>
<td>5.45</td>
<td>3.64</td>
<td>4.55</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinese</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>16.67</td>
<td>50.00</td>
<td>66.67</td>
<td>16.67</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>33.33</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>16.67</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>16.67</td>
<td>16.67</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black African</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>8.33</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>25.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>4.35</td>
<td>8.70</td>
<td>13.04</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>13.04</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>13.04</td>
<td>13.04</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>