### I.D. Assessment and Critique

References: FAA-H-8083-9

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>The student should develop knowledge of the elements related to the critique and evaluation as required in the CFI PTS.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Elements   | 1. Assessment  
             2. Critique                                                                                           |
| Schedule   | 1. Discuss Objectives  
             2. Review material  
             3. Development  
             4. Conclusion                                                                                       |
| Equipment  | 1. White board and markers  
             2. References                                                                                       |
| IP’s Actions | 1. Discuss lesson objectives  
             2. Present Lecture  
             3. Ask and Answer Questions  
             4. Assign homework                                                                                   |
| SP’s Actions | 1. Participate in discussion  
             2. Take notes  
             3. Ask and respond to questions                                                                      |
| Completion Standards | The student has the ability to properly critique and evaluate students using the methods and characteristics described. |
Introduction:

Attention
The dreaded tests and awful instructor critiques, this is how you do it.

Overview
Review Objectives and Elements/Key ideas

What
The critique refers to the instructor’s role as a critic, and the evaluation portion discusses creating and conducting effective evaluations.

Why
The instructor must be able to appraise student performance and convey this information back to the student. Also, throughout a course, and at the end of a course, a student must be evaluated to measure and document whether or not the course objectives have been met.

How:

1. Evaluation
   A. Purpose – To determine how a student is progressing in the course
      i. A good assessment provides practical and specific feedback to students, including direction and guidance on how to raise performance
      ii. Contributes to ADM and judgment skills
   B. Characteristics
      i. Objective
         a. Focused on student performance, not personal opinions, likes, dislikes, or biases
         b. To be objective, a critique must be honest, and based on the performance as it was
      ii. Flexible
         a. The performance must be examined in the context it was accomplished
         b. Fit the tone, technique and content of the critique to the occasion as well as the student
         c. Allow for variables and be flexible to satisfy the requirements of the moment
      iii. Acceptable
         a. Before accepting the critique, students must accept the instructor
            • Must be confidence in qualifications, teaching ability, sincerity, competence and authority
         b. Present it fairly, with authority, conviction, sincerity, and from a position of competence
      iv. Comprehensive
         a. Cover strengths AND weaknesses
         b. What will provide the greatest benefit?
            • A few major points or more minor points
            • Critique what most needs improved or only what can be reasonably expected to improve
      v. Constructive
         a. The critique is pointless unless the student profits from it
         b. Don’t offer a negative critique without a solution
      vi. Organized
         a. It needs to follow some pattern of organization otherwise it may lose its impact
            • Any pattern is acceptable as long as it is logical and makes sense to student and instructor
b. Options include:
   - The sequence of the performance itself
   - Work backward from where the demonstration failed (or was successful)
   - Break the whole into parts or build the parts into a whole

vii. Thoughtful
   a. Reflects thoughtfulness to self-esteem, recognition, and approval from others
   - Ridicule, anger, or fun at a student’s expense have no place in a critique

viii. Specific (rather than general)
   a. Tell the student why something was not good and how to improve it
   b. Students should have no doubt what was good, and what was poor, and how they can improve
C. **Traditional Assessment**
   i. Generally refers to written testing
   ii. Characteristics of a good test:
      a. Reliability
      b. Validity
      c. Usability
      d. Objectivity
      e. Comprehensiveness
      f. Discrimination

D. **Authentic Assessment**
   i. The student is asked to perform real-world tasks, and demonstrate a meaningful application of skills and competencies
      a. Students must generate responses from their own knowledge rather than choosing from options
   ii. Open ended questions and set criteria are important characteristics

E. **Oral Assessment**
   i. Most common method of assessment
   ii. Comprised of direct or indirect questioning of the student

F. **Characteristics of Effective Oral Questions:**
   i. Have only one correct answer
   ii. Must apply to the subject of instruction
   iii. Should be brief and concise, but also clear and definite
   iv. Must be adapted to the ability, experience, and stage of training of the students
   v. Center on only one idea
   vi. Should be limited to who, what, where, when, why, or how and not a combination
   vii. Must present a challenge to the student
   viii. Demand and deserve the use of proper English

G. **Types of Questions to Avoid**
   i. “Do you understand?”/“Do you have any questions?” have no place in effective quizzing
   ii. Puzzle Questions
   iii. Oversize
   iv. Toss-up
   v. Bewilderment
   vi. Trick Questions
   vii. Irrelevant Questions

2. **Critique**
   A. **Instructor/Student Critique**
      i. The instructor leads a group discussion in which students offer criticism of a performance
         a. This should be controlled carefully and directed with a firm purpose (not a free-for-all)

   B. **Student Led Critique**
      i. A student is asked to lead the critique
      ii. This can generate student interest and learning, and be effective

   C. **Small Group Critique**
      i. Small groups are assigned a specific area to analyze and present their findings on
         a. Results in a comprehensive critique
D. Individual Student Critique by another Student
   i. Another student is requested to present the entire critique
      a. The instructor must maintain firm control over the process

E. Self Critique
   i. A student is required to critique personal performance
   ii. Do not leave controversial issues unresolved, or erroneous impressions uncorrected
   iii. Make sure the student realizes the mistakes

F. Written Critique
   i. 3 advantages
      a. Instructor can devote more time and thought to it
      b. The student can keep written critiques and refer to them whenever they wish
      c. The student has record of suggestions, recommendations, and opinions of all other students
   ii. Disadvantage is that the other members of the class do not benefit

G. Ground Rules
   i. Do not extend the critique beyond its scheduled time limit and into time allotted for other activities
      a. Point of diminishing returns is reached very quickly
      b. No more than 10 – 15 min (Definitely not more than 30 min)
   ii. Avoid trying to cover too much
      a. Get the main points (4-5 things to correct at most)
   iii. Allow time for a summary of the critique to reemphasize the most important things to remember
   iv. Avoid absolute statements (most rules have exceptions)
   v. Avoid controversies with the class and don’t take sides
   vi. Never allow yourself to maneuvered into defending criticism
      a. Don’t let the student argue and tell you that you are wrong
   vii. If part of the critique is written, ensure it is consistent with the oral portion

Conclusion
Brief review of the main points

PTS Requirements:
To determine that the applicant exhibits instructional knowledge of assessments and critiques by describing:

1. Assessment:
   a. Purpose of assessment.
   b. General characteristics of effective assessment.
   c. Traditional assessment.
   d. Authentic assessment.
   e. Oral assessment.
   f. Characteristics of effective questions.
   g. Types of questions to avoid.

2. Critique:
   a. Instructors/student critique.
   b. Student-lead critique.
   c. Small group critique.
   d. Individual student critique by another student.
   e. Self-critique.
   f. Written critique.