The Army and Democracy
Military Politics in Pakistan

Aqil Shah
Dartmouth College
Sept 12, 2014
The Data

• One hundred military interviews (2007-2013)

• Pakistan Army Green Book, 1991-2011

• The National Defense University (NDU):
  • Training Curriculum, journal and strategy papers

• Archives
  • Pakistan Cabinet Record, British Army Museum, India Office Records
Interview Findings: “Logic of Appropriateness”

- 3/4th of military informants viewed a coup as a legitimate form of regime change under “crisis” conditions

- 3/4th believed civilian politicians were incapable of managing national security

- 2/3rd considered politicians as unfit to rule

- Without exception, officers advocated a permanent “watchdog” role for the military in governance
3. Institutional Socialization

• “The army’s ‘guardian’ role is rooted in its professional training, which is based on developing patriotism and character. And more than that a sense of group relationship where a person sacrifices for the benefit of the group. And then as we progress in the army, this becomes ingrained in us.”
  
  - General Pervez Musharraf, 2010.
Tutelary Professionalism

“Gone are the days when the sole role of an army was limited, either to invade or beat back the invaders. . . . Geopolitical and geo-strategic regional compulsions of South Asia have made the revision and redefinition of Pakistan Army’s role a necessity.”

The Musharraf-Era

- 70% percent of NDU officer’s “declassified” research papers written between 2000-06, concerned with resolving civilian/political problems:
  - E.g., political party reforms, admin. decentralization, anti-corruption, civil service reforms, tax reforms, etc.
“We need to adjust democracy to local conditions. Parliamentary system fragments power. Presidential system needed to achieve unity of command.”

Pakistan has too many centers of power. The Senate should be abolished. National Assembly seats should be rationalized to include technocrats.

“Regional parties should be banned. Political parties should be merged into two truly ‘national’ parties.”

“Parties without internal democracy should not be allowed to contest elections.”
Norm Persistence:  
Post-transitional Military Politics, 2008-

- In 2012, of the 987 contact hours in the NDU course, only one 2-hour lecture on the constitution of Pakistan.
- \(\frac{1}{4}\)th of that lecture on the constitutional role of the armed forces.
I. Domestic Politics

• Incompetent politicians: threat to national security
  “The political leadership lacks the aptitude to read basic defense policy documents, and even the ability to think…they cannot formulate any policy.”

• Uneducated politicians unfit to rule
  “Governance is a complex business and politicians lack the requisite education level…increase percentage of technocrats in parliament to 50% to ensure correct management and planning of available resources for the development of the country.”
II. National Security: New Threats, Old Responses

- India still enemy no. 1
- Terrorism sponsored by India (and the U.S.) via Afghanistan
- Goal: “Implode” Pakistan to denuclearize it
- “Asymmetric [jihadi] warfare” as weapon of choice

- NDU National Strategy Papers, 2007-2012
- The Army *Green Book*, 2000-2011